OFFICIAL REPORT OF PROCEEDINGS BEFORE THE

NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of: Case No.: 13-RC-198325

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

Employer

And

GRADUATE STUDENTS UNITED
Petitioner

Place: Chicago, IL Date: 05/30/17 Pages: 1405-1679

Volume: 8

OFFICIAL REPORTERS

Veritext National Court Reporters Mid-Atlantic Region 1250 Eye Street, NW – Suite 350 Washington, DC 20005 888-777-6690

Page 1405	1				Page 1407
		LND	1 17		rage 1407
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD	1	INDE		Z CV	DDV DCV
REGION 13	2	WITNESS ANTON FORD	D/	I CA	RDX RCX
REGION 13	4	By Ms. Auerbach	7	7	
UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO,)	5	By Mr. Fasman	,	26	
Employer,)	6	By Hearing Office	er Mols	48	
and) Case No.	7	By Ms. Auerbach	1,1015	50	
GRADUATE STUDENTS UNITED,) 13-RC-198325	8	By Mr. Fasman			52
Petitioner.)	9	By Ms. Auerbach		56	
	10	MATTHEW VAND	ERPOE	L	
	11	By Ms. Auerbach	5	57	
	12	By Mr. Pearlman		72	
The decree of 1 1	13	By Hearing Office	er Mols	122	_
The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to notice, before CHRISTINA MOLS,	14	By Ms. Auerbach		123	
Hearing Officer, at 219 South Dearborn Street,	15 16	By Mr. Pearlman MATTHEW McENI	EDNEV		125
Eighth Floor, Chicago, Illinois, on Tuesday,	17	By Ms. Fasman		39	
May 30, 2017, at the hour of 9:00 a.m.	18	By Ms. Auerbach	1.	179	
, ,	19	Hearing Officer M	Iols	186	
	20	By Mr. Fasman		187	
	21	KAMIL ASHAM			
	22	By Mr. Weitzman		222	
	23	By Hearing Office	er Mols	227	
	24	By Ms. Auerbach		269	9
	25				
Page 1406					Page 1408
1 A P P E A R A N C E S 2 On behalf of the Employer:	1	EXHIB	ITS		
3 PROSKAUER ROSE, LLP	2				
BY: MR. ZACHARY D. FASMAN 4 MR. ALLAN H. WEITZMAN	3	EXHIBIT	MARI	KED	RECEIVED
MR. STEVEN J. PORZIO 5 MR. PAUL SALVATORE	4	Employer's	24	DEIEC	
MR. STEVEN PEARLMAN	5 6	No. 52 No. 53	34 34	REJEC REJEC	
6 Eleven Times Square New York, New York 10036	7	No. 54	34	REJEC	
7 (212) 969-3440 zfasman@proskauer.com	8	No. 55	100	104	ILD
8	9	No. 56	100	104	
On behalf of the Petitioner: 9	10	No. 57	128	128	
DOWD BLOCH BENNETT CERVONE 10 AUERBACH & YOKICH	11	No. 58	145	146	
BY: MS. MELISSA J. AUERBACH	12	No. 59	160	161	
11 8 South Michigan Avenue Suite 19th Floor	13	No. 60	165	166	
12 Chicago, Illinois 60603 (312) 372-1361	14	No. 61	167	167	
13 mauerbach@dbb-law.com	15	No. 62	174	174	
14 and 15 AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS	16 17	No. 63 No. 64	174 201	174	
BY: MS. CHANNING COOPER 16 555 New Jersey Avenue NW	18	No. 64 No. 65	201	208 219	
Washington, D.C. 20001	19	110. 03	210	417	
17 (202) 879-4400 ccooper@gmail.com	20				
18	21				
20	22				
21 22	23				
23 24	24				
25	25				

1 (Pages 1405 to 1408)

	Page 1409		Page 1411
1	EXHIBITS	1	
1 2	ЕХПІВІІЗ	1 2	ANTON FORD, called as a witness herein, having been first duly
3	EXHIBIT MARKED RECEIVED	3	sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
4	Petitioner's	4	DIRECT EXAMINATION
5	No. 72 23 26	5	BY MS. AUERBACH:
6	No. 73 127 128	6	Q. Are you currently employed?
7	12, 120	7	A. Yes.
8		8	Q. Where?
9		9	A. University of Chicago.
10		10	Q. And what's your position?
11		11	A. I'm an associate professor and director of
12		12	undergraduate studies in the philosophy department.
13		13	Q. And how long have you been associate
14		14	professor of philosophy?
15		15	A. Since last December. Before that I was an
16		16	assistant professor.
17		17	Q. And are you a tenured currently
18		18	tenured?
19		19	A. Yes.
20		20	Q. And how long have you been tenured?
21		21	A. Since I was promoted to associate, so a
22 23		22	year ago December.
24		24	Q. So December 2015? A. Yes.
25		25	Q. And did you hold prior positions at the
2.5	Page 1410	23	Page 1412
1			
1	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.	1	university?
2	So in an off the record discussion the	2	A. Prior to being an assistant professor?
3 4	parties covered the order of witnesses according to their availability. The witness who we covered the	3 4	Q. Prior to being the associate professor.
5	direct questioning with on Friday is not available	5	A. I was an assistant professor.Q. Beginning when?
6	this morning but will return this afternoon for	6	A. 2008.
7	cross, so as to not delay the proceedings	7	Q. And as an associate professor of
8	unnecessarily, we are proceeding with the	8	philosophy do you teach undergraduates and
9	Petitioner's next witness. So if Petitioner would	9	graduates?
10	like to call its next witness.	10	A. Yes.
11	MS. AUERBACH: Petitioner calls Professor Anton	11	Q. And have you taught courses in which
12	Ford.	12	course assistants or teaching assistants were used?
13	(WHEREUPON, the witness was	13	A. Yes.
14	duly sworn.)	14	Q. And what courses have those been?
15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you state and spell	15	A. Introduction to ethics, a course called
16	your name for the record.	16	justice, most recently a course called racial
17	THE WITNESS: Anton Ford, A-n-t-o-n, F-o-r-d.	17	injustice, last term a course on marks.
18	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you.	18	Q. And are those what how are those
19	MR. PORZIO: Madame Hearing Officer, can we go off the record for a moment?	19	courses taught? Are they lectures or
20 21	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.	20	A. Yes. I give the lectures for the courses.
22	(WHEREUPON, a discussion was had	21 22	These are courses with at least 35, sometimes as
23	off the record.)	23	many as 60, students. I give the lectures. And the course assistants run the discussion sections
24	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.	24	which are sections of about 15 students. So one
25		25	course assistant usually teaches two of those. And

2 (Pages 1409 to 1412)

Page 1413 Page 1415

2.4

those are courses in which -- those are parts of the course in which students can talk to one another.

1 2

The course assistants have typically done the grading of the assignments. They have typically held office hours. I've also held office hours, and I've talked with the course assistants about the grading.

- Q. And do the course assistants also grade exams or just assignments?
- A. I don't typically have exams in a philosophy course. There are take-home exams for one course that I've taught, and when that happened the graduate student and I -- the graduate student did most of the grading, but I graded alongside in the sense that we would talk about what would be a good answer to each of the questions. And then there was back and forth in adjusting the grades.
- Q. And so the assignments that the graduate student CAs grade, are those written papers?
 - A. Normally they are papers, yes.
- Q. And normally about how many of those are there during a quarter?
- A. It's hard to generalize. But if there is a course assistant, then there's going to be at

discussion sections for the undergraduate students.

- Q. And then at the beginning of the course, have you spent time explaining to the CA what the responsibilities are with respect to discussion sections and grading?
- A. A little bit of time, but it's people -the CAs normally know. And I don't have unusual
 expectations, and so I think those -- generally
 speaking people know what kind of job is required
 as a CA.
- Q. And approximately how many hours a week do the -- are the course assistants expected to devote to course assistant responsibilities?
- A. Well, officially I think they're not -they're expected not to spend more than 15 hours
 per week. I do think -- I do think it varies how
 much they have to spend because different -- it's
 always the prerogative of a professor to do all the
 grading. Now, I don't believe anybody in the
 department -- philosophy department does that,
 so -- and it's the prerogative of the professor to
 take on as much of the CA's work as he or she wants
 to do, but . . .
- Q. In the courses that you've taught with the use of CAs, who benefitted from the

Page 1414

responsibilities carried out by the CAs?

least -- at least 30 that each course assistant's going to do. Normal you don't get assigned a course assistant unless you have more than 30.

Q. And how many hours a week are the discussion sections?

A. Each discussion section of 15 students or so is an hour, and so one course assistant normally has two of those in the department. So two hours of discussion sections.

Q. And how many hours of office hours per week do the course assistants hold?

A. One. I'm sorry. There's no hard and fast rule. I'm just describing from my --

Q. From what you've taught?

A. Exactly.

Q. And the courses you've taught that use course assistants, do you also lead discussion groups or are those only led by the course assistant?

A. If they are graduate students in those courses, I run a discussion group with the graduate students. So some courses are mixed upper level undergraduate and graduate students. And in those cases I do the discussion for the graduate students, and the graduate student CA does the

A. Well, I benefitted because the CA was doing grading and meeting with students and leading discussions that otherwise I would be responsible for doing, so it saves me a tremendous emount of

for doing, so it saves me a tremendous amount of time.

The graduate student benefits I suppose in the sense that they, you know, learn by -- you know, one good way to learn material is to try to teach it. But the main beneficiary I would say is the undergraduates who they're teaching.

Q. And after the course assistants grade the assignments, have you looked over their grading?

A. Yes. And also while they're grading. I mean, the way it sometimes works is the graduate students -- a graduate student CA will look at the papers, will put some provisional marks on them, will show those provisional marks to me or say a low one, a middle one, a high one; and we will talk about what sorts of grades to give to these and what sorts of comments, and we'll sometimes discuss the comments. So that happens before the final grade is assigned.

Q. How does the philosophy department -- well, do you know approximately how many majors --

3 (Pages 1413 to 1416)

Page 1416

Page 1419 Page 1417 1 undergraduate majors the philosophy department 1 hire the instructors who teach tutorials for our 2 2 currently has? majors and the preceptors who run the writing 3 A. Approximately 150. 3 workshops for undergraduates finishing their 4 4 Q. Do you know approximately how many undergraduate thesis. Q. And what is a tutorial? 5 graduate students, Ph.D. students the department 5 6 6 currently has? A. The tutorial is a small seminar on a 7 7 A. If I had to guess, I would say around 50. special topic for our juniors and seniors in the 8 8 major. It is taught by a graduate student. And we I'm unsure. 9 9 normally have about five of those per year on a Q. And do you know how the philosophy 10 department ranks in humanities in terms of the 10 variety of different topics. 11 11 Q. And are all those tutorials taught by number of majors? 12 12 graduate students? A. I believe we're second to the English 13 department in number of majors, so it's a very 13 A. Yes. 14 14 large major. Q. And do all of the philosophy graduate 15 15 Q. And has there been any difficulty in students typically teach tutorials? 16 finding enough course assistants among the graduate 16 A. Yes. It's normal for a graduate student 17 students in the department? 17 to teach a tutorial. 18 A. Yes. Increasingly it's been difficult to 18 Q. And in what year do the graduate students 19 staff these positions because the undergraduate 19 typically --20 population is growing and the graduate student 20 A. Normally in the fifth. 21 population is not growing. If anything, it's 21 Q. And do graduate students beyond the fifth 22 22 getting slightly smaller. And so we have in recent year also teach tutorials? 23 years had a regular difficulty finding enough CAs 23 A. Yes. 24 to staff these large --24 Q. And if they do that beyond their fifth 25 Q. And if you don't have enough graduate 25 year, do they get paid an additional amount for Page 1418 Page 1420 1 students within the department to staff the CA 1 doing that? 2 2 slots, what has happened? A. Yes. 3 3 O. And what does the instructor over a A. Let me say, it is not responsibility as 4 DUS, so I'm not sure about all the details, but I 4 tutorial have -- what responsibilities does that 5 do know that they're drawn from other departments. 5 person have? 6 I believe there are sometime -- if it gets -- if 6 A. They have the normal -- they have the full 7 7 the situation gets desperate enough, they may even responsibilities. They're the instructors of 8 be drawn from other universities in the area. I'm 8 record, so they have whatever responsibilities a 9 not sure about that last, but I know for sure from 9 professor would have if they were teaching a 10 10 other departments. course. So they design the syllabus. They teach 11 Q. For how long a period of time are the 11 the course. They make up the assignments. They 12 graduate students fully funded in the philosophy 12 grade the assignments, and they assign the grades. 13 13 department? They deliver the grades to the registrar. 14 14 A. Five years. Q. And how do you go about selecting the 15 15 Q. And do most of the Ph.D. students obtain instructors for the tutorials? 16 their Ph.D. within five years? 16 A. We solicit applications which -- to all 17 17 A. Almost no one does. the graduate students and request that they send us 18 O. Do graduate students in the philosophy 18 a CV, a syllabus, a completely finished syllabus 19 department serve as instructors and preceptors? 19 down to the assignments, the reading assignments, 20 20 and a description of the course. And then having 21 21 Q. And have you had any role with respect to solicited those applications, the director of 22 selecting graduate students who serve as 22 graduate students and the director of undergraduate 23 23 instructors and preceptors? students look at all of the applications and select 24 24 A. Yes. As the director of undergraduate the five or so that look like they'll be the best studies, it's my responsibility to choose -- to 25

4 (Pages 1417 to 1420)

courses giving some priority to the people in the

Page 1423 Page 1421 1 1 fifth year. seminars. 2 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Just a quick question, Q. Do faculty members teach -- do they teach 3 when this call is put out and applications are 3 any of these tutorials? 4 4 solicited, is there any kind of set framework for A. There is a junior tutorial that's taught 5 the courses the department must offer or are the 5 by a faculty member for some of our majors. 6 courses all of the undergrad student's own design. 6 There's one. 7 THE WITNESS: They're entirely the graduate 7 Q. And is that taught in a similar fashion to 8 student's own design. There are no parameters. 8 the ones taught by the graduate students? 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. 9 A. Yes. 10 THE WITNESS: Often the courses suggested by 10 Q. And what do preceptors do in the 11 graduate students are in some way related to their 11 philosophy department? 12 dissertations, so it's . . . 12 A. Preceptors run a thesis writing workshop 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. 13 for the seniors who are writing a BA thesis. They 14 14 BY MS. AUERBACH: meet with the group they're responsible for three 15 15 Q. And in reviewing the course design, do you times in the automatic, couple times in the winter, 16 pick ones to ensure that it's within the goals of 16 once at the very beginning of the spring. And 17 the department in terms of the undergraduate 17 they -- they provide additional support above and 18 18 education? beyond that which the student's main advisor can 19 19 A. Yeah. So the reason that I am apart of provide. 20 the selection process is because I'm responsible 20 Q. The main advisor is the faculty member? 21 for making sure that the curriculum offered to the 21 A. That's right. So each student BA writer 22 undergraduates covers the necessary basis. There's 22 has a faculty advisor, but, you know, between 23 23 not too much overlapping class. There are classes meetings with the faculty advisor which may be 24 at different levels. 24 rare, they're meeting on a much more regular basis 25 And so part of what I'm thinking about is 25 with the graduate student preceptor. Page 1422 Page 1424 not merely the quality of the course proposed in 1 Q. And who is responsible for their final 1 2 2 absolute terms, but how it fits into the overall grade given the seniors on their thesis? 3 A. Two people. The first person, the first 3 curriculum. 4 4 reader is that student's advisor; and then the Q. And once the instructors are chosen, do 5 5 they then teach this fourth quarter? director of undergraduate studies, in this case 6 6 currently me, assigns a second reader, also a A. Yes. 7 7 Q. And if Ph.D. students serve as instructors faculty member. Those two people discuss the grade in tutorials beyond their fifth year, are they 8 and assign the grade. And the grade given for the 9 9 final paper is then applied to the workshop. So performing the same function as those grad students 10 10 who are in their fifth year -the preceptors do not give grades. 11 A. Yes. 11 Q. And do faculty members ever serve as 12 Q. -- who are performing that function? 12 preceptors? 13 13 A. Yes. It's normal for the director of A. Yes. 14 14 Q. And the graduate students who serve as undergraduate studies to run one these workshops 15 15

instructors for tutorials benefit whom by that 16 work? 17 A. Well, they benefit the undergraduates who 18 don't normally have the opportunity to have a 19

small, focused seminar with other majors. And I guess they benefit the undergraduate program in that we don't have enough faculty. We don't have enough faculty to teach those classes as well as the big lecture courses that we're responsible for doing. So if it weren't for these graduate students, the majors would not have access to small

20

21

22

23

24

25

alongside the graduate students.

Q. And have you done that?

A. Yes.

Q. And when you did that, how many graduate students were also running the workshops?

A. Two others like . . .

Q. So two graduate students plus you?

A. Yes, yes.

Q. And how did the work that the graduate students did as preceptors compare to what you did as a preceptor?

5 (Pages 1421 to 1424)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 1425 Page 1427 1 A. It was the same. We discussed together. 1 student instructor positions. 2 2 Q. And is this currently on the Provost Together we decided on the schedule and carried it 3 3 website? out. 4 4 Q. And do you know about how many hours a A. Yes. 5 weak or over the quarter the preceptors expected to 5 Q. And it's dated in 2009. Was it brought to 6 6 devote to preceptor responsibilities? Is there your attention sometime nearer to the time that it 7 7 was written? 8 8 A. Yes. A. I don't know. 9 9 Q. And how was that? Q. Do preceptors get paid for doing 10 10 A. In a faculty meeting it was brought to preceptor --11 11 our -- a colleague who, I believe, was then the A. Yes. Q. -- duties? 12 12 director of graduate studies brought it to our 13 And who benefits from the responsibilities 13 14 14 carried out by the graduate students as preceptors? MS. AUERBACH: I move to introduce Exhibit 72. 15 A. The undergraduate thesis writers as well 15 MR. FASMAN: We need to read it and then 16 as, I should say, as well as the faculty advisors 16 voir dire if we choose to do so. 17 who would have to spend a lot more time working 17 MR. PORZIO: So we haven't seen this document with the undergraduates as the graduate students 18 18 before. And I think before we can agree to it 19 19 being accepted into the record, we would like to weren't supplying the kind of regular feedback that 20 they are doing. 20 see if this is the most recent version that's on 21 21 Q. And how are graduate students selected to the website. We just haven't seen it. We can't 22 determine based on just reading it whether it's the 22 be preceptors? 23 23 A. On the basis of their previous teaching most recent and authentic version. 2.4 24 experience at the university and a cover letter. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: We'll just -- does the 25 Q. Has the department awarded teaching awards 25 witness know if this is the most recent version of Page 1426 Page 1428 1 to graduate students? 1 this document that is maintained on the university 2 2 website? A. Yes. THE WITNESS: Yes, it's on -- this is on the 3 3 O. And how are the winners of those awards 4 selected? 4 website now. 5 5 A. We send e-mails out to the undergraduates MR. FASMAN: That wasn't quite what was asked. 6 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I know. 6 soliciting nominations. After collecting those 7 7 nominations, the chair, the director of graduate THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. Is it the most 8 8 studies and the director of undergraduate studies recent? True. Well, I'm sorry. Could you ask the 9 look them over and decide on a student on the basis 9 question again, please, so I can answer precisely? 10 of those -- the testimonials provided -- sorry. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So you had testified 11 this was brought to your attention around the time 11 It's not just nominations, but the students then 12 write something talking about the work that these 12 that it was written, that it was maintained on the 13 13 university's website or the office of the provost graduate students have done for them. And on the 14 14 website. Do you know if this is the same one basis of reading all those, we give an award to one 15 that's still kept on the office of the provost 15 of the graduate student instructors. (WHEREUPON, Petitioner's Exhibit 16 website or this is the most -- first off, answer 16 17 17 No. 72 was marked for that question. 18 THE WITNESS: Yes, yes, I know that. 18 identification.) 19 BY MS. AUERBACH: 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: And do you know if there 20 20 Q. I'm handing you a document identified as are anymore recent versions that are in use? Petitioner's Exhibit 72. 72. 21 THE WITNESS: I do not know that. 21 22 22 Can you identify this document? HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Are you going to 23 23 A. Yes. This is a report on the provost's wait? Are you going to defer to wait or --24 MR. PORZIO: At this point we would like to 24 website that outlines the job descriptions and work expectations for lecturers and other graduate 25 object to it, and I guess pending our review of the 25

6 (Pages 1425 to 1428)

Page 1429 Page 1431 1 1 Q. You have to answer. website, we can then come back to it. 2 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. A. Yes. Sorry. 3 MS. AUERBACH: This is currently on the website 3 Q. Now, when did that become effective, sir? 4 and the only version of it on the website. 4 A. July 1 is when my -- you find out on 5 MR. FASMAN: Well, we should at least be able 5 December 15 and the following July 1st. 6 to look at that. I would note that Mr. Rosenbaum 6 Q. Got it. Let me go back and ask you just a 7 is no longer the provost. I mean, this was eight 7 couple of questions for clarification of the 8 years ago. So I think we ought to be afforded the 8 record. 9 opportunity to look at it at least. If anything, 9 I believe you testified that for 10 if there's a new version, this would be a 10 instructors and preceptors as the director of 11 historical document. 11 undergraduate education in the philosophy 12 MS. AUERBACH: Well, I would just note that the 12 department, it's your responsibility to choose 13 Employer has put in documents that were a few years 13 these people --14 old from prior people who held positions that they 14 A. That's right. 15 no longer held, too. 15 Q. -- correct? 16 MR. FASMAN: Well, we have because we've been 16 And --17 able to then say this is the most recent version. 17 A. Although, let me clarify. With instructors I also discuss with the director of 18 18 We've done that uniformly. 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So the witness has given 19 graduate studies. 20 his knowledge of the document. At this moment it 20 Q. Correct. 21 may be possible that there is potentially a more 21 A. It's not entirely my responsibility. 22 22 recent version out there, but, you know, the Q. And with regard to -- those are the 23 23 instructors and preceptors. And you also work witness has testified that this is still maintained 24 24 on the university website. So I'm going to receive directly with CAs who are assigned to your courses? 25 it into evidence. 25 A. That's right. Page 1430 Page 1432 1 If the Employer at a later time finds 1 Q. Do you instruct them what to do from time 2 2 evidence that there is a more recent document, we to time? 3 can discuss it further. But for now Exhibit 72 is 3 A. Yes. 4 received. 4 Q. And how would you define your role as the 5 (WHEREUPON, Petitioner 5 director of undergraduate studies? What does that 6 Exhibit No. 72 was received into 6 entail, sir? 7 7 evidence.) A. I'm responsible for the undergraduate 8 8 MR. FASMAN: Thank you. program, for the major basically. So I'm 9 MS. AUERBACH: Those are all the questions I 9 responsible for making sure that there's a 10 10 sufficient number and variety of courses that meet 11 MR. FASMAN: Can we take a couple minutes, 11 the requirements for our undergraduate majors. I 12 please? 12 have -- there's an assistant director of 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record. 13 undergraduate studies who's employed to help me 14 (WHEREUPON, a short recess was 14 with mostly meeting with graduate students, 15 15 taken.) answering technical questions about what applies 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. 16 for what, dealing with transfer credit, things like 17 Employer can proceed with his questions 17 that. But my special domain is the undergraduate 18 18 for the witness. program. 19 MR. FASMAN: Thank you, Madame Hearing Officer. 19 Q. Okay. And is it fair to say that you 20 **CROSS-EXAMINATION** 20 would also be dealing with if there were complaints 21 BY MR. FASMAN: 21 about a course assistant or course instructor --22 Q. Professor Ford, good morning. 22 A. Yes. 23 A. Good morning. 23 Q. -- that they would come to you? 24 Q. You were tenured in December of 2015? 24 A. Yes. 25 A. [Nodding]. 25 Q. And same for instructors and preceptors --

7 (Pages 1429 to 1432)

Page 1433 Page 1435 1 1 A. Yes. MR. FASMAN: Certainly. Let the record 2 2 Q. -- correct? reflect, though, that I merely asked him what was 3 3 Have such complaints occurred? involved in union organizing. It was a much more 4 4 A. Undergraduates complaining about the generic question than you've just said. But, look, 5 course instructor? 5 our position is quite simple. 6 6 Q. Yeah, I don't like Fasman --Professor Ford has testified that he is 7 7 A. What's that? the director of undergraduate education and 8 8 philosophy department. As such, he selects or is Q. I don't like Fasman, he doesn't know what 9 he's doing, something like that? 9 materially involved in selection of graduate 10 A. No. I have not ever had a complaint from 10 students for becoming instructors of record, 11 11 preceptors, both positions that would presumably be a student about a CA. Q. Okay. Now, you are a -- strike that. 12 12 of interest in support to them and perhaps 13 Do you know what is involved in union 13 compensation. He's also testified that he is an 14 14 overall supervisory role over the education of organizing, sir? 15 MS. AUERBACH: Objection, relevance. 15 undergraduate students in the philosophy department 16 MR. FASMAN: I'll connect it. 16 which are precisely the people who are being taught 17 MS. AUERBACH: Well, I have an objection, 17 by the individuals who are at issue here. 18 18 If allowed to continue this line of relevance. 19 19 MR. FASMAN: Not yet. I am entitled to ask a questioning, we would establish the following, that 20 few questions and then connect it up. 20 Professor Ford has supervisory responsibilities 21 MS. AUERBACH: Well, don't agree. I think 21 over the individuals that the union is seeking to 22 22 it -- there's an objection pending. organize, number one. Number two, that he is the 23 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you give a little founding member of the AAUP Advocacy Chapter and 24 24 background? its current secretary, that he has appeared at 25 MR. FASMAN: Not without doing something I 25 various forums and spoken at various forums in Page 1434 Page 1436 1 don't want to do in front of the witness. If you 1 favoring of graduate student unionization that was 2 2 run -- that have been run by the union. And I would like to excuse the witness and the people in would like to ask him as well whether he has 3 3 the room, I'm happy to explain. solicited any cards on behalf of the union in 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can we go off the 4 5 5 record? connection with those roles. I think -- thank you. 6 6 (WHEREUPON, a discussion was had As a tenured faculty member, I think he is 7 7 off the record.) also managerial under the Sheva decision, but I 8 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. think he's gone further than that. Under the Sheva 9 MR. FASMAN: May we have the witness step 9 decision, he's a tenured faculty member as a member 10 10 of management, and I think we're entitled to outside while we do this? 11 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Give me just a minute. establish that there is supervisory taint with regard to this petition and perhaps an unfair labor 12 Off the record. 12 13 13 practice involved as well. I think I'm entitled to (WHEREUPON, a short recess was 14 14 establish that on the record. taken.) 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What is the Petitioner's 16 So before we went off the record, the 16 position? 17 17 Employer asked the question of the witness MS. AUERBACH: The Petitioner's position is, 18 18 first of all, that the line of questioning is concerning any involvement or his knowledge of the 19 unionization effort. The Petitioner raised an 19 irrelevant to this preelection hearing and, second, 20 20 objection concerned to relevance. In an off the that he under very clear board policy allegations 21 record discussion, the parties raised their 21 regarding the shown of interest are not subject to 22 22 positions on the matter. litigation in a representation hearing, but are a 23 So now I would like the parties to state 23 matter of administrative determination by the 24 24 regional director. their respective positions for the record. 25 Employer? 25 Further, even if it were subject to

8 (Pages 1433 to 1436)

Page 1437 Page 1439 1 litigation, there's no showing that this person is 1 they include Professor Hirschfeldt who we heard a supervisor, and there's also no showing that he 2 2 from last week. 3 3 has solicited cards for the union. And with Employer 53 discusses a forum that was 4 4 respect to the Sheva case does not find that all held by the AAUP Advocacy Chapter in connection --5 tenured faculty are supervisory. There have been a 5 with in collaboration with the GSU. This panel of 6 number of U.S. court of Appeal decisions after 6 speakers was presented by Professor Ford who we've 7 Sheva finding that tenured faculty were not 7 already heard is the director of undergraduate 8 8 supervisory. education in the philosophy department and an 9 But, in any case, primarily that the 9 officer. And 53 also discusses in detail a speech 10 issues raised by the Employer are not relevant to 10 that was made by Professor Hirschfeldt at that 11 this hearing and this shown of interest is not 11 forum. 12 subject to litigation in this proceeding. 12 Finally, 54 is a statement from the AAUP 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So having considered the 13 Chapter with regard to unionization events at the 14 parties' arguments as well as an in camera review 14 university, signed again by Professor Hirschfeldt, 15 15 of some documents raised by the Employer, you know, the chapter vice president, and by Professor Ford 16 16 in consultation with the regional director, the as the chapter secretary. 17 region is not going to permit this line of 17 MS. AUERBACH: The union objects to receiving 18 18 questioning. It is well-established that showing into evidence these documents for the same reasons 19 19 as the objection to the testimony. of interest is a not litigable issue, is subject to 20 administrative review. If there is a possibility 20 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So as with the testimony 21 of supervisory taint in the organizing activity, 21 as these primarily deal to the Employer entering 22 22 that is a matter left for the unfair labor practice these in regards to a matter that I am not going to 23 23 proceedings and not for representation proceedings permit questioning on, I'm going to reject 24 24 such as this. Employer's Exhibits 52, 53 and 54. 25 So if there is a question the Employer has 25 Page 1438 Page 1440 1 with regards to the potential supervisory role of 1 (WHEREUPON, Employer's Exhibit 2 2 Nos. 52, 53 and 54 were the witness in overseeing the grad students and 3 3 those questions that may get to the heart of the rejected.) 4 matter is raised in the Employer's offer proof on 4 MR. FASMAN: I would like those placed in the 5 5 the matters being considered in these proceedings, rejected exhibits files. 6 I will allow those questions. But to the extent 6 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: They will be. 7 7 that as it relates to the organizing activities or MR. FASMAN: Thank you. 8 8 the showing of interest, I am not going to permit HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I believe they're the 9 those questions. 9 only ones so far. 10 10 MR. FASMAN: All right. I would like to mark Okay. So are there any other further 11 three exhibits then, and you can reject them if you 11 matters before I go collect the witness? 12 wish. 12 MR. FASMAN: Not from our side. 13 13 MS. AUERBACH: Which are you marking? Okay. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Off the record. 14 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 14 (WHEREUPON, a short recess was 15 Nos. 52, 53 and 54 were marked 15 taken.) 16 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. for identification.) 17 17 Employer can proceed with his questions MR. FASMAN: Are we still on the record? 18 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes. for the witness. 19 MR. FASMAN: I would like to offer in evidence 19 MR. FASMAN: Thank you. I would like to ask 20 20 three documents, Employer's Exhibit 52, 53 and 54, Professor Ford two questions along the lines of 21 21 what we were just discussing. all of which deal with efforts by, pardon me, the 22 22 AAUP Advocacy Chapter to publicize its views in BY MR. FASMAN: 23 favor of unionization. And I would note that on 23 O. Professor Ford, have you ever solicited a 24 24 union authorization card on behalf of the Number 52, on the bottom, not only the officers of 25 this group not only include Professor Ford, but 25 Petitioner?

9 (Pages 1437 to 1440)

1	Page 1441		Page 1443
1	MS. AUERBACH: Objection.	1	A. I see. I'm sorry.
2	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Objection sustained. Do	2	Q. No. That's fine. I do
3	not answer, Dr or Professor Ford.	3	A. Of course what I said about them goes for
4	BY MR. FASMAN:	4	these others as well. I if that's what's at
5	Q. Have you ever been in the presence of	5	issue, then sure, of course.
6	anyone where a union authorization card was	6	Q. It's not just that they benefit by
7	solicited?	7	teaching and learning the material, though. They
8	MS. AUERBACH: Objection.	8	learn how to teach when they teach, right?
9	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Objection sustained.	9	A. Yes, of course.
10	MR. FASMAN: Thank you.	10	Q. If I'm an instructor in a class, an
11	BY MR. FASMAN:	11	instructor designs the class, right?
12	Q. Professor Ford, you were talking earlier,	12	A. Yes.
13	you testified earlier about when CAs are involved	13	Q. This is a significant honor, isn't it?
14	in let me go back to something else here.	14	A. Well, it's a significant responsibility I
15	With regard to instructors and preceptors,	15	would say.
16	you were asked questions about who benefits from	16	Q. Well, it's a competitive process, I
17	the activities of instructors and preceptors. Do	17	presume?
18	you remember those questions?	18	A. Yes.
19	A. Yes.	19	Q. You entertain applications?
20	Q. Do you remember your answers?	20	A. Yes.
21	A. Yes.	21	Q. Even submit the whole
22	Q. The one group of people you didn't mention	22	A. Yes.
23	as benefitting from this were the graduate	23	Q syllabus down to the work assignments?
24	instructors and the graduate preceptors, and I	24	A. Yes.
25	don't understand how you can skip those. You're a	25	Q. And so getting chosen
	Page 1442		Page 1444
1		1	A. Yes.
1 2	professor of philosophy, truth, justice. I mean, they benefit from this clearly, don't they?	2	Q is a benefit to the individual?
3	A. I think if you check the record, you'll	3	A. Well, as getting hired for any job is.
	see that I did mention them.)	
- 71		1	
4		4 5	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning.
5	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I	5	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class
5 6	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question.	5 6	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes.
5 6 7	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question.A. With the last two what?	5 6 7	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning.They're actually taking over a classA. Yes.Q right?
5 6 7 8	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question.A. With the last two what?Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were	5 6 7 8	 Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on
5 6 7 8 9	 Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. 	5 6 7 8 9	 Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching
5 6 7 8 9	 Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the 	5 6 7 8 9	 Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	 Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I 	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	 Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	 Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And 	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know,	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates. Q. Well, actually that's what you testified	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say they were job applicants.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates. Q. Well, actually that's what you testified to with regard to course assistants, and I wrote	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say they were job applicants. Q. You would. Do they but you don't take
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates. Q. Well, actually that's what you testified to with regard to course assistants, and I wrote that down very clearly. And then when we talked	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say they were job applicants. Q. You would. Do they but you don't take applications from outside the university, do you?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates. Q. Well, actually that's what you testified to with regard to course assistants, and I wrote that down very clearly. And then when we talked about the other categories	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say they were job applicants. Q. You would. Do they but you don't take applications from outside the university, do you? A. No.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates. Q. Well, actually that's what you testified to with regard to course assistants, and I wrote that down very clearly. And then when we talked about the other categories A. Oh.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say they were job applicants. Q. You would. Do they but you don't take applications from outside the university, do you? A. No. Q. To be an instructor of record in the
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. You didn't with regard to the last two. I guess that's why I'm asking the question. A. With the last two what? Q. Instructors and preceptors, they were conspicuously absent from your answer. A. No. I believe I said something to the effect of and I started with the faculty, then I said the graduate students themselves benefit. And I said something to this effect because, you know, it's an important way to learn, to teach, something like that. I don't remember. We can ask the court reporter to Q. Yeah. A. And then I mentioned the undergraduates. Q. Well, actually that's what you testified to with regard to course assistants, and I wrote that down very clearly. And then when we talked about the other categories	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Yeah. Well, but they they're learning. They're actually taking over a class A. Yes. Q right? And they would be entitled to put that on their resume when they go to apply for a teaching position? A. Sure, just like any job. Q. Yeah. And so that would be a big benefit to them? A. Yeah. Work experience helps. Q. Yeah. Okay. Of course you're not looking for these are not job applications. You're actually looking for scholars, right? A. Well, they're job applicants. I would say they were job applicants. Q. You would. Do they but you don't take applications from outside the university, do you? A. No.

10 (Pages 1441 to 1444)

	Page 1445		Page 1447
1	Q at the university of Chicago, I'd have	1	Q. Right.
2	to be a graduate student	2	A. So there so it's slightly more
3	A. That's right.	3	complicated.
4	Q at the University of Chicago. Okay.	4	Q. So you could as the director of
5	And the same thing with regard to	5	undergraduate education, you review whether a
6	preceptors	6	course that I propose or a grad student proposes to
7	A. That's right.	7	teach as an instructor of record
8	Q if they're involved, they're helping	8	A. Yes.
9	preceptors are working with undergraduate	9	Q is consistent with the overall
10	philosophy majors?	10	curriculum being offered?
11	A. Yes.	11	A. Yes.
12	Q. And helping them to put together their	12	Q. And presumably you well, let me ask you
13	thesis in the best possible fashion	13	this.
14	A. That's right.	14	By yourself could you say, no, it's not,
15	Q correct?	15	and you can't teach it?
16	And these are people who work within the	16	A. Well, the decision is made with the
17	philosophy department, correct?	17	director of graduate students. So if I had a
18	A. Yes.	18	strong objection to it, I mean, I don't think that
19	Q. They're not in the writing program?	19	DGS is going to overrule it. I mean, the reason
20	A. That's correct.	20	that the DGS is involved is because they're
21	Q. Okay. But I would learn as a preceptor,	21	graduate students. The reason I'm involved is
22	presumably I would learn something about	22	because they're graduate students teaching
23	pedagogy	23	undergrads. So if I say
24	A. Yes.	24	Q. Right.
25	Q by helping these	25	A this doesn't work, we have a class a
	Page 1446		Page 1448
1	A. Of course.	1	faculty member is already teaching a class on this
2	Q undergraduates?	2	subject, we don't need this class, liken the
3	A. Certainly.	3	argument
4	Q. Are they required to take any training,	4	Q. Yeah, you could effectively say, we're not
5	sir?	5	doing that?
6	A. To be a preceptor, no.	6	A. That's right.
7	Q. When you interview them	7	Q. Okay. Are the grant students in the
8	A. Uh-huh.	8	philosophy department in general looking for
9	Q I think, I may have misquoted you, but	9	teaching positions?
10	what do you look for when you go to choose them?	10	A. At a certain stage in their career, they
11	A. Previous teaching experience primarily.	11	are. Before I think their third year, they're not.
12	Q. Okay. Why do you choose previous teaching	12	But after that, they they are.
13	experience?	13	Q. And how would why do you split it
14	A. Because like anything else, the more you	14	between third and then thereafter?
15	teach, the better you get. And we want somebody	15	A. Well, I should say that this is not
16 17	who's good at it.	16 17	strictly my purview because that's the director of
	Q. Yeah. And the same thing with regard to	18	graduate studies, but my understanding of the
18 19	instructors, right? A. Yes.	19	reason that it works that way is because in the
20	A. 1 es. Q. Or is it more complex?	20	first couple years the graduate students focus on taking classes.
21	A. It's a little more complex there because	21	Q. I see. I see.
22	there we're judging a syllabus, and just because	22	A. So that they can concentrate on taking
		23	classes.
1 / 3	Voll've been a ('A doesn't mean voll've but together a		
23 24	you've been a CA doesn't mean you've put together a	l .	
23 24 25	good syllabus. And we're also looking at how the syllabus fits into the curriculum.	24 25	Q. But thereafter they're basically looking forward and to becoming a member of the academy is

	Page 1449		Page 1451
1	what I would presume you do with a Ph.D.?	1	administrative concern.
2	A. Right.	2	Q. You do know, though, that in order to get
3	Q. Just as you did?	3	a Ph.D. degree from the University of Chicago
4	A. That's right.	4	department of philosophy, you have to have
5	Q. Okay. And in teaching teaching award	5	satisfied your GAI point requirement, correct?
6	is something that you mentioned at the end of your	6	A. Yes. But how they're distributed, I don't
7	direct testimony. There's an e-mail I think you	7	know.
8	testified there's an e-mail that goes around for	8	Q. No, I understand that.
9	nominations?	9	A. Uh-huh, yes.
10	A. Uh-huh.	10	Q. Presumably these being a CA, being an
11	Q. And the chair of the department, the	11	instructor, being a preceptor, all
12	director of graduate studies and yourself decide	12	A. Count towards that.
13	who gets the teaching awards, correct?	13	Q count towards some
14	A. [Nodding].	14	A. In some way other.
15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you say?	15	Q. Yes?
16	THE WITNESS: Yes. I'm sorry, sorry. Yes.	16	A. Yes.
17	BY MR. FASMAN:	17	Q. And those are academic requirements?
18	Q. Thank you.	18	A. I don't know. I don't understand. I
19	So what criteria do you use to decide	19	don't understand the system well, that part of it,
20	whether someone's going to get a teaching award?	20	well enough to say.
21	A. The number of nominations that they get,	21	Q. Well, you can let me see if I can ask
22	the credibility of the nominations they get, the	22	it in a more simple fashion. You can't get your
23	sorts of things that students say about them in	23	A. A Ph.D.
24	those nominations. Also, we hold on to the	24	Q Ph.D
25	nominations over a course of years, so we don't	25	A. That's right.
			3
	Page 1450		Page 1452
1		1	
1 2	just throw them away each year. So if somebody	1 2	Q without five points
2	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if	2	Q without five points A. Yes.
2	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things		Q without five pointsA. Yes.Q right?
2 3 4	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that.	2 3 4	Q without five pointsA. Yes.Q right?A. Correct.
2 3 4 5	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that	2	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to
2 3 4	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right?	2 3 4 5	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed.	2 3 4 5 6	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award?	2 3 4 5 6 7	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	 Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors receive compensation for that, correct? A. Correct.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes. EXAMINATION
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors receive compensation for that, correct?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes. EXAMINATION BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors receive compensation for that, correct? A. Correct. Q. But they also receive another benefit,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes. EXAMINATION BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Q. So referring to the quarter that we're
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors receive compensation for that, correct? A. Correct. Q. But they also receive another benefit, don't they? They get GAI points? A. I don't I don't under I don't doubt	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes. EXAMINATION BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Q. So referring to the quarter that we're currently in, spring 2017, do you know how many
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors receive compensation for that, correct? A. Correct. Q. But they also receive another benefit, don't they? They get GAI points?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes. EXAMINATION BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Q. So referring to the quarter that we're currently in, spring 2017, do you know how many graduate students in the philosophy department are
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	just throw them away each year. So if somebody gets one every year, that's significant even if they never get two in any particular area, things like that. Q. That might inform the recommendation that you could write, right? A. Right. Yes, it would indeed. Q. Okay. What do I get as a teaching award? Do you get any financial A. No. Q. Is there a financial A. I don't believe there is. Q. Okay. Presumably the student would put it on his or her resume of course? A. That's right. Q. Okay. Just a couple of other questions. You mentioned that preceptors and instructors receive compensation for that, correct? A. Correct. Q. But they also receive another benefit, don't they? They get GAI points? A. I don't I don't under I don't doubt it, but it's not my I really don't know how GAI	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q without five points A. Yes. Q right? A. Correct. Q. So presumably that's not related to A. Okay. Yes. Q to compensation? A. Yes, yes. Q. That's all I was asking. A. Yes, yes, yes. MR. FASMAN: Okay. I think I'm finished with my cross. Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Petitioner, any further questions for the witness? MS. AUERBACH: Just a couple. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Actually, I think I have of a couple. Just give me a few minutes. EXAMINATION BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Q. So referring to the quarter that we're currently in, spring 2017, do you know how many graduate students in the philosophy department are currently acting as CAs, instructors and

12 (Pages 1449 to 1452)

Page 1453 Page 1455 1 so I don't have a sense of that. 1 year. 2 Q. Okay. Do you know how many instructors of 2 Q. But they may do it one quarter one year 3 record there are this quarter that are grad 3 and then another quarter the next year? 4 4 students? A. That's possible. 5 5 Q. With respect to the fifth year graduate A. I believe there are two instructors of 6 record, but I may be wrong about that. I would 6 students who were serving as instructors, do you 7 7 know whether or not those grad students have have to have look it up. And there are two 8 8 already fulfilled their GAI requirements or not preceptors, I'm sure about that. 9 9 when they reach their fifth year? Q. Currently how many faculty does the 10 10 department of philosophy employ? A. I don't know. I don't know. 11 A. I believe it's about 18. I'm not sure. 11 Q. As director of undergraduate studies, is 12 12 your focus on the undergraduate curriculum? Q. Do you know how many courses, 13 undergraduate courses the department is offering 13 14 Q. Is that a position a permanent position or 14 this quarter? 15 15 is that a position that's rotated? A. Off the top of my head, no. Certainly not 16 more than -- not more than eight right now. You're 16 A. It's rotated. 17 asking about this term? 17 O. And how does that work? 18 Q. Yes, this quarter. 18 A. It's like the other committee assignments 19 19 A. No. Sorry. That can't be right. I'm and administrative positions within the department. 20 sorry. It may be more than that. I'm not sure. 20 Every three or so years somebody new is asked to do 21 It's on the department website. 21 this position -- to do the director -- to be the 22 22 Q. Yeah, if you don't know -director of undergraduate studies asked by the 23 23 A. We can look it up. I don't know. Let me chair. And then once they've done three, they're 24 say I don't know. 24 considered to have done their tour. 25 Q. Okay. 25 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: The chair of the Page 1454 Page 1456 1 A. I don't know. 1 department of philosophy. 2 2 Q. We can look it up. THE WITNESS: The chair of the department of 3 3 A. I don't know. philosophy. 4 Q. I don't know is always an acceptable 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Thank you. 5 5 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. answer. 6 6 A. Okay. I don't know. **RECROSS-EXAMINATION** 7 7 Q. Do you know if there's a particular BY MR. FASMAN: 8 8 undergraduate to instructor ratio that the Q. Just a couple of questions. I meant to 9 9 ask this earlier, and I apologize. department of philosophy strives for? 10 10 A. An undergraduate to instructor ratio, no, You said that with regard to instructors 11 there is no such ratio. 11 of record, in your decisional process you give 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: That's all of my 12 priority to people in their fifth year of studies? 13 13 A. Uh-huh. questions. 14 14 REDIRECT EXAMINATION Q. Why is that so? Why is that the case, 15 15 BY MS. AUERBACH: sir? 16 Q. With respect to being an instructor, you 16 A. Because it is part of the graduate 17 17 mentioned how many -- you were asked how many education that they do this. So we want -- so it instructors this quarter. Is -- does it happen 18 18 is -- it is important that they do this before 19 that a graduate student may serve as an instructor 19 finishing their requirements, that they have a turn 20 20 one quarter but then not serve as an instructor the to do this if possible. So people in their sixth 21 21 next quarter? year have already had their chance and . . . 22 22 Q. Okay. And how about third and fourth A. Yes. 23 Q. And then again serve as an instructor 23 vear? 24 24 another quarter after that? A. They are -- they don't -- sorry. What is 25 the question? Why don't they --25 A. Yes. They're typically not twice in a

13 (Pages 1453 to 1456)

1 they should have the opportunity to do that before 2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 1 you. 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you		Page 1457		Page 1459
2 A. Oh. 3 Q. I mean 4 A. I see. 5 Q I come up with the greatest course in 6 the history of 7 A. I see. I see. 8 Q the philosophy department. 9 A. I see. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: 13 C. So two and two or something? 14 A. I see. 15 Q. So two and two or something? 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 17 MR. FASMAN: 18 C. So two and two or something? 19 A. I see. 19 A. I see. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: 13 C. Six? A. And they will be distributed over three terms. Q. So two and two or something? A. It could, I mean, necessarily turn out that way, but on average it will be two. Q. Were all of these students in the fifth year? A. No. Q. Was there someone older or younger? A. Older. Q. Older? A. How many years up? A. How many years Q. How many. A. How many years Q. How many. A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a officerent sort of Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year. 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can	1	O. I mean, why not	1	meeting to select, but have not announced, six.
3 Q. Six?	2		I .	
4 Â. And they will be distributed over three terms. 5 Q1 come up with the greatest course in 6 the history of 7 A. I see. I see. So you seem to the fifth year. 8 Q the philosophy department. 9 A. I see. I see. I see. So you gust are talking over each other. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 11 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 12 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years and fourth years also don't have teaching experience until the fifth year. 14 Q. Older? 15 A. Yes. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 16 Q. How many years up? 17 A. How many years 18 Q. How many years 18 Q. How many years 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 21 A. Yes. 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 22 will be in a better position to teach and because 12 the most. We had a very small fifth year? 4 A. Sooth because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because 12 they should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. 2 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 3 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a that's a different sort of 4 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? 4 A. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 11 HeARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 21 have no fu	3	O. I mean		
5 Q. — I come up with the greatest course in 6 the history of — 7 A. I see. I see. 8 Q. — the philosophy department. 9 A. I see. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't — third years and fourth years also don't have teaching 14 and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 experience until the fifth year. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 17 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have — 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 And that's because that will instruct them 21 A. Both because it will — well, because they 22 will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 1 they should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 4 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 5 a. — that's a different sort of	4			-
6 the history of 7 A. I see. I see. 8 Q the philosophy department. 9 A. I see. I see. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are 11 talking over each other. 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years 12 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 14 and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 A. Yes. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 17 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 21 A. So the because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because 25 MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further; 19 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a different sort of 19 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 20 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 6 fifth year - 21 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a 22 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? 23 L. Uh-huh. 9 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 24 A. How many years up? 25 A. Older. 26 Q. How many years up? 27 A. How many years up? 28 A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year? 26 Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? 27 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. 28 MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl Page 1458 29 Page 1458 20 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 6 fifth year - 29 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 6 fifth year - 20 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 6 fifth year - 21 A. Hara's a different sort of 22 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 23 A. Older. 24 A. Yes. 25 Q. How many years up? 25 A. Yes. 26 Q. How many years up? 26 A. Wow would. Yes. 27 Q. I see. But normal	5			•
7 A. I see. I see. 8 Q the philosophy department. 9 A. I see. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years 14 and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 experience until the fifth year. 16 BY MR. FASMANS 17 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 21 A. Both because it will well, because they 22 will be in a better position to teach and because 23 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 24 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 25 a that's a different sort of 26 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 27 Mr. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 28 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? 29 A. Uh-huh. 20 Q. What's the time to Problem is it varies. 20 Q. What's the time to Problem is it varies. 21 A. It could, I mean, necessarily turn out that way, but on average it will be two. Q. Were all of these students in the fifth year? A. No. Were all of these students in the fifth year? A. No. Q. Was there someone older or younger? A. No. Pach A. No. Pach How many years Q. How many years Q. How many A. How many years Q. I was there someone older or younger? A. Yes. 20 L How many A. How many years Q. How many A. A woo, pach a their fifth year of studies A. You woul				
8 that way, but on average it will be two. 9 A. I see. 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years 14 and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 experience until the fifth year. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 17 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 20 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 23 better how to teach? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because 25 will be in a better position to teach and because 26 poptrunity to preceptors or is that different? 27 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 28 a that's a different sort of 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 4 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? 11 A. No. 12 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 13 A. Older. 14 A. No. 15 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 16 A. No. 18 A. Older. 19 A. Uh-hub. 9 Q. How many years up? 10 A. How many years up? 11 A. How many years up? 12 A. How many years up? 13 A. How many years up? 14 A. How many years up? 15 A. Yes. 20 Q. How many up and the fifth year, I don't really ken way. 21 A. How many years up? 22 A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really ken way. 22 Q. How many 23 A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really ken way. 24 A. Pou would, yes. Yeah, you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year. 25 Page 1458 26 Page 1458 27 Page 1468 28 Page 1468 29 Page 1468 20 Page 1468 21 Page 1468		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
9 Q. Were all of these students in the fifth year? 10 year? 11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 12 Q. Was there someone older or younger? 13 A. No. Q. Was there someone older or younger? 14 A. No. Q. Was there someone older or younger? 15 A. Yes. 16 Q. How many years up? 17 A. How many years up? 18 Q. How many years up? 18 Q. How many years up? 19 A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year or have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. 20 A. Yes. 21 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, than! 23 better how to teach? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because 24 A. No. Preceptors or is that different? 25 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a a that's a different sort of Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 10 department? A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 12 Haven of further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 12 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 15 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 15 A. No. Preceptors are different. 15 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 16 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 16 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 16 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 16 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you 16 have no further questions. 16 have no further questions. 17 have no further questions. 18 have no fur	8			
HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. You guys are talking over each other. MR. FASMAN: Sorry. THE WITNIESS: Well, they don't third years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth years also don't have teaching tand fourth years and fourth	9			
11 talking over each other. 12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years 14 and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 experience until the fifth year. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 17 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 23 better how to teach? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they 25 will be in a better position to teach and because 26 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 27 doportunity to preceptors or is that different? 28 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 29 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 30 a that's a different sort of 40 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 41 fifth year 42 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 42 department? 43 A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 44 It varies in the policies about how long you can 45 A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 46 A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 47 A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 48 A. No. 49 A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 49 A. Idon't know and the problem is it varies. 40 Dider? 40 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 40 A. How many 41 Q. How many 41 A. How many years up? 42 A. How many years up? 44 A. How many years up? 45 A. How many years up? 46 Q. How many 48 A. How many years up? 49 A. How many years up? 40 A. How many years up? 40 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 40 A. How many years up? 41 A. How many years up? 42 A. How many 4 A. How many 4 A. How many years up? 4 A. How many 4 A. How many 4 A. How many 4	10			•
12 MR. FASMAN: Sorry. 13 THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years and fourth years also don't have teaching 14 and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 experience until the fifth year. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 16 Q. How many years up? 17 A. How many years up? 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 And that's because that will instruct them 21 department of the year of studies 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 22 department of the year of studies 24 department of the year of studies 25 will be in a better position to teach and because 25 department of the year of your would expect all they should have the opportunity to do that before 2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 4 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 5 a that's a different sort of				•
THE WITNESS: Well, they don't third years and fourth years also don't have teaching and fourth years also don't have teaching 15 experience until the fifth year. 15 A. Yes. 16 BY MR. FASMAN: 16 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have 17 your preference, the department's preference is to 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 19 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 20 know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three 21 A. Yes. 21 at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 22 deter how to teach? 23 the instructors to be in their fifth year? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they 24 will be in a better position to teach and because 25 will be in a better position to teach and because 26 determined by the proper should have the opportunity to do that before 27 leaving, both of those. 29 determined by the proper should have the opportunity to do that before 29 leaving, both of those. 30 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 30 a that's a different sort of		<u> </u>	I .	
and fourth years also don't have teaching experience until the fifth year. BY MR. FASMAN: Q. I see. I see. So you want to have lay your preference, the department's preference is to have individuals in their fifth year of studies have the opportunity to teach their own class? Q. And that's because that will instruct them letter how to teach? A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because they should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a that's a different sort of Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year A. Uh-huh. Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. It varies in the policies about how long you can 14 Q. Older? A. Yes. Q. How many years up? A. How many years up? A. How many years Q. How many A. How many years Q. How many A. How many years up? A. How many years up? A. How many years up? A. How many years Q. How many A. How many years Q. How many A. How many years Q. How many A. How many years up? A. How many years up? A. How many years up? A. How many years Q. How many A. How many years A. How many years A. How many years A. How many years	13	•		
15	14			
16 BY MR. FASMAN: 16 Q. How many years up? 17 A. How many years up? 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 18 your preference, the department's preference is to 18 Q. How many years Q. How many years up? A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? 24 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. 25 MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, than! Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1466 Page 1458				
17 Q. I see. I see. So you want to have		÷		
18 your preference, the department's preference is to 19 have individuals in their fifth year of studies 20 have the opportunity to teach their own class? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 23 better how to teach? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they 25 will be in a better position to teach and because 26 leaving, both of those. 27 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 28 doportunity to preceptors or is that different? 29 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 20 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 21 a fifth year, I don't really 22 know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. 23 Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? 24 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. 25 MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl 26 Page 1458 27 Page 1458 28 Page 1458 29 Page 1458 20 L see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? 29 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. 20 MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl 21 you. 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 23 anything further? 24 A. No. 25 Will be in a better position to teach and because 26 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 27 A. No. 28 Go if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 29 A. Uh-huh. 30 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 30 department? 31 A. No. 32 Drata's not something that you set? 33 A. No. 34 A. No. 35 Page 1468 36 A. No. 36 A. No. 37 A. No. 38 A. No. 39 A. Uh-huh. 40 A. No. 41 department? 41 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 42 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would anything further? 43 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would anything further? 44 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would anything further? 45 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would anything further? 46 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would anything further? 48 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would anything further? 49 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would expect all the instructors to be in th	17			
have individuals in their fifth year of studies have the opportunity to teach their own class? A. Yes. Q. And that's because that will instruct them better how to teach? A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because They should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a a that's a different sort of Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year A. Uh-huh. Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. It varies in the policies about how long you can A. Yes. 20 A. Oh, past the fifth year, I don't really know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 146 you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. AUERBACH: Q. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? A. No. Q. That's not something that you set? A. No. MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
have the opportunity to teach their own class? A. Yes. Q. And that's because that will instruct them better how to teach? A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 they should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a that's a different sort of Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year A. Uh-huh. Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. It varies in the policies about how long you can know. A couple, not more than two or maybe three at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl page 1458 Page 146 you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. AUERBACH: Q. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? A. No. Q. That's not something that you set? A. No. MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
21 A. Yes. 22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 23 better how to teach? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they 25 will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 1 they should have the opportunity to do that before 2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 21 at the most. We had a very small fifth year class. Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl 23 the instructors to be in their fifth year? A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl 24 you. 25 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you			I .	*
22 Q. And that's because that will instruct them 23 better how to teach? 24 A. Both because it will well, because they 25 will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 1 they should have the opportunity to do that before 2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 2 Q. I see. But normally you would expect all the instructors to be in their fifth year? A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 146 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl Page 146 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl Page 146 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanl Page 146 Page 146 Page 146 O. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? A. No. MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you		**		*
better how to teach? A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 they should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? A. No. Preceptors are different. That's a a that's a different sort of Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my fifth year robeyond? fifth year A. Uh-huh. Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. It varies in the policies about how long you can the instructors to be in their fifth year? A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1460 Q. Do. G. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? A. No. Q. That's not something that you set? A. No. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you	22		I .	•
A. Both because it will well, because they will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 I they should have the opportunity to do that before leaving, both of those. Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same opportunity to preceptors or is that different? A. No. Preceptors are different. That's A. No. Preceptors are different. That's A. No. Preceptors as an instructor in my fifth year A. Uh-huh. Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your department? A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. I t varies in the policies about how long you can A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. Page 1458 Page 1458 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. Page 1458 A. You would, yes. Yeah, you would. MR. FASMAN: All right. Nothing further, thanly will right. Page 1458 A. You would, MR. FASMAN: All right. I have. A. No. Preceptors are different same anything further? A. No. Preceptors are different? A. No. Q. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? A. No. A. No. MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you	23			-
25 will be in a better position to teach and because Page 1458 1 they should have the opportunity to do that before 2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can Page 1458 Page 146 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 146 Page 1458 Page 146 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 146 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 1458 Page 146 Page 1458 Page 146 Page 146 Page 1458 Page 146				
Page 1458 1 they should have the opportunity to do that before 2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can Page 1458 Page 146 1 you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you	25	•		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that 7 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you		<u>.</u>		Page 1460
2 leaving, both of those. 3 Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 2 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, do you have anything further? 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that 7 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you	1	they should have the opportunity to do that before	1	VOII
Q. I see. I see. And do you give the same 4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 10 11 department? 12 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 11 It varies in the policies about how long you can 3 anything further? 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that 7 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				•
4 opportunity to preceptors or is that different? 5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 15 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that 7 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
5 A. No. Preceptors are different. That's 6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 5 BY MS. AUERBACH: 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that 7 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
6 a that's a different sort of 7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 6 Q. Do you know who set the policy that 7 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
7 Q. So if I'm chosen as an instructor in my 8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 17 instructors should be either fifth year or beyond? 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
8 fifth year 9 A. Uh-huh. 9 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 8 A. No. 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
9 A. Uh-huh. 10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 9 Q. That's not something that you set? 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you	8	= · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
10 Q. What's the time to Ph.D. in your 11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 10 A. No. 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
11 department? 12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 11 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
12 A. I don't know and the problem is it varies. 13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. All right. I 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you				
13 It varies in the policies about how long you can 13 have no further questions. So, Professor Ford, you		•		
		stay in graduate school. It varies. So averages		÷
15 aren't very interesting. I think these days it's 15 (Witness excused.)			15	
around eight, but this is not based on any me 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can we go off the				
17 looking into it. That's my sense. 17 record?			17	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
18 Q. And how many instructors of record are 18 (WHEREUPON, a short recess was			18	(WHEREUPON, a short recess was
19 chosen per quarter? Did you answer that? Two this 19 taken.)		- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	19	
20 quarter? 20 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: The Petitioner can	20		20	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: The Petitioner can
21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: He said there were 21 proceed with its next witness.		•		
22 two 22 MS. AUERBACH: Petitioner calls Matthew	22		22	<u> </u>
THE WITNESS: I said two. So, for example, I 23 Vanderpoel.	23	THE WITNESS: I said two. So, for example, I	23	Vanderpoel.
24 can be more confident about next year because I 24 (WHEREUPON, the witness was	24		24	(WHEREUPON, the witness was
25 just selected. We just selected we had the 25 duly sworn.)	25	just selected. We just selected we had the	25	duly sworn.)

14 (Pages 1457 to 1460)

Page 1461 Page 1463 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: He's already answered, 1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Please state and spell 1 2 2 your name for the record. so let's move on. 3 THE WITNESS: Matthew Vanderpoel, 3 BY MS. AUERBACH: 4 M-a-t-t-h-e-w, and my surname, V-a-n-d-e-r-p-o-e-l. 4 Q. And then the amount you receive separately 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. 5 for the TAship before taxes are withheld, is that 6 6 MATTHEW VANDERPOEL, the same amount as the amount that's deducted from 7 7 the stipend? called as a witness herein, having been first duly 8 8 sworn, was examined and testified as follows: A. That is correct. 9 DIRECT EXAMINATION 9 Q. And the taxes are withheld from just the 10 BY MS. AUERBACH: 10 part for the TAship? 11 Q. Are you currently a Ph.D. graduate student 11 A. Yes. 12 at the University of Chicago? 12 MR. PEARLMAN: Objection, leading. 13 A. Yes, I am. 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I mean, it's already 14 Q. And in what school or division? 14 been answered, so I'll permit it so we can move on to the next question. 15 A. I'm Ph.D. candidate in the Divinity 15 16 16 BY MS. AUERBACH: 17 Q. And when did you start the Ph.D. program 17 Q. And how do you go about applying -- when 18 at the Divinity School? 18 you applied for your TAships, how did you go about 19 A. I entered the Ph.D. program in the fall of 19 applying for them? 20 20 A. So the case for all three of those TAships 2012. 21 Q. And were you awarded a five-year stipend 21 is to my knowledge standard practice in the as a Ph.D. student? 22 Divinity School, the dean of students circulates 22 23 23 that a professor is looking for one or more TAs for A. Yes. 24 24 a given course. And then we are to submit a cover Q. And have you had occasion to serve as a 25 teaching assistant? 25 letter expressing our qualifications and interest Page 1462 Page 1464 1 A. Yes. I've served as a teaching assistant 1 for the post and a CV to the dean of students who 2 2 on three occasions. passes it along to the professor who are then 3 3 Q. And which quarters of which years have you subsequently notified. 4 4 Q. And what were the courses in which you done that? 5 A. I served as a TA in the fall quarter of 5 served as TA? 6 2014, the spring quarter of 2015, and then again in 6 A. The first one fall of 2014, I was a 7 7 the spring quarter of 2016. teaching assistant for History of Christian 8 8 Q. And on the occasions when you served as a Thought One. In the spring of 2015, I was a 9 9 teaching assistant for History of Christian teaching assistant, did you still receive the same 10 10 stipend or were you paid separately for the Thought Three. And then in the spring of 2016, I 11 teaching assistant role? 11 was a teaching assistant for a course. So I might 12 A. So the way it works within the Divinity 12 have like the second part of the title slightly off 13 13 School is we are paid quarterly for our stipend, from the exact catalogue wording, but Suffering, 14 14 and then the amount for our TAship is deducted. colon, History of the Interpretation of the Book of 15 15 And then we receive a separate paycheck which Job. 16 already has payroll taxes withheld for our TAship 16 Q. Okay. And going to the first of those 17 17 and the relevant quarter. And that is supposed to courses, what were your responsibilities as a 18 18 arrive that quarter, but sometimes they're late. teaching assistant? 19 Q. When you say the TAship -- the amount from 19 A. For the first of those courses? 20 20 the TAship is deducted, you mean deducted off the Q. Right, so the History of Christian 21 21 amount of the stipend? Thought One? 22 A. Yes. 22 A. So in the History of Christian 23 23 Thought One, I was responsible for attending all of MR. PEARLMAN: Objection, leading. MS. AUERBACH: Well, just trying to clarify 24 24 the lectures. I was responsible for holding a 25 25 what he said. discussion section. I was responsible for holding

Page 1465 Page 1467

2.4

office hours by appointment. And I was responsible for delivering one lecture. I also then -- so the assignment structure for that course is a take-home midterm and a take-home final. So I was serving with another TA, and we were -- we were the primary graders and markers for all the master's students in the course. So for the midterm and the final, my fellow TA and I divided up those grading assignments.

- Q. So were there students in the course a combination of master's students and others?
- A. Yeah, I believe there may -- so this course was about 40 to 50 people or about 50. And there were about 10 Ph.D. students, about 40 master's students, and there probably were one or two college students mixed in.
- Q. So did you do any of the grading for the other Ph.D. students?
- A. No.

- Q. And in that course did the -- what, if any, guidance or instruction did you receive from the faculty member for teaching a course with respect to your discussion sections and grading?
- A. So with respect to the discussion sections, I had a meeting with the professor

outside of class, and the professor felt that deserved some reflection in the grade.

- Q. And about -- do you know about how many hours per week you devoted to being a TA for that course?
- A. It would have been three hours a week for the lectures, one hour a week every week for the discussion section. I probably prepped between readings and then to be ready for discussion section probably two to three hours a week for that. On average probably a half hour of appointments with students. Grading then would have been two rounds of about 15 hours of work. And preparing my lecture was probably 20 hours of prep. I was maybe a little overzealous on that point.
- Q. And then with respect to the second course in which you TA'd History of Christian Thought Two --
- A. Three actually.
- Q. Oh, Three, right. Were there any -- were your responsibilities similar or were they different?
 - A. So in that course the only differences that were notable were there were times where the

Page 1466

Page 1468

wherein I asked what the expectations were. The instructor was rather generous and said, I sort of trust you to do what you want. If you have specific questions as it's going along, feel free to talk to me. I asked if the instructor wanted regular feedback as to how the discussion sections were going or attendance or things like that, and I was told that was not necessary.

As for grading, we were involved in the creation. We being the two TAs. We were involved in the creation of the exams. So we would meet prior. And so there usually ended up being four or five questions on the exams, and each of us TAs wrote one or two for each of those. So we had sort of discussed on that thing which questions would be there. We had a sense of generally what we were looking for.

And then when we provided grading and commenting on all of our papers, they were submitted then to the instructor who looked them over before submitting them as the grades of record. So I know, for instance, the only feedback I got on one was I was told that the instructor was going to raise one grade I had given because the student had met with the professor extensively

instructor was -- I do not recall if it was illness or the instructor being out of town, but I was asked to sort of provide the main teaching instruction without a professor present for a course or for like one day of that class. So that was unique.

It was also a much smaller class. Enrollment was unusually low. I believe there were eight students. So the professor opted to do the grading for that course primarily.

- Q. And how about the third one you TA'd, the one about the Book of Job?
- A. That one was similar, and I was involved in grading. I was involved in -- I was also involved somewhat in course planning for that as I have language skills that were helpful for translating and compiling some documents the professor wanted to use. And then I also served as the lecturer in class when the professor was out of town for that course.
- Q. Okay. And did you also hold discussion sections for that course?
- A. I did
- Q. With respect to discussion sections and grading, what, if any, instruction and feedback did

16 (Pages 1465 to 1468)

	Page 1469		Page 1471
1	you receive from the faculty member?	1	A. I get biweekly paychecks for that.
2	A. I received no instruction beyond, you know	2	Q. And are there tax withholdings from those?
3	what to do, you've done courses with me, I trust	3	A. Yes.
4	you.	4	Q. What are your responsibilities as a
5	Q. So is this the same faculty member who	5	research assistant?
6	taught one of the prior courses you TA'd?	6	A. So they're fairly varied. Some of it is
7	A. The same instructor of it was the same	7	administrative tasks. A good bit of it is sort of
8	professor for both History of Christian	8	class prep for this professor, so I will help
9	Thought Three and Suffering.	9	compile book lists, put things on reserve at the
10	Q. And do you know whether any graduate	10	library, correspond with the book shops to order
11	students outside the Divinity School have TA'd any	11	them.
12	classes in the Divinity School?	12	I do some language work for languages she
13	A. Yes.	13	doesn't enjoy working in. Sort of if she's like
14	MR. PEARLMAN: Foundation.	14	find this, I search through sources and compile
15	THE WITNESS: The first course that I	15	that set those sets of information for her. I
16	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Hold on one second. So	16	gather articles and books for her. It's pretty
17	she asked him if he knew, so you do have you	17	varied, but I feel like research assisting is a
18	heard of such things occurring?	18	good summary of what I do.
19	THE WITNESS: Yes, in the courses I served as a	19	Q. And when you refer to languages she
20	TA.	20	doesn't like to work with, what languages are
21	BY MS. AUERBACH:	21	those?
22	Q. Okay. What experience did you have in	22	A. Specifically in this case with this
23	serving as a TA?	23	professor, it's Latin and Middle French.
24	A. So the first course I mentioned, History	24	Q. And what do you do with respect to those
25	of Christian Thought One in which I served as a TA,	25	languages?
		l .	
	Page 1470		Page 1472
1	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and	1	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often
2	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences.	2	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while,
2	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant?	2 3	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete
2 3 4	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes.	2 3 4	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this
2 3 4 5	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that?	2 3 4 5	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like
2 3 4 5 6	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of	2 3 4 5 6	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here.
2 3 4 5 6 7	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll	2 3 4 5 6 7	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis? A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay. Have you also worked as a workshop
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis? A. Yes. Q. And how much are you paid for that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay. Have you also worked as a workshop coordinator?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis? A. Yes. Q. And how much are you paid for that? A. I believe it's \$10 or \$11. There was a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay. Have you also worked as a workshop coordinator? A. I have.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis? A. Yes. Q. And how much are you paid for that? A. I believe it's \$10 or \$11. There was a raise that kicked in recently. I'm not sure if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay. Have you also worked as a workshop coordinator? A. I have. Q. And when have you done that?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis? A. Yes. Q. And how much are you paid for that? A. I believe it's \$10 or \$11. There was a raise that kicked in recently. I'm not sure if testify affected me.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay. Have you also worked as a workshop coordinator? A. I have. Q. And when have you done that? A. In the 2014 to 2015 academic year, I was a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	my fellow TA was a Ph.D. candidate in history and social sciences. Q. Have you served as a research assistant? A. Yes. Q. And when have you done that? A. So I was appointed as one in January of 2016. I don't believe I was entered into payroll for a couple months, and I'm still continuing in that role. Q. And to who with whom are you working as research assistant? A. I work as a research assistant with one of my advisors, Professor Susan Schreiner, in the Divinity School. Q. And approximately how many hours a week do you do that? A. Ten. Q. And are you paid on an hourly basis? A. Yes. Q. And how much are you paid for that? A. I believe it's \$10 or \$11. There was a raise that kicked in recently. I'm not sure if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. She'll say, for instance, so it'll often be a source that she hasn't worked with in a while, and I will remember so to give a concrete example, oh, here are John Calvin's sermons on this topic. I remember there's something about like Aristotelian determinations of providence in here. Can you spend some time running through it and see what's there. I'll run through those texts because we don't all have reliable English editions of these, unfortunately. You should all get involved as early modernists and correct those. And, yeah, but I'll go through, find those instances, and give her like citation information so she can follow up with them as she sees appropriate. Q. And so you're reviewing the texts in the A. Middle French. Q languages okay. Have you also worked as a workshop coordinator? A. I have. Q. And when have you done that?

17 (Pages 1469 to 1472)

Page 1473 a large sis one of large 1473 a large sis one of large sis of large sis one of la

Page 1473 Page 1475

A. So the Medieval studies workshop is one of the workshops through the council on advance studies. And it's a very interdisciplinary workshop, so it has regular attendance from students in divinity, humanities and social sciences. Both faculty and graduate students and basically we meet regularly to discuss papers.

- Q. And what have been or what were your responsibilities as a workshop coordinator?
- A. So I'd say there were kind of three main areas. The first and most basic was just making sure there was a room to meet in, scheduling, announcing it, making sure there was coffee.

 Second then we would coordinate visiting scholars to come. So the year I did it we had a total of four visiting scholars come to our workshop, two of them were international.

So we would work with the council of advance studies office to coordinate airfare, lodging. We would speak with these professors before they came to talk about the expectations, sort of the intellectual culture of the workshop, what sort of angles we were hoping to get out of their works, what we thought they contributed. And that was probably like the largest bit of time.

- A. Yes. One of us would do so invariably every session, and sometimes both of us would need to.
- Q. And how many times during the year did the workshop meet?
- A. So for regular sessions we would have five meetings a quarter. I would also say we'd average one or two special sections a quarter on top of that that be cosponsored with another workshop. And then another element of the workshop is we coordinate a panel at our professional society, so then there would have been like an event at the international congress for Medieval studies in May of 2015 that we also coordinated.
- Q. And were you compensated for being a workshop coordinator?
 - A. Yes.

two of us.

- O. And how much?
- A. So this was before -- I believe this is no longer the current pay structure in practice, but there was \$500 stipend given to me and my co-coordinator for entire year, I believe.
- HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Was that each or to be split between the two of you?
 - THE WITNESS: It was to be split between the

Page 1474

Page 1476

And then sort of the final element was my fellow coordinator and I were sort of in charge of crafting a set of intellectual themes that tied together our investigations of discussions over the course of the year. So we had a voice along with the faculty advisors in selecting those visiting scholars, but then we would sort of determine, you know, laterally which student papers we would read, who would serve as respondents to sort of set these tones of conversation. And as part of that we were responsible for reading and reviewing all these papers and documentation and being ready to guide discussion.

- Q. And what did being ready to guide discussion involve?
- A. Simply to have read the paper, have a few questions ready, to have made sure that a respondent had been selected and knew that they were sort of on call for the first couple of questions. And if there were any lulls, my co-coordinator and I would make contact and basically try to gauge which one of us wanted to ask a question.
- Q. And then did you and your co-coordinator ask questions?

MS. AUERBACH: Those are all the questions I have.

MR. PEARLMAN: May we go off the record?

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Sure. Off the record.

(WHEREUPON, a short recess was taken.)

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. Employer can proceed with his questions for the witness.

MR. PEARLMAN: Thank you, Madame Hearing Officer.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. PEARLMAN:

- Q. Mr. Vanderpoel, am I pronouncing that correctly?
 - A. Vanderpoel.
- 18 Q. Okay. Thanks.

What's your career goal?

- A. I would like to be a professor.
 - Q. Do you know where you want to be a professor?
 - A. I think I would prefer to be a professor at a R1k research institution, but with the job market as it is that may not be in the cards for

18 (Pages 1473 to 1476)

Page 1477 Page 1479 1 1 be interested in applying for that position. I me. 2 2 Q. What would you like to be a professor of? said I would be. And then she had me submit, I 3 A. As somebody who works -- probably a 3 believe, it was a CV soliciting my desire to be a 4 research assistant for Professor Schreiner. 4 professor of religious studies. 5 Q. I apologize. Did you say religious 5 Q. Do you know why she asked you in 6 6 studies? particular? 7 A. Yes. 7 A. She and I -- she's one of my advisors, so 8 8 we have a degree of rapport. She feels comfortable O. Let's start with a document that's in the 9 record. It's identified as Employer Exhibit 45? 9 with me I would gather. I also know that I have 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Which one is that? 10 sort of -- as I indicated earlier, she asked in 11 MR. PEARLMAN: That's a research letter dated 11 that conversation to confirm that I have all the 12 12 August 2016. Middle French skills and Latin skills which she has 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: This one? 13 as well but she prefers working with Spanish and 14 14 MR. PEARLMAN: Yes, ma'am. German given the option. 15 15 Q. So what are the languages with which you (WHEREUPON, previously marked 16 Employer Exhibit No. 45 was 16 are proficient? 17 introduced for the record.) 17 A. So proficiency is somewhat of a sliding 18 18 BY MR. PEARLMAN: scale, and I would want like a little more clarity. 19 19 Q. Mr. Vanderpoel, if you could take a moment I would say I've been determined by faculties at 20 to read that document, please? 20 the University of Chicago to be expert in Latin and 21 A. Of course. 21 Old and Middle French. That's not my 22 22 Q. Okay. Have you had an opportunity to the determination. 23 23 read that document? Then I also claim functional research 2.4 A. I have. 24 knowledge, though I am not active in these, in 25 Q. Did you read this upon receipt from Teresa 25 Ancient Greek. And I have sort of reading Page 1478 Page 1480 1 Owens? 1 qualifications from the University of Chicago in 2 2 A. I don't believe that I was somebody who French -- Modern French and German. 3 3 Q. Based on your testimony I'll ask you what actually received this at this time. I believe it 4 probably was more limited circulation, probably 4 are the languages that you handle that 5 5 incoming students last fall, and I had been here a Professor Schreiner doesn't like? 6 6 A. To clarify, doesn't like is -- she finds bit, but I received information at my orientation 7 7 fall 2012. it an inefficient use of her time to spend to work 8 8 Q. And you just read it here today? with them, like I am not inclining she's not expert 9 9 in them as well, but Middle French and Latin 10 10 Q. Do you believe everything stated in here particularly. Q. And what did you do with respect to using 11 is true and correct? 11 12 A. To my knowledge. 12 those language skills vis-a-vis your work with 13 13 Q. Okay. I want to first start focusing on Susan Schreiner? 14 14 the non-lab RA position that you held, okay? A. So as I indicated before, she would give 15 15 A. Yes. me a set of texts and does so with some regularity. 16 Q. Okay. You assisted Professor Schreiner? 16 Be on the lookout for this topic, this theme, if 17 A. Schreiner. 17 this gets mentioned. I'll run through the 18 18 O. S-c-h-e-i-n-e-r? documents quickly and then let her know this sermon 19 A. Yes. 19 or this page number depending on how that given 20 20 Q. How did you come to work for text is divided up. It seems to be references to 21 21 **Professor Schreiner?** what you're interested in here or there. 22 22 A. She told me in January of 2016 that she Most of these documents are not digitized. 23 23 They're difficult to search with. And in a lot of was considering starting a new project and was 24 24 approved to have funding to hire a research ways the scholars in other time periods are not 25 25 assistant if she so desired and asked me if I would used to just the process of searching through them

19 (Pages 1477 to 1480)

Page 1483 Page 1481 other periods where I work. 1 to see what the content is. 1 2 2 Q. How does that relate to your course of Q. What's your dissertation topic? 3 A. How much detail do you want? 3 study? 4 4 A. Her research expertise or my -- sorry, I O. Just a sentence or two. 5 5 don't understand the antecedent. A. My dissertation focuses on debates of the 6 role of language in the -- of Paris and 14th and 6 Q. Well, her new courses --7 7 15th centuries. A. Uh-huh, oh, to my course of study? 8 8 Q. Did those texts that you looked through in O. Yes. 9 connection with this non-lab RA position with Susan 9 A. So in the Divinity School we have to -- in 10 Schreiner relate in any way to that? 10 the area of study in which I am, History of 11 11 A. The only overlap would be use of similar Christian Thought Three, we have to be -- we have 12 languages, but they are centuries apart, different 12 to pass exams in three separate like time periods. 13 figures. They're not related other than the sheer 13 And so even though all my research thus far has 14 14 fact of I use French and Latin in my dissertation. fallen within the Medieval time period as divided 15 15 Q. These are texts you hadn't previously within my subfield, I've also prepared for exams 16 16 and passed my exams in ancient and early Modern 17 17 Christianity. So I have -- so there's overlap A. Texts that Professor Schreiner's looked 18 18 at? between Professor Schreiner's research interests 19 Q. Yes, sir. 19 and my like training as an early modernist as like 20 A. In at least one instance it was a text I 20 a side field. 21 had previously read for coursework, but typically, 21 Q. I appreciate the clarification. 22 22 A. You're welcome. 23 23 Q. You also worked on class preparation. Q. Have you taken any courses by -- is it 24 What did that involve? 24 Dr. Schreiner? 25 A. So in those instances, it would be I want 25 A. Yes. Page 1482 Page 1484 1 to have a selection from this -- so this is 1 Q. Okay. Thank you. 2 2 something that was from that course, Suffering. I Have you taken any courses from 3 3 want to have a selection from equinus on the Dr. Schreiner before? 4 syllabus. These are sort of the themes I'm 4 A. Yes. 5 interested in. Where do you think that would be? 5 Q. What courses are those? 6 Good. And so I've found a couple relevant 6 A. Many, it could take me a little bit to 7 7 sections, suggested them to her, and then they sort of walk through them and list them, especially 8 appear in the syllabus. 8 if you're asking me to say when. But would you 9 Q. You created book lists as well. What did 9 like me to try to --10 10 that involve? Q. Let's hold off on the question. I want to 11 A. So the book lists would be like that was a 11 make it a little easier for you. If you could just 12 little more lower level administrative stuff where 12 tell the courses? 13 13 she said these are the texts I want to teach for A. To my knowledge, I might forget the odd 14 14 the course, can you find out what the current one, Calvin's Institutes, Early Modern Catholicism, 15 15 decisions are. And then I would get them the History of Christian Thought Three which I took 16 numbers to approve and submit that to the seminary 16 prior to TA'ing it, Renaissance and Reformation, 17 co-op to order textbooks and also to the library to 17 Readings in Luther, a seminar on idolatry. And I 18 18 put on reserve for students. believe those are the only courses I have taken 19 Q. What is Susan Schreiner's new topic? 19 with her. There might be . . . 20 20 A. She's actually between a couple new topics Q. Okay. And taking a step back and getting 21 21 right now, and I don't know to what extent this is back into the language related focus that you 22 22 public knowledge. I don't want to reveal trade mentioned before that there's certain areas that 23 23 secrets on behalf of her, but I can say that it is you're more facile, shall we say --24 24 at least the century, if not, later than the time A. Okay. 25

20 (Pages 1481 to 1484)

Q. In that it is self colloquial. She didn't

25

period I work in, on principally geographically and

Page 1485 Page 1487 1 writing a course paper involves some form of focus on it as much. You're not denigrating? 2 literature review, unless you mean it more 2 A. Yeah. 3 Q. I get that. That helped hone in your --3 particular. 4 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Where did you complete polish your language skills, didn't it? 5 A. Insofar as using languages in any capacity 5 your undergraduate degree? 6 6 THE WITNESS: I received my bachelor of arts in does, it -- yeah, that seems the case. 7 7 art history and history out in Wheaton College out Q. So the work that you did for 8 8 in the burbs. Professor Schreiner gave you more insight into the 9 subject that you and Professor Schreiner were 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thanks. 10 10 BY MR. PEARLMAN: focusing on, correct? 11 11 A. Insight into the area she works on, yes. Q. In working in this non-lab RA position, 12 12 this was not an academic requirement. This wasn't Q. And it assisted you with respect to your 13 course of study? 13 part of your academic requirement, right? 14 14 A. No. Yes. That is correct. A. So I only began being her research 15 15 O. Let's talk about the various occasions you assistant after I completed my examinations, so it 16 16 does not seem to be the case to me that it assisted had to be a teaching assistant. You indicated that 17 me with my course of study, unless I'm 17 you had to apply to be a teaching assistant, 18 18 misunderstanding your use of the term course of correct? 19 19 A. Correct. 20 20 Q. Okay. And you indicated that you needed Q. Did the research you did with 21 Professor Schreiner overlap with any areas that you 21 to submit a cover letter and a CV, and that was 22 passed on to a professor. That helps you prepare 22 yourself were studying? Schreiner (pronunciation), 23 23 I apologize. for the same responsibilities that you'd need when 24 24 A. No, because at that point I entered into you ultimately get a job or seek a job in academia, 25 25 candidacy and have been in my own research in my correct? Page 1486 Page 1488 1 own topic, so there hasn't been overlap in my 1 A. Presumably to some extent, though, I 2 2 research assisting work with her and dissertation imagine the genre of cover letter is different and 3 3 research. I maintain an updated CV independently, but I can 4 4 see how. Q. You said that you were asked to take on 5 5 this non-lab RA position, correct? Q. You said that there are three courses that A. She asked if I was interested in it, yes. 6 6 you TA'd? 7 7 Q. Okay. She didn't tell you that you had to A. Correct. 8 8 take on this position, correct? Q. History of Christian Thought One, 9 A. She did not. 9 Thought Three and then Suffering, Book of Job, do I 10 10 Q. No one told you you had to. You did it have those --11 voluntarily, correct? 11 A. Yep. 12 A. Yeah. I wanted the money. 12 Q. Were there any others? 13 13 Q. Had you ever done a literature review in A. Those are the only course I've TA'd at the 14 14 the past? University of Chicago. 15 15 A. A literature review in the past, yes. Q. So what year of graduate student life were 16 you in when you TA'd? I'll break it down --That's been a regular part of my academic training. 16 17 17 Q. How many times have you done literature A. Yeah. 18 18 Q. -- just to keep it easy, but for history reviews like you were doing with this professor? 19 A. So I worked as a research assistant to a 19 of Christian Thought One --20 20 professor in undergraduate where I prepared a A. So far that was the -- doing the math, 21 21 number of research like literature reviews on that was the end of my third year of world study. 22 specific topics. I -- I had already completed like 22 I should clarify, though, to explain that within 23 a preliminary research review for my dissertation. 23 the different -- no one's previously testified. We 24 24 My dissertation topic changed, so I previously are required to hold an MA prior to entering it. 25 prepared one of my previous ideas, and many ways to 25 So I had two years of master's coursework at the

Page 1489 Page 1491 1 1 University of Chicago Divinity, so my third/fifth A. That is correct. 2 2 Q. And you said on direct examination that 3 Q. Okay. Same question with respect to 3 your professor told you that she trusts you, and 4 History of Christian Thought Two? 4 she was the same professor that you had in the 5 A. Three. 5 past? 6 6 Q. I apologize. Right, you said Three. A. Uh-huh. 7 7 A. I'm sorry. I'm just a little sore of that Q. So is it fair to say that you had built up 8 because Two is my main area of study, and I haven't 8 her confidence in you after History of Christian 9 gotten to teach it yet. That would have been my --9 Thought Three after you served as the TA in that 10 10 fall of my -- or spring of my fourth year. course? 11 Actually, no. I got confused on my dates here. I 11 A. So I had to my knowledge -- I'm trying to 12 apologize for the mistake. 12 remember the order of testimony. I think the way I 13 Q. That's okay. 13 described the preparation for the Suffering class 14 A. Fall of 2014, spring of 2015 when I did 14 would also be accurate as she sort of indicated the 15 HC1, and HC3 would have been my fourth/fifth year 15 similar degree of trust which I understood to be 16 16 of graduate study. based on the fact that I've taken coursework with 17 Q. How about Suffering? 17 her as I previously outlined with you, and she's 18 A. The subsequent year then would have 18 seen my work and interacted with her and, I 19 been -- math is really -- no, I'm really bad at 19 imagine, also saw my CV and my teaching history on 20 math which is the reason I'm in humanities. 20 it. 21 Q. Take your time. I see you trying. 21 So I -- I don't -- I truly do not feel 22 22 A. The -- okay. So this is my fifth year. there was -- I was not treated differently as a TA 23 Let's work back. So last spring that would have 23 between History of Christian Thought Three and 24 24 been my end of fourth year for Job, and the others Suffering, Book of Job, course. Q. Do you believe that you had built up a 25 would have been in my third year. 25 Page 1490 Page 1492 1 Q. Okay. Now, you were given more latitude 1 strong relationship with Professor Schreiner? 2 2 from your faculty professor as you went through A. I believe I had had a really strong 3 3 these courses as a TA, correct? relationship with Professor Schreiner, yeah, for 4 A. The first course I did was with a separate 4 sometime now. 5 professor. The two other ones had a high degree of 5 Q. Do you believe Professor Schreiner is 6 latitude, and I understood those to be based on the 6 familiar with your skill set as a TA? 7 7 different sort of temperaments of the professors A. Insofar as she's observed it, yes. 8 8 and how they interacted with students. So the two Q. Did she observe it when you were teaching 9 I had was with the same professor, HC3, Christian 9 History of Christian Thought Three? 10 10 Thought Three. And Suffering, I did not notice a A. She was not present for discussion 11 real difference in the expectations or the 11 sections. She was not present for office hours. 12 communications he received about my TA 12 She was not present at the time I lectured, 13 13 responsibilities there. so . . . 14 14 Q. Who was your professor for History of Q. Did she observe any of your performance? **Christian Thought One?** 15 15 A. Yeah, I guess not. 16 A. Professor Willemien Hoffman. 16 Q. Did she write a performance evaluation for 17 Q. Professor for History of Christian 17 you? 18 Thought Three? 18 A. If she did, I did not receive it or know 19 A. Professor Susan Schreiner. 19 of its existence. 20 20 Q. Was she also your professor for Suffering, Q. So she may have and you're not aware of 21 Book of Job? 21 it? 22 22 A. That is correct. A. Yeah, I... 23 Q. Okay. You said that was -- that the 23 Q. She is on your dissertation committee, 24 24 progression in which you TA'd these courses, it was correct? Thought One, Thought Three, then Suffering? 25 25 A. Yes. She's one of my two advisors.

22 (Pages 1489 to 1492)

Page 1493 Page 1495 Q. Is Otten on your dissertation committee as 1 1 A. Yes. 2 2 Q. Okay. You did not have the ultimate well? 3 A. Indeed. She is my other co-advisor. 3 authority to issue the grade in that course, 4 4 W-i-l-l-e-m-i-e-n, and then O-t-t-e-n. correct? 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. 5 A. No. So I did not submit grades to the 6 BY MR. PEARLMAN: 6 registrar. What I meant by primary is insofar as I 7 7 Q. Did you take the courses, History of assigned the number grade to the exams I was told 8 8 Christian Thought One and Three and Suffering to grade. I also provided comments. And then the 9 before you TA'd them? 9 way it was set up is that so we comment on Word 10 10 documents, and professor made it exclusive. So A. I had taken History of Christian 11 11 Thought One and Three prior. Suffering was like a we'd be aware in advance, so my name appears on all 12 one-off topic course, so it is -- it had not been 12 the comments the students received. 13 offered before. It's not been offered since. 13 Q. But ultimately you didn't issue the grade, 14 14 O. Schreiner taught it? correct? 15 15 A. Yes. A. No. That is correct. I did not 16 O. Did she teach Three? 16 ultimately input the grade. 17 A. Was she the instructor of record when I 17 Q. So your professor may have agreed with the 18 18 TA'd? comments that you made and grades that you Q. Yes. 19 19 suggested; and they may have ultimately been given, 20 A. Yes. 20 but that doesn't mean that you issued the grade? 21 Q. But before that when you took it as a 21 A. I concede the semantic distinction you're 22 22 student, did she also? drawing, that is correct. 23 23 A. Yes, she taught that. Q. Okay. But it's not just semantics, right? 24 Q. And you had interaction with her in that 24 Substantively, you didn't issue the final grade? 25 capacity, correct? 25 A. I did not issue the final grade Page 1494 Page 1496 1 A. Yes, as a student in that course. 1 substantively, but I'm the one who read -- the way 2 2 Q. What was your grade? it was put to me is the professor would use the 3 A. Oh, for HCT3, I -- I believe I got an 3 language, you are grading this for me. So that is 4 A-minus on that. I really don't know off the top 4 the mode in which I'm speaking, but I'm not the 5 of my head, though. 5 primary or final issuer of a grade. 6 6 Q. In History of Christian Thought One, you Q. A grade got changed that you suggested? 7 7 delivered one lecture, correct? A. Yes. 8 A. That is correct. 8 Q. Why did that get changed? 9 9 Q. Was that opportunity offered or required? A. So this student had a -- had in my 10 A. I believe the way it was framed to me was 10 assessment a very poor exam. I marked it poorly. 11 Professor Otten said, this is an expectation, what 11 I commented on it. And when I submitted it to the 12 topic do you want to lecture on, so . . . 12 professor, it was sort of within the range of -- it 13 13 Q. You were told that it was a requirement was a grade so low that it was sort of like an 14 14 that you lecture? explanation, I felt, was warranted. 15 A. I believe the word used was expectation, 15 And so I said, hey, so-and-so student -- I 16 but I understood it to be a sort of requirement 16 probably said hey in my e-mails to professor --17 17 where this is how she runs it. so-and-so had this low score. I think the exams 18 O. Did you ask for clarification? 18 stands by it. And then she ended up responding, I 19 A. No, I don't believe I did. 19 think you marked that fairly and that was correct. 20 20 Q. You also said with respect to History of This student had been regularly meeting with me 21 21 Christian Thought One, you used the words, and hopefully to try and improve their performance, so 22 22 correct me if I'm wrong, that you were a primary I'm inclined to give them a few more points to sort 23 23 grader and marker -of reflect that, but -- so to my knowledge that 24 24 A. Yeah. grade was changed. 25 25 Q. -- is that correct? Q. And that reflects that you were grading

23 (Pages 1493 to 1496)

Page 1497 Page 1499 1 tougher than the professor was grading overall? 1 and it was before the final class meeting I was 2 2 A. No. I believe the professor was explicit notified. So it was a Monday morning class, and I 3 that she was taking into account factors external 3 believe it was like the Friday prior. to the actual written performance on the exam 4 4 O. And that was Professor Schreiner? 5 itself in the giving of the grade which is what she 5 A. Professor Schreiner let me know that she б told me, saying the student had been meeting with 6 would be unable to be in class and asked that I 7 7 me regularly and I wanted to have that reflect in cover a certain set of material that was going to 8 8 be on the exam that she had already circulated to the grade. 9 Q. You didn't challenge the professor's 9 the students. She uses a take-home exam format and 10 10 determination in this grade as well, correct? wanted there to be he instruction on this one element of the exam. 11 A. No, I did not. 11 12 12 Q. Did you ask the professor questions Q. And that happened once, correct? 13 relating to grading at all? 13 A. In that course, yes. 14 14 Q. Remind me how many students were in that A. I guess this instance of saying this grade 15 seems particularly low was some sort of informal 15 course? 16 query wanting affirmation that that was okay. 16 A. That was the small course. I can't recall 17 Q. And you learned something from this 17 exactly. I would say around ten. 18 experience, right? 18 Q. This was an easy thing for you to do to 19 A. Of course. 19 give that lecture on that one occasion, correct? 20 Q. You learned better grading techniques and 20 A. It required a degree of preparation and --21 better ideas on how you're going to grade or how 21 but it was within my skill set. 22 22 Q. Now, let's talk about the Suffering grading is done? 23 23 A. Yes, like doing anything. Yeah. course. There's only eight students in that 2.4 24 course? Q. That's a skill set that you will benefit 25 from when you become a professor yourself, correct? 25 A. No. That was a larger course. If I Page 1498 Page 1500 1 A. Likely, as I probably won't get the 1 misspoke --2 2 research gig, but . . . Q. That was the larger course? Q. Now, the professor changed a grade in this 3 3 A. Yeah. That one numbered -- because 4 one instance. There had been other instances that 4 initially it was supposed to be a 15-person 5 5 the professor has changed the grade as well, seminar, and then there was demand. And I remember 6 6 enrollments jumped around a bit, and I believe it correct? 7 7 settled 28 to 30 students. A. None to my knowledge for things I have 8 8 graded. Q. With respect to History Three, that's the 9 9 one you were saying was just 8? Q. It's possible that this was done more 10 10 A. It was 8 or 10, around there. frequently with other Ph.D. students, and you're 11 O. And aren't there a minimum number of 11 just not aware of that, correct? 12 A. I have not spoken with other TAs about 12 students that need to be in a course in order for 13 13 their grading practices with this professor. I there to be a TA? 14 14 cannot answer that. A. In Divinity it's my understanding there 15 15 Q. So it's possible. You just don't know? are those. It's also my understanding the faculty 16 16 can petition to have those waived. A. It's very possible. I do, in fact, not 17 17 know. Q. And that's what happened in this instance, 18 18 Q. Now, with respect to History of Christian correct? 19 Thought Three, you indicated that there was an 19 A. I presume so. I don't know for a fact to 20 20 occasion when the professor was out of town, so you what extent Professor Schreiner needed to jump 21 21 provided a lecture. Do I have that ave right? through extra hoops. 22 A. It was either out of town or illness. I 22 Q. But Professor Schreiner needed to jump 23 can't recall which. 23 through extra hoops to get you a position where you 24 24 could TA for only eight folks? Q. And that happened one day, correct? 25 A. Yes. So it was near the end of the term, 25 A. If my understand -- understanding of the

Page 1501 Page 1503 1 1 dissertation? policies is correct, that seems to be the case. 2 2 Q. So she created this opportunity for you? A. So I had never discussed the low amount of 3 A. Presumably. I also -- I'm speculating 3 students with her. The conversation I indicated a 4 4 now. It could be the enrollment was higher and couple weeks before the end of the term when she 5 dropped within the course, I don't know how this --5 was like, oh, are you interested, like I'm looking 6 O. But that would be a tremendous drop, 6 for a TA so be sure to apply if you are. That 7 7 would have been in the context of meeting with her wouldn't it? Going from what, 24 to 8? Isn't it 8 during exam preparation. 8 more realistic that she created this opportunity 9 9 So I took my exams, fall of 2015. And so for you? 10 10 we would have been -- I imagine she would have just A. It is possible. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: If you know. 11 11 raised that after we concluded discussion of my 12 THE WITNESS: I don't know. 12 book list. 13 BY MR. PEARLMAN: 13 Q. That was your qualifying exams for your 14 14 Q. Did you discuss that with her? Ph.D., right? 15 15 A. No. Like so the conversation, she had A. That is correct. mentioned that she was looking for a TA for that 16 16 Q. Now, you talked about an instance where 17 course and asked me to like be sure to apply if I 17 there was a Ph.D. student who was outside of the 18 wanted it, and that was a couple weeks before the 18 Divinity School who served as a TA in a divinity 19 19 end of the term prior to that course. But that was course. Do you recall that? 20 the only conversation we had had about TA'ing prior 20 A. Yeah. So I TA for History of Christian 21 21 Thought One with Otten. My co-TA was a candidate 22 22 Q. And since there were only eight students, in history. 23 23 that was a relatively small course for you to TA, Q. In history, that's a course that's 24 wasn't it? 24 cross-listed between the history department and 25 A. In terms of grading responsibilities, 25 divinity, correct? Page 1502 Page 1504 1 absolutely, yes. That sort of time responsibility 1 A. I have no knowledge -- I have no idea how 2 2 is for like discussion section and discussions it's listed. I know it's cross-listed between 3 3 comparable, so overall is significantly easier History of Christian and Theology of Divinity, but 4 course to TA. Yes, of course. 4 beyond that I take your word for it. 5 5 Q. You discussed that with (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 6 Professor Schreiner in a meeting relating to your 6 No. 55 was marked for 7 7 dissertation, correct? identification.) 8 A. I suggest --8 BY MR. PEARLMAN: 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Discussed what? 9 Q. Handing you a document that we'll mark for 10 BY MR. PEARLMAN: 10 identification purposes as Employer 55. 11 O. The requirements of the course as a TA? 11 A. Thank you. 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: For which course? 12 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 13 MR. PEARLMAN: For Suffering -- I'm sorry. For 13 No. 56 was marked for 14 14 Three, the last course. identification.) 15 15 MS. AUERBACH: I don't understand the question. BY MR. PEARLMAN: 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Are you referring to the 16 Q. Are you familiar with these documents? 17 17 lecture that he gave when she was out did they A. I've seen this one before from looking at 18 discuss that particular topic? I'm confused. 18 the Divinity School website about course listings. 19 MR. PEARLMAN: Right. Just to clarify, the 19 I have not seen this before, but it appears to be a 20 20 topic is Mr. Vanderpoel being chosen to TA this time schedule thing drawn from the department of 21 small course with eight folks in Three. 21 history. 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. 22 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So the first one you 23 BY MR. PEARLMAN: 23 referred to is Employer 55, and the second one you 24 Q. Did you discuss that with 24 referred to is Employer 56? Professor Schreiner in connection with your 25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

25 (Pages 1501 to 1504)

Page 1507 Page 1505 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Sorry, the record can't 1 cross-list. I know this individual. They're also 1 2 2 see what we're looking at. qualified of course. 3 BY MR. PEARLMAN: 3 Q. Okay. 4 4 Q. I'll represent to you that you'll see at A. And distinction of a historian of 5 the bottom of 56 that this was printed out from the 5 Christianity and a historian is a pretty nominal 6 website of the university and maintained in the 6 distinction, I find. 7 ordinary course of business. 7 Q. Prior to serving as a TA for the first 8 Does this show you that this course that 8 time, you were required to take training courses, 9 you've referenced is cross-listed in history and 9 correct? 10 divinity? 10 A. Not to my knowledge, I did not take 11 11 A. The text does appear so speak for itself training courses. 12 12 in this case, yes. Q. You've not taken any training courses? 13 Q. So it would make sense that a Ph.D. 13 A. I have attended a couple voluntary 14 14 student who had co-TA'd this course with you would sessions of the craft of teaching thing in the be co-TA'ing this particular course because he's a 15 15 Divinity School. 16 history Ph.D., correct? 16 Q. How courses in your craft of teaching? 17 A. It makes sense that he was a co-TA in the 17 A. So they're not offered in a course format. 18 18 course insofar as he's a historian and insofar as It'll be, oh, today so-and-so will be talking about 19 he has the expertise related to that area of study 19 this topic, so it will usually be something like --20 insofar as I trust Professor Otten's decision to 20 thinking of an instance that comes to mind, like 21 hire him as a TA. 21 the visiting professor will be discussing syllabus 22 Q. What is his area of expertise? 22 design. And during my third year, so sort of I was 23 23 A. Broadly I believe he works on episcopal a little bit more active, and I probably went to 24 politics in sort of the early Byzantine periods. 24 two of those events a quarter. 25 Q. What is that? What does that mean? 25 And it only started up around then. It Page 1506 Page 1508 1 A. He's very interested in the changing role wasn't available when I started. And subsequent to 2 2 of bishops and how they interact with imperial then, I go maybe the year after that, my fourth 3 3 authority sort of after the Roman empire is year, I probably went once a quarter. And I think 4 dividing between east and west. So he focuses on 4 I've gone to one this year. After the craft of 5 the Greek east and changing dynamics of secular and 5 teaching, I haven't done any training with the 6 Chicago Center For Teaching. 6 episcopal authorities within that. I believe he 7 Q. Do you intend to seek a craft of teaching 7 works on case studies involving doctrinal 8 8 controversy, but I can't go into any more detail certificate? 9 9 A. I would like to. I'm not sure that I will about his work than that. 10 10 be able to complete it given the logistical Q. So he's qualified and well-qualified to 11 constraints of my ongoing research and geographic 11 teach History of Christian Thought One, correct? 12 A. Absolutely. 12 considerations. 13 13 Q. And clearly related to his course of MR. PEARLMAN: I apologize. Let me pause for 14 14 one moment as a housekeeping matter. I move to study? 15 15 admit Exhibits 55 and 56. A. Yeah. He and I have comparable skill sets 16 MS. AUERBACH: I don't have any objection. 16 as scholars and certainly qualified. 17 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibits 55 and Q. You're not aware of any other instances 18 18 where a graduate student outside of divinity served 56 are received. 19 as a TA for divinity course, correct? 19 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 20 20 Nos. 55 and 56 were admitted for A. I'm aware of other instances in which -- I 21 21 the record.) am aware of an instance in which a historian TA'd 22 22 for another course. BY MR. PEARLMAN: 23 23 Q. I apologize for taking the step back. Q. Do you know what that course was?

26 (Pages 1505 to 1508)

In terms of craft teaching, why did you

24

25

take those courses?

24

25

A. So I believe it was a history student who

TA'd for History of Christian Thought Two, similar

Page 1509 Page 1511 A. Combination of factors. Some desire to be 1 teaching certificate? 2 more self-reflexive about my own pedagogy and A. So as I indicated before, I will like to things like that --3 if it's feasible. A lot of the requirements for 4 Q. What was the word you used? More self -that are only offered at very specific times of the A. I said self-reflexive, so take your pick 5 year, and I'm sure if I'm on campus to complete the 6 with my hyperbole, self-reflexive, self-reflective. requirements. So hopefully, but it's a 7 I wanted to be more intentional and thoughtful as wait-and-see situation. 8 myself in pedagogy in taking those courses. At Q. You want to do that as a credentialing that point I was hoping to receive the 9 opportunity? certification which would provide some sort of boon 10 A. Yeah, to have a credential for my CV in 11 in the job market, and also, frankly, the free that regard. 12 lunches provided at many of those events. Q. And also to grow and learn as a teacher, Q. That was a consideration of yours in 13 correct? 14 taking courses in craft of teaching? A. The primary interest I think it's truthful A. In like -- so they're not courses. It'll 15 to say, yes, is that I would want the credential on be like a one-and-a-half hour session, and that is 16 my CV. And if I get some learning along the way, absolutely a consideration of mine in attending a 17 which I have thus far, that would be beneficial. 18 one-and-a-half-hour education. But at this point the decision to complete it would 19 Q. Now, you benefitted in with respect to be based on whether or not I want a credential. your teaching skills as a result of taking the 20 Q. Has Dr. Schreiner encouraged you to seek craft of teaching courses, correct? 21 out craft of teaching course? A. Again, they're not courses. So I don't 22 A. No, she never has. 23 Q. Has anyone else in the divinity division? want to --Q. What would you characterize them? 24 School, excuse me. A. They'll be called a session or event. 25 A. To me personally, the only people who have Page 1510 Page 1512 Q. Let's call it a session. Same question 1 asked me to attend events are the students who 2 and substitute in session. coordinate it because they want to keep attendance 3 A. I would say to the extent I found them numbers up. Generally deans and large gathering helpful is highly variable, but on the whole 4 settings will talk it up and encourage us to they're helpful. 5 attend, but no professors in my work for TA work HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Do you recall which 6 have encouraged me. 7 topics you took when you attended these sessions? Q. You have benefitted from going to the 8 THE WITNESS: I can recall a few here and craft of teaching courses with respect to your 9 teaching abilities? there. So like one, for instance, was how do you 10 A. I believe I have benefitted through design a syllabus for intro to religious studies which is a very -- sort of a question that likely 11 attending sessions through the craft of teaching as many of us would have to address at some point 12 to my pedagogy. 13 professionally. There was one on syllabus designs Q. Let's turn back to some of the other 14 typically within History of Christianity which I things that you did as a TA. A. Uh-huh. believe was more helpful, right up my alley. 15 Some of them will be things teaching 16 Q. With respect to grading, did you find it 17 theology in the classroom which is less helpful for easier to grade papers the first time that you did so? Let me strike that and ask a better question.

me insofar as hopefully I'm not required to teach 18 that. So it somewhat overlaps with my purview. So 19 Did you find it easier to grade papers 20 other things I've gone to some like managing after the first time of doing so? 21 classroom presence, how to project authority, the A. Yes. I have graded papers prior to any of 22 role of humor in the classroom, these sorts of my teaching experience at University of Chicago. things. But they all kind of run together frankly. 23 So there was somewhat diminishing returns there. 24 BY MR. PEARLMAN:

Q. Are you seeking to obtain a craft of

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

But it's fair to say the grading has gotten easier TA'ing in University of Chicago, as well.

27 (Pages 1509 to 1512)

Page 1513 Page 1515 Q. In any of the three courses that you had 1 are relevant when giving topics. So I know some of 2 identified, One, Three and Suffering, did you my work for that was reflected in the specific prepare exam questions? 3 readings assigned, like specific page ranges not is 4 A. Yes. So for one I wrote both -- I wrote this what you're going to or not going to be in on exam questions both for the midterm and final. 5 the syllabus. That was the case for Suffering. Q. Was that -- did you do that for any other 6 But that was not in my capacity as a TA that I did 7 courses? 8 A. No. So Professor Schreiner for Three has Q. Okay. But professor assigns the reading. 9 You don't assign the reading, correct? a set group of questions that -- who knows the last 10 time that changed, and the Suffering course she A. So I -- assigns in the sense of puts it on 11 prepared the questions on her own. the syllabus, yes. 12 Q. So it was just in one that you prepared Q. The professor assigns meaning they questions. Is that your testimony? 13 exercise their own independent judgment to 14 A. Yes. That is the case. determine whether or not it should go on the 15 Q. Did you prepare those questions on your syllabus; is that a fair statement? own or working with a professor? 16 A. Of course. A. So the professor contacted me and my 17 Q. Okay. The professor does the lectures fellow TA and said, let's meet briefly this day 18 except for that one instance that you mentioned? after class to finalize midterm questions and 19 A. Well, so I delivered a lecture in every 20 course I've TA'd, but yes. somewhere for the final exam, have a couple questions ready to propose or pitch, and then we'll 21 Q. Other than that one instance, was the see how it shakes out. 22 professor present? So we came with sort of questions 23 A. No. So also when I TA'd for Suffering, prewritten. The professor sort of has her typical 24 Professor Schreiner was not present in that class. pool that she draws from, and we sort of gave ours. 25 Q. Did you discuss the lecture with Page 1514 Page 1516 She said which one sounded interesting to hers, and 1 **Professor Schreiner?** 2 A. So it was a verbal conversation a couple 3 weeks prior. She called me up after class and 4 said, I will be out of town on this day, can you be 5 prepared to lead class. I would appreciate it if 6 little bit of choice. you can deal with -- at that point we were 7 comparing and contrasting philosophical models of Q. You learn from the professor in the 8 Myron Menard -- she asked I hold lecture. 9 Q. That's something you were already 10

1 2 we sort of mutually agreed upon one from her 3 standing pool to fill out the rest to make sure 4 that there's good spread for students who want to 5 write on like Topic X rather than Y to give them a 6

process of preparing these exam questions interactively with the professor?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. In a small way. It was a pretty -- it was a -- yes, but it wasn't a cloud parting moment.

Q. Now, the professor formulates the syllabus for the courses. And when I've been talking about courses, I'm talking about the three that you TA'd.

A. Yes. So the one like -- so in some of my work as a research assistant, I actually did some of the prep for which readings ended up on the syllabus for the Suffering course, but that was not in my role as a TA.

Q. I'm sorry. I just want to make sure I caught what you said. You said you did some of the prep for the --

A. So as I testified earlier as a research assistant, I've done some help in course prep for Professor Schreiner by identifying which readings well-familiar with, correct?

A. Well-familiar with, there's figures with whom I was familiar, the sort of -- I will admit I was not at that point familiar with like the technicalities of Providence.

Q. Did you feel you were ready to do what you were being asked to do?

A. Absolutely. I have -- part of being a graduate student is knowing how to know something even if you don't know it at the moment. So I felt very well-equipped to learn those topics, and I felt I had a firm mastery on them by the time I presented on the material.

Q. Did you have the opportunity to ask any questions to professor that you may need to ask before delivering a lecture?

28 (Pages 1513 to 1516)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 1517 Page 1519 1 1 A. I would always feel -- reach out to Dr. -question, yeah. 2 2 Professor Schreiner if I had a question. Q. In serving -- doing the discussion 3 Q. With respect to these three courses we've 3 sections helped you advance as a teacher, correct? 4 4 been discussing, did you lead any discussion A. Yeah, in some general way. Particularly 5 sections as a TA? 5 for the History of Christian Thought One, it was б 6 A. Yes. kind of -- kind of a boring experience for me, 7 7 Q. Okay. Did you do that in each of the 8 three courses? 8 Q. All right. To clarify, you took History 9 A. Yes. It was not weekly in the Suffering 9 of Christian Thought One before you TA'd; is that 10 course. They were biweekly discussion sections 10 correct? 11 because that's what Professor Schreiner told me to 11 A. That is correct. 12 12 O. Was that with Professor Otten? 13 Q. How many discussions were in the 13 A. Yes. That would have been when I was a 14 discussion sections? 14 wee master's student. 15 A. So it was like the -- sort of smaller 15 Q. Okay. And what's -- what grade did you 16 class for the Three. And then for when I did 16 get? 17 History of Christian Thought One, it was not a 17 A. I only got an A-minus in that one. 18 mandatory discussion section. So instead of like a 18 Q. What sort of interaction did you have with 19 full half of a class, only like 10 to 15 showed up 19 Professor Otten in that regard? 20 any given week. And then it also was not mandatory 20 A. That was my very first quarter as a 21 in the Suffering course, and I had, say, 10 to 15 21 master's student. I had no interaction with her 22 22 about the course besides turning in assignments and show up any given week. 23 23 O. You discussed what would occur in this receiving grades. 2.4 discussion sections with the professors, correct? 24 Q. As a TA for these three courses, you also 25 A. So professor Schreiner and I didn't have 25 held office hours, correct? Page 1518 Page 1520 1 discussion beyond her saying, if you have 1 A. Yes, by appointment. 2 2 questions, talk to me. Professor --Q. And you spoke with Professor Schreiner and 3 3 Professor Otten for History Thought One told me to Otten about how to hold office hours, correct? 4 let her know if I have any questions, but generally 4 A. It amounted to what, both of the 5 to lead it how I wanted, and she was sure it would 5 conversations, where they said be ready to answer 6 6 questions of whatever sort. It was a very sort of be good. Gave me sort of a washing that many 7 7 students who take History of Christian Thought One informal, you know what to do, the implied, we're 8 8 have no prior training in Christianity. here to answer questions. 9 So to the extent much of the discussion 9 Q. Were they available to answer questions of 10 10 section is not so much to be on course material, yours? 11 but introductory knowledge about Christianity, that 11 A. I'm confident if I had, they would be 12 would be necessary to engage in the graduate level 12 available. 13 13 course they're on. Q. But you didn't have any questions of 14 14 Q. Did you ever take Professor Schreiner or them --15 Professor Otten up on their offers to you to raise 15 A. No. 16 any questions to them or interact with them about 16 Q. -- with respect to conducting office 17 17 conducting discussion sections? hours? 18 18 A. I never felt I reached a point in my A. Yeah. I...

discussion sections where I needed help or was uncertain about what I was doing, so I have not talked with them or asked them questions about that.

Q. But you believe if you did, they'd be available to you?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. I am confident that they would answer my

29 (Pages 1517 to 1520)

Q. When you said that office hours would be

A. So in the Divinity School, we don't have

So students are required to reach out if they want

to meet to discuss anything, that was verbalized

and said sort of -- so it's like verbally stated

like physical offices or space of any given sort.

by appointment, what does that mean?

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 1521 Page 1523

every class like if you have further questions,
e-mail the TA or one of the TAs to meet with them
during office hours. And then there's also the
expectation that I stay around after class to
answer questions. So that's typically like a
50-minute stretch.

- Q. And it was infrequent that students reached out to you with requests for office hour appointments, correct?
 - A. It varies heavily by course.
 - Q. Can you break it down with respect to --
 - A. Yeah.

2.4

Q. I think that's what you were going to do.
If you could break it down with those three
courses?

A. I would say I average a half hour, 20 minutes to a half hour of meeting with students for History of Christian Thought One. History of Christian Thought Three was more infrequent if we would have averaged it out of 10 to 15 minutes a week. The Suffering course had a number of highly invested students, so I probably spent at least an hour every week meeting with students within office hours discussing course material and background.

would be a situation. Great, what's your availability; I'm free to meet, and we can talk through it at length.

- Q. Did you ever meet with students anywhere outside of a formal setting outside of like a classroom instead like in a coffee shop?
- A. Like the student lounge I've met with students, the Divinity School.
 - Q. You don't believe a coffee shop?
- A. I don't believe I ever did in a coffee shop because the coffee shop only recently got seating in the Divinity School.
 - O. In a restaurant?
 - A. No. I only met with students in the Divinity School in that capacity.
- 16 Q. Anywhere else?
 - A. No, not to my knowledge.
- Q. Have you taught in excess of your requirements?
- A. So on paper, no, I have not. You -- so in the Divinity School --
 - Q. Can you help me understand that? I apologize for interrupting. You said on paper you haven't. Can you help me understand what you mean by that?

Page 1522

Page 1524

- 1 hours sessions?
 - A. So it would vary a little bit appointment to appointment. Usually I would try to find a vacant class within the Divinity School because that was convenient. I believe I held one in the student lounge. I've held discussions in the student lounge of the Divinity School as well.

Q. Okay. Where did you hold these office

- Q. Did you anywhere else? Did you do any by telephone?
- A. No. I've never conducted by telephone. I've answered questions extensively in e-mail in cases where that seems to be sufficient. So I guess anywhere I open my laptop.
- Q. So on some occasions you would answer by -- questions by e-mail in lieu of conducting a physical sit-down office hour?
- A. So it would sort of depend on the inquiry I received. So in one instance you might get a question like, oh, I'm really interested in time, what's a good text for me to look at. You can just write back, oh, wow, I'm so delighted for your enthusiasm for the course. Check out the latter of our earlier discussion or I'm having difficulty unpacking this concept or I wasn't totally clear on what proof so-and-so was saying on this day. That
- A. Yeah. So in the Divinity School we're required to get five GAI points, and they're apportioned in the similar divisions amply testified here. The operative differences are we're -- I'm not sure if this pertains to other divisions. It may. We're allowed to get one teaching point for teaching externally outside of the university as a whole, and -- but that's capped at one. And I am led to believe this is a concession for us having fewer TA responsibilities within the Divinity School.

Often in many cases we are able to petition sort of have the GAI requirements waived. I know a number of friends who have done this for graduation. If we can demonstrate that we have an outside teaching experience or in some cases people have tried to TA more within the Divinity School, but have been unable to secure appointments.

- Q. Have you petitioned for a waiver?
- A. No, because I've not petitioned to graduate. I've not submitted my application. I don't intend to for a couple years.
- Q. And who in particular told you that you could petition for a waiver at some point?
 - A. So I had at one point expressed concern

30 (Pages 1521 to 1524)

Page 1525 Page 1527 1 1 about teaching points, I believe, to same time you were an RA for Professor Schreiner? 2 Professor Otten. She sort of indicated, don't 2 A. Yes. 3 worry about it. They never hold anyone back on the 3 Q. So you had said that you received biweekly 4 basis of that. You're making an effort. Don't 4 paychecks for your role as an RA for 5 worry about it. 5 Professor Schreiner. With regard to the money, I 6 6 Subsequent to that, I knew of some friends don't know if your stipend for the TA appointment, 7 7 who graduated without five GAI teaching points. I were you paid via separate checks for those 8 8 sort of asked them, oh, how did that go; oh, I different roles or was it in one check? 9 submitted a petition to Dean Owens, the dean of 9 A. So the RA shift? 10 10 students, and I showed that I had had some outside O. Yes. 11 11 A. The TA shift checks within the Divinity teaching experience that was more than commensurate 12 with the GAI points I was missing despite the exam 12 School then. I don't know if this changed our 13 on that, and had made an effort to TA as I could 13 disbursement like a one lump sum payment for the 14 14 quarter, and I received the RA payment separately within the Divinity School. And these students 15 characterized it to me as a pretty perfunctory sort 15 biweekly. 16 of thing. It wasn't a difficult process. 16 Q. Okay. And did you then also receive a 17 Q. You don't know this personally. You're 17 separate check for the -- when you were workshop 18 just taking their word for it? 18 coordinator or were you ever a workshop coordinator 19 A. That is correct. 19 at the same time you were a TA or RA? 20 Q. You haven't seen any documents that 20 A. I would have been, yes, and that was 21 corroborate that or negate that one way or the 21 separate. And also to give a little detail on 22 other? 22 that, this has changed now; but the year I did it, 23 23 A. That is correct. the council for advance study due to logistical 24 2.4 Q. How many GAI points do you currently have? limitations, they could only have one of the two 25 A. So I have three or four points, so I have 25 co-coordinators actually receive the paycheck. So Page 1526 Page 1528 1 four points from these TAs. I submitted to 1 the paycheck was only written to my co-coordinator, 2 2 certainly a teaching point. I qualify for a fourth who then wrote a check to me for half of it. And 3 3 point, but I haven't received confirmation from the then I had to go back to the council for advance 4 Divinity School that that has processed. 4 studies for tax guidance on reporting that. 5 5 O. To come full circle? Q. Did you receive that have guidance? A. Yes. Counsel of advance studies was 6 A. Correct. 6 7 7 Q. At present you have not exceeded your helpful. 8 8 teaching appointments? Q. So do you for each of these -- and if 9 A. No, I have not. 9 they're different, let me know. 10 10 MR. PEARLMAN: If I could have a moment? Do you receive a physical check or is it 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record. 11 direct deposit? 12 (WHEREUPON, a discussion was had 12 A. So direct deposit only began, I believe, 13 13 off the record.) this academic year in the Divinity School. So I 14 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. received physical checks for the stipend and TA 15 15 MR. PEARLMAN: Thank you very much, payments up to this point. This year I received my 16 stipend payments electronically, but RA hours were 16 Mr. Vanderpoel. I have no further questions at 17 17 through the Workday system. So I received those this time. 18 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okav. via direct deposit from the beginning. 19 **EXAMINATION** 19 Q. Okay. And so for the RA position, you 20 20 BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS: said you worked about ten hours per week. You'd 21 log those into the Workday system? 21 Q. So I believe you said, correct me if I'm 22 wrong, that you TA'd the Suffering course in this 22 A. Yes. So I log on the University of

31 (Pages 1525 to 1528)

Chicago website and have a little clock on button

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. I think that's

23

24

25

that I click.

23

24

25

spring of 2016; is that correct?

Q. So then with you TA'ing that course at the

A. That is correct.

2 3 BY	my questions. REDIRECT EXAMINATION	1	B 44 1940
2 3 BY	• •		Petitioner exhibit?
3 BY		2	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yeah, since that's what
	Y MS. AUERBACH:	3	we've been doing it.
	Q. Did Professor Schreiner ever refer to your	4	(WHEREUPON, Petitioner Exhibit
5 res	search assistant as a non-lab research assistant	5	No. 73 was marked for
	sition?	6	identification.)
	A. No, I've only heard that term used within	7	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: This will be 73. And
	e ambience of these proceedings. We say research	8	then we'll mark the mark the subpoena itself as an
	sistant or RA.	9	Employer exhibit as well. So I will take this,
	MS. AUERBACH: I don't have anything else.	10	review it. And Employer can review it, and then
	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Does Employer have any	11	I'll have the parties state their positions into
	rther questions?	12	the record before we proceed after the lunch break.
13	RECROSS-EXAMINATION	13	So let's resume, say, 1:45.
	Y MR. PEARLMAN:	14	MR. SALVATORE: Can we have until 2:00?
	Q. Just quickly, Mr. Vanderpoel, you've been	15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: How long does the
	rending almost all of these sessions, correct?	16	Employer want I want to count for time because
	A. Which sessions? These hearing sessions?	17	we still have the next witness, Mr. Porzio's
	Q. These hearing sessions.	18	argument on the eligibility mechanics, and as well
	A. I've been to about half of them.	19	as the cross-examination for the final witness.
	Q. It's been more than half of them that	20	And I do intend to keep us through the end of that
	uve been at, correct?	21	witness, so just be mindful of time. Do you think
	A. Let me do math which you know is a fraught	22	that's do you think this will allow enough time?
	deavor. I guess prior to this, I was at four of	23	MR. FASMAN: Yeah.
	e seven, so, yeah, more than half.	24	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: We'll resume then at
	Q. You've been Tweeting from these sessions?	25	2:00 with the Employer's final witness.
	Page 1530		Page 1532
1	A. Indeed I have.	1	Off the record.
	Q. From all of the sessions you've been	2	(WHEREUPON, a short recess was
	esent?	3	taken.)
-	MS. AUERBACH: Objection, relevance.	4	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.
	MR. PEARLMAN: I think he answered.	5	So before the recess, the Petitioner
	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: He answered, but before	6	submitted a petition to revoke subpoena duces
	e proceed with the next question, I think it's	7	tecum, so since we've been doing this with the
	propriate to cover.	8	prior subpoenas to revoke, I have marked this
	MR. PEARLMAN: I don't have any other	9	document as Petitioner Exhibit 73 and the actual
	estions.	10	subpoena as Employer Exhibit 57. I move to receive
	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So, with that,	11	them at this time. Is there any objections?
	r. Vanderpoel, you are excused.	12	MS. AUERBACH: No objection.
	THE WITNESS: Thank you very much.	13	MR. PORZIO: No objection.
14	(Witness excused.)	14	(WHEREUPON, Petitioner Exhibit
	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So I know the	15	No. 73 was received into
	mployer has its next witness scheduled for 1:00.	16	evidence.)
	s past 1:00. How about we do just a short lunch	17	(WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit
	eak, maybe, say, a half an hour, come back, and	18	No. 57 was marked for
	oceed with the Employer's final witness, all	19	identification and received into
-	ght?	20	evidence.)
	MS. AUERBACH: Before we break, I'd also like	21	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner Exhibit 73
	I have a petition to revoke subpoena. I want	22	and Employer Exhibit 57 are received.
	file it and serve it right now.	23	So before we proceed with the next
24	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay.	24	witness, I would like the parties to state their
25	MR. PORZIO: Are you going to mark this as	25	respective positions into the record with regards

32 (Pages 1529 to 1532)

Page 1533 Page 1535

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

1

2

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

to the petition to revoke. Petitioner, if you would like to state your position.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. AUERBACH: Yes. So the second subpoena served on the Union is substantially the same as the first subpoena, the Petitioner's motion -petition to revoke the first subpoena was granted. The second subpoena is also overly broad and unduly burdensome and beyond the scope of a proper subpoena. It's more in the range of a broad discovery request. It includes 9 of the 11 requests of the original subpoena with only minor changes.

Some of the words all was taken out of before documents, but that doesn't change the nature of any of the individual requests. They still broadly request documents going to issues in the case. All of the -- as seen by the documents already put in evidence by the Petitioner, all the documents put in evidence by the Petitioner are documents within the control of the Employer either on the Employer's website or documents given to individual students by the Employer. So all the documents requested are within the Employer's control, and just in the nature of a discovery request to the extent it asks for documents which

MR. PORZIO: Sure, a few things. So hearing Miss Auerbach's characterization of the subpoena, I think on the record just recently she said substantially the same, but in the petition to revoke it's drafted as almost identical, our first subpoena as compared to our second. And I just want to make very clear that they are not identical, not almost identical. In fact, the rest of her paragraph, it gives several reasons why they're not almost identical and that 2 of the 11 provisions were removed entirely.

One of the requests were changed significantly in terms of the wording, and a number of them including, I think I would say, probably nine had the word any removed which is based on the hearing officer's ruling was the grounds in which the hearing officer granted the petition to revoke our initial subpoena. So I disagree with the characterization within the petition to revoke which essentially states a legal conclusion that the omission of the word all does not alter the overbroad scope or unduly burdensome nature of the request because I don't think that's the case as a matter of fact or law.

Number 2, just to be clear, we're not

Page 1534

the, you know, the Union may use as exhibits at the hearing or may show that individuals are employees or may shows that individuals are students and not employees.

The subpoena requests advance notice of documents the Union may introduce as exhibits by asking that question which goes beyond the proper scope of the subpoena. There's no right to list of exhibits in the hearing. And to the extent the subpoena seeks any affidavits or witness statement that were provided to the board, such documents are irrelevant. But prior to service of this second subpoena on the Union, the Union did notify the Employer that the Union did not provide any affidavits or witness statements to the region. So I'm not in support of this petition, so I'm not sure why that request was even included anyway.

But then the subpoena is overly broad to the extent it seeks documents in the possession of Union members who are not agents of the Union. So for those reasons we ask that the subpoena be revoked. I mean, yes, that the subpoena be revoked.

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What is the Employer's position?

looking -- and I believe I made this representation

to the Union off the record on at least a couple of

3 occasions. We're not looking for documents in any

4 of these requests that are available on the

5 university's public websites. We're not asking the

6 Union to go do the research on our websites. But

7 the fact that the Union characterizes them as all

8 being within the control of university, I don't

9 think that's necessarily true. And indeed in the

10 initial petition to revoke which I noticed has the

11 wordings no longer in this subpoena says to a large

12 extent or words to that effect, the documents would

13 be within the university's control. I agree with

14 the way the Union initially phrased it and that

15 there are some documents that would be responsive

to and probative to this hearing that might not be

within the university's control, at least given the

fact of the significant decentralization within the

university.

So as indicated, we're not looking for documents that are on publicly available websites. We're looking for documents in the Union's possession that would be responsive to 2 that are not on those websites.

Similar comments for Number 3.

33 (Pages 1533 to 1536)

Page 1536

Page 1537 Page 1539 1 With respect to Number 4 about the under Attorney Auerbach's signature, it says, 1 2 2 Employer seeking advance notice of the documents attorneys for the charging party here, I think this 3 3 Union seeks to introduce as exhibits, just because was for ULPN client --4 4 MS. AUERBACH: Yeah, different. the fact that the Union says, and I agree, that 5 there's no provision in board rules requiring the 5 MR. PORZIO: So let's just clear that up. I 6 6 Union to do this, that's not the standard for -- in think for the record it should say attorneys for 7 7 Petitioner and, you know, GSUA. which a subpoena or a petition to revoke is 8 MS. AUERBACH: That's correct. That was my 8 analyzed. It's whether the information is relevant 9 to this hearing. And clearly given the fact that 9 mistake. 10 10 they're going to be introduced as Petitioner HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So then it should 11 11 be attorneys for charging party, Graduate Students exhibits, they're clearly going to be relevant to 12 12 United, correct? this proceeding. 13 Number 5, to the extent our request says 13 MS. AUERBACH: Petitioner it should be. 14 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm sorry. Is that all documents including affidavits or witness 15 15 correct? statements, the Union provided to the National 16 Labor Relations Board in support of or as part of 16 MS. AUERBACH: Yes, that's correct. I did 17 the Board's investigation of the petition. The 17 borrow my signature from a document. 18 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So then --Petitioner's counsel is correct. She did make the 19 19 MS. AUERBACH: It should be Petitioner. representation to me off the record that no such 20 20 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So considering item documents were provided to the board. And if the 21 Petitioner's counsel is willing to state on the 21 Number 9 in the subpoena duces tecum to be 22 22 satisfied, so then Items 1 through 8 are record right now that no documents including 23 23 affidavits or witness statements were provided to outstanding. 24 MR. PORZIO: Correct. 24 the labor board as part of the investigation of 25 25 this petition, then we're satisfied. If they're HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So as I Page 1538 Page 1540 1 willing to make that representation, then we're 1 represented to the parties in off the record 2 2 happy with that. discussion, I have not had an opportunity to 3 3 consult with regional director on this matter. He So I guess I ask Attorney Auerbach if 4 she's willing to make that representation. 4 is given an opportunity to review these documents. 5 5 MS. AUERBACH: So just to alleviate confusion So in order to not unnecessarily delay these 6 over Number 9, the Union did not submit to the 6 proceedings, my understanding we have some witness 7 7 scheduled for these times. So while the regional region with the petition any affidavits or witness 8 8 statements and did not submit any documents other director has the opportunity to review this matter, 9 than those required to be filed with the petition 9 let's proceed with the Employer's next witness. 10 10 such as documents related to the showing of MR. PORZIO: That's fine with the understanding 11 11 that we'd like depending on when we hear back from 12 MR. PORZIO: And I just want to make sure that 12 the regional director given the state of the 13 13 hearing which I think is coming to a close at some I'm clearly understanding because I think you said 14 14 point soon, we'd like to call for production of the Union submit any documents with the petition --15 15 these documents in the request 1 through 8 as of MS. AUERBACH: Or in support of the petition. now pending the regional director's decision. 16 16 MR. PORZIO: Okay. So essentially what you're 17 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. saying is the only documents you submitted with the 18 MR. PORZIO: Thank you. 18 petition, documents that would be necessary to 19 support the showing of interest. 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I don't think it would 20 20 be a problem to get -- I should have a ruling for MS. AUERBACH: Correct. 21 21

34 (Pages 1537 to 1540)

22

23

24

25

you on this matter today.

MR. PORZIO: Thank you.

filed the petition to revoke a day early. It

wasn't due until tomorrow, so I did it partly

MS. AUERBACH: And I'll note that I actually

MR. PORZIO: Thank you. With that being said,

we're satisfied with Number 9. We can strike that.

As a housekeeping note, I think there's a

there to be confusion on the record, but on Page 3

typographical error. I just don't want to have

22

23

24

1	Page 1541		Page 1543
1	because we're nearing the end of the hearing even	1	LAWRENCE McENERNEY,
2	though it wasn't due yet.	2	called as a witness herein, having been first duly
3	MR. PORZIO: Well, I think today is the fifth	3	sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
4	day.	4	DIRECT EXAMINATION
5	MS. AUERBACH: No, because the holiday of	5	BY MR. FASMAN:
6	yesterday.	6	Q. Mr. McEnerney, by whom are you employed?
7	MR. PORZIO: I didn't count the holiday. I	7	A. The University of Chicago.
8	filed this on the 22nd, the petition.	8	Q. And what is your job title?
9	MS. AUERBACH: Right, so counting five days, it	9	A. The director of the writing program.
10	would be tomorrow.	10	Q. How long have you held that job title,
11	MR. PORZIO: I'll double check. Let me check	11	sir?
12	one more time. I, too, am not incredibly great	12	A. About 25 years.
13	with math. No. Today is the fifth day.	13	Q. Do you hold any other positions at the
14	MS. AUERBACH: All right.	14	University of Chicago, sir?
15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Well, so that's noted	15	A. I do. My wife and I are the resident
16	for the record. I should have a ruling for you all	16	masters of the Renee Granville-Grossman East
17	today.	17	dormitory.
18	MR. PORZIO: Thank you. I appreciate it.	18	Q. What does that entail, sir?
19	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So then if the Employer	19	A. We're the I'm the faculty resident
20	would like to call its next witness.	20	faculty for the dorm. We live in the dorm,
21	MR. PORZIO: One final thing, just a request,	21	organize social events, interact with students,
22	Attorney Auerbach and Attorney Cooper, do you have	22	enjoy them.
23	a sense or can you give us a sense of how many	23	Q. Can you give us a brief summary of your
24	additional witnesses you have beyond the witness	24	educational background, sir?
25	we're going to cross-examine today in terms of	25	A. I have a bachelor's degree in English and
	Page 1542	23	Page 1544
1	planning purposes?	1	history from the college of I have a bachelor's
2	MS. AUERBACH: About six or seven.	2	
	MR PORTICE ORSA	1	from the College of William and Mary in English and
3 4	MR. PORZIO: Okay.	3	history and a master's in English from the
4	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay.	3 4	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago.
4 5	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is	3 4 5	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing
4 5 6	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go	3 4 5 6	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how
4 5 6 7	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should	3 4 5 6 7	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir?
4 5 6 7 8	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday.	3 4 5 6 7 8	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s,
4 5 6 7 8 9	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg
4 5 6 7 8 9	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.)	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.) HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you please state and	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize in any particular type of writing?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.) HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you please state and spell your name for the record?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize in any particular type of writing? A. Yes. We actually have a very narrow
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.) HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you please state and spell your name for the record? THE WITNESS: Lawrence McEnerney,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize in any particular type of writing? A. Yes. We actually have a very narrow specialty. Our specialty is what we call expert
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.) HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you please state and spell your name for the record?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize in any particular type of writing? A. Yes. We actually have a very narrow specialty. Our specialty is what we call expert writing. That's confusing to people because they
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.) HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you please state and spell your name for the record? THE WITNESS: Lawrence McEnerney,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize in any particular type of writing? A. Yes. We actually have a very narrow specialty. Our specialty is what we call expert writing. That's confusing to people because they think we're talking about people who are experts at
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. MS. AUERBACH: I mean, the direct on all is fairly short, so I think realistically it might go into Thursday morning. I don't think it should take a whole day on Thursday. MR. PORZIO: Thank you. MR. FASMAN: Thank you. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Any other housekeeping matters before we proceed with testimony? No, okay. So the Employer can call its next witness. MR. FASMAN: University of Chicago calls Lawrence McEnerney to the stand. (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly sworn.) HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Can you please state and spell your name for the record? THE WITNESS: Lawrence McEnerney,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	history and a master's in English from the University of Chicago. Q. Let's talk for a moment about the writing program at the University of Chicago. When and how was it begun, sir? A. About 40 years ago, late '70s, early '80s, but three faculty members, Joseph Williams, Greg Cologne and Kenneth Dam. Joe was a linguist and a member of the English department, and he was interested in the writing program writing problems that arise for people who are advanced writers in the field. He began doing research in that field and then created a writing program, a single course, that has now grown into a substantial program. Q. Now, does the writing program specialize in any particular type of writing? A. Yes. We actually have a very narrow specialty. Our specialty is what we call expert writing. That's confusing to people because they

35 (Pages 1541 to 1544)

Page 1545 Page 1547

- to deploy that knowledge in writing. We believe
- 2 they face a very different set of writing
- 3 challenges than other people do. And it's a
- separate field of writing because most people think
 of writing as a basic skill, something you learn in
- 6 grammar school, high school, college even. And we take -- we look at particular difficulties in
- writing that don't even emerge until later on in someone's career.
 - Q. Is this different than journalism?

- A. It is. The main difference is that typically we're working with people who are using their writing process to create new ideas. We work with people for whom they're thinking about things that are complicated enough, difficult enough that they have to use their writing process to figure
- out what it is they themselves think. And our
- specialty is helping them take that draft and convert it for readers. Typically, although
- convert it for readers. Typically, although there's certainly exceptions, journalists don't do
- there's certainly exceptions, journalists don't do that. Journalists aren't using their writing
- process to create ideas that they haven't thought
- of before.Q. And is it different than creative writing?
- A. Yes. We work with almost exclusively with

mostly with the college. The college provides our space and computers and things like that. But administratively, we actually have a -- kind of float free

- Q. Do you have relationships with other departments, schools and divisions within the university?
- A. Yes. We have individual agreements with different schools, divisions, even departments to provide services for them. So an individual department or division might contact us and say they'd like our help with a particular writing task done in their division, and so we would make an individual agreement with them on how to provide those services.
- Q. Okay. Can you explain for the record briefly the full-time staff in the writing program? You're the director. Who else is in the full-time staff?
- A. Yes. I'm the director. Katherine Cochrane, my long time colleague, is the deputy director. Tracy Whiner is the senior associate director. Linda Smith is an assistant director. Or, excuse me, I take that back, an associate director. There are two assistant directors,

Page 1546

Page 1548

- writers who are creating text that are going to be read inside a profession. So the text typically don't have the function of entertaining. They're typically not imaginative or creative. They typically have to serve professional functions like persuading, informing, explaining inside of a given profession.

 O. Is this program unique in major
 - Q. Is this program unique in major universities?
 - A. We believe it is. We don't believe that there's any other university using our very narrow focus. There are certainly places that use some aspects of what we do. But University of Chicago is a distinctive place that has this extreme focus on expert writing. Most other schools in the country have to attend to different kinds of writing, and so they don't use this program.
 - Q. Where -- within the university administrative, where is the writing program housed?
 - A. It's confusing because we kind of float around separately administratively. We are not part of any department or any of division. We are not part of a school. Because most of our work is done budgetarily through the college, we work

- Ashley Lyons and Meg Mass. And Margaret Fink is our program coordinator.
- Q. Okay. Let's turn to some of the programs of the writing program. Is there a writing program in the humanities core?
- A. Yes. So one of our programs is what we call a writing intern program, and what that program does is provide teaching support to the humanities common core. All first year undergraduates are required to take at least two quarters, sometimes three, in the humanities core. And the writing program is charged to provide a writing intern for each section of the humanities core.
- Q. How many sections of the humanities core will it be in a given quarter?
- A. It's been changing quickly with the size of the college, but I think this year in the fall and the winter we had about 90 sections. This quarter I think we're down to about 50 or 60.
 - Q. And there's a writing intern in each one?
- A. That's correct.
- Q. Are the writing interns all graduate students?
 - A. No. There's actually a greater demand for

36 (Pages 1545 to 1548)

Page 1549 Page 1551 1 writing interns than graduate students can meet, so 1 the University of Chicago, and I want to become a 2 2 we have several interns who come who are not active writing intern. What's the application process? 3 graduate students including what are called mentors 3 A. The application process will ask you for 4 4 in the master's of humanity program. We have some basic information about you. We'll ask for a 5 people who are not students at the university at 5 sample of your writing. And we'll ask you to --6 all and including people, members of the staff. My 6 give you a student paper and ask you to comment on 7 7 colleagues and I very often teach in the -- as that paper, and then we would interview you. 8 8 writing interns. Q. And everyone gets interviewed? 9 MR. FASMAN: Okay. Let me mark this. What is 9 A. I think so. 10 it? 10 Q. What's the purpose of the interview, sir? 11 11 A. Well, the interview, we're looking HEARING OFFICER MOLS: 58. 12 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 12 primarily for the graduate student's ability to 13 No. 58 was marked for 13 interact well with undergrads and particularly to 14 14 see whether they're interested in working with identification.) 15 15 BY MR. FASMAN: undergrads. 16 Q. Mr. McEnerney, let me show you a document 16 Q. Are you looking for someone who's 17 that we've marked for identification as Employer 17 interested in the pedagogy of writing? 18 18 Exhibit 58, ask you if you can identify it for us. A. We certainly prefer that. We are in the 19 19 A. Yes. It's a description of the writing training process, and in their work pedagogy is 20 intern position, I assume, from our website. 20 crucial. So of course it's helpful if they're 21 Q. It is indeed from the website. Are you 21 interested in that exclusively. 22 22 familiar with this document? Q. Do you expect a writing intern to have a 23 23 A. Yes. particular substantive background, an English 24 2.4 major, history major, chemistry major? Q. Are you satisfied that it's an accurate 25 description? 25 A. No. In fact, we're quite eager to draw Page 1550 Page 1552 1 A. Yes. It -- I think it does. The only 1 interns from throughout the university. 2 2 thing I hesitate is about because the interning Q. And how about do you look at prior 3 3 position is often quite varied, I think this gives accomplishments as a writer? 4 a good account of the typical work of the writing 4 A. What we mostly are looking for is to make 5 5 sure they understand the function of writing at a 6 Q. Okay. Well, let's -- we're going to talk 6 research university. As I said, our program has 7 7 about that. quite a narrow focus, and so it's important that 8 8 MR. FASMAN: I move for the admission of graduate students working with us understand the 9 Employer's Exhibit 58, please. 9 role of writing especially in this process of 10 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: If you'll recall, 10 creating new knowledge, people thinking new 11 Petitioner 58 --11 thoughts. We make sure -- we need to make sure 12 MS. AUERBACH: Yeah, I think it's essentially 12 people understand how writing can be used that way. 13 13 the same as what was previously marked as Q. So is it fair to say this is pedagogy of 14 14 Petitioner Exhibit 58, but not yet introduced, but writing as a creator of knowledge? 15 I don't have an objection to it. 15 A. Yes. The -- both formally, I mean, the 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So then --16 university is a creator of knowledge. It's a 17 MS. AUERBACH: Just noting that. 17 research university. That's what we do. But even 18 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 58 is when people, a particular person isn't creating 19 received. 19 knowledge in the formal sense, they're still using 20 20 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit their writing process to create knowledge as they 21 21 No. 58 was received into the go for themselves and for their readers. And so we 22 22 need to make sure that people who work in this record.) 23 MR. FASMAN: Thank you. 23 program understand writing can be used in that way. 24 24 BY MR. FASMAN: Q. Okay. If I'm accepted as a writing 25 Q. So let's assume I'm a graduate student at 25 intern, are there courses I have to take?

37 (Pages 1549 to 1552)

Page 1553 Page 1555 Q. -- or practical application? A. Well, there's a training program that 1 2 you're required to take that you can register for How does that work? as a course. Some numbers of interns do take it as 3 A. Yes. Usually -- well, the course includes a course, but even if they don't, they have to 4 some straight lecturing where we're explaining to complete the training program. 5 the students the diagnostics, the analytics that we Q. Tell us about the training program. What 6 use of readers, but then we break into workshops 7 is it? that are trying to replicate the workshop 8 A. It's a ten-week program. It's ten weeks environment that the graduate students will be long because it is designed also to be a course, 9 leading when they are teaching. And they are also 10 and the university is on the quarter system. So doing continual comments on student papers, giving our courses are ten weeks long. So it's a ten-week 11 us those comments. So that we can help them in two different ways. equivalent of a ten-week course. It is a ten-week 12 course. It requires three hours a week in class 13 One is we want to make sure that they're and then some number of hours outside of class that 14 using the analytic in a useful way for students, can be taken for a grade or taken simply as 15 but we're also are helping them for basic 16 pedagogical practices in how to comment on student Q. And this is -- strike that. 17 papers. 18 Who teaches this course? Q. When is the course given? 19 A. The course currently is being taught by my A. The course is given in the spring, summer colleagues Katherine Cochrane, Tracy Whiner, and 20 and fall of most years. they will be working with Ashley Lyons and Meg Mass 21 Q. And you said it was a course or a training 22 and I believe Margaret Fink as well in teaching the program. Is it taken pass/fail or are there grades 23 course. given? 24 Q. Am I correct in assuming that you've A. For those students who register for the taught this course in the past? 25 course, they typically will take it pass/fail. Page 1554 Page 1556 A. Yes, I have. 1 O. So there's no final exam? Q. A few times? 2 A. No. 3 A. A few times. Q. So I get through my ten weeks of the Q. Tell us what the overall subject of the 4 course. How do you decide that I'm ready to teach 5 writing in the humanities course? Is there a course is. 6 A. The course is, it's called, pedagogies of process for that? 7 writing. And it's, first of all, introducing the A. Well, certainly you've been working with students to our particular approach to writing, our 8 members of the writing staff for the whole ten 9 particular pedagogies of it, our particular weeks, and it's very much a part of our 10 analysis of writing, this whole notion of being responsibility to make sure that you're ready to do able to take a first draft that a writer created 11 for the writer's own thinking and then turning it 12 Q. Okay. Let's assume that you and your 13 into an effective work for readers. staff think I am ready to do this. When do the We spend a lot of time in this course 14 interns actually teach? 15 talking about analytics of readers, training the A. Well, if interns have trained in the graduate students in how to think more effectively 16 spring or summer, then they will typically begin 17 about the readers of the prose. So part of the teaching in the fall quarter.

23 Q. And do the students in the course actually multiple sections, so we will be assigning an have that type of practicum --24 intern into every section. It's a very complicated 25 process getting people into 90 different sections.

course is about these analytics of readers.

Another part of the course is pedagogical practice,

running writing seminars, responding to student

papers, looking at prompts, how they work, so

A. Yes.

forth.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

38 (Pages 1553 to 1556)

O. Okay. And are the interns assigned to

particular sections of the humanities core?

seven different courses that constitute the

humanities core. Each of these courses has

A. Yes. There are currently, I believe,

18

19

20

21

22

Page 1557 Page 1559 We ask interns about their preferences. We ask 1 is whether or not my professor is going to use what 2 2 faculty about their preferences. And we try to I've taught --3 make the best matches we can. 3 A. Right. 4 4 Q. Okay. We'll leave it at that. That could Q. -- or something else. 5 go on for a while. 5 Do the writing interns attend the lectures 6 6 A. That could go on. in the class? 7 7 Q. So once assigned to a section, who is the A. Yes. And they're not lectures. Well, in 8 writing intern responsible to? 8 one case they're lectures. But most of these 9 A. Very much the instructor of that section. 9 classes are discussion-based classes. So there'll 10 We will have trained the intern. We like to think 10 be typically 18 or 19 undergraduates in a class. 11 11 And the interns will attend those classes, will that we're giving them, adding to their ability to 12 12 analyze writing, adding to their ability to teach. read the text that the instructor is teaching and 13 But once they are assigned to the section, the 13 will attend the classes. 14 14 instructor of that section will set the goals and Q. Would you expect them to lead a discussion 15 15 the outcomes and the assessment for that section. section? 16 Q. And are the faculty members supposed to 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

mentor the writing intern? A. That's a -- we hope so. And some faculty members certainly do. But that's a -- it's a complicated issue. Some faculty members are -writing is very important to them. Other faculty members it's less so, and they're more willing to

give their writing interns much more independence.

Q. So, let's say, I'm a writing intern. I'm fresh from your course. I come into one of the

my materials. I've thought about them. Do I use

them -- use the materials I've created? I presume

I've created materials in your --

Q. -- in the pedagogy course?

A. Right.

A. Of course.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. This is very much up to the discretion of both the intern and the instructor. There are some instructors who encourage interns to teach these plenary sessions. There are other instructors who are not comfortable with that. And there are interns who want to and there are some interns who don't want to.

O. What would the writing intern's focus be in this class? Would it be on writing?

A. Well, it's almost exclusively writing.

humanity core sequences in the fall. I have all of

1 Now, it isn't exclusively writing. This gets to be 2 a complicated question and again varies from

3 section to section and course to course. There are

4 some courses where the writing interns are very 5 much not experienced in the substantive material of

the course. There are other sections where they 6 7 are very experienced in that substantive --

8 substance and material. 9

And there are some faculty who want the writing interns to say nothing except writing issues. There are other faculty who encourage interns to dig into more substantive aspects of student writing.

Q. Would you expect all of the writing interns to comment or critique student papers?

A. Yes.

Q. How does -- in what way, sir? How does that work?

A. Well, so take a typical, if there is such a thing, a typical humanities section. For one quarter the students might write three or four papers. So you have 18 or 19 students in the section. Faculty member might say to an intern, on the first paper I'll comment on half the paper, you comment on half the papers. And then the second

Page 1558

explain that. A. It's important to us that interns be able to provide their students, the undergraduate students, with materials to help their learning. But we also are encouraging the interns to make these materials their own. We want them to put them in their own words, finding their own examples that work for them. But whether or not they would use those materials also again goes back to the instructor. And the instructor can say, I'm not interesting in what the writing program does. I want you to work on other aspects of writing in which case the interns will often come back to us,

Q. And how does that work? Maybe we should

Q. Okay. So for, let's say, I'm a writing intern and I get over my little first hurdle which

and we'll try to help them develop other materials

to serve that particular instructor.

39 (Pages 1557 to 1560)

Page 1560

Page 1563 Page 1561 1 paper they would swap those papers. 1 Q. Okay. Is it possible to earn all of a 2 Other faculty prefer the writing interns 2 student's required GAI points through being a 3 to comment on writing aspects of all of the papers, 3 writing intern? 4 and the faculty member comes along and comments on, 4 A. I don't know. I don't know. 5 the faculty member would say, substantive aspects 5 Q. Okay. To your knowledge do writing 6 6 of the paper. interns ever work beyond their GAI points? 7 7 Q. Would you expect the writing interns to A. Oh, yes. 8 produce provisional comments or provisional grades 8 Q. How frequent is that? 9 in this process? 9 A. I would, off the top of my head, I would 10 A. Typically, especially at the beginning, 10 say maybe 5 to 10 percent of them do that. 11 the interns should be providing on any paper that 11 Q. And if I'm a writing intern who has taught 12 they're commenting on, the instructors typically 12 before, do I get preference in the next year's 13 want them to be suggesting a grade to the 13 selection as a writing intern? How does that work? instructor. So writing intern says, I think it's a 14 14 A. Well, in the past, at least in the past 15 B-plus, I think it's an A-minus. Some instructors 15 10 or 15 years, there hasn't been an issue of 16 are very confident in the interns and they say, you 16 preference because we've had more sections to fill 17 don't need to -- you don't need to pass this by me, 17 than we've had interns to fill them. So that 18 just go ahead and give the grade. But it is 18 really hasn't been an issue. 19 ultimately the instructor's responsibility to take 19 Q. You're happy to have more? 20 responsibility for those grades. 20 A. Oh, we are so happy. 21 Q. Faculty is responsible for grading, right? 21 Q. What's a writing tutor? Let's change 22 22 subjects. What's a writing tutor? 23 23 Q. How many quarters would an intern be A. A writing tutor is someone who works on a 24 expected to serve? 24 drop-in basis with a student from humanities core 25 A. Well, we'd like them to teach for a year. 25 or other course, I believe, who wants help with a Page 1562 Page 1564 Now, that's often just two quarters, an autumn 1 particular paper. And they just arrive at our 1 2 location and sign up and work with that tutor. 2 quarter and winter quarter, because the third 3 3 Q. Students are the ones dropping in? quarter there are fewer sections and there's a much A. Students are the ones dropping in. 4 less demand for interns. But if an intern -- if an 4 5 5 intern starts with us and then gets a fellowship Q. Not the tutors? 6 A. Not the tutors. 6 offer or something so they can't teach in a 7 7 quarter, that's certainly fine. MR. FASMAN: Let me mark 59. 8 8 Q. Okay. Do interns receive GAI points for (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 9 their service? 9 No. 59 was marked for 10 10 A. Most of them do. identification.) 11 11 Q. Okay. Do interns ever repeat; that is, BY MR. FASMAN: 12 work for more than a year? 12 Q. Let me show you what's now been marked as 13 13 Employer Exhibit 59 for identification and ask you A. Yes indeed. 14 if you know what that is, sir. 14 Q. How frequent is that? A. Oh, I would guess a quarter or a third. A 15 A. Yes. I believe it's the description of 15 16 the tutoring position from our website. 16 third I would think teach for more than one year. 17 17 Q. And you're familiar with this, sir? Q. Okay. And that's out of a total number of 18 A. Yes. 18 how many, 90? 19 A. Well, there are 90 sections, but in any 19 MR. FASMAN: And I will note that the URL at 20 20 the bottom left page is where we took it from, and given year there would be 50 or 60 interns. And 21 21 I'm not even -- it varies year to year because some I would move for its admission. 22 MS. AUERBACH: No objection. 22 interns are teaching more than one section, and 23 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 59 is again there are many people teaching these sections 24 24 working as interns who are not graduate students at received. 25 MR. FASMAN: Thank you. 25 all.

40 (Pages 1561 to 1564)

Page 1567 Page 1565 1 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 1 A. Well, it's generally seen as that the 2 2 No. 59 was received into progression is -- and I'm not sure that we're right 3 evidence.) 3 in this, but it's generally seeing that it's easier 4 4 to be a tutor in the sense of working with somebody BY MR. FASMAN: 5 5 one on one than managing a writing workshop. I'm Q. Let me ask you some of the same questions 6 that I've already asked you about the writing 6 not sure that's right, but that's again the 7 7 culture. So people tend to, once they're interns, 8 8 they tend to stay as interns or lectors in the A. Uh-huh. 9 9 Q. What's the process for my being appointed writing course. 10 10 writing tutor? Q. Okay. How many quarters would I be 11 11 A. The application process is similar, expected to work as a writing tutor? 12 12 background information about you, a sample of A. I think we would like people to do three 13 writing and commenting on a sample student paper 13 quarters or one academic year. 14 14 and an interview. Q. And does that happen? 15 15 Q. And when you interview the applicant, not A. Yes. Although, again, there's -- autumn 16 you, when the writing program interviews the 16 and winter tend to be more heavily needed. And so 17 applicant, what's looked for? 17 sometimes people might work two quarters and not 18 18 A. We're very eager to look at their ability with the third quarter. 19 19 to communicate, in this case communicate quickly Q. Okay. Let's talk about another program 20 20 with the best aim in the university. What's the with students because the drop in -- the drop in 21 tutor -- student is dropping in. The tutor has to 21 Little Red Schoolhouse? 22 22 respond quite quickly, looking for their interest A. Little Red Schoolhouse is the advanced 23 in working with undergraduates, working -- looking 23 writing course that we teach to graduate students 2.4 for their interest in writing and the teaching of 24 and to undergraduates. It's a one-quarter course, 25 writing. 25 ten weeks, requires eight writing assignments Page 1566 Page 1568 1 Q. Okay. And I take it there are no 1 during the course. And it is really in the center 2 2 particular substantive fields here either? of our expertise, our focus on expert writing. 3 3 A. No. Again, we're eager to get a wide Q. How long has this course been in 4 range of students. 4 existence? 5 Q. And what course or courses, if any, do I 5 A. I believe the first time it was taught was 6 6 have to take to become a writing tutor? in 1980, so it's been around about almost 40 years. 7 7 A. The training -- there's also the training Q. Have you taught it? 8 process for tutors which is some of the same 8 A. Many times. 9 9 materials, some of the same sessions as for the Q. What department is it in? 10 writing intern, but also some different pedagogy 10 A. It's offered primarily through the English 11 because the pedagogies are different working with 11 department, although, for some years it was offered 12 someone individually as working with a workshop. 12 through business school. 13 13 Q. Can you give us just a general example of Q. Okay. You say you've taught it. Who 14 14 that for the record, sir? else, if anyone, teaches it? A. Well, so rather than having the tutors 15 15 A. My colleagues Kathy Cochrane and Tracy 16 work with workshops and imagining, helping them 16 Whiner and I are the lecturers for it. But then it 17 17 participate in workshops, advancing their skills at is -- it's taught primarily by the lectors, the 18 18 managing a conversation, much more of an issue of graduate student lectors who are running the 19 one on one if a student comes in, imagining a 19 workshops. 20 20 student paper, working with a tutor to look at it Q. What's the focus of the course? 21 21 and say, the student needs this kind of help, how A. The course is on this process of 22 22 do I provide that help for them. converting a text that a writer has created to 23 23 Q. Do you select from prior writing interns? develop her own thinking and to make it a text 24 24 A. That can happen, but it's not common. that's effective for her professional readers. So 25 25 Q. Why not? it's about, we say, it's called a writing course,

Page 1571 Page 1569 1 two. All right. My own confusion. 1 but much of it is actually about reading. It's 2 2 MR. FASMAN: Give me just a minute, please. about trying to train writers to predict how 3 readers are going to process their work so they can 3 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Sure. 4 get the results from those readers that they want. 4 MR. FASMAN: I think I've got these backwards, 5 Q. Is there a limitation on the types of 5 but let's put this in anyhow. б 6 people, types of students who can take this course? (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 7 7 No. 61 was marked for A. Graduate students -- I believe any 8 graduate student in the university can take it. 8 identification.) 9 Undergraduates, only third and fourth years can 9 MR. FASMAN: This is Employer 61. 10 10 take it. BY MR. FASMAN: 11 11 Q. Tells us what that is, sir. MR. FASMAN: Okay. Let me show you a document 12 12 that I've marked as Employer Exhibit 60. A. Yes. This is a description of the lector 13 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 13 position, and the lectors are the graduate students 14 No. 60 was marked for 14 and others who teach in the academic and 15 identification.) 15 professional writing course. 16 16 BY MR. FASMAN: MR. FASMAN: Okay. I move for the admission of 17 Q. You may have two of them there, but what 17 Employer's Exhibit 60, please. 61, sorry. 18 18 MS. AUERBACH: I note that it's the same as is this, sir? 19 19 A. The description -- it looks to be the Petitioner Exhibit 59, but I have no objection. 20 description of the school house course from our 20 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer's Exhibit 61 is 21 website. 21 received. 22 22 MR. FASMAN: And indeed the URL shows where (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 23 23 this was taken, and I move for its admission. No. 61 was received into 24 24 MS. AUERBACH: No objection. evidence.) 25 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 60 is 25 Page 1570 Page 1572 received. 1 BY MR. FASMAN: 1 2 2 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit Q. So now let me direct your attention to the 3 3 No. 60 was received into bottom of the last paragraph of 61, sir? 4 evidence.) 4 5 MR. FASMAN: Just because I'm getting 5 Q. And ask you this one -- this one actually 6 forgetful, we moved the other two, 58 and 59 into 6 does say additional teaching opportunities for 7 7 evidence? lectors? 8 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Uh-huh. A. Yeah. 9 MR. FASMAN: Thank you. 9 Q. Are there lectors for undergraduate and 10 BY MR. FASMAN: 10 graduate sections of this course? 11 Q. Now, let me ask you, sir, if, speaking 11 A. Yes. 12 generally, this is an accurate picture of what 12 Q. How does that work? 13 13 lectors in the Little Red Schoolhouse do? A. Well, typically, when a lector is new, A. It is accurate. 14 14 teaching in the schoolhouse, they will teach 15 15 Q. So I note in the last paragraph on the undergraduate sections. Once they have done that 16 bottom of the first page which starts out, 16 successfully, we would love to have them teach 17 17 additional teaching opportunities for lectors, do graduate students. So then it becomes graduate 18 18 you see that, sir? students teaching graduate students. 19 A. No. The last --19 Q. And this is -- the undergraduates would be 20 20 Q. Last paragraph, Page 1? third and fourth year undergraduates? 21 A. Paragraph begins but when your draft comes 21 A. That's correct. 22 22 back -- no. Q. Senior level? 23 23 Q. No. I may be looking at something A. Yes. 24 different. Oh, sorry, sorry. We're getting ahead 24 Q. Okay. So same question about becoming a of ourselves here. I think I may have given you 25 25 lector, how do I become a lector? What's the

42 (Pages 1569 to 1572)

Page 1573 Page 1575 1 1 process? are led by are lectors. So we do the lectures. We 2 2 A. Same process, the application process do the easy part. We do the explaining concepts 3 requires background information, a writing sample, 3 and we hope motivating students to take this 4 4 commenting on a sample student paper and interview. seriously. 5 Q. Okay. And is it also true that you are 5 The students will then write a paper after 6 6 looking for people interested in the pedagogy of every lecture, so they're writing eight papers 7 7 writing? during the quarter. They're submitting those 8 8 papers to their seminar group by -- typically by A. Yes, indeed. And people who are 9 interested in working with writers. 9 Monday night, and then on Tuesday they're come in a 10 Q. Does the -- in becoming a lector, does the 10 writing workshop led by the lectors where the real 11 program sometimes select individuals with prior 11 learning in the courses happens. Q. And does the lector critique the paper? 12 experience in other writing program activities? 12 13 A. Certainly. 13 A. Yes. The lector will first prepare the 14 Q. Why? 14 papers the night before the seminar to be able to 15 15 run that writing seminar and then give written A. Well, if you mean experience within our program -- and actually I think that, I'm not sure 16 16 comments on each paper. 17 of this, but I think if a graduate student has 17 Q. And is there a discussion in the -- in 18 18 already taught, for example, as an intern, we don't this in the workshop? 19 19 A. Yeah. The discussion is -- it's more a go through the application process for them to 20 become a lector. We already know what they can do. 20 matter of practicing the analytics. It's not a 21 But if you mean experience in teaching in other 21 discussion of an exchange of ideas about the paper. 22 22 kinds of writing programs, we're certainly The students aren't reading each others papers and 23 23 interested in that as well. saying I disagree or agree with the argument here. 2.4 Q. So, let's say, I'm qualified. I pass 24 What they're doing is we've given them in each 25 throughout interviews. Is there any training that 25 lecture a particular diagnostic or analytic to Page 1574 Page 1576 1 I have to take? 1 apply to the writing, and the students are applying 2 2 A. The same training, the same quarter-long that analytic. And lector's there to help them to 3 3 course. It's -- I shouldn't say it's exactly the make sure they're using that the analytic usefully. 4 same because the schoolhouse is a different 4 Q. I apologize if I didn't ask you this, but 5 5 teaching -- teaching responsibilities in the to the lectors have to attend the lectures? 6 schoolhouse is different from teaching in the 6 A. Well, the first time they teach, we 7 7 humanities core, but we also -- we will do the same certainly want them to attend the lectures. But 8 8 training in the principles of diagnostic, I would after they've taught it once, they don't because 9 say, the analytics of our program, and then 9 the lectures are -- tend to be repetitive in 10 10 pedagogical techniques for commenting on paper and previous quarters. 11 pedagogical techniques for running writing 11 Q. How about as a first time lector, would 12 workshops. 12 you expect me to have interaction with the writing 13 13 Q. So what -- tell me what I do as a lector. program staff in my performance? 14 14 If you and I were ever sitting down and saying, A. Typically. What we typically do is 15 15 Mr. McEnerney, what -- if I become a lector, what physical someone is lectoring for the first time, 16 am I going to be doing next semester in this 16 they will submit their comments to their students 17 17 course? to the writing program staff, and it would

43 (Pages 1573 to 1576)

typically be Ashley or Meg who would be looking at

those comments and making sure that they're using

our analytics the way we hope we believe are useful

Q. Okay. And there would be feedback from

for students. And they might also observe one of

the workshops during the quarter.

the observation?

A. Yes.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. Sure. What lectors do is, I would say,

The way the course is organized, the first week

meet on Tuesdays and Thursdays. But after the

sessions in the course are writing workshops which

the bulk of the teaching in the writing course.

there are lectures in both of the sessions. We

first, week one session each week is a writing

workshop. So after the first week, half of the

Page 1577 Page 1579 Q. Okay. Do lectors work more than one 1 1 consultant? 2 2 A. A graduate writing consultant is a -- it's quarter? 3 A. We hope so. They can act -- they can work 3 not really like a writing tutor, but it's closer to 4 4 in multiple quarters and, say, we encourage them a writing tutor than to a lector or an intern 5 from going from teaching undergrads to teaching 5 because a consultant is working individually with a 6 6 graduate students. graduate student, helping them prepare sometimes 7 7 Q. How many -- strike that. course papers, but very often grant proposals, 8 Is the Little Red Schoolhouse course 8 conference papers or even articles for publication. 9 9 Q. And how do they -- how do they typically taught on a pass/fail or grade basis? 10 A. It's optional. It's up to most students, 10 do that? 11 11 not every student has the choice; but most students A. Well, it's a -- it requires -- it 12 12 can choose to take it either for a quality grade or certainly requires more advanced understanding of, 13 for a pass/fail depending on what the student's own 13 I would call it, the function of this writing. So 14 14 goals are for the course and the program they're in a writing -- a graduate writing consultant needs to 15 15 might have restrictions on that. understand the difference between the job of a 16 Q. Meaning what, there might be a school that 16 piece of writing inside the class and the job for a 17 says you need to take this --17 professional audience. 18 18 A. A school or department or degree program These are mostly texts that the graduate 19 19 might say you have to have a certain -- you can students are needing to demonstrate as -- to 20 20 only have a certain number of courses with execute as part of their profession, and the 21 pass/fail or they might say specifically our course 21 graduate writing consultants are there to help them 22 22 you have to take for a letter grade versus a execute that successfully. There -- this is 23 becoming similar to some of the work that we do 23 pass/fail. Students are coming to the schoolhouse 24 24 with faculty. for many programs and departments across the 25 university, and they have different rules. 25 Q. So this is, for example, writing for a Page 1578 Page 1580 1 Q. Okay. Let me ask you finally to take a 1 medical journal --2 look at one other document. 2 A. Yes. 3 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 3 O. -- or a low review article? 4 No. 62 was marked for 4 A. Yes. 5 identification.) 5 Q. Would they have to know how those 6 BY MR. FASMAN: 6 documents are written? 7 Q. This is a document I've marked for 7 A. Well, yes. They have to know and again 8 identification as Employer Exhibit Number 62. I'm 8 written for us is very important because typically 9 wondering if you can identify that for us? 9 the early drafts of a text like this is the writer 10 A. Yes. The description of the graduate 10 working out her own thinking. So they have to writing consultants or consultations. This, I 11 11 understand the way the writer is using language to 12 believe, is addressed to people who would not 12 help herself think. And one of our specialties is 13 13 become consultants, but who would seek their help. when experts are using writing to help themselves 14 14 MR. FASMAN: I see. And I will represent that think, they use in particular patterns. The 15 this is from the University of Chicago's website patterns are different from the way people read. 15 16 taken at the time of the URL on the lower left 16 And so being able to take something that 17 corner, and I move for its introduction. 17 you've written for your own thinking and adapt it 18 MS. AUERBACH: No objection. 18 for your readers is what the graduate writing 19 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Employer Exhibit 62 is 19 consultants are doing. They need to understand the 20 20 received. writing process. They need to understand the 21 21 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit reading process, and they need to be able to adapt 22 No. 62 was received into 22 to different professional fields.

44 (Pages 1577 to 1580)

Q. How do you get that background?

Q. Is there a training requirement for a

A. I hope that that's what he we do.

23

24

25

23

24

25

evidence.)

Q. Mr. McEnerney, what is a graduate writing

BY MR. FASMAN:

Page 1581 Page 1583 1 writing consultant? 1 roles in many different kinds of fields. 2 2 A. There's not -- there's not a separate MR. FASMAN: I have no further questions on 3 training requirement. The writing consultants are, 3 direct examination. 4 as far as I know in every case, people -- graduate 4 MS. AUERBACH: Could we have a break? 5 students who have done -- have extensive experience 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Sure. Off the record. б 6 teaching in the writing program. (WHEREUPON, a short recess was 7 7 Q. Okay. How many of them typically are taken.) 8 there? 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. 9 A. I don't know. I don't know. 9 Petitioner can proceed with its questions 10 Q. Would you say that successful writing 10 for the witness. 11 consultants are interested in the pedagogy of 11 **CROSS-EXAMINATION** 12 12 BY MS. AUERBACH: writing? 13 A. Yes. I would be confident that they are. 13 Q. You said that not all of the writing 14 14 interns are graduate students. Is it true that Q. Indeed for all of these positions; is that 15 15 some of the interns already have their Ph.D.'s, but right? 16 A. Yes, yes. 16 worked previously in the writing program? 17 Q. They're all interested in pedagogy of 17 A. Yes. 18 18 writing? Q. So do you know approximately out of the 19 19 A. There's -- when they -- when graduate 90 interns you need in the fall quarter, about how 20 students get into this program, we certainly count 20 many of those are graduate students? 21 on them being interested in the pedagogies of 21 A. Well, first of all, it's 90 sections, but 22 22 writing. And for 40 years we've seen it over and there's probably only about 65 or 70 people who are 23 23 over and over again. teaching those 90 sections. Q. These are -- all of these positions we've 24 24 Q. So 65 interns in the fall? 25 talked about are voluntary positions, aren't they? 25 A. Well, but then, yes, 65 interns. But how Page 1582 Page 1584 1 A. I'm not sure what you mean by voluntary. 1 many of them are graduate students off the top of 2 my head, I would say 50 perhaps. 2 Q. Well, I don't have to become a writing 3 3 Q. And then the others are -- other than intern or a lector? 4 A. No. That's correct. 4 people who already have their Ph.D.s, are there 5 5 Q. You have to apply for that? other people who work as interns? A. Yes. 6 A. Yes. For example, there are three people 6 7 7 Q. So people apply for that voluntarily? who work in the master's of arts program in the 8 8 A. Yes. humanities. They're called MAPH mentors, and each 9 9 of them has two sections. They work -- part of Q. And they're not required to stay in that 10 program for any given period of time? 10 their job is to be writing interns and another is 11 to work for the math program. But there's also 11 12 Q. Any of these programs? 12 people who both with Ph.D.'s and without, for 13 13 example, me. I don't have one, and I was teaching A. No. 14 14 Q. It's all voluntary? last fall. I was teaching three of them myself. 15 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So when you say MAPH, A. Yes. 16 16 Q. Do individuals who become writing interns, that's M-A-P-H. 17 17 consultants, lectors, do they have any career path THE WITNESS: M-A-P-H, I'm sorry. Yes. 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. 18 that you've ever noticed? 19 A. We -- Chicago doesn't have a program of 19 BY MS. AUERBACH: 20 20 Q. And do all of the interns fulfill explicitly training people to be writing teachers. 21 21 essentially the same responsibilities whether We don't have -- we don't have that goal, but it's 22 22 they're Ph.D. students or one of the other certainly been the case that many people who have 23 23 categories of people you talked about? come up through the program have gone on either to 24 24 be explicitly writing teachers or to include A. Yes. 25 25 Q. And you said that it's complicated getting writing pedagogy as part of their professional

45 (Pages 1581 to 1584)

Page 1585 Page 1587 1 interns in to 90 sections. Why is it complicated? 1 finished their GAI points? 2 2 A. Well, first of all, there are 90 sections A. I have not. I don't know. 3 and only 60 or 65 interns. So simply having people 3 Q. Do you have any involvement in determining 4 4 the GAI -- whether the intern fulfills the GAI doing multiple sections is scheduling, it's 5 scheduling complicated. But there are also 5 points or not? 6 6 complications because some instructs do want an A. No. 7 7 intern who has some experience with the readings in O. And do all the interns have the same 8 that field. Other instructors don't. Then we have 8 responsibility regardless of whether they're 9 9 getting GAI points or not, for example? issues of interns who don't want to work with 10 10 particular faculty members and so the complication A. Yes. 11 11 is trying to get that whole jigsaw puzzle to fit Q. If a writing tutor has previously served 12 12 together. as a writing tutor and therefore taken the quarter 13 Q. So since you have 65 interns and 13 training course, that person does not need to 14 14 90 sections, does that mean some of the interns are retake the course to get lector, right? 15 15 placed in more than one section? A. I believe that's correct. I'm sorry. 16 A. Yes. 16 Here were three titles there, and, I'm sorry, the 17 Q. So all 90 sections have an intern 17 intern, the lector and tutors. 18 18 assigned? Q. I was just talking about the intern and 19 19 A. Yes. lector? 20 Q. And so the seven courses in the humanities 20 A. So the intern and lectors, yes, they do 21 core are always taught with a writing intern 21 not retake the training program. 22 22 assigned to each section? Q. And some people who have served as interns 23 23 A. That's correct. go on to then serve as lectors? 2.4 24 Q. Do you know what percentage of the Ph.D. A. Yes. 25 students who are writing interns receive GAI points 25 Q. But some people become lectors without Page 1586 Page 1588 1 for their service? 1 having been interns? 2 2 A. I'm afraid I don't, no. A. Yes. 3 3 Q. And you talked about the program staff Q. And do you know each year approximately 4 how many Ph.D. students intern in the fall and 4 reviewing the lectors' comments on student writing. 5 winter but not in the spring quarter? 5 That happens the first couple weeks of the quarter, 6 6 A. No. I don't. not the entire quarter, correct? 7 7 Q. Are there some who intern in the fall and A. It can happen throughout the quarter. 8 the winter but do not intern in the spring? 8 Especially if the -- if the staff thinks it would 9 9 be useful to do that. A. Yes. The students -- the first year 10 10 undergraduates are not required to take a third Q. But it doesn't always happen throughout 11 quarter of the humanities core. So there are --11 the quarter? 12 there are many of the sections basically shut down 12 A. No, it does not always happen. 13 13 in the spring. And so there are many, many --Q. And lectors are not always observed by 14 14 there are some interns who will work autumn and members of the writing program staff? 15 winner but not spring. 15 A. They certainly -- if by -- if you mean is 16 Q. And that happens every year? 16 every lector observed or do you mean is every 17 17 A. Yes. lector observed in every session? 18 18 O. Well, let's start is every lector Q. And are the same -- are there typically 19 the same amount of interns in the fall and winter 19 observed? 20 20 A. I'm quite sure we try to make sure that quarters? 21 21 A. Typically very close. Might be a two or everyone is observed. three difference. 22 22 Q. And how frequently is that? 23 Q. And do you know -- have you done 23 A. Once or twice a quarter. 24 24 calculations as to what percentage of Ph.D. Q. How much are the interns paid? 25 A. I think interns are paid either 3,000 or I 25 students serve as interns after they've already

46 (Pages 1585 to 1588)

Page 1589 Page 1591 want to say possibly 3,600. I think there are 1 1 the program the student's coming from. So for 2 actually different rates. 2 those students, I guess, you know, for both the 3 Q. That's for the quarter? 3 pass/fail students and the letter grade students, 4 A. For the quarter. 4 do the writing lectors ever grade assignments that 5 Q. And how much are lectors paid? 5 would be used in determining the final grade for 6 6 A. I think it's the same. this unit? Does that make sense? 7 7 Q. The interns and lectors prepare their own A. No. I'm not sure. So the lectors are 8 lesson materials? 8 grading the students' weekly assignments. 9 A. Yes. 9 Q. And are those grades then used to 10 MS. AUERBACH: Can you show him Petitioner 10 determine the final grade --11 11 Exhibit 60? A. Yes. 12 (WHEREUPON, Petitioner Exhibit 12 Q. -- that is submitted to the registrar? 13 No. 60 was introduced.) 13 A. Oh, yes. 14 THE WITNESS: Is this part of it? 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: That's all of my 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Oh, I think I gave you 15 auestions. 16 16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 17 BY MS. AUERBACH: 17 BY MR. FASMAN: 18 18 Q. Is that the job application packet from Q. Two more questions, Mr. McEnerney, we --19 the university's website for the writing program? 19 about grades. The lectors are not the final 20 A. Yes, I think so. 20 arbiters of the grade? 21 MS. AUERBACH: I move to introduce Petitioner's 21 A. No. The grades are the responsibility for 22 22 Exhibit 60. the Little Red Schoolhouse, the three of us who are 23 23 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner's Exhibit 60 the instructors for the course. 24 is received. 24 Q. What happens if there's a difference of 25 25 opinion about the paper I do. Lector says one, you Page 1590 Page 1592 1 (WHEREUPON, Petitioner Exhibit 1 say something else. How is that worked out or is No. 60 was received into 2 it worked out? 2 3 3 evidence.) A. Well, I mean, the student has to get a 4 MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have. 4 grade. So the process is the process that a 5 5 **EXAMINATION** student would have if they were appealing a grade BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS: which I'm afraid is fairly hierarchical, and the 6 6 7 7 Q. I just want to make sure I understand. instructor would make the decision. 8 8 This could be confusion on my part, so I apologize Q. Okay. I didn't understand one of your 9 in advance. 9 answers. Isn't it true that all interns receive 10 10 So for the writing lectors for the Little GAI points? I mean, there's no top limit on GAI 11 Red Schoolhouse course, when they are a lector for 11 points, right? 12 one of those courses, would they be the instructor 12 A. I don't know. I mean --13 13 of record? Q. When somebody acts as a writing intern --14 14 A. No. A. Uh-huh. 15 15 Q. Okay. So they would be working with Q. -- even if they're past the five GAI 16 essentially a faculty member who would be the points, there's no limit on that. That is, they 16 can just tote them up. They're more? 17 instructor of record or someone from the writing 17 18 18 program? A. Well, for example, when I worked as an 19 A. For the Little Red Schoolhouse course, for 19 intern, I didn't get GAI points. So someone who's 20 20 a MAPH mentor, they wouldn't get those points. I the English course, the instructor of record is me 21 21 and my colleagues, Kathy Cochrane and Tracy Whiner. don't actually know how it would work for someone 22 We are the instructors of record. 22 who is still a graduate student. 23 O. Thank you. 23 Q. Yeah. I guess I was asking you -- you 24 24 So I know you said that that course can be were unsure about whether grad students receive GAI 25 either pass/fail or a letter grade, depending on 25 points for their service as a writing intern. My

47 (Pages 1589 to 1592)

Page 1593 Page 1595 1 MR. PORZIO: Yeah, all the mechanics, date, 1 only point was they continue to get them beyond the 2 2 GAI points; that is, you could have five or six or time. 3 3 nine or whatever you have? HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes. So if the Employer A. I don't know that. 4 4 would like to state its position for the record. Q. Okay. That's fine. I won't ask any 5 5 MR. PORZIO: Sure. Thank you. 6 6 I'd like to start with the mechanics of further? 7 MR. FASMAN: I have no further questions. 7 the election in terms of how it's to be conducted. 8 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner, any further The university's goal regarding an election if one 9 questions? 9 were to be directed in this case is to provide 10 10 MS. AUERBACH: No. eligible graduate students with the greatest 11 11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: All right. You are opportunity to cast a ballot on this very 12 12 significant issue of unionization. It's for this excused. Thank you. 13 (Witness excused.) 13 reason that the university strenuously opposes the 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record. 14 Union's proposal to conduct this selection if one 15 15 (WHEREUPON, a short recess was is to occur by mail ballot. 16 16 For the reasons I'll elaborate on in a 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. 17 moment, a mailed ballot election should not be 18 18 So it's my understanding that the Employer ordered in this case since doing so would, one be 19 19 has concluded with the testimony it wishes to enter contrary to board law and procedure; two, 20 into the record with regards to the witnesses. So 20 disenfranchise voters; and, three, unnecessarily 21 before we move on, it's my understanding Employer 21 increase the chance for voter irregularities such 22 22 is going to move to enter a final exhibit into the as voter fraud or voter intimidation. 23 23 record: is that correct? Madame Hearing Officer, as you know, the 24 24 MR. PORZIO: That's correct, two exhibits to be board has a strong preference for manual ballot 25 25 exact, Employer Exhibit 15 and 15A. We move to elections. Indeed, Section 11301.2 of the National Page 1594 Page 1596 have those received in evidence. 1 1 Labor Relations Board Case Handling Manual for our 2 2 MS. AUERBACH: So the Union objects to the cases states that, "the board's longstanding policy 3 3 portion of 15, Employer's 15 and 15A with respect is that representation elections should be as a 4 to school social service administration because 4 general rule be conducted manually." 5 5 there has been no testimony put on to corroborate Similarly, other NLRB decisions also apply 6 the veracity of the information in those exhibits 6 presumption in favor of manual ballot elections. 7 pertaining to that school. 7 See Nuvo Elevator Industries, 8 8 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So the objection Case Site 326 NLRB 470, and Pin Site 470 and 471. 9 is noted. Employer's Exhibit 15 and 15A are 9 And there, "under board precedent and policy, the 10 received into evidence and will be given the 10 applicable presumption favors a manual not mail appropriate weight at the time of the decision with ballot election." 11 11 12 regards to the extent that the information 12 In fact, conducting an election by mail 13 contained within has been authenticated. 13 ballot is a rare exception. In Section 22-110 of 14 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 14 the NLRB's outline of law and procedure in 15 Nos. 15 and 15A were received 15 representation cases states that the mail ballot 16 into evidence.) 16 election -- mail ballots are to be utilized only in 17 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Before we move on to the 17 "unusual circumstances." 18 cross-examination for the witness that we began on 18 So even with regard to the relatively 19 Friday afternoon, it's my understanding that the 19 recent phenomena of graduate student organization 20 Employer wishes to state for the record its 20 cases, we've conducted extensive research that 21 position concerning the appropriate eligibility 21 identify all such cases where an election was 22 formula to be used should the regional director set 22 ordered. We found 11 such cases; 8 of those 23 an election in this matter and the mechanics of the 23 resulted in elections being conducted by manual 24 election should an election be set in this matter: 24 ballot. Only 3 were conducted by mail ballot. 25 is that correct? 25

48 (Pages 1593 to 1596)

Page 1597 Page 1599 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 1 1 dated February 23, 2017, in 2 2 No. 63 was marked for Case Number 10-RC-187957. 3 3 identification.) So I'd like to move Employer 4 4 MR. PORZIO: So I'd like to show you what we've Exhibit Number 63 into evidence L. 5 marked Employer's Exhibit Number 63. So on this 5 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Petitioner could state 6 6 list, Madame Hearing Officer, you can see a list of its position for the record. 7 12 decisions in higher education universities where 7 MS. AUERBACH: Well, I mean --8 8 graduate students have filed a petition to MR. PORZIO: Just one note, I'm sorry, 9 organize. And you'll see a few things, one, the 9 Attorney Auerbach. George Washington University, I 10 name of the case. So, for example, number one, New 10 neglected to mention that while it's not for 11 York University, you'll see next to that the NLRB 11 graduate students, per se, it's for resident 12 12 case number, that case, and then in small Roman advisors. MR. SALVATORE: Resident hall advisors, dorm 13 numeral or small letter A, you'll see the election 13 14 procedure. And it'll say either manual ballot or 14 advisors. 15 mail ballot. And then, B, you'll see a link to 15 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. 16 either the notice of election and/or decision and 16 MS. AUERBACH: I mean, I don't know if it's 17 direction of election applicable to that case. 17 appropriate. I have no objection to it being 18 Some of them -- some of these cases, for example, 18 admitted as the Employer's argument essentially. 19 19 I'm not stipulating that what's on here is true, Harvard was -- the election was conducted pursuant 20 to a stipulated election agreement so there was no 20 but to the extent they want to introduce it for 21 DD&E. 21 their argument. I don't know if it's appropriately 22 22 And as you can see, only three cases were an exhibit. 23 23 decided. The elections were conducted by mail-in HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yeah. So that's, I 24 24 ballot. Of particular note, Number 12, Boston mean --25 College which is the most recent decision, the 25 MR. PORZIO: So I'm prepared to introduce -- I Page 1598 Page 1600 have with me the DD&E's from each of these 12 cases 1 direction of election issue that came out on May 17 2 2 or the notice of election for those that there earlier this month, and the regional director for 3 wasn't a DD&E. I didn't want to have the record 3 Region 1 stated, "the election will be held in a bogged down with documents, 90 percent of which are 4 manner and on a date, time and place to be 4 5 5 determined." irrelevant to this case. So this is really a 6 6 summary of those documents. And, importantly, in a footnote the RD 7 7 stated, "the spring semester at Boston College has So rather than introduce 12 separate 8 8 now ended and the Employer stated at the hearing DD&E's, I thought this would be -- I made sure that 9 that students may leave campus for the summer." 9 I limited -- was careful in the wording, wanted to 10 10 be completely factual, so I thought this was a good And we believe a reasonable interpretation of this 11 way to do that as opposed to introducing all 12. 11 portion of the DD&E, the regional director did not 12 want to direct an election over the summer for fear 12 MS. AUERBACH: I think all I was saying was I'm 13 13 not objecting to the Employer submitting a written of disenfranchising voters. 14 In fact, at Duke University which is one 14 document with case sites. I just don't know that 15 15 of the three case on this exhibit where a mail it should be an exhibit. 16 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yeah. So my thought is, Ballot was ordered, upon review of the RD's 17 17 you know, in the original ruling at the open of decision directing a mail ballot election, current chair of the NLRB, Phillip McNamara in dicta stated 18 these proceedings that we would permit evidence on 18 19 he believes, "substantial questions are raised 19 the eligibility formula but not with regards to the 20 20 regarding the appropriateness of the regional specific mechanics of the election, so mail versus 21 21 manual would fall under that umbrella. director's use of a mailed ballot election since a 22 22 board rule that favors manual elections, and the MR. PORZIO: Well, I believe the ruling was we 23 23 facts suggest that a manual election would have wouldn't be permitted to have live testimony, and 24 24 reasonably permitted participation by eligible this is not live testimony. This is really just voters. You can find that quote in NLRB order 25 summary argument. And Attorney Auerbach is

49 (Pages 1597 to 1600)

Page 1601 Page 1603 correct, you know, this is part of our argument 1 1 work schedule vary so significantly that they are 2 section. So I think it's entirely appropriate for 2 not present at that common location in common time; this to be an Employer exhibit. 3 3 and, finally, three, is there a strike, lock out or 4 4 MR. SALVATORE: We want it to be part of the picketing in progress. None of these three factors 5 record, however, so that it doesn't get lost in the 5 can be answered in the affirmative in this case. 6 6 First, eligible voters are not scattered 7 7 MS. AUERBACH: Right, but I think the typical based on job duties performed over a wide 8 8 ruling is that there won't be any evidence taken on geographic area. The graduate students here 9 mechanics. So that's why I'm saying is if it's a 9 satisfy their teaching and/or research requirements 10 10 written part of your argument, I think as on or very near to the university's campus in 11 Employer's argument, it's appropriate, but not as 11 Chicago, Illinois. 12 an exhibit. 12 Second, eligible voters are not scattered; 13 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. 13 i.e., where individuals are not present 14 14 MR. PORZIO: So we've done this in other cases contemporaneously at that common location. Here 15 where we've been told we cannot have live testimony 15 while graduate students may have slightly different 16 on this issue, but that we were permitted to 16 class schedule, they are all on similar academic 17 introduce documentary evidence in support of our 17 schedules and would all be available to participate 18 argument. And I think it's important in this case 18 in a manual ballot election if one was necessary 19 to help the reader of the record to understand our 19 and conduct it on the university's campus with 20 argument. 20 various polling periods on the polling day or days. 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: We'll go off the record 21 Third, clearly there is no strike, lockout 22 22 for a moment. or picketing in progress. Given that not even one 23 23 (WHEREUPON, a short recess was of the three prongs of San Diego Gas and Electric 24 24 taken.) is met in this case, a mailed ballot cannot be HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record. 25 25 squared with NLRB policies and procedures. Page 1602 Page 1604 1 So the Employer has moved for the 1 Notwithstanding, assuming arguendo this regional 2 2 admission of Employer's Exhibit 63. The Petitioner director find for students are, quote, scattered as 3 3 defined in San Diego Gas and Electric, a mailed has stated its position on the document. After 4 consultation with the regional director, it is true 4 ballot election should still not be. 5 5 that we said we would not permit testimony in the Section 11301.2 of the case handling 6 manner -- in the matter concerning the mechanics of 6 manual for representation cases instructs that if 7 7 the election, but the region will permit the any of the San Diego Gas and Electric factors is 8 8 document. So Employer Exhibit 63 is received. satisfied, the regional director should also 9 (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit 9 consider, one, the desires of the parties; two, the 10 10 No. 63 was marked for likely ability of voters to read and understand 11 identification.) 11 mailed ballots; and, three, the availability of 12 MR. PORZIO: Appreciate it. Thank you, Madame 12 addresses for employees. I am going to address 13 Hearing Officer. San Diego Gas and Electric cite 13 numbers one and three because I don't think there's 14 14 325 NLRB 1143 which is a 1998 case is a seminal any dispute as to the ability of graduate students 15 case for assessing the appropriateness of a mailed 15 to read and understand the ballots. 16 ballot election. There the board established the 16 First, the desires of the parties, here at 17 17 following three affective tests for regional the university as made and continues to make it 18 directors to consider if mail ballot election is 18 abundantly clear that if an election were directed, 19 appropriate. The three factors are answered in the 19 its strong preference is for a manual ballot 20 20 affirmative finding militates towards determining election. Second, the availability of addresses, 21 21 that a mail ballot election is appropriate. if the mailed ballot election is ordered during the 22 The three questions are as follows. Are 22 rapidly approaching summer break, the university 23 eligible voters both scattered because of their job 23 has serious doubts that the ballots would actually

50 (Pages 1601 to 1604)

be received by all eligible voters for three

primary reasons. One, that many of the addresses

24

25

24

25

duties over a wide geographic area; two, are

eligible voters scattered in the sense that their

Page 1605 Page 1607

on the university's systems are outdated; and, two, many students have multiple address on file without giving any indication as to which address the student actually resides.

Here the Union has asked for a mailed ballot election to be conducted between May 30 and June 20. Classes for the spring 2017 early quarter end tomorrow on May 31, literally one day before the Union proposes that the ballots be sent out. Scott Campbell, the university registrar for the university, provided us with an affidavit regarding his concerns with the contact information the university has for the petition for students as it relates to a mailed ballot.

(WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit No. 64 was marked for identification.)

MR. PORZIO: Madame Hearing Officer, I am showing you what's been marked Employer Exhibit 64. As described, this is an affidavit of Scott Campbell who as I mentioned is the registrar for the University of Chicago. As you can see, it's signed and dated. Let me go through some of the more important points in this.

First, Mr. Campbell notes in his affidavit

indication as to which address is the proper address used. The university would not know which addresses to provide to the NLRB in the event that a decision of direction of election was issued to ensure that the ballots are received by the students that are intended to receive them. Thus, if a mailed ballot election is ordered, the university would be left to guess which addresses to use for 96 percent of the petitioned-for unit.

To make matters worse, Mr. Campbell's affidavit also states in his experience, student addresses -- student address information that is two or more years old is unreliable given the frequency with which students move from place to place. As you can see in Exhibit A of Mr. Campbell's affidavit, more than 48 percent of the addresses the university has on file are more than two -- are two or more years old. So as you can see on Exhibit A on the column on the left, it says, students with physical addresses from 2015 or prior, that's 1,095 or 48.8 percent. Students with no physical address in the system meaning they just haven't provided one is 450 students or 20.05 percent. And students with no physical address on the system or an address from prior from

Page 1606

06 Page 1608

that many, many students after the close of the spring quarter, which is taking place in a few days, are, in effect, on summer vacation and leave for parts unknown until resumption of classes for the coming quarter which starts on September 25, 2017.

As you can see from Exhibit B on Mr. Campbell's affidavit which is attached, the overwhelming majority of the petition for students, in fact, about 96 percent of them, have multiple addresses on file. Some have as many as four addresses on file. So just so I can explain this chart very briefly which is Exhibit B on Employer Exhibit 64, on the left-hand column you'll see the number of addresses the university student information system has for the petitioned-for students, 80 students or 3.5.percent have one address. And for four addresses you'll see further down 48 students or 17.96 percent have four addresses. So where I give you that figure it's adding two addresses, three addresses and four addresses, you'll get to 2,163 or 96.39 percent of the petitioned-for bargaining unit.

Since there are multiple addresses on file for almost the entire petitioned-for unit and no

2015 or prior is 1,545 or 68.85 percent of the petitioned for unit. Taken as a whole, it's clear that there is a lack of accurate address information in this case to that prong as described in the manual.

Third, Mr. Campbell's affidavit makes it clear that the university rarely communicates with graduate students by U.S. mail. Instead Mr. Campbell indicated that the primary mode of communication between the university and the graduate students is e-mail. Thus, it's apparent that mailed ballot election would be problematic at any point during the academic year, but even more so over the summer recess when students leave the campus and Chicago area. Importantly, students are not required to provide the university with their summer contact information. As such, university -the university may not have knowledge of each student's whereabouts until their return to the campus on September 25 for start of the autumn quarter.

The result is that between quarters, it would be nearly impossible for the university to determine with any accuracy the proper address used. As such, it's highly likely that ballots

51 (Pages 1605 to 1608)

Page 1609

would be mailed for elections where students would not be present to receive them with the result that ballots would not be cast in a timely manner causing disenfranchisement. Undoubtedly, many students spend the summer doing research in the б field studying elsewhere, with family on vacation or traveling, given the considerable likelihood of that, there would not be a representative showing in the event of an over the summer mailed ballot election, directing one basically would not effectuate the purposes of the act.

2.4

In fact, we have reason to believe that international students which make up a significant portion of the petitioned-for unit would be disproportionately disenfranchised if a mailed ballot election were conducted in this case over the summer because a great number of these students leave the country for the summer to return to their home city or country. Even if the university has a good address for these individuals, between the time it takes for the ballot to be mailed by international mail, be received by the student at the address, filled out and returned by international mail, many students' ballots may not make it back in time to be counted.

2017 quarter quickly coming to an end, the university submits that any election that may be directed in this case be conducted appropriate time and appropriate date after September 25, the start of the autumn 2017 quarter and be done so by manual ballot.

Page 1611

The university's request to hold the election after September 25 is fully consistent with board decisions. See Tuscaloosa College site 199 NLRB 28, there the board moved the date of the election beginning of the fall semester to ensure that a representative complement to the petitioned-for faculty would have an opportunity to express their wishes.

And, therefore, we would argue for all the above-mentioned reasons that if an election were conducted in this case, it be conducted by manual ballot at a number of locations around the campus which we can discuss further with the Union and with the board over the course of one or two days after September 25, 2017, the start of the autumn quarter.

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Are you going to move for the admission of Employer 64?

MR. PORZIO: Yes. We hereby move Employer --

Page 1610

Page 1612

what's been marked for identification as Employer's

The general counsel's memo on representation cases which is GC Memo 15-06 sets forth general guidance for when regional directors should schedule elections. In the memo the general counsel says where there's choice, the regional director should avoid scheduling the election on dates which all or part of the facility will be closed in which past experience indicates that the rate of absenteeism will be high or on days that many persons will be away from the facility on company business or on vacation. Days immediately proceeding or following holidays should be -- should also be avoided as the rate of absenteeism is likely to be high.

Based on this reading, it's clear that general counsel wants to maximize voter turnout, and as indicated in my argument and in the affidavit that's Employer Exhibit 64, it would be clear that if a mailed ballot election would be ordered over the summer, that's exactly what would happen, and that would militate towards a finding that a manual ballot not over the summer would be appropriate.

Therefore, for the reasons discussed above in particularly at this late date with the spring

what's been marked for identification as Employer's Exhibit 64 into evidence.

MS. AUERBACH: I mean, I object for the same
 reasons previously, but there should be no evidence
 taken on the mechanics.

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So the Petitioner's objection is noted for the record. However, I am going to receive Employer Exhibit 64 in evidence.

(WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit No. 64 was received into evidence.)

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So I just want to state I ask the parties for their positions on more specifics concerning appropriate hours for a manual election as well as dates and locations. Whether we do that now or later, is fine, just as long as we get that into the record.

MR. WEITZMAN: We're prepared to put ours in now.

21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. You can proceed.

MR. PORZIO: So, Madame Hearing Officer, if you refer to. I forget the exhibit number now, I think

refer to, I forget the exhibit number now, I think
 it's Board Exhibit 3, which is Employer's statement

25 of position.

52 (Pages 1609 to 1612)

Page 1613 Page 1615 1 1 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You can proceed. sufficient number of students can return to campus. 2 2 MR. PORZIO: If you don't have it -- that's HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So then before we move 3 fine. 3 on to the eligibility, does the Employer have 4 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: You can proceed. anything further in regards to its position 5 MR. PORZIO: As indicated in the Employer's 5 regarding the mechanics of the election? 6 6 statement of position which was filed prior to the MR. PORZIO: It does not unless the Madame 7 start of this hearing, it gives some additional 7 Hearing Officer has any questions on our position, 8 8 detail in terms of the actual timing of the I'm happy to answer them. 9 election and the locations. So as you can see 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So should the regional 10 we're proposing a start time of 9:00 a.m. and going 10 director set an election in this matter and should 11 12 hours through 9:00 p.m. We do believe it can be 11 he decide that a manual election is appropriate, we 12 conducted in one day. And we would be amenable to 12 are dealing with a very -- potentially very large 13 discussing an hour break or so at some point in the 13 unit. So even with three locations operating 14 middle of the day to provide the board agents with 14 simultaneously, it is possible that there would be 15 a time to take a lunch break, but I think 11 to 15 a very high volume of individuals waiting to vote 16 12 hours would be sufficient to get people before 16 at a particular time. So given that, what is the 17 classes and/or after class. 17 Employer's position concerning the number of 18 18 observers that may be used in a manual election at HEARING OFFICER MOLS: At multiple locations. 19 19 a given location? MR. PORZIO: Yes, and I am about to get to 20 20 MR. PORZIO: So depending on how the board that. 21 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. wanted to conduct this, if they wanted to have two 22 22 MR. PORZIO: So the locations that the tables running concurrently within any one of the 23 23 university has identified are as follows. One three locations that we identified, our position 24 24 would be that an equal number of observers for each would be a location within Stuart Hall, and again 25 given that we don't know a date of the election, 25 side should be at each table. So if we have two Page 1614 Page 1616 1 it's difficult to give you an exact room number, 1 tables running within the room, one Union observer, 2 2 but a room within Stuart Hall, address 5835 South one university observer at each table with the 3 3 Greenwood Avenue. The second would be in the board agent. So if you got two, then two 4 Biological Sciences Learning Center, and that's on 4 university observers within that room. 5 5 924 East 57th Street, and, third, a room within HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. At each location. 6 6 Kent Chemical Laboratory, which is at 1020-24 East MR. PORZIO: At each location. And, like I 7 50th Street. 7 said, we're very amenable to discussing, you know, 8 8 And if the Union, if Union wanted to have how to make that work for the board and for the 9 the election conducted over two days, I -- by 9 Petitioner if that's the case. 10 10 MR. SALVATORE: And have made it work at other manual ballot, we would be certainly willing to 11 11 entertain that. And if they propose opening ballot 12 sooner and closing later, we similarly would be 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. I think that's 13 willing to discuss it as well. 13 all of my questions for the moment. I may have 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Does the Employer have 14 more --15 any position with regard to particular days of the 15 MR. PORZIO: That's fine. 16 16 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: -- once we continue. 17 17 MR. PORZIO: So it doesn't have -- it doesn't So with that you can proceed with your argument concerning eligibility formula. 18 as long as, you know, it's not on the holiday and 18 19 it's not during, you know, a reading period or 19 MR. PORZIO: Thank you. So as indicated in 20 20 Employer -- or Board Exhibit 3, our statement of something like that. Just to be clear, depending 21 21 on what happens, while the autumn term starts on position, we've maintained that the appropriate 22 22 September 25 which is a Monday, I think, you know, eligibility formula to use in this case is a 23 to make sure students may not have classes that 23 standard eligibility formula which the board 24 24 defines as those students who would be eligible to don't start exactly on the 25th, so maybe a day or 25 two in the next week would be fine to make sure a 25 vote within the petitioned-for classifications who

53 (Pages 1613 to 1616)

Page 1617 Page 1619

are on the Employer's payroll and working as of the close of the pay period immediately preceding either the issuance of a DD&E or the approval of a stipulated election agreement.

б

And that's -- you can look for that language in Plymouth Towing 178 NLRB 651. What the Union's asked for in this case is nonstandard formula. They've asked for a one-year, one academic year lookback which is a variation from the board's standard eligibility formula which we've asked for which would only include those students within the petitioned-for classification within the spring 2017 quarter.

The board has held that when parties disagree on the appropriate eligibility formula to use, which is the case here, unless "the evidence adduced at the hearing supports a deviation from our usual eligibility requirements, eligibility will be determined by the usual payroll periods." That site is B-W Construction Company, 161 NLRB 1600. That's at Note4.

Here it's clear that the parties disagree on the formula to use, and the Union has failed its burden to prove that a deviation from the standard eligibility formula is necessary. Because the graduate students within the petitioned-for unit will be appointed again. Beth Niestat, the executive director of U-Grant, testified that various divisions of school set back the academic requirements of the graduate programming, and that as a result the university's very decentralized.

David Nuremberg, dean of social sciences, testified that students in social science division must obtain five teaching points during their Ph.D. program. Teaching points are generally obtained in social sciences in years three through five. He also testified that he discourages students from teaching beyond their teaching.

Christopher Wild, collegiate master of the humanities collegiate division, testified that the students in dramatic studies must obtain 12 teaching points. Dr. Wild also noted that dramatic study students usually obtain their teaching points in years two, three and five of the program.

Dr. Wild further testified that he discourages students from teaching in excess of the teaching requirement.

Dr. Victoria Prince, dean of the division of biological sciences testified that BSD requires two quarters of teaching. Dr. Prince testified

Page 1618

Page 1620

Union is seeking this eligibility formula other than the standard, the burden is on the Union to present evidence demonstrating that a one academic year lookback is more appropriate and that the -- than the -- than the strong presumption in favor of the standard eligibility formula has been rebutted.

The evidence the Union would have to establish is that the petitioned-for students have a "continuing interest in the terms and conditions of employment of the unit beyond the spring 2017 quarter." And this is what was discussed in the Columbia case which is at 364 NLRB Number 90 slip opinion at Page 21.

Here the unit has failed to support its position that a deviation from the standard formula is necessary. On the contrary, the university set forth evidence that teaching and research expectations vary widely by department, school, and based on degree requirements in that it's unusual for students to teach beyond the required amount. Additional university witnesses have presented uncontroverted evidence that students who have met their academic requirements are "discouraged" from going beyond their academic requirement.

As a result, there is no indication that

that she discourages students from teaching after they've completed their teaching requirement.

As a result, it's not been shown, let alone proven, that the graduate students who held a covered position in the past have a necessary continuing interest in the terms and conditions of employment to justify their participation in any election if one is directed.

(WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit No. 65 was marked for identification.)

MR. PORZIO: I've handed you what's been marked Employer's Exhibit 65. And just to point out what was just recently received into evidence by the Madame Hearing Officer, Employer Exhibit 15 and 15A, each division, each school within the petitioned-for unit, the academic requirements and the years in which they're supposed to fulfill those requirements are listed for each of those divisions. So that's already in 15 and 15A, but I pointed out some of the key testimony on those points.

So back to Employer Exhibit 65 which I've handed you, similar to Employer Exhibit 63, we prepared a chart that tracks the same

54 (Pages 1617 to 1620)

Page 1621 Page 1623 1 director has applied an eligibility formula other 1 12 universities that have -- that have been subject 2 2 than the standard eligibility formula in grad to a graduate student representation petition. And 3 3 for each one we've identified the name, the NLRB student cases. 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2

3

4

7

8

13

14

case number, and then in small letter A, we've given you the eligibility formula that was applied in that case by the regional director for that region. So, for example, in Number 4, Yale University, the eligibility formula that was

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

applied was a standard eligibility formula, and in B you'll see a link to the decision and direction of election where you can find that.

A couple things to note, a nonstandard voter eligibility formula has only been applied in 3 of the 12 cases. The other 9 have had a standard voter eligibility formula. On those three that -where a nonstandard eligibility period was used, Duke University was one. There the regional director approved the Union's request to apply one-year lookback formula, but the board upon reviewing the regional director's decision found that the NLRB has "not passed on the appropriate eligibility format for graduate students employer representation elections following its decision in Columbia. The university should have been allowed to litigate the propriety of the Union's proposal

This demonstrates that the mere fact that this is a graduate student organizing campaign does not weigh in favor of deviation from the board's standard eligibility formula. So I would like to move what's been marked for identification as Employer's 65 into evidence.

MS. AUERBACH: I object for the same reason. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. So for the same reason as the prior exhibits, I am going to receive Employer Exhibit 65 in evidence.

14 MR. PORZIO: Thank you.

> (WHEREUPON, Employer Exhibit No. 65 was received into evidence.)

MR. PORZIO: So for all the aforementioned reasons, the Union failed to carry its burden of proving that deviation from the board's standard eligibility formula is warranted. Thus, the board's standard eligibility formula should be applied. And if it an election is ordered in this case, the only students who should be deemed eligible to vote are those who held a covered

Page 1622 Page 1624

1 back eligibility formula at the preelection 2 hearing. 3

Prior to the university being permitted to litigate this issue, the eligibility formula, the Union withdrew its petition. Thus, while the regional director in Duke initially approved the lookback eligibility formula, it's not clear whether such formula would have been deemed to be the appropriate formula had the petition not been withdrawn and that issue was actually litigated.

Second point to note, at Cornell which as you can see by the asterics, was not processed by the NLRB, but there at the AFT the same Union involved here agreed to the standard eligibility formula. And in Loyola University, the only other graduate student case to be heard by this region, Region 13, the regional director applied a standard eligibility formula.

So taking Duke out of the equation for a moment for the reasons discussed earlier, the only two cases where a nonstandard eligibility formula was used was Columbia and New School. Both come out of the same region, Region 2, and decided by the same regional director, Karen Fernbach. In other words, no other region, no other regional

1 positioned in the spring 2017 quarter.

HEARING OFFICER MOLS: And just for clarity sake, since we've had a number of individuals discuss about the different payment methods, that's

5 correct for the entire quarter, correct? 6 MR. PORZIO: That's correct. If an easier way

to answer that question is if you go back to Board Exhibit 3A, with the updated list, it'll be anyone within our petition -- the appropriate unit that

9 10 we've set. I believe it's Attachment D.

11 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: It's one of the 12 attachments in the --

MR. PORZIO: Yeah, one of the attachments. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. Does the Employer

15 have anything further it wishes to add with regards 16 to eligibility?

17 MR. PORZIO: Not at this time.

18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So it's my understanding

19 then that the Petitioner will state its position on

20 the eligibility -- appropriate eligibility formula 21 and the mechanics of the election closer to the

22 close of the hearing. So we will take your

23 position at that time.

24 MS. AUERBACH: That's correct.

25 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Before we move on to the

55 (Pages 1621 to 1624)

	Page 1625		Page 1627
1	cross-examination of the Petitioner's witness, I do	1	correct?
2	have a ruling on the petition to revoke. So after	2	A. Correct.
3	consultation with the regional director, the region	3	Q. One was Dr. Rick Fehon, F-e-h-o-n
4	has decided to grant the petition to revoke for the	4	A. Correct.
5	reasons outlined in the petition to revoke which is	5	Q correct.
6	Petitioner Exhibit 73. That's granted in whole.	6	And other was Dr. Chip Ferguson?
7	MR. PORZIO: So I understand, you're granting	7	A. Edwin Ferguson, Chip is a nickname, but
8	the petition to revoke on all parts?	8	yes.
9	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Yes, for the reasons	9	Q. Everyone calls him Chip, right?
10	outlined in Petitioner Exhibit 73.	10	A. Yes. Everyone calls him Chip.
11	MR. PORZIO: Thank you.	11	Q. Dr. Prince was not a professor in
12	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So is the Employer ready	12	developmental mechanisms in the winter of 2014,
13	for cross-examination?	13	correct?
14	MR. WEITZMAN: Five-minute recess.	14	A. No.
15	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.	15	Q. Correct?
16	(WHEREUPON, a short recess was	16	A. Correct. Yes. That is correct.
17	taken.)	17	Q. Okay. Therefore, the experience that you
18	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.	18	described as your TA experience with Dr. Fehon and
19	So now we are going to proceed with the	19	Dr. Ferguson was not intended to contradict
20	Employer's cross-examination of witness Kamil	20	Dr. Pierce's testimony on how she mentors TAs when
21	Asham.	21	she is the exclusive course director, correct?
22		22	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Dr. Prince, maybe I
23		23	misheard. You said Dr. Pierce.
24		24	THE WITNESS: I heard Pierce as well.
25		25	MS. AUERBACH: Well, objection to
	Page 1626	l .	
	Page 1020		Page 1628
1	KAMIL ASHAM,	1	Page 1628 MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so
2		1 2	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct.
	KAMIL ASHAM,	l .	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so
2 3 4	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows: CROSS-EXAMINATION	2	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in
2	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows: CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. WEITZMAN:	2 3 4 5	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and
2 3 4 5 6	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA
2 3 4 5 6 7	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the objection. I mean, the testimony is what it is to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the objection. I mean, the testimony is what it is to the he can testify about his experience in that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the objection. I mean, the testimony is what it is to the he can testify about his experience in that course under those professors and to what extent it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the objection. I mean, the testimony is what it is to the he can testify about his experience in that course under those professors and to what extent it may have differed from Dr., you know, when he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the objection. I mean, the testimony is what it is to the he can testify about his experience in that course under those professors and to what extent it may have differed from Dr., you know, when he worked with Dr. Prince, but whether or not what his
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	KAMIL ASHAM, called as a witness herein, having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR. WEITZMAN: I'm going to start all over so we have it correct. BY MR. WEITZMAN: Q. Therefore, the experience you described in your direct examination regarding Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson and your interaction with them as a TA was not intended to contradict any of Dr. Prince's testimony on how she mentors her TAs in courses where she is exclusively the course director, correct? MS. AUERBACH: Objection to the question as argumentative and, I mean, the witness was answered questions he was asked on direct. So there was no intention on the witness's part except to have the questions he was asked. Otherwise, it's argumentative whether it contradicts or doesn't contradict. HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I'm going to sustain the objection. I mean, the testimony is what it is to the he can testify about his experience in that course under those professors and to what extent it may have differed from Dr., you know, when he

56 (Pages 1625 to 1628)

Page 1629 Page 1631 1 BY MR. WEITZMAN: 1 A. Correct. 2 Q. Your experience in that case was based 2 Q. The purpose of the discussion section was 3 exclusively on your interaction with Dr. Fehon and 3 to go over points in the paper that should be 4 Dr. Ferguson, correct? 4 understood and addressed and in the critique, 5 A. Correct. 5 correct? 6 6 Q. Have you ever been a TA in Dr. Prince's A. Correct. 7 course in the AP5 sequence which is the course she 7 Q. To enable for you to go over the points 8 described during her testimony? 8 with the students, Dr. Ferguson gave you a written 9 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: First off, do you know 9 summary of the papers, correct? 10 what the AP5 sequence is? 10 A. A written summary of the paper, I do not 11 THE WITNESS: I do. I am aware of it, but --11 recollect that, no. 12 and I have TA'd a course in which Dr. Prince is one 12 Q. So you don't deny it either? 13 of the instructors, but I do not believe it is part 13 A. I mean, unless I have developed senility 14 of the AP5 sequence. It is also a graduate level 14 over the last few years, I cannot imagine what I 15 course, but I do not believe it's --15 must be missing. But, no, I do not believe I 16 BY MR. WEITZMAN: 16 was -- I ever received a written summary of the 17 Q. The course you're referring to is the 17 paper. 18 second TA experience, correct? 18 Q. You don't believe so? 19 A. Correct. 19 A. No. 20 Q. And we will get to that. 20 O. Good. 21 With regard to Dr. Fehon and Dr. Ferguson, 21 If Dr. Ferguson is called as a rebuttal 22 when you testified that they didn't train you for 22 witness, he's going to testify that he had a 23 discussion sections "particularly," is it your 23 one-hour meeting with you prior to each discussion 24 testimony that there was no training whatsoever? 24 section. Do you recall that? 25 A. To say there was no training would imply 25 A. I recall having a one -- so here's how the Page 1630 Page 1632 1 that they never said anything to me at all about my 1 course worked. The first half of the course --2 O. Well --2 TA experience which is almost exclusive -- which is 3 3 A. Let me -almost never the case. I was given positive 4 feedback. I was given positive affirmation I would 4 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: First off. 5 5 say because feedback implies I should fix THE WITNESS: It will be pertinent to this something, but I was told that I was doing really 6 6 question. 7 7 well. Students seemed to like me. And that was in 8 the first discussion section where Dr. Richard 8 BY MR. WEITZMAN: 9 9 Fehon sat in on, and that to my recollection is all Q. That's a yes or no question. 10 A. No, but it is pertinent because Dr. Edwin 10 of affirmation I got. Ferguson didn't actually come into the course until 11 Q. Well, my question wasn't about 11 affirmation. My question was about training you 12 12 the second half of the quarter. So it's not 13 13 for discussion sections. possible for him t have discussed every single 14 14 A. Okav. discussion section with me because that would have 15 been like all ten weeks. And he wasn't actually 15 Q. So with regard to training you for 16 supervising until the last five weeks of the 16 discussion sections, is it your testimony that you 17 17 received no training for discussion sections quarter. 18 18 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: So was the course split whatsoever? 19 A. Not particularly, no. 19 in half between the two --20 20 Q. So let me see if I can refresh your THE WITNESS: Yes, it was. 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: -- professors? 21 recollection on what in particular Dr. Ferguson did 22 to prepare you for discussion sections. So this 22 BY MR. WEITZMAN: 23 23 was a class in which students had to read certain O. For the session that Dr. Ferguson was teaching, did he meet with you an hour prior to the 24 24 papers, discuss them in the section that you led and prepare critique of those papers, correct? 25 discussion section? 25

57 (Pages 1629 to 1632)

Page 1635 Page 1633 1 A. Not for all the discussion section, no. 1 lack of recollection of seeing them to me indicates 2 2 Q. Any? that I, in fact, did not actually see them. 3 A. One, I believe, yes. 3 Q. As to the student critiques, Dr. Ferguson 4 4 Q. Does it refresh your recollection if I also provided you with a written guideline on how 5 tell you that Dr. Ferguson's written summaries of 5 to grade a critique, correct? 6 the papers also contained the points that he wanted 6 A. I do not believe so, no. 7 7 you to go over during the discussion section? Q. Okay. You're not denying, correct? 8 8 A. I -- I am denying it. A. I believe if -- again, like I said, I do 9 not recollect a written summary. But I believe if 9 Q. The discussion section in which one of the 10 10 professors sat in, that was Dr. Fehon? Dr. Ferguson had those points, he would have 11 11 communicated them to me verbally in the session A. Correct. 12 12 that he spent with me. Q. The purpose of Dr. Fehon sitting in on 13 We have -- I want to reiterate something 13 your first discussion section was to observe you, 14 14 that I said last time which was that I had taken correct? 15 15 this course before in the year before. So I was A. Correct. 16 very familiar with the material, and some of the 16 Q. Afterwards he gave feedback that your 17 papers had changed from the last year when I took 17 session was good. You already testified to that, 18 the course but the large majority of them had not. 18 correct? 19 19 And so, therefore, there was I think -- I believe A. Correct. 20 only discussion of the changes were made because I 20 Q. Because Dr. Fehon told you that your 21 was very familiar with the course. And having 21 section was good, you really didn't expect him to 22 22 gotten an A in the course, Dr. Ferguson was, to my return for further observation, did you? 23 recollection, very confident in my ability to 23 A. I didn't have any expectations actually. 24 24 convey the material. I expected -- because when I took the course the year before, I do remember Rick and Chip attending 25 Q. Are you sure you got an A? 25 Page 1634 Page 1636 1 A. I did, yes. Yes. 1 multiple sessions. And the time that I TA'd, I was 2 2 O. Could it have been A-minus? surprised to not see them as often as I had seen 3 3 A. No. I think it was an A. them when I had taken the course. 4 Q. You think? You think? 4 Q. You don't know why they attended 5 A. I -- yes. It was an A. 5 discussion sections when they were taught by other 6 6 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Next question. TA's, correct? 7 7 A. I cannot say with a hundred degree of 8 8 BY MR. WEITZMAN: certainty. But I believe that when Dr. Fehon gave 9 9 me his positive feedback, I took it to mean that I Q. So if Dr. Ferguson comes as a rebuttal 10 10 witness and brings his summaries in point, are you was doing really well and that they didn't need to 11 saying that you don't remember seeing them or are 11 sit in on further sections. 12 you saying that he'd be making those up? 12 Q. Good. 13 13 A. Can you rephrase that question, I don't --The instructor of record when you took the 14 14 Q. Sure. If Dr. Ferguson brings in the course previously was Dr. Fehon, correct? 15 summaries and the summaries have the points that he 15 A. Correct. 16 wanted you to go over --16 Q. Exclusively, right? 17 17 A. No. I believe it was both. A. Uh-huh. 18 Q. -- would your testimony be that you don't 18 O. Both, okay. 19 remember seeing them or would your testimony be 19 And not only did you take the class, but 20 that he made them up for the purpose of this 20 vou also had attended discussion sections? 21 21 A. Correct. hearing?

58 (Pages 1633 to 1636)

Q. You saw how they were run?

discussion section in that course, correct?

Q. You were familiar with what went on in a

22

23

24

25

22

23

24

25

A. I wouldn't want to attribute any, you

know, wrongful intention to Dr. Ferguson. So,

yeah, my testimony -- yes, my testimony would be

that I do not recollect seeing them. However, my

Page 1637 Page 1639 1 1 feedback on the rubric aspect of the grading. But A. Correct. 2 2 Q. If you needed any further direction about other than that, does that answer your question 3 how to discuss -- how to lead a discussion section 3 about the fleshing out the rubric? 4 4 in that course, you could have asked, correct? Q. If I understand your answer, Dr. Fehon 5 A. Correct. 5 gave less mentoring on the rubric because he liked 6 6 Q. Let's turn now to grading in that course. the way you did it? 7 7 Do you agree that one way to teach a teaching A. Correct. 8 assistant about grading is to give the teaching 8 Q. Okay. 9 assistant a rough rubric and challenge the teaching 9 A. Although, I would say that's to some 10 assistant to see if he can approve it? 10 degree speculation because he actually never --11 11 well, he said I did it well, but --A. Sure, yeah. 12 Q. That's what you testified? Q. You testified that you were given a rough 12 13 rubric, and you did make changes to that rubric, 13 A. Yeah. 14 14 Q. Which of the professors was the one that correct? 15 15 changed the A you had given because he said you A. Correct. 16 Q. And then Dr. Fehon gave you feedback on 16 gave too many As? 17 the rubric, correct? Or was it Dr. Ferguson? 17 A. Dr. Ferguson. 18 18 A. So both -- so let me -- because these Q. And in changing that A to a lower grade, 19 19 questions are so specific, please let me give a Dr. Ferguson was teaching you about his philosophy 20 20 on grade distribution, correct? comprehensive answer. 21 There was a midterm that was supervised by 21 A. No, I do not believe that was the 22 22 Dr. Fehon, and then the final was supervised by intention at all. The intention was demanding a 23 Dr. Ferguson. The way they approached the midterm 23 certain consistency and standardization within the 2.4 24 and final was very different. Dr. Fehon gave me a class. It may have been, you know, a byproduct of 25 rough rubric. Dr. Ferguson gave me a -- well, a 25 it that he thought that I needed to be hasher in my Page 1638 Page 1640 1 more fleshed-out rubric. 1 grading. But the primary objective of it was that 2 2 However, in both cases, I felt even though he felt that the students needed grades that they 3 3 I was not asked to do it, that I needed a portion, were absolutely deserving of, and giving too many 4 you know, exactly what phrases went down as certain 4 grades in this particular course was not something 5 point, for instance, right. So a question about 5 that he was comfortable with doing. 6 drosophila imaginal discs, pardon me for the 6 Q. And he explained that to you? 7 7 jargon, the rough rubric would not let me know A. Yeah, he did actually. 8 whether I was supposed to give two out of five 8 O. Good. So now let's talk about office 9 points or four out of five points or three out of 9 hours. 10 10 five points. So I had to design a rubric that You testified that the faculty did not sit 11 would allow me to apportion points accordingly. 11 in on office hours, correct? 12 And when I graded those papers according 12 A. Correct. 13 13 to that rubric and handed the papers back to Q. Office hours gives students the 14 14

Dr. Fehon, I provided him that rubric. So when I showed it to him, he said -- he -- he said, yes, this looks good to me. And my grades were as they were, I believe.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And with Dr. Ferguson, it was slightly different because he had given me a more fleshed-out rubric. I had only -- I needed to clarify and flesh out some things, but not others. And so when I handed the papers back to him, he said, oh, yeah, good, I'm glad that you got that, or, hmm, maybe you're being a little too hard on this one. So Dr. Ferguson gave a little bit more

- opportunity to tell the TA what the student finds confusing about the professor's lecture, correct?
 - A. Correct.
- Q. Office hours provides students with an opportunity to ask that question without the professor being present, correct?
 - A. Correct.
- 21 Q. Therefore, if a professor sat in on office hours, it would inhibit one of the purposes of office hours, correct?
 - A. Well, if they -- if a professor sat in on one of the discussion sections, so students are

59 (Pages 1637 to 1640)

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

25

Page 1641 Page 1643 free to discuss with the -- with their TA in 1 Q. All right. So that class started with 1 2 2 discussion sections as well. And, as I testified, four lectures by the professors, Dr. Prince and 3 the professors were not present for nine of the 3 Dr. Ferguson, correct? 4 4 discussion sections that I presented, and they were A. Correct. 5 free to talk to me during the discussion sections. 5 Q. And then the latter part of course had the 6 I do not believe they were inhibited more 6 format where there would be a lecture by a 7 7 or less in office hours as compared to the professor followed by a student presentation on a 8 8 discussion sections because in both cases paper, correct? 9 9 A. I believe the structure of the course was professors were not present, but I do not see that 10 10 actually not former or latter. Student as the function of office hours, no. 11 11 Q. But it's one of the things that students presentations were preferred pretty much throughout 12 use office hours for, correct? 12 course, and they started, I believe, in the second 13 A. Correct. 13 week or the third week. The second week I gave a 14 14 presentation, and then the third week student Q. Asking you questions that they don't want 15 to ask in front of the professor, correct? 15 presentations began. And they continued all the 16 A. Not always. Again --16 way to tenth week, and every week students -- there 17 Q. I didn't say always. I said is it a 17 were two students who gave presentations --18 Q. Okay. So let's see --18 function? 19 19 A. It is a function, but --A. -- former or the latter. 20 20 Q. I say we talk about the same page. Q. Thank you. 21 A. Can I respond to that a little bit more? 21 A. Sure. 22 22 Q. You just did. It was a yes or no Q. First four lectures by Dr. Ferguson and 23 23 Dr. Prince, correct? question. A. Yes, so that's the first two weeks, yes. 24 24 A. All right. 25 Q. Let's talk about your second TA 25 Q. Okay. Two weeks? Page 1642 Page 1644 experience. That course was DVBI36200, correct? 1 1 A. Two weeks, and then the first lecture of 2 2 A. I don't know the code. the third week. 3 3 Q. The title of that course was, stem cells Q. That was followed by a paper presentation 4 and regeneration, correct? 4 by you, correct? 5 5 A. So the first three lectures and then a A. Correct. 6 Q. The year in which you TA'd that course, 6 paper presentation by me and then another lecture, 7 7 there were 11 undergraduates and one graduate that would be the order that I remember. 8 student correct? 8 Q. Wasn't there another student who made a 9 9 A. That sounds to me about right, yeah. presentation immediately after you? 10 Q. And there were five professors assigned to 10 A. Yes, there was. Yes, you're right. 11 stem-cell and regeneration that quarter, correct? 11 Q. Okay. So you did a good job, right? A. I believe so. Dr. Ferguson told me that 12 A. Correct. But I believe Dr. Prince and 12 13 13 Dr. Edwin Ferguson were the main professors -he really liked it. Q. Correct. 14 14 Q. When you made your presentation, you were 15 A. -- leading the course. 15 observed by both Dr. Prince and Dr. Ferguson, correct? 16 Q. I agree. 16 17 17 A. Yeah. A. Correct. 18 Q. So you had taken the same course the year 18 O. And afterwards, in addition to what before, correct? 19 19 Dr. Ferguson told you, Dr. Prince also told you it 20 A. Correct. 20 was a good presentation, correct? 21 21 A. Correct. Dr. Prince never fails to give Q. And can we assume that you did well when 22 22 you took that course? me positive feedback. 23 23 A. Yes. In this particular case, I cannot O. Good. So after that, the format of the 24 24 remember if I got an A or an A-minus, but I think class was lecture and then two student 25 25 it was one of the two. presentations on paper, correct?

60 (Pages 1641 to 1644)

Page 1647 Page 1645 1 presentation because of your continuity, correct? 1 A. Correct. 2 2 Q. And it was in those subsequent weeks when A. Correct. 3 other faculty would lecture the class on the team 3 Q. And first you gave your impression on the 4 4 basis, correct? presentation either that day or shortly thereafter 5 A. Correct. 5 while it was fresh in everybody's memory, correct? 6 Q. And you were the only one who saw all the 6 A. Correct. And there was some especially 7 7 presentations, correct? after all the presentations were complete, there 8 8 A. Correct. was some evaluation and talk about each of the 9 9 Q. And you were told at the outset of the presentations with Dr. Prince and with 10 10 class that part of your role was to bring Dr. Ferguson. 11 11 continuity to the course, correct? Q. And during those subsequent discussions at 12 A. Correct. 12 the end of the course that you just described, you 13 O. In this course, there were no discussion 13 would also be asked for your input on the grades 14 14 that the students should be given, correct? sections as we were referred to them in the 15 15 A. I was -- I never -- I don't believe I previous TA experience, correct? 16 A. Correct. 16 assigned them grades. I believe I assigned them a 17 17 number score out of ten. I was not responsible for Q. The discussions in this class took place 18 18 as discussions on the paper that was presented, grading any component of that course. And the 19 19 correct? midterms and finals were also exclusively graded by 20 20 the professors. So I believe I ranked them in a A. Correct. 21 21 one to ten scale, and that rank I assume was done Q. And when those discussions took place, it 22 22 was the professor who would lead the class to the grades. 23 23 discussions that followed the student's Q. Did you ever have any input on the grades? 24 24 A. Not on the -- so insofar as giving that presentation of a paper, correct? 25 A. Can you rephrase that question, please? 25 ranking system translated into grades, yes; but Page 1646 Page 1648 1 O. Sure. 1 insofar as actually assigning letter grades, no. 2 2 The student would make a presentation on a Q. I want to move on to your selection of the 3 paper, correct? 3 Prince lab which you currently do your research? 4 4 A. Correct. A. Correct. 5 Q. And after the student's presentation, 5 Q. You said that you did three rotations, but 6 6 really Dr. Prince's lab was the fourth rotation, there would be a class discussion, correct? 7 7 A. Correct. correct? 8 Q. The person who led the discussion 8 A. Correct. 9 9 following the presentation of the paper was the Q. You started with the first rotation in the 10 professor, correct? 10 fall of 2012 with Dr. Neil Shubin, correct? 11 A. I see, yes, correct. 11 A. Correct. 12 Q. Okay. Also, in the stem cells and 12 Q. In the winter of 2013, you had a rotation 13 13 regeneration class, there were no office hours in with Dr. Otten, correct? 14 the usual sense of those words, correct? 14 A. Correct. 15 A. No. That is correct. 15 Q. And then in spring of 2013, you had a rotation with Dr. Rick Fehon, correct? 16 Q. Okay. But you did meet one on one with 16 17 each student to help them prepare their 17 A. Correct. 18 presentation, correct? 18 O. The fourth was in the summer of 2013 with 19 A. That is correct. 19 Dr. Prince? 20 20 Q. In that class, if you remember, the A. Correct. 21 21 grading was 25 percent paper presentation, Q. The normal number of rotations is three, 22 15 percent critiques, 30 percent midterm and 22 correct? 23 23 30 percent final? A. Correct. 24 24 Q. And you had four? A. That sounds about right. 25 25 Q. And you had input on the 25 percent paper A. Correct.

61 (Pages 1645 to 1648)

Page 1649 Page 1651 1 Q. I understand your plans after you receive 1 Q. Also known as PCP, correct? 2 your Ph.D. include the option of getting a 2 A. Correct. 3 fellowship from Harvard to write a book, correct? 3 Q. Prickle is a molecule involved in PCP, 4 4 A. That is one of the things that I'm looking correct? 5 5 into, yes. A. Correct. 6 6 Q. And when you testified that you selected Q. The Prince lab has -- had previously 7 7 studied prickle, correct? Dr. Prince because of her mentoring style, were you 8 8 referring in part to the fact that of the four labs A. Correct. 9 you had rotated in, Dr. Prince would be the one who 9 Q. The Prince lab's research on prickle has 10 10 would be the most supportive of your ultimate been in the context of the migration of neurons, 11 career goals even if they were outside of research? 11 correct? 12 A. I didn't know about outside of my -- so, 12 A. Correct. 13 correct, insofar as, yes, I believe that Dr. Prince 13 MR. WEITZMAN: Could you show the witness 14 14 was by far the best mentor I believed in my mind. Exhibit 18, please? 15 As a first year, I didn't really consider my career 15 **HEARING OFFICER MOLS:** Employer 18? 16 prospects at the time. And it is only over the 16 MR. WEITZMAN: Petitioner 18. 17 years in Dr. Prince's lab that I've really 17 BY MR. WEITZMAN: 18 developed those ideas about what I'm going to do 18 Q. I want you to look at Petitioner 19 after graduate school. 19 Exhibit 18. We're going to go through it to see if 20 And a lot of this is also to the credit of 20 your current interest in prickle and neurocrest are 21 Dr. Prince herself who collaborates and brainstorms 21 consistent with Dr. Prince's previous research 22 22 with me about what I could possibly do and supports interests. 23 23 me in my endeavors. A. Okay. 2.4 Q. So first let's turn to the first page. Q. What were the mentoring skills that 24 25 attracted you to Dr. Prince's lab when you went 25 The second article from the bottom where the first Page 1650 Page 1652 1 through your rotation there? 1 author is Mapp, M-a-p-p? 2 2 A. I think the mentoring skills -- this is a A. Yes. 3 3 hard one especially in her presence, but I think Q. That dealt with prickle 1B, correct? 4 the mentoring skills that Dr. Prince exhibited at 4 A. Correct. 5 the time and still continues to exhibit is 5 Q. And then on the next page, the second one 6 6 forthrightness, for one. She is very forthright down is another article where Mapp is the first 7 7 about how she feels about how you're doing. Her author, and it also he dealt with prickle 1B, 8 8 feedback is meaningful and often very positive. correct? 9 9 She is very encouraging. She gives credit A. Correct. 10 where credit's due. And she is, you know, despite 10 Q. Lower on that page, in fact, next to the 11 being the dean of students, one would think she's 11 last article by Rosch Schneider also dealt with 12 very, very busy person, she is; however, she always 12 prickle 1B, correct? 13 13 makes herself available whenever you need her A. Correct. 14 14 really to talk. And that for a first year student O. And then if we look on the bottom of 15 15 is -- are all very appealing attributes in a Page 3 of 5, there's an article where the next 16 mentor. 16 author is Hunter, and where it talks about the 17 17 Q. For the record, the current subject of second pharyngeal arch, that is populated by 18 18 neurocrest cells, correct? your dissertation research is the role of prickle 19 molecules in neurocrest migration, correct? 19 A. Pharyngeal, and correct. 20 20 A. Correct. Q. Good. Thank you for correcting me. 21 21 O. But when you discussed joining In the middle of the fourth of five pages 22 22 Dr. Prince's lab with Dr. Prince, what you where Schilling is the first author, one of the 23 23 discussed as your interest was an interest in subjects discussed is neurocrest, correct? planar cell polarity, correct? 24 24 A. Correct.

62 (Pages 1649 to 1652)

Q. And on the last page, there are two

25

A. Planar cell polarity, yes.

25

Page 1655 Page 1653 articles, one is where Gail is the first author and good for grants. However, that would have been 1 1 2 2 that dealt with neurocrest, correct? rendered moot if I had had no research results 3 3 pertinent to that, right. So to some degree I had A. Correct. 4 4 Q. And the one right underneath that, to convince my thesis committee of the worthiness 5 Dr. Prince is the first author, and it also dealt 5 to work on that project. 6 with neurocrest? 6 Q. And the findings that you made are what 7 7 subsequently led to a 2016 grant by the Chicago A. Correct. 8 8 Biomedical Consortium, correct? Q. And that article that we just referred to 9 by Dr. Prince goes back to a 1994 interest that --9 A. Correct. 10 where Dr. Prince developed her interest in 10 Q. Do you agree that it's perfectly normal 11 11 neurocrest, correct? for a PI to write research grants based on findings 12 A. Correct. 12 of the grad students so that the PI can support the 13 Q. Based on this review of Dr. Prince's 13 students' research? 14 14 publications, is it fair to say that your current A. That is absolutely correct. He has right 15 15 dissertation topic is a merger of two of grounds for support for the lab in general, not 16 Dr. Prince's interests regarding prickle molecules 16 just the graduate students, but, yes, graduate 17 neurocrest? 17 students are integral to the lab, so yes. 18 18 A. That is correct. And that is not -- that Q. You testified that you have trained 19 19 is generally the norm for any graduate student in a others, but it's a fact that you are not the only 20 20 lab to work within the ambit of the lab's focus. one in the lab who mentors junior students and 21 Q. Your current dissertation topic is not the 21 technicians, correct? 22 22 same as your original dissertation topic, correct? A. Oh, correct. Absolutely. 23 23 A. Correct. Q. In fact, the two undergraduate seniors who 24 24 will graduate next week completed their senior Q. In your original proposed thesis, you 25 proposed to work on cell migration both in the 25 research thesis in the Prince lab, and you were not Page 1654 Page 1656 1 context of neurons and neurocrest, correct? 1 one of the two primary mentors of those two 2 2 A. Correct. students, correct? 3 3 Q. And what you've done is narrowed the scope A. Correct. 4 just to neurocrest? 4 Q. You -- so, again, it's perfectly normal 5 A. Correct. 5 for graduate students and even technicians to train Q. You talked about a research grant in your 6 6 more junior people in the lab, correct? 7 7 prior testimony? A. Yeah. It's the norm. 8 A. Uh-huh, correct. 8 Q. Do you agree that getting a Ph.D. means 9 9 Q. The research grant that you referred to in that the Ph.D. is the foremost expert in the 10 10 your testimony was a research grant for the focused topic of his dissertation in which no one 11 Chicago -- from the Chicago Biomedical Consortium, 11 else has the same level of expertise? 12 correct? 12 A. I would say that that is correct, yeah. 13 13 A. When referring to that grant, I was not That is correct. 14 14 actually referring to the Chicago Biomedical Q. So when you train someone in an area in 15 15 Consortium even though that is a grant that I which you are writing your dissertation, you would 16 was -- that we have. What I was talking about in 16 expect that your unique expertise would make you 17 17 that context was how I was able to convince my the logical choice to do that training, correct? 18 thesis committee to let me work on neurocrest 18 A. That is correct. However, I am going to 19 cells. 19 segue to another -- sorry --20 20 And what I said was that in addition to Q. You answered the question? 21 21 the expectation that I would be producing data, you A. But no -- what is pertinent is that --22 22 know, in that area, it was also brought up in my --Q. Segues --23 one of my these thesis committees that neurocrest 23 A. This question implies that graduate 24 24 cells are indeed a very hot area, and, you know, students all lead to training when it pertains to 25 would be very -- would be very possibly be very 25 their dissertation research. Graduate students and

Page 1657 Page 1659 1 all the undergraduate students and technicians Q. What other research do you do? 1 2 train others when even it's not pertinent to the 2 A. So I -- so my dissertation as you 3 dissertation research. And, in fact, there are 3 mentioned is about the role of prickle genes in 4 4 examples from all graduate students in the lab neurocrest development. There are always side 5 where they have trained others, and it has been to 5 projects that the research, the technician who 6 no benefit of their other than dissertation 6 works under my tutelage may want to, you know, 7 7 research at all. So it is not exclusively to the develop and work on independently. 8 benefit of the graduate students for dissertation 8 It involves a protein called rest and 9 research that they train first. 9 other graduate student may also want to follow up 10 MR. FASMAN: That wasn't my question, move to 10 on that project. I have some preliminary data on 11 11 that project, but it does not pertain to my strike. 12 12 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I likely would have dissertation. And if we were to make it connect to 13 followed up with a further clarification, so I'm 13 my dissertation -- actually we have no expectation 14 14 going to permanent the testimony. or desire to make it connect to my current research 15 15 BY MR. WEITZMAN: topic. So, no, not all research experiments that I 16 Q. Let me ask my yes or no question again 16 do are relating to my dissertation. 17 because it didn't relate to a benefit issue. 17 Q. Mr. Asham, isn't it a fact that your 18 18 My question was whether -- is when you thesis committee considers rest as part of your 19 train someone in an area in which you are writing a 19 thesis? 20 20 dissertation, you would expect that your unique A. I don't believe they do at the moment, no. 21 expertise would make you the logical choice for 21 Q. Did they at one time? 22 that training, correct? 22 A. At one point, yes. 23 23 A. Correct. Q. What percentage of your time do you spend Q. Good. Based on your expertise, you have 2.4 24 on researching rest which at one point your thesis 25 trained students, correct? 25 committee considered part of your thesis? Page 1658 Page 1660 1 A. Correct. 1 A. I don't know what percentage of my time is 2 2 Q. But you have not yet published a spent researching rest. I don't know how to 3 3 dissertation in your area of expertise, correct? apportion my research time in my head with 4 A. Correct. 4 percentages. I would say my thesis committee was 5 Q. Nor have you published the required -- let 5 very adamant that I do not study rest actually 6 6 me start that question all over. which is why the percentage of time that I spent 7 7 Nor have you published the degree working on it has fallen dramatically. Now maybe 8 requirement peer reviewed paper, correct? 8 5 to 10 percent of my time is studying rest. At 9 9 A. No. I'm hoping to later this year, hoping some -- at an earlier point it may have been closer 10 10 to 20 percent. to submit. 11 Q. So the answer to that question is you have 11 Q. Your research on rest was a branch of your 12 not? 12 thesis topic that you thought would lead to some 13 13 positive results, correct? A. No. 14 14 Q. You are fifth year? A. Correct. 15 A. You are correct. 15 Q. One moment, please. 16 Q. You are fifth year, and you have not 16 There was some testimony on direct about 17 published that peer reviewed paper? 17 Dr. Prince's publications. As far as you know, 18 18 A. Correct. there is no requirement to be listed as an author 19 Q. And you haven't finished your 19 on a paper that the person must do what the Union's 20 20 dissertation? lawyer called "primary research," correct? 21 21 A. That is correct. A. I'm not sure I understand the question. 22 22 Q. The research that you do in the Prince lab Q. Okay. Is there any requirement that to be 23 23 is exclusively for your dissertation topic, listed on a paper one must perform what the Union 24 called "primary research?" 24 correct?

64 (Pages 1657 to 1660)

A. No, I do not believe in publication

25

25

A. Almost exclusively.

Page 1661 1 requirements that is an absolute requirement. And 2 I think what you mean by research is actual 3 experimental work. Interpretation of data is also 4 considered worthy of an authorship, and that is 5 predominantly why principal investigators, advisors 6 are the senior corresponding authors on papers. 7 That's norm. 8 Q. In fact, there's several ways to be listed 9 on a paper, provided if the person makes an 10 intellectual contribution to the publication, 11 correct? 12 A. Correct. 13 Q. And as far as you know, Dr. Prince has 14 made an intellectual contribution to all the 15 publications in which she is listed as an author

during the time that you have been in the Prince lab, correct?

17

16

20

21

22

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

18 A. Absolutely. 19

Q. You testified about some experiments that Dr. Prince did in connection with the Love article. Do you recall that testimony?

A. Correct.

23 Q. She performed those experiments following 24 peer review of the Love article, correct?

A. Correct.

1 continues to be.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q. When you have your meetings, the one-hour meeting, the two of you discuss what's going on with your experiments, correct?

A. Correct.

Q. You discuss the interpretation of the data, correct?

A. Correct.

Q. Do you discuss your plans towards the ultimate publication of your study, correct?

A. Correct.

Q. You discuss your career plans?

13 A. Correct.

Q. What else do you discuss?

A. We discuss a lot of things. We --

Dr. Prince and I have a very, in my view, a very supportive personal relationship. So we talk about, you know, personal stuff as well. We talk about -- we, in my mind, have transitioned from a relationship where Dr. Prince is an expert, and I am just soaking up a lot of information from her because she is just a fountain of knowledge.

We have transitioned from that relationship to something which is much more collaborative. You know, we talk and there are

Page 1662

Page 1664

Page 1663

Q. In addition to those experiments, you are aware that Dr. Prince also collaborates with grad students on their experience -- experiments as a team, correct?

A. Are you -- is there a question referring to actual experiments being conducted?

Q. Yes.

A. Yes, I believe she does.

Q. Okay. You've seen Dr. Prince sit next to the two more junior grad students in a lab and help them with their experiments?

A. Yeah. She helped me when I was a more junior student as well.

Q. When you testified that you meet with Dr. Prince one hour each week, that's the formal time of your meetings with her, correct?

A. Yeah. It changes around a bit, but yes.

Q. And you didn't want to give the impression to the hearing officer that that one hour was the only time that you speak with Dr. Prince during the week, did you?

A. Oh, absolutely. We talk -- Dr. Prince makes herself available whenever I ask her to be available, and that is one of the reasons why I have repeatedly said she is an ideal mentor and

occasions when I disagree, for instance, with Dr. Prince. And then I reason with her, and she agrees or disagrees with me. And then she says something, and I agree or disagree. It's a very collaborative relationship. I actually feel that it's -- you know, there's a -- I don't think any of it can be parceled into one, you know, particular facet of, you know, conversation.

Q. The transition from one kind of a relationship to the next kind of relationship that you described, that's the way it should be, right?

A. Correct.

Q. And the next step will be for you to be an independent scientist?

A. I believe I already am to a very, very large degree an independent scientist. So I think one of the assumptions inherent in that question is that we are only independent scientists once we absolutely graduate with our Ph.D.s, and I do not believe that's true. We are independent scientists and do work -- we are independent scientists well before we graduate, and we do work throughout our graduate degree.

Q. With respect to the research you do in the lab, does anyone prescribe what your duties are?

65 (Pages 1661 to 1664)

Page 1665 Page 1667 1 1 A. Well, Dr. Prince and I have a running list A. Correct. 2 2 of experiments I need to complete before we submit Q. And then you had to be interviewed by the 3 my manuscript for publication, so what's prescribed 3 writing program personnel before you were invited 4 for me are things that Dr. Prince and I have 4 to participate, correct? 5 decided that are critical for my dissertation 5 A. Correct. 6 6 research. Q. Little Red Schoolhouse is itself a course. 7 7 Q. Does anyone tell you on a daily or weekly It's called English 33000, correct? 8 basis what you're to do? 8 A. I don't know the code. 9 A. No. In fact, Dr. Prince asks us every 9 Q. It's an English course? 10 week on -- we have this online platform called Base 10 A. That is what the course is. 11 Camp where we put our weekly plans up. And we 11 Q. Lectors initially participate in the 12 don't always do that, but we try hard to do that 12 undergraduate version of the course and then can 13 because that allows both Dr. Prince and all of the 13 progress to the graduate version, correct? 14 14 graduate students to be following what we're doing A. Yes. The first quarter I teach 15 15 on a daily basis. undergrads, and the second quarter I taught 16 Q. You are the one who decides what your 16 undergrads. However, I do at least know one lector 17 weekly plans will be, correct? 17 who taught graduate opportunities in her first 18 A. Correct. But if there is an experiment 18 quarter. 19 that Dr. Prince told me to do a week or two 19 Q. Being a lector in the writing program is 20 earlier, I will prioritize that. 20 not the same as being a TA in a biology course, 21 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: What was the name of 21 correct? 22 that platform again? 22 A. No. but work is work. 23 23 THE WITNESS: Base Camp, it's a fun online tool O. Well, let's talk about the differences 24 everyone should check out. 24 between the kind of course that you TA'd in and the 25 BY MR. WEITZMAN: 25 writing program. The writing course can be taken Page 1666 Page 1668 1 Q. It's a way that you learn time management 1 pass/fail, correct? 2 2 tools by making a plan and sticking to it? A. It can be taken -- not for all students. 3 3 A. It's a lab organization software, yeah. So in my first quarter the undergraduate students 4 Q. Let me now talk to you about your lector 4 all took it -- I think to my recollection, perhaps 5 experience, moving away from the lab, moving away one or two of them took it pass/fail, but a large 6 from Dr. Prince. 6 portion of them, if not all of them took it for a 7 7 You're a lector in the Little Red letter grade. The graduate students in the second 8 8 Schoolhouse, right? quarter I lectored all took a pass/fail. 9 9 A. Correct. Not currently, not presently. Q. And when somebody takes the course 10 Q. Not presently, but you were? 10 pass/fail, there's less emphasis on the exactitude 11 11 for grading, correct? 12 Q. And that's the writing program designed to 12 A. Well, that's not entirely true. So for 13 improve writing by undergraduate and graduate 13 one, many of these students didn't decide that they 14 students, correct? 14 wanted to take a pass/fail until well into the 15 15 A. Correct. course. So when I was lectoring the graduate 16 students, they told me in the fifth week that they Q. To be a lector, you were required to take 16 17 17 training in English 50300, a full quarter-long were going to take a pass/fail. And up until then writing course taught by members of the writing 18 18 I had been assigning them letter grades. 19 program, correct? 19 And assigning letter grades is still 20 20 A. Correct. important because for graduate students. Unlike 21 21 Q. In addition to taking a full quarter's undergraduate students, they have to maintain a 22 worth of graduate training before joining the 22 letter grade average in order to maintain good 23 writing program and being a lector, you also had to 23 standing in their program. So it really mattered 24 qualify by submitting an application including one 24 what I was grading them for in order for the pass 25 or more of your papers, correct? 25 or the fail. Does that make sense?

66 (Pages 1665 to 1668)

	Page 1669		Page 1671
1	Q. You can grade them pass/fail without	1	staff of the writing program deliver lectures, as
2	giving them a letter grade, correct?	2	Mr. McEnerney testified earlier today. And largely
3	A. Yes. That's eventually what happened.	3	graduate students are lectors, and they lead
4	Q. Right. Unlike being a TA in a biology	4	discussion sections themselves without any outside
5	class, the subject matter in the writing project is	5	or external help.
6	divorced from substance, correct?	6	Q. Are there midterms?
7	A. Divorced from substance, divorced from	7	A. No.
8	substance would mean that we are not dealing with	8	Q. Are there finals?
9	the substance in its actual form, and I actually	9	A. No.
10	think that we are. We don't deal with the actual	10	MR. WEITZMAN: May we go off the record please.
11	content in terms of the arguments presented. We do	11	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.
12	not engage with them on their own terms. We engage	12	(WHEREUPON, a short recess was
13	with them the way a rhetorician would, for	13	taken.)
14	instance, or the way a craftsman would. And we try	14	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.
15	to craft those arguments and writing in order to	15	MR. WEITZMAN: We have no other questions for
16	suit, as Mr. McEnerney testified, in order to suit	16	the witness.
17	the audiences that the writers are writing for.	17	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Okay. I think I have
18	Q. So you can have literature majors, physics	18	one or two.
19	majors, music majors or any other combination of	19	EXAMINATION DAVIE - DAVIG OFFICED MOVE
20	divergent substantive interests in your writing	20	BY HEARING OFFICER MOLS:
21	class, right?	21 22	Q. So when you were discussing your time as a
22 23	A. Absolutely.	23	writing lector, you said that writing lectors do
24	Q. And they come together in the Little Red Schoolhouse based on their mutual desire to learn	24	hold discussion sections. Can you tell me what you said the instructors hold lectures and writing
25	how to be better writers, correct?	25	lectors do the discussion sections. How many
25		23	
	Page 1670		Page 1672
1	A. Correct.	1	discussion sections are there in a given week for
2	Q. As a lector in the writing program, you	2	the Little Red Schoolhouse course?
3	work with students on their papers and	3	A. One per week.
4	presentations. That's what the writing course is	4	Q. One per week?
_			
5	about, correct?	5	A. Uh-huh.
6	A. Students don't present papers in the	6	Q. And in the discussion sections that you
6 7	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program.	6 7	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing
6 7 8	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program.Q. Okay. So you work with them on their	6 7 8	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present?
6 7 8 9	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program.Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers?	6 7 8 9	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for
6 7 8 9 10	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program.Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers?A. Yes.	6 7 8 9 10	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section.
6 7 8 9 10 11	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter 	6 7 8 9 10 11	 Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were
6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do?	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes.	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes. Q. You don't teach. You don't lead a	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing lector, have you did you sorry, let me
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes. Q. You don't teach. You don't lead a discussion section which is separate and apart from 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing lector, have you did you sorry, let me rephrase.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes. Q. You don't teach. You don't lead a discussion section which is separate and apart from what the faculty member is teaching. You are the	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing lector, have you did you sorry, let me rephrase. In your time as a writing lector, were you
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes. Q. You don't teach. You don't lead a discussion section which is separate and apart from 	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing lector, have you did you sorry, let me rephrase.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes. Q. You don't teach. You don't lead a discussion section which is separate and apart from what the faculty member is teaching. You are the faculty?	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing lector, have you did you sorry, let me rephrase. In your time as a writing lector, were you only ever responsible for one section at a time
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Students don't present papers in the writing program. Q. Okay. So you work with them on their papers? A. Yes. Q. You do not give substantive matter lectures in the writing course, correct? A. Correct. Q. You do not lead discussion sections, correct? A. I do lead discussion sections. Q. That's what you do? A. Yes. Q. You don't teach. You don't lead a discussion section which is separate and apart from what the faculty member is teaching. You are the faculty? A. In the discussion section?	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. And in the discussion sections that you personally conducted, were you the only writing lector present? A. Yes. Every one writing lector for every discussion section. Q. Do you recall how many students there were in your group? A. It varies. The first time I think I had seven and second time I had five. So it's somewhere between five to seven, maybe sometimes eight, but, yeah, I think they try to keep it between five and eight. Q. Have you when you were a writing lector, have you did you sorry, let me rephrase. In your time as a writing lector, were you only ever responsible for one section at a time or

67 (Pages 1669 to 1672)

Page 1673 Page 1675 1 A. Actually in my experience, students mostly 1 So I see here from my notes, you were a 2 2 writing lector in the winter of 2015 or the winter came to office hours -- I mean, yes, one of the 3 or spring of 2016? 3 purposes of office hours is for students to clarify 4 A. No, the spring of 2015. 4 things that, you know, didn't understand in 5 Q. Oh, I'm sorry. 5 lectures, but one of the -- mostly what I found was 6 6 A. Fall, I'm sorry. students coming to me to ask rationale for grades 7 Q. Oh, I see that. Sorry, my mistake. 7 on assignments and to see where they could, you 8 8 Were you ever a TA during the same quarter know, get feedback from me really. So especially 9 when you were a writing -- also a writing lector? 9 in my first quarter of TA'ing, that was my 10 10 A. No. To apply for the writing lector or experience. The office hours were mostly used to 11 intern positions, you have to be -- you have to 11 get feedback, what did I do wrong, what did I do 12 have completed your TA requirements from your home 12 well, so I would give that feedback. 13 program, at least for BSD. 13 Q. Have you given training to others in the 14 HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I think that's all of my 14 lab that did not specifically relate to 15 15 dissertation? auestions. 16 MS. AUERBACH: I have a few. 16 A. Yes. 17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 17 MR. WEITZMAN: Objection, leading. 18 18 BY MS. AUERBACH: HEARING OFFICER MOLS: He's already answered 19 19 Q. So with respect to the writing lector the question, so you can proceed with the next 20 position, is there a deadline by which in the 20 question. 21 quarter by when students have to declare if they 21 BY MS. AUERBACH: 22 22 want to take the course pass/fail? Q. Can you give an examples of that? 23 23 A. I think it is the fifth week. That is A. So I came in to graduate school with a 24 24 somewhere middle of the quarter, but I am not background in computational biology which is not 25 exactly sure. 25 the focus of our lab. Our lab is very much a Page 1674 Page 1676 1 Q. And so did that happen that students did 1 developmental embryological lab. One instance 2 would be a workshop I gave on Mac lab which is a 2 not declare until the middle of the quarter that 3 3 coding software to those in my lab who did not know they wanted to take the course pass/fail? 4 A. Yeah. 4 how to code. That was an instance of, you know, me 5 5 O. Even if the students take the course giving them something which I wasn't working on, 6 6 but they potentially could be working on them. And pass/fail, do you still have to write comments on their papers? 7 another graduate student is actually using Mac lab. 7 8 8 A. Oh, yeah, everything else remains the HEARING OFFICER MOLS: When did that workshop 9 9 occur? same. 10 10 Q. You have to write a whole page of THE WITNESS: I believe sometime either late 11 comments --11 last year or early this year, very recently. 12 12 BY MS. AUERBACH: A. Yes. 13 13 Q. Do you have plans to publish a peer Q. -- on each paper? 14 reviewed paper? 14 A. Or more. 15 15 O. Or more? A. Yes. Hopefully later this summer, if not, 16 later this year. 16 A. Yeah. 17 17 Q. You talked about the online platform where Q. And that you have to do regardless of 18 you put your weekly plans up. Is that an 18 whether they're going for letter grade or 19 pass/fail? 19 expectation of Dr. Prince that you do that? 20 20 A. It was something that was suggested by A. Yes, yes. 21 21 Dr. Prince, something that we should try out as, Q. Did students -- going back to when you 22 22 you know, you know, a lab management thing. And held office hours when you were a TA, did students 23 23 she explicitly said if it doesn't work out, it use office hours for things other than asking you 24 doesn't work out. We revert back to our old 24 about things they didn't understand from the 25 methods of manage. 25 professors?

68 (Pages 1673 to 1676)

	Page 1677		Page 1679
,	_	1	
1	As it turns out it has really helped all	1 2	CERTIFICATION
2	of us keep ourselves to our own schedules because		This is to sensify that the attack of
3	previously we would have our own schedules, and	3	This is to certify that the attached
4	they would be private and nobody else would know,	4	proceedings before the National Labor Relations
5	you know, except for Dr. Prince. But now it's much	5	Board (NLRB), Region 13, in the matter of
6	more centralized. Everyone can see it. So it's	6	UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO and GRADUATE STUDENTS UNITE
7	very effective we found.	7	Case Number 13-RC-198325, at Chicago, Illinois, on
8	Q. When you say all of us, who are you	8	May 30, 2017, was held according to the record, and
9	referring to?	9	that this is the original, complete, and true and
10	A. All the graduate students in the lab, and	10	accurate transcript that has been given compared to
11	I believe the technician also does upload her	11	the recording, at the hearing, that the exhibits
12	weekly plans.	12	are complete and no exhibits received in evidence
13	Q. And when you talk about plans, what's	13	or in the rejected exhibit files are missing.
14	included in that?	14	
15	A. So the experiments that anybody has	15	D 1 0 227
16	planned for the week on a day-to-day basis. Yeah,	16	Raelene Stamm, CSR
17	primarily the experimental work goes into those	17	License No. 084-004445
18	plans.	18	
19	Q. Does that include the timing or just what	19	
20	you're going to do?	20	
21	A. I break it down by day of the week, so	21	
22	Monday I'll do this, Tuesday I'll do this,	22	
23	et cetera.	23	
24	Q. And approximately how many hours a week do	24	
25	you currently spend in the week?	25	
	Page 1678		
1	A. That's hard to estimate because it does		
2	fluctuate. So I don't I don't really know the		
3	answer to that. It could be somewhere between		
4	30 and 50, I have no idea.		
5	MS. AUERBACH: That's all I have.		
6	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Does Employer have any		
7	further questions for the witness?		
8	MR. WEITZMAN: Let me just check. May I go off		
9	the record for no more than five minutes?		
10	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Off the record.		
11	(WHEREUPON, a short recess was		
12	taken.)		
13	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: On the record.		
14	Does Employer have any further questions		
15	for the witness?		
16	MR. WEITZMAN: We do not.		
17	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: Thank you. You are		
18	excused.		
19	(Witness excused.)		
20	HEARING OFFICER MOLS: I think it's an		
21	appropriate time to adjourn for today. We will		
22	resume proceedings to tomorrow morning at 9:00 a.m.		
23	Off the record.		
24	(WHEREUPON, the hearing was		
25	adjourned at 4:15 p.m.)		

69 (Pages 1677 to 1679)

	accuracy 1608:24	administrative	aft 1622:13
A	accuracy 1008:24 accurate 1491:14	1436:23 1437:20	afternoon 1410:6
aaup 1435:23	1549:24 1570:12	1450:25 1457:20	1594:19 1626:6
1438:22 1439:4,12	1570:14 1608:3	1431.1 1433.19	agent 1616:3
abilities 1512:9	1679:10	1546:19	\mathbf{c}
ability 1551:12	act 1577:3 1609:11		agents 1534:20 1613:14
1557:11,12		administratively 1546:22 1547:3	
1565:18 1604:10	acting 1452:23 active 1479:24		ago 1411:22 1429:8 1544:8
1604:14 1633:23	1507:23 1549:2	admission 1550:8 1564:21 1569:23	
able 1429:5,17			agree 1427:18
1508:10 1524:12	activities 1438:7	1571:16 1602:2	1433:21 1536:13
1554:11 1558:10	1441:17 1573:12	1611:24	1537:4 1575:23
1575:14 1580:16	activity 1437:21	admit 1508:15	1637:7 1642:16
1580:21 1654:17	acts 1592:13	1516:12	1655:10 1656:8
aboveentitled	actual 1497:4 1532:9	admitted 1508:20	1664:4
1405:14	1613:8 1661:2	1599:18	agreed 1495:17
abovementioned	1662:6 1669:9,10	advance 1473:2,19	1514:2 1622:14
1611:16	adamant 1660:5	1495:11 1519:3	agreement 1547:14
absent 1442:9	adapt 1580:17,21	1527:23 1528:3,6	1597:20 1617:4
absenteeism 1610:9	add 1624:15	1534:5 1537:2	agreements 1547:8
1610:13	adding 1557:11,12	1590:9	agrees 1664:3
absolute 1422:2	1606:21	advanced 1544:13	ahead 1561:18
1661:1	addition 1644:18	1567:22 1579:12	1570:24
absolutely 1502:1	1654:20 1662:1	advancing 1566:17	aim 1567:20
1506:12 1509:17	1666:21	advisor 1423:18,20	airfare 1473:19
1516:17 1640:3	additional 1419:25	1423:22,23 1424:4	allan 1406:4
1655:14,22	1423:17 1541:24	advisors 1425:16	allegations 1436:20
1661:18 1662:22	1570:17 1572:6	1470:13 1474:6	alleviate 1538:5
1664:19 1669:22	1613:7 1618:21	1479:7 1492:25	alley 1510:15
abundantly 1604:18	address 1510:12	1599:12,13,14	allow 1438:6
academia 1487:24	1604:12 1605:2,3	1661:5	1531:22 1638:11
academic 1451:17	1606:18 1607:1,2	advocacy 1435:23	allowed 1435:18
1472:23 1486:16	1607:12,22,25,25	1438:22 1439:4	1524:6 1621:24
1487:12,13	1608:3,24 1609:20	affective 1602:17	allows 1665:13
1528:13 1567:13	1609:23 1614:2	affidavit 1605:11,20	alongside 1413:15
1571:14 1603:16	addressed 1578:12	1605:25 1606:8	1424:15
1608:13 1617:9	1631:4	1607:11,16 1608:6	alter 1535:21
1618:3,23,24	addresses 1604:12	1610:18	ambience 1529:8
1619:4 1620:17	1604:20,25	affidavits 1534:10	ambit 1653:20
academy 1448:25	1606:11,12,15,18	1534:15 1537:14	amenable 1613:12
acceptable 1454:4	1606:20,21,21,22	1537:23 1538:7	1616:7
accepted 1427:19	1606:24 1607:3,8	affirmation 1497:16	america 1405:1
1552:24	1607:12,17,20	1630:4,10,12	american 1406:15
access 1422:25	adduced 1617:17	affirmative 1602:20	aminus 1494:4
accomplishments	adjourn 1678:21	1603:5	1519:17 1561:15
1552:3	adjourned 1678:25	afforded 1429:8	1634:2 1642:24
account 1497:3	adjusting 1413:18	aforementioned	amount 1416:5
1550:4	administration	1623:18	1419:25 1462:14
	1594:4	afraid 1586:2 1592:6	1462:19,21 1463:4

1463:6,6 1503:2	1489:6,12 1508:13	apportioned 1524:3	argument 1448:3
1586:19 1618:20	1508:23 1523:23	appreciate 1483:21	1531:18 1575:23
amounted 1520:4	1576:4 1590:8	1516:5 1541:18	1599:18,21
amply 1524:3	apparent 1608:11	1602:12	1600:25 1601:1,10
analysis 1554:10	appeal 1437:6	approach 1554:8	1600.23 1001.1,10
analytic 1555:14	appealing 1592:5	approached 1637:23	1610:17 1616:18
1575:25 1576:2,3	1650:15		1628:25
analytics 1554:15,18	appear 1482:8	approaching 1604:22	
1555:5 1574:9	1505:11	appropriate 1472:14	argumentative 1628:12,16
1575:20 1576:20		1530:8 1594:11,21	*
analyze 1557:12	appeared 1435:24 appears 1495:11	1599:17 1601:2,11	arguments 1437:14 1669:11,15
•	1504:19	1602:19,21	aristotelian 1472:6
analyzed 1537:8 ancient 1479:25	applicable 1596:10	1610:23 1611:3,4	arrive 1462:18
1483:16	1597:17	1610.23 1611.3,4	1564:1
angles 1473:23		1616:21 1617:15	art 1487:7
angles 1473.23 announced 1459:1	applicant 1565:15 1565:17	1618:4 1621:21	art 1467.7 article 1580:3
			1651:25 1652:6,11
announcing 1473:13 answer 1413:17	applicants 1444:18 1444:19	1622:9 1624:9,20 1678:21	1652:15 1653:8
1428:9,16 1431:1	· -		1661:20,24
1441:3 1442:9	application 1524:21 1551:2,3 1555:1	appropriately 1599:21	articles 1471:16
1454:5 1458:19	*		1579:8 1653:1
1498:14 1518:25	1565:11 1573:2,19 1589:18 1666:24	appropriateness 1598:20 1602:15	
			arts 1487:6 1584:7
1520:5,8,9 1521:5 1522:14 1615:8	applications 1420:16	approval 1617:3	asham 1407:21
	1420:21,23 1421:3	approve 1482:16 1637:10	1625:21 1626:1,6
1624:7 1637:20	1443:19 1444:16 1444:21		1659:17
1639:2,4 1658:11		approved 1478:24 1621:18 1622:6	ashley 1548:1
1678:3	applied 1424:9		1553:21 1576:18
answered 1463:1,14	1463:18 1621:5,9 1621:13 1622:17	approximately 1415:11 1416:25	asked 1428:5 1434:17 1435:2
1522:11 1530:5,6 1602:19 1603:5			1434:17 1433:2
1628:13 1656:20	1623:1,23	1417:3,4 1470:15	
1675:18	applies 1432:15 apply 1444:9	1583:18 1586:3 1677:24	1455:20,22 1466:1 1466:5 1468:3
answering 1432:15	1487:17 1501:17	arbiters 1591:20	1469:17 1478:25
answering 1432.13 answers 1441:20	1503:6 1576:1	arch 1652:17	1479:5,10 1486:4,6
1592:9	1582:5,7 1596:5	area 1418:8 1450:3	1479.5,10 1480.4,0
antecedent 1483:5	1621:18 1673:10	1483:10 1485:11	1512:1 1516:8,16
anton 1407:3	applying 1463:17,19	1489:8 1505:19,22	1512.1 1510.8,10
	1479:1 1576:1	1602:24 1603:8	1516.21 1525.6
1410:11,17,17		1602:24 1603:8	
1411:1	appointed 1470:6 1565:9 1619:2		1617:7,8,11
anybody 1415:19		1654:24 1656:14	1628:13,15 1637:4
1677:15	appointment 1465:1	1657:19 1658:3	1638:3 1647:13
anymore 1428:20	1520:1,20 1522:2,3	areas 1473:11	asking 1442:6,25
anyway 1534:17	1527:6	1484:22 1485:21	1452:9 1453:17
ap5 1629:7,10,14	appointments	arent 1458:15	1484:8 1534:7
apart 1421:19	1467:12 1521:9	1500:11 1545:21	1536:5 1592:23
1481:12 1670:20	1524:18 1526:8	1575:22 1581:25	1626:7 1641:14
apologize 1456:9	apportion 1638:11	argue 1611:15	1674:23
1477:5 1485:23	1660:3	arguendo 1604:1	asks 1533:25 1665:9
	-	_	<u>-</u>

agmant 1,020.1	1414.17 1415 10	1410.11 1411 5	outoms#-1400.15
aspect 1639:1	1414:17 1415:12	1410:11 1411:5	automatic 1423:15
aspects 1546:13	1416:12 1417:16	1421:14 1426:19	autumn 1562:1
1558:20 1560:12	1442:20	1427:14 1429:3,12	1567:15 1586:14
1561:3,5	assisted 1478:16	1430:9 1433:15,17	1608:20 1611:5,21
assessing 1602:15	1485:12,16	1433:21 1436:17	1614:21
assessment 1496:10	assisting 1471:17	1438:13 1439:17	availability 1410:4
1557:15	1486:2	1441:1,8 1452:15	1523:2 1604:11,20
assign 1420:12	associate 1411:11,13	1454:15 1456:5	available 1410:5
1424:8 1515:9	1411:21 1412:3,7	1460:5,11,22	1508:1 1518:24
assigned 1414:2	1547:22,24	1461:10 1462:24	1520:9,12 1536:4
1416:23 1431:24	assume 1549:20	1463:3,16 1469:21	1536:21 1603:17
1495:7 1515:3	1550:25 1556:12	1476:2 1502:15	1650:13 1662:23
1556:18 1557:7,13	1642:21 1647:21	1508:16 1529:3,10	1662:24
1585:18,22	assuming 1553:24 1604:1	1530:4,21 1532:12	ave 1498:21
1642:10 1647:16		1533:3 1538:3,5,15	avenue 1406:11,16 1614:3
1647:16	assumptions 1664:17	1538:20 1539:4,8 1530:13 16 10	
assigning 1556:23		1539:13,16,19	average 1459:8
1648:1 1668:18,19	asterics 1622:12	1540:23 1541:5,9 1541:14,22 1542:2	1467:11 1475:7 1521:16 1668:22
assignment 1465:3	attached 1606:8 1679:3	1541:14,22 1542:2 1542:5 1550:12,17	
assignments 1413:5 1413:10,19	16/9:3 attachment 1624:10	1542:5 1550:12,17 1564:22 1569:24	averaged 1521:20 averages 1458:14
1413:10,19		1564:22 1569:24 1571:18 1578:18	averages 1458:14 avoid 1610:6
	attachments 1624:12 1624:13		
1420:12,19,19 1443:23 1455:18		1583:4,12 1584:19	avoided 1610:13
1443:23 1455:18 1465:9 1519:22	attend 1512:1,5	1589:10,17,21 1590:4 1593:10	award 1426:14
	1546:16 1559:5,11 1550:13 1576:5 7		1449:5,20 1450:8 awarded 1425:25
1567:25 1591:4,8 1675:7	1559:13 1576:5,7 attendance 1466:7	1594:2 1599:7,9,16 1600:12,25 1601:7	awarded 1425:25 1461:21
assigns 1424:6	1473:4 1512:2	1612:3 1623:10	1401:21 awards 1425:25
assigns 1424:6 1515:8,10,12	14/3:4 1512:2 attended 1507:13	1612:3 1623:10 1624:24 1627:25	awards 1425:25 1426:3 1449:13
assistant 1411:16	1510:7 1636:4,20	1624:24 1627:25	aware 1492:20
1412:2,4,25	attending 1464:23	1673:18 1675:21	1495:11 1498:11
1412:2,4,25	1509:17 1512:11	1676:12 1678:5	1506:17,20,21
1413:23 1414:3,7	1529:16 1635:25	auerbachs 1535:2	1629:11 1662:2
1432:12,21	attention 1427:6,13	1539:1	
1461:25 1462:1,9	1428:11 1572:2	august 1477:12	В
1461.23 1462.1,9	attorney 1538:3	authentic 1427:23	b 1408:1 1409:1
1462:11 1464:7,9	1539:1 1541:22,22	authenticated	1597:15 1606:7,13
1470:11,12 1471:5	1599:9 1600:25	1594:13	1621:10
1470.11,12 1471.3	attorneys 1539:2,6	author 1652:1,7,16	ba 1423:13,21
1485:15 1486:19	1539:11	1652:22 1653:1,5	bachelor 1487:6
1487:16,17	attracted 1649:25	1660:18 1661:15	bachelors 1543:25
1514:16,24 1529:5	attribute 1634:22	authorities 1506:6	1544:1
1514:10,24 1323:3	attributes 1650:15	authority 1495:3	back 1413:18 1429:1
1547:25 1637:8,9	audience 1579:17	1506:3 1510:21	1431:6 1441:14
1637:10	audiences 1669:17	authorization	1484:20,21
assistants 1412:12	auerbach 1406:10	1440:24 1441:6	1489:23 1508:23
1412:12,23 1413:4	1406:10 1407:4,7,9	authors 1661:6	1512:13 1522:21
1413:7,9 1414:1,11	1407:11,14,18,24	authorship 1661:4	1525:3 1528:3
, , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			<u> </u>

			1
1530:18 1540:11	basis 1421:22	1629:13,15	1669:4 1675:24
1547:24 1558:17	1423:24 1425:23	1631:15,18 1633:3	biomedical 1654:11
1558:21 1570:22	1426:9,14 1470:18	1633:8,9,19 1635:6	1654:14 1655:8
1609:25 1619:4	1525:4 1563:24	1636:8,17 1638:17	bishops 1506:2
1620:23 1622:1	1577:9 1645:4	1639:21 1641:6	bit 1415:6 1471:7
1624:7 1638:13,22	1665:8,15 1677:16	1642:12 1643:9,12	1473:25 1478:6
1653:9 1674:21	becoming 1435:10	1644:12 1647:15	1484:6 1500:6
1676:24	1448:25 1572:24	1647:16,20	1507:23 1514:6
background 1433:24	1573:10 1579:23	1649:13 1659:20	1522:2 1638:25
1521:24 1543:24	began 1485:14	1660:25 1662:8	1641:21 1662:17
1551:23 1565:12	1528:12 1544:14	1664:15,20	biweekly 1471:1
1573:3 1580:23	1594:18 1643:15	1676:10 1677:11	1517:10 1527:3,15
1675:24	beginning 1412:5	believed 1649:14	bloch 1406:9
backwards 1571:4	1415:2 1423:16	believes 1598:19	board 1405:2
bad 1489:19	1528:18 1561:10	beneficial 1511:17	1436:20 1534:11
ballot 1595:11,15,17	1611:11	beneficiary 1416:10	1537:5,16,20,24
1595:24 1596:6,11	begins 1570:21	benefit 1422:15,17	1595:19,24 1596:1
1596:13,15,24,24	begun 1544:7	1422:20 1442:2,12	1596:9 1598:22
1597:14,15,24	behalf 1406:2,8	1443:6 1444:2,12	1602:16 1611:9,10
1598:16,17,21	1436:4 1440:24	1450:20 1497:24	1611:20 1612:24
1602:16,18,21	1482:23	1657:6,8,17	1613:14 1615:20
1603:18,24 1604:4	believe 1415:19	benefits 1416:7	1616:3,8,20,23
1604:19,21 1605:6	1417:12 1418:6	1425:13 1441:16	1617:14 1621:19
1605:14 1607:7	1427:11 1431:9	benefitted 1415:25	1624:7 1679:5
1608:12 1609:9,16	1440:8 1442:10	1416:2 1509:19	boards 1537:17
1609:21 1610:19	1450:12 1453:5,11	1512:7,10	1596:2 1617:10
1610:22 1611:6,18	1465:12 1468:8	benefitting 1441:23	1623:6,20,22
1614:10,11	1470:7,21 1475:19	bennett 1406:9	bogged 1600:4
ballots 1596:16	1475:22 1478:2,3	best 1420:24	book 1464:14
1604:11,15,23	1478:10 1479:3	1445:13 1557:3	1468:12 1471:9,10
1605:9 1607:5	1484:18 1491:25	1567:20 1649:14	1482:9,11 1488:9
1608:25 1609:3,24	1492:2,5 1494:3,10	beth 1619:2	1490:21 1491:24
bargaining 1606:23	1494:15,19 1497:2	better 1446:15	1503:12 1649:3
base 1665:10,23	1499:3 1500:6	1457:23,25	books 1471:16
based 1427:22	1505:23 1506:6,24	1497:20,21	boon 1509:10
1458:16 1480:3	1510:15 1512:10	1512:18 1669:25	boring 1519:6
1490:6 1491:16	1518:23 1522:5	beyond 1419:21,24	borrow 1539:17
1511:19 1535:15	1523:9,10 1524:9	1422:8 1423:18	boston 1597:24
1603:7 1610:15	1525:1 1526:21	1460:7 1469:2	1598:7
1618:19 1629:2	1528:12 1536:1	1504:4 1518:1	bottom 1438:24
1653:13 1655:11	1545:1 1546:10,10	1533:8 1534:7	1505:5 1564:20
1657:24 1669:24	1553:22 1556:20	1541:24 1563:6	1570:16 1572:3
basic 1473:11 1545:5	1563:25 1564:15	1593:1 1618:10,20	1651:25 1652:14
1551:4 1555:15	1568:5 1569:7	1618:24 1619:13	bplus 1561:15
basically 1432:8	1576:20 1578:12	big 1422:23 1444:12	brainstorms 1649:21
1448:24 1473:7	1587:15 1598:10	biological 1614:4	branch 1660:11
1474:22 1586:12	1600:22 1609:12	1619:24	break 1488:16
1609:10	1613:11 1624:10	biology 1667:20	1521:11,14
		-	=

1520.10 21	1500.25 1516.2	1415.00 05 1416.1	1654.24
1530:18,21	1509:25 1516:3	1415:22,25 1416:1	1654:24
1531:12 1555:6	1543:2 1549:3	1417:23 1431:24	center 1508:6 1568:1
1583:4 1604:22	1554:6 1568:25	1441:13 1452:23	1614:4
1613:13,15	1584:8 1626:2	1452:25	centralized 1677:6
1677:21	1631:21 1659:8	case 1405:7 1424:5	centuries 1481:7,12
brief 1543:23	1660:20,24	1437:4,9 1456:14	century 1482:24
briefly 1513:18	1665:10 1667:7	1463:20 1471:22	certain 1448:10
1547:17 1606:13	calls 1410:11	1485:6,16 1501:1	1484:22 1499:7
bring 1645:10	1460:22 1542:15	1505:12 1506:7	1577:19,20
brings 1634:10,14	1627:9,10	1513:14 1515:5	1630:23 1638:4
broad 1533:7,9	calvins 1472:4	1533:17 1535:23	1639:23
1534:18	1484:14	1558:21 1559:8	certainly 1435:1
broadly 1505:23	camera 1437:14	1565:19 1581:4	1446:3 1453:15
1533:16	camp 1665:11,23	1582:22 1595:9,18	1506:16 1526:2
brought 1427:5,10	campaign 1623:5	1596:1,8 1597:10	1545:20 1546:12
1427:12 1428:11	campbell 1605:10,21	1597:12,12,17	1551:18 1556:7
1654:22	1605:25 1608:9	1598:15 1599:2	1557:19 1562:7
bsd 1619:24 1673:13	campbells 1606:8	1600:5,14 1601:18	1573:13,22 1576:7
budgetarily 1546:25	1607:10,16 1608:6	1602:14,15 1603:5	1579:12 1581:20
built 1491:7,25	campus 1511:5	1603:24 1604:5	1582:22 1588:15
bulk 1574:19	1598:9 1603:10,19	1608:4 1609:16	1614:10
burbs 1487:8	1608:15,20	1611:3,17 1616:9	certainty 1636:8
burden 1617:24	1611:18 1615:1	1616:22 1617:7,16	certificate 1508:8
1618:2 1623:19	candidacy 1485:25	1618:12 1621:4,6	1511:1
burdensome 1533:8	candidate 1461:15	1622:16 1623:24	certification 1509:10
1535:22	1470:1 1503:21	1629:2 1630:3	1679:1
business 1505:7	cant 1427:21	1642:23 1679:7	certify 1679:3
1568:12 1610:11	1447:15 1451:22	cases 1414:24	cervone 1406:9
busy 1650:12	1453:19 1498:23	1522:12 1524:12	cetera 1677:23
button 1528:23	1499:16 1505:1	1524:16 1596:2,15	chair 1426:7
bw 1617:20	1506:8 1562:6	1596:20,21,22	1449:11 1455:23
byproduct 1639:24	1626:12,17	1597:18,22 1600:1	1455:25 1456:2
byzantine 1505:24	capacity 1485:5	1601:14 1604:6	1598:18
	1493:25 1515:6	1610:2 1621:14	challenge 1497:9
<u> </u>	1523:15	1622:21 1623:3	1637:9
c 1406:1,16	capped 1524:8	1638:2 1641:8	challenges 1545:3
ca 1414:25 1415:3,10	card 1440:24 1441:6	cast 1595:11 1609:3	chance 1456:21
1416:2,16 1418:1	cards 1436:4 1437:3	catalogue 1464:13	1595:21
1433:11 1446:23	1476:25	categories 1442:22	change 1533:14
1451:10	career 1448:10	1584:23	1563:21
calculations 1586:24	1476:19 1545:9	catholicism 1484:14	changed 1486:24
call 1410:10 1421:3	1582:17 1649:11	caught 1514:21	1496:6,8,24 1498:3
1474:19 1510:1	1649:15 1663:12	causing 1609:4	1498:5 1513:10
1540:14 1541:20	careful 1600:9	ccooper 1406:17	1527:12,22
1542:13 1544:21	carried 1416:1	cell 1650:24,25	1535:12 1633:17
1548:7 1579:13	1425:2,14	1653:25	1639:15
called 1411:2	carry 1623:19	cells 1642:3 1646:12	changes 1533:12
1412:15,16 1461:7	cas 1413:20 1415:7	1652:18 1654:19	1633:20 1637:13

1660 17	1656 17 1657 01	1442 10 11 1444 5	1604 01 1660 0
1662:17	1656:17 1657:21	1443:10,11 1444:5	1624:21 1660:9
changing 1506:1,5	choose 1418:25	1447:25 1448:1,2	closing 1614:12
1548:17 1639:18	1427:16 1431:12	1457:20 1459:21	cloud 1514:11
channing 1406:15	1446:10,12	1467:1 1468:5,7,19	coadvisor 1493:3
chapter 1435:23	1577:12	1471:8 1481:23	cochrane 1547:21
1438:22 1439:4,13	chosen 1422:4	1491:13 1499:1,2,6	1553:20 1568:15
1439:15,16	1443:25 1458:7,19	1513:19 1515:24	1590:21
characterization	1502:20	1516:3,5 1517:16	cocoordinator
1535:2,19	christian 1464:7,9	1517:19 1521:1,4	1472:24 1474:21
characterize	1464:20,22	1522:4 1553:13,14	1474:24 1475:22
1509:24	1467:18 1469:8,25	1559:6,10,24	1528:1
characterized	1483:11 1484:15	1579:16 1603:16	cocoordinators
1525:15	1488:8,19 1489:4	1613:17 1626:24	1527:25
characterizes 1536:7	1490:9,15,17	1630:23 1636:19	code 1626:12 1642:2
charge 1452:25	1491:8,23 1492:9	1639:24 1643:1	1667:8 1676:4
1474:2	1493:8,10 1494:6	1644:24 1645:3,10	coding 1676:3
charged 1548:12	1494:21 1498:18	1645:17,22 1646:6	coffee 1473:13
charging 1539:2,11	1503:20 1504:3	1646:13,20 1669:5	1523:6,9,10,11
chart 1606:13	1506:11,25	1669:21	collaborates 1649:21
1620:25	1517:17 1518:7	classes 1421:23	1662:2
check 1442:3	1519:5,9 1521:18	1422:22 1448:20	collaboration 1439:5
1522:22 1527:8,17	1521:19	1448:23 1469:12	collaborative
1528:2,10 1541:11	christianity 1483:17	1559:9,9,11,13	1663:25 1664:5
1541:11 1665:24	1507:5 1510:14	1605:7 1606:4	colleague 1427:11
1678:8	1518:8,11	1613:17 1614:23	1547:21
checks 1527:7,11	christina 1405:15	classification	colleagues 1549:7
1528:14	christopher 1619:14	1617:12	1553:20 1568:15
chemical 1614:6	circle 1526:5	classifications	1590:21
chemistry 1551:24	circulated 1499:8	1616:25	collect 1440:11
chicago 1405:5,17	circulates 1463:22	classroom 1510:17	collecting 1426:6
1406:12 1411:9	circulation 1478:4	1510:21,22 1523:6	college 1465:16
1445:1,4 1451:3	circumstances	clear 1436:20	1487:7 1544:1,2
1461:12 1479:20	1596:17	1522:24 1535:7,25	1545:6 1546:25
1480:1 1488:14	citation 1472:13	1539:5 1604:18	1547:1,1 1548:18
1489:1 1508:6	cite 1602:13	1608:2,7 1610:15	1597:25 1598:7
1512:22,25	city 1609:19	1610:19 1614:20	1611:9
1528:23 1542:15	claim 1479:23	1617:22 1622:7	collegiate 1619:14
1543:7,14 1544:4,6	clarification 1431:7	clearly 1442:2,21	1619:15
1546:13 1551:1	1483:21 1494:18	1506:13 1537:9,11	colloquial 1484:25
1582:19 1603:11	1657:13	1538:13 1603:21	cologne 1544:10
1605:22 1608:15	clarify 1431:17	click 1528:24	colon 1464:14
1654:11,11,14	1462:24 1480:6	client 1539:3	columbia 1618:12
1655:7 1679:6,7	1488:22 1502:19	clock 1528:23	1621:24 1622:22
chicagos 1578:15	1519:8 1638:21	close 1540:13	column 1606:14
chip 1627:6,7,9,10	1675:3	1586:21 1606:1	1607:19
1635:25	clarity 1479:18	1617:2 1624:22	com 1406:7,13,17
choice 1514:6	1624:2	closed 1610:8	combination
1577:11 1610:5	class 1421:23	closer 1579:3	1465:11 1509:1
	-	-	-

	1		
1669:19	1633:11	1637:20	1502:18
come 1429:1	communicates	computational	confusing 1544:22
1432:23 1457:5	1608:7	1675:24	1546:21 1640:15
1473:15,16	communication	computers 1547:2	confusion 1538:5,25
1478:20 1526:5	1608:10	concede 1495:21	1571:1 1590:8
1530:18 1549:2	communications	concentrate 1448:22	congress 1475:13
1557:25 1558:21	1490:12	concept 1522:24	connect 1433:16,20
1575:9 1582:23	company 1610:11	concepts 1575:2	1659:12,14
1622:22 1632:11	1617:20	concern 1451:1	connection 1436:5
1669:23	comparable 1502:3	1524:25	1439:4 1481:9
comes 1507:20	1506:15	concerned 1434:20	1502:25 1661:20
1561:4 1566:19	compare 1424:24	concerning 1434:18	consider 1602:18
1570:21 1634:9	compared 1535:6	1594:21 1602:6	1604:9 1649:15
comfortable 1479:8	1641:7 1679:10	1612:15 1615:17	considerable 1609:7
1559:20 1640:5	comparing 1516:7	1616:18	consideration
coming 1540:13	compensated	concerns 1605:12	1509:13,17
1577:23 1591:1	1475:15	concession 1524:10	considerations
1606:5 1611:1	compensation	concluded 1503:11	1508:12
1675:6	1435:13 1450:18	1593:19	considered 1437:13
commensurate	1452:7	conclusion 1535:20	1438:5 1455:24
1525:11	competitive 1443:16	concrete 1472:3	1659:25 1661:4
comment 1495:9	compile 1471:9,14	concurrently	considering 1478:23
1551:6 1555:16	compiling 1468:17	1615:22	1539:20
1560:15,24,25	complaining 1433:4	conditions 1618:9	considers 1659:18
1561:3	complaint 1433:10	1620:6	consistency 1639:23
commented 1496:11	complaints 1432:20	conduct 1595:14	consistent 1447:9
commenting	1433:3	1603:19 1615:21	1611:8 1651:21
1466:19 1561:12	complement 1611:12	conducted 1522:10	consortium 1654:11
1565:13 1573:4	complete 1487:4	1595:7 1596:4,20	1654:15 1655:8
1574:10	1508:10 1511:5,18	1596:23,24	conspicuously
comments 1416:21	1553:5 1647:7	1597:19,23 1605:6	1442:9
1416:22 1495:8,12	1665:2 1679:9,12	1609:16 1611:3,17	constitute 1556:21
1495:18 1536:25	completed 1485:15	1611:17 1613:12	constraints 1508:11
1555:10,11 1561:4	1486:22 1620:2	1614:9 1662:6	construction
1561:8 1575:16	1655:24 1673:12	1672:7	1617:20
1576:16,19 1588:4	completely 1420:18	conducting 1518:17	consult 1540:3
1674:6,11	1600:10	1520:16 1522:15	consultant 1579:1,2
committee 1455:18	complex 1446:20,21	1596:12	1579:5,14 1581:1
1492:23 1493:1	complicated 1447:3	conference 1579:8	consultants 1578:11
1654:18 1655:4	1545:15 1556:24	confidence 1491:8	1578:13 1579:21
1659:18,25 1660:4	1557:20 1560:2	confident 1458:24	1580:19 1581:3,11
committees 1654:23	1584:25 1585:1,5	1518:25 1520:11	1582:17
common 1548:9	complication	1561:16 1581:13	consultation 1437:16
1566:24 1603:2,2	1585:10	1633:23	1602:4 1625:3
1603:14	complications	confirm 1479:11	consultations
communicate	1585:6	1626:13	1578:11
1565:19,19	component 1647:18	confirmation 1526:3	contact 1474:21
communicated	comprehensive	confused 1489:11	1547:11 1605:12

1,000,17	! 4-1472.14	1505.02 1507.15	1660.12 14 20
1608:17	coordinate 1473:14	1585:23 1587:15	1660:13,14,20
contacted 1513:17	1473:19 1475:11	1588:6 1593:23,24	1661:11,12,17,22
contained 1594:13	1512:2	1594:25 1601:1	1661:24,25 1662:4
1633:6	coordinated 1475:14	1624:5,5,6,24	1662:16 1663:4,5,7
contemporaneously	coordinator 1472:20	1626:11,15,16,19	1663:8,10,11,13
1603:14	1473:9 1474:2	1626:22,23 1627:1	1664:12 1665:17
content 1481:1	1475:16 1527:18	1627:2,4,5,13,15	1665:18 1666:9,14
1669:11	1527:18 1548:2	1627:16,16,21	1666:15,19,20,25
context 1503:7	core 1548:5,9,11,14	1628:2,10 1629:4,5	1667:1,4,5,7,13,21
1651:10 1654:1,17	1548:15 1556:19	1629:18,19	1668:1,11 1669:2,6
continual 1555:10	1556:22 1558:1	1630:25 1631:1,5,6	1669:25 1670:1,5
continue 1435:18	1563:24 1574:7	1631:9 1635:5,7,11	1670:12,13,15
1593:1 1616:16	1585:21 1586:11	1635:14,15,18,19	correcting 1652:20
continued 1643:15	cornell 1622:11	1636:6,14,15,21,23	correctly 1476:16
continues 1604:17	corner 1578:17	1636:25 1637:1,4,5	correspond 1471:10
1650:5 1663:1	correct 1431:15,20	1637:14,15,17	corresponding
continuing 1470:8	1433:2 1445:15,17	1639:7,20 1640:11	1661:6
1618:9 1620:6	1445:20 1449:13	1640:12,15,16,19	corroborate 1525:21
continuity 1645:11	1450:18,19 1451:5	1640:20,23	1594:5
1647:1	1452:4 1463:8	1641:12,13,15	cosponsored 1475:9
contradict 1627:19	1472:11 1478:11	1642:1,4,5,8,11,12	cota 1503:21
1628:7,17	1485:10 1486:5,8	1642:14,19,20	1505:17
contradicts 1628:16	1486:11 1487:14	1643:3,4,8,23	cotad 1505:14
contrary 1595:19	1487:18,19,25	1644:4,16,17,20,21	cotaing 1505:15
1618:16	1488:7 1490:3,22	1644:25 1645:1,4,5	council 1473:2,18
contrasting 1516:7	1491:1 1492:24	1645:7,8,11,12,15	1527:23 1528:3
contributed 1473:24	1493:25 1494:7,8	1645:16,19,20,24	counsel 1528:6
contribution	1494:22,25 1495:4	1646:3,4,6,7,10,11	1537:18,21 1610:5
1661:10,14	1495:14,15,22	1646:14,15,18,19	1610:16
control 1533:20,24	1496:19 1497:10	1647:1,2,5,6,14	counsels 1610:1
1536:8,13,17	1497:25 1498:6,11	1648:4,7,8,10,11	count 1451:12,13
controversy 1506:8	1498:24 1499:12	1648:13,14,16,17	1531:16 1541:7
convenient 1522:5	1499:19 1500:18	1648:20,22,23,25	1581:20
conversation	1501:1 1502:7	1649:3,13 1650:19	counted 1609:25
1474:10 1479:11	1503:15,25	1650:20,24 1651:1	counting 1541:9
1501:15,20 1503:3	1505:16 1506:11	1651:2,4,5,7,8,11	country 1546:16
1516:2 1566:18	1506:19 1507:9	1651:12 1652:3,4,8	1609:18,19
1664:8	1509:21 1511:13	1652:9,12,13,18,19	couple 1423:15
conversations	1515:9 1516:10	1652:23,24 1653:2	1430:11 1431:7
1520:5	1517:24 1519:3,10	1653:3,7,11,12,18	1448:19 1450:16
convert 1545:19	1519:11,25 1520:3	1653:22,23 1654:1	1452:15,17 1456:8
converting 1568:22	1521:9 1525:19,23	1654:2,5,8,12	1459:20 1470:8
convey 1633:24	1526:6,21,23,24	1655:8,9,14,21,22	1474:19 1482:6,20
convince 1654:17	1529:16,21	1656:2,3,6,12,13	1501:18 1503:4
1655:4	1537:18 1538:20	1656:17,18	1507:13 1513:20
coop 1482:17	1539:8,12,15,16,24	1657:22,23,25	1516:2 1524:22
cooper 1406:15	1548:22 1553:24	1658:1,3,4,8,15,18	1536:2 1588:5
1541:22	1572:21 1582:4	1658:21,24	1621:12

1410 10 17	1554 < 14 10 10 22	1510 0 1510 1 7	15.60.15
course 1412:12,15	1554:6,14,18,19,23	1512:8 1513:1,7	critique 1560:15
1412:16,17,23,25	1555:3,18,19,21,25	1514:13,14 1517:3	1575:12 1630:25
1413:2,4,7,9,12,13	1556:4,5 1557:25	1517:8 1519:24	1631:4 1635:5
1413:25 1414:1,3,7	1558:6,7 1560:3,3	1521:15 1552:25	critiques 1635:3
1414:11,17,18	1560:6 1563:25	1553:11 1556:21	1646:22
1415:2,12,13	1566:5 1567:9,23	1556:22 1560:4	cross 1410:7 1452:12
1416:12 1417:16	1567:24 1568:1,3	1566:5 1575:11	crossexamination
1420:10,11,20	1568:20,21,25	1577:20 1585:20	1430:20 1476:13
1421:15 1422:1	1569:6,20 1571:15	1590:12 1628:8	1531:19 1583:11
1432:21,21 1433:5	1572:10 1574:3,17	coursework 1481:21	1594:18 1625:1,13
1442:20 1443:3,5,9	1574:19,20,25	1488:25 1491:16	1625:20 1626:4
1444:15 1446:1	1577:8,14,21	court 1437:6	crossexamine
1447:6 1449:25	1579:7 1587:13,14	1442:15	1541:25
1450:14 1457:5	1590:11,19,20,24	cover 1425:24	crosslist 1507:1
1463:24 1464:11	1591:23 1611:20	1463:24 1487:21	crosslisted 1503:24
1465:3,7,10,13,20	1626:10,14,21,25	1488:2 1499:7	1504:2 1505:9
1465:22 1467:5,17	1627:21 1628:9,21	1530:8	crucial 1551:20
1467:24 1468:5,10	1629:7,7,12,15,17	covered 1410:3,4	csr 1679:16
1468:15,20,22	1632:1,1,11,18	1620:5 1623:25	culture 1473:22
1469:15,24 1474:5	1633:15,18,21,22	covers 1421:22	1567:7
1477:21 1482:2,14	1635:24 1636:3,14	craft 1507:14,16	current 1435:24
1483:2,7 1485:13	1636:25 1637:4,6	1508:4,7,24	1475:20 1482:14
1485:17,18 1487:1	1640:4 1642:1,3,6	1509:14,21	1598:17 1650:17
1488:13 1490:4	1642:15,18,22	1510:25 1511:21	1651:20 1653:14
1491:10,24	1643:5,9,12	1512:8,11 1669:15	1653:21 1659:14
1493:12 1494:1	1645:11,13	crafting 1474:3	currently 1411:6,17
1495:3 1497:19	1647:12,18	craftsman 1669:14	1417:2,6 1424:6
1499:13,15,16,23	1666:18 1667:6,9	create 1545:13,22	1427:2 1429:3
1499:24,25 1500:2	1667:10,12,20,24	1552:20	1452:21,23 1453:9
1500:12 1501:5,17	1667:25 1668:9,15	created 1482:9	1461:11 1525:24
1501:19,23 1502:4	1670:4,12 1672:2	1501:2,8 1544:15	1553:19 1556:20
1502:4,11,12,14,21	1673:22 1674:3,5	1554:11 1558:3,4	1648:3 1666:9
1503:19,23	courses 1412:11,14	1568:22	1677:25
1504:18 1505:7,8	1412:19,20,21	creating 1546:1	curriculum 1421:21
1505:14,15,18	1413:1 1414:16,21	1552:10,18	1422:3 1446:25
1506:13,19,22,23	1414:22 1415:24	creation 1466:10,11	1447:10 1455:12
1507:2,17 1511:21	1420:25 1421:5,6	creative 1545:24	cv 1420:18 1464:1
1513:10 1514:18	1421:10 1422:23	1546:4	1479:3 1487:21
1514:24 1515:16	1431:24 1432:10	creator 1552:14,16	1488:3 1491:19
1515:20 1517:10	1453:12,13 1464:4	credential 1511:10	1511:10,16
1517:21 1518:10	1464:17,19 1469:3	1511:15,19	cx 1407:2
1518:13 1519:22	1469:6,19 1483:6	credentialing 1511:8	
1521:10,21,24	1483:23 1484:2,5	credibility 1449:22	<u>D</u>
1522:22 1526:22	1484:12,18 1488:5	credit 1432:16	d 1406:3,16 1407:1
1526:25 1544:16	1490:3,24 1493:7	1649:20 1650:9	1417:5 1418:15,16
1551:20 1553:3,4,9	1507:8,11,12,16	credits 1650:10	1422:7 1449:1
1553:12,13,18,19	1508:25 1509:8,14	criteria 1449:19	1451:3,23,24
1553:23,25 1554:5	1509:15,21,22	critical 1665:5	1458:10 1461:11

1461.15 17 10 22	doop 1462.22 1464.1	dolor: 1410:7 1540:5	1528:18
1461:15,17,19,22	dean 1463:22 1464:1	delay 1410:7 1540:5 delighted 1522:21	
1465:14,18 1470:1	1525:9,9 1619:7,23	8	deputy 1547:21
1498:10 1503:14	1650:11	deliver 1420:13	described 1491:13
1503:17 1505:13	deans 1512:3	1671:1	1605:20 1608:4
1505:16 1583:15	dearborn 1405:16	delivered 1494:7	1627:18 1628:4
1584:4,12,22	debates 1481:5	1515:19	1629:8 1647:12
1585:24 1586:4,24	december 1411:15	delivering 1465:2	1664:11
1619:9 1624:10	1411:22,23	1516:25	describing 1414:13
1649:2 1656:8,9	1430:24 1431:5	demand 1500:5	description 1420:20
1664:19	decentralization	1548:25 1562:4	1549:19,25
daily 1665:7,15	1536:18	demanding 1639:22	1564:15 1569:19
dam 1544:10	decentralized 1619:6	demonstrate	1569:20 1571:12
data 1654:21	decide 1426:9	1524:15 1579:19	1578:10
1659:10 1661:3	1449:12,19 1556:4	demonstrates 1623:4	descriptions 1426:24
1663:7	1615:11 1668:13	demonstrating	deserved 1467:2
date 1595:1 1598:4	decided 1425:2	1618:3	deserving 1640:3
1610:25 1611:4,10	1597:23 1622:23	denigrating 1485:1	design 1420:10
1613:25	1625:4 1665:5	deny 1631:12	1421:6,8,15
dated 1427:5	decides 1665:16	denying 1635:7,8	1507:22 1510:10
1477:11 1599:1	decision 1436:7,9	department 1411:12	1638:10
1605:23	1447:16 1505:20	1414:8 1415:20,20	designed 1553:9
dates 1489:11	1511:18 1540:16	1416:24 1417:1,5	1666:12
1610:7 1612:16	1592:7 1594:11	1417:10,13,17	designs 1443:11
david 1619:7	1597:16,25	1418:1,13,19	1510:13
day 1468:5 1498:24	1598:17 1607:4	1421:5,17 1423:11	desire 1479:3 1509:1
1513:18 1516:4	1621:10,20,23	1425:25 1431:12	1659:14 1669:24
1522:25 1540:24	decisional 1456:11	1435:8,15 1439:8	desired 1478:25
1541:4,13 1542:8	decisions 1437:6	1444:24 1445:17	desires 1604:9,16
1603:20 1605:8	1482:15 1596:5	1448:8 1449:11	desperate 1418:7
1613:12,14	1597:7 1611:9	1451:4 1452:22	despite 1525:12
1614:24 1647:4	declare 1673:21	1453:10,13,21	1650:10
1677:21	1674:2	1454:9 1455:19	detail 1439:9 1481:3
days 1458:15 1541:9	deducted 1462:14,20	1456:1,2 1457:8	1506:8 1527:21
1603:20 1606:3	1462:20 1463:6	1458:11 1503:24	1613:8
1610:9,11 1611:20	deemed 1622:8	1504:20 1544:11	details 1418:4
1614:9,15	1623:24	1546:23 1547:11	determination
daytoday 1677:16	defer 1428:23	1568:9,11 1577:18	1436:23 1479:22
dbblaw 1406:13	define 1432:4	1618:18 1626:8	1497:10
dd 1597:21 1598:11	defined 1604:3	departments 1418:5	determinations
1600:1,3,8 1617:3	defines 1616:24	1418:10 1457:18	1472:6
deadline 1673:20	degree 1451:3	1547:6,9 1577:24	determine 1427:22
deal 1438:21	1479:8 1487:5	depend 1522:17	1474:7 1515:14
1439:21 1516:6	1490:5 1491:15	depending 1480:19	1591:10 1608:24
1669:10	1499:20 1543:25	1540:11 1577:13	determined 1479:19
dealing 1432:16,20	1577:18 1618:19	1590:25 1614:20	1598:5 1617:19
1615:12 1669:8	1636:7 1639:10	1615:20	determining 1587:3
dealt 1652:3,7,11	1655:3 1658:7	deploy 1545:1	1591:5 1602:20
1653:2,5	1664:16,23	deposit 1528:11,12	develop 1558:22
	'	,	1

	•		
1568:23 1659:7	1556:25 1566:10	1594:22 1598:2,11	1414:17,21,24
developed 1631:13	1566:11 1570:24	1602:4 1604:2,8	1415:1,4 1434:6,21
1649:18 1653:10	1574:4,6 1577:25	1610:6 1615:10	1464:25 1465:23
development 1659:4	1580:15,22 1583:1	1619:3 1621:6,18	1465:24 1466:6
developmental	1589:2 1603:15	1622:6,17,24	1467:8,9 1468:21
1626:14,21	1624:4 1637:24	1623:1 1625:3	1468:24 1474:13
1627:12 1676:1	1638:19	1627:21 1628:9	1474:15 1492:10
deviation 1617:17,24	differently 1491:22	directors 1540:16	1502:2 1503:11
1618:15 1623:6,20	difficult 1417:18	1547:25 1598:21	1517:4,10,14,18,24
devote 1415:12	1480:23 1525:16	1602:18 1610:3	1518:1,9,17,19
1425:6	1545:15 1614:1	1621:20	1519:2 1522:23
devoted 1467:4	difficulties 1545:7	disagree 1535:18	1526:12 1540:2
dgs 1447:19,20	difficulty 1417:15,23	1575:23 1617:15	1559:14 1575:17
diagnostic 1574:8	1522:23	1617:22 1664:1,4	1575:19,21
1575:25	dig 1560:12	disagrees 1664:3	1629:23 1630:8,13
diagnostics 1555:5	digitized 1480:22	disbursement	1630:16,17,22
dicta 1598:18	diminishing 1512:23	1527:13	1631:2,23 1632:14
didnt 1441:22	dire 1427:16	discouraged 1618:23	1632:25 1633:1,7
1442:5 1484:25	direct 1410:5 1411:4	discourages 1619:12	1633:20 1635:9,13
1485:4 1486:7	1449:7 1461:9	1619:21 1620:1	1636:5,20,25
1495:13,24 1497:9	1491:2 1528:11,12	discovery 1533:10	1637:3 1640:25
1517:25 1520:13	1528:18 1542:5	1533:24	1641:2,4,5,8
1541:7 1576:4	1543:4 1572:2	discretion 1559:16	1645:13 1646:6,8
1592:8,19 1600:3	1583:3 1598:12	discs 1638:6	1670:14,16,20,23
1629:22 1632:11	1628:5,13 1660:16	discuss 1416:21	1671:4,23,25
1635:21,23	directed 1595:9	1424:7 1430:3	1671:4,23,23
1636:10 1641:17	1604:18 1611:3	1431:18 1473:7	discussionbased
1649:12,15	1620:8	1501:14 1502:18	1559:9
1657:17 1662:18	directing 1598:17	1501:14 1502:18	discussions 1416:4
1668:13 1674:24	1609:10	1502.24 1515.25	1474:4 1502:2
1675:4	direction 1597:17	1614:13 1624:4	1517:13 1522:6
diego 1602:13	1598:1 1607:4	1630:24 1637:3	
O .			1645:17,18,21,23 1647:11
1603:23 1604:3,7 differed 1628:22	1621:10 1637:2 directly 1431:24	1641:1 1663:3,6,9 1663:12,14,15	disenfranchise
difference 1490:11	directly 1431.24 director 1411:11	* *	1595:20
1545:11 1579:15	1418:24 1420:21	discussed 1425:1	disenfranchised
1545:11 1579:15	1418:24 1420:21 1420:22 1424:5,13	1466:15 1502:5,9	1609:15
	,	1503:2 1517:23	disenfranchisement
differences 1467:24	1426:7,8 1427:12	1610:24 1618:11	
1524:4 1667:23	1431:10,18 1432:5	1622:20 1632:13	1609:4
different 1415:17	1432:12 1435:7	1650:21,23	disenfranchising
1419:10 1421:24	1436:24 1437:16	1652:23	1598:13
1458:4,5,6 1467:23	1439:7 1447:4,17	discusses 1439:3,9	disproportionately
1481:12 1488:2,23	1448:16 1449:12	discussing 1440:21	1609:15
1490:7 1527:8	1450:24 1455:11	1507:21 1517:4	dispute 1604:14
1528:9 1539:4	1455:21,22 1540:3	1521:24 1613:13	dissertation 1481:2
1545:2,10,24	1540:8,12 1543:9	1616:7 1671:21	1481:5,14 1486:2
1546:16 1547:9	1547:18,20,22,23	discussion 1410:2,22	1486:23,24
1555:12 1556:21	1547:23,25	1412:23 1414:5,6,9	1492:23 1493:1
		-	-

1500 5 1500 1	1420 2 1477 0 20	1, , 1,00,17	1641 14 1642 2
1502:7 1503:1	1430:2 1477:8,20	domain 1432:17	1641:14 1642:2
1650:18 1653:15	1477:23 1504:9	dont 1413:11 1414:2	1647:15 1659:20
1653:21,22	1532:9 1539:17	1415:7,19 1417:25	1660:1,2 1664:6
1656:10,15,25	1549:16,22	1422:18,21,21	1665:12 1667:8
1657:3,6,8,20	1569:11 1578:2,7	1425:8 1433:6,8,21	1669:10 1670:6,19
1658:3,20,23	1600:14 1602:3,8	1434:1 1441:25	1670:19 1678:2,2
1659:2,12,13,16	documentary	1442:2,15 1444:20	dorm 1543:20,20
1665:5 1675:15	1601:17	1447:18 1448:2	1599:13
dissertations	documentation	1449:25 1450:12	dormitory 1543:17
1421:12	1474:12	1450:21,22,22,22	double 1541:11
distinction 1495:21	documents 1429:13	1450:23 1451:6,18	doubt 1450:22
1507:4,6	1437:15 1438:20	1451:18,19 1453:1	doubts 1604:23
distinctive 1546:14	1439:18 1468:17	1453:22,23,24	dowd 1406:9
distributed 1451:6	1480:18,22	1454:1,3,4,6	dr 1441:3 1483:24
1459:4	1495:10 1504:16	1455:10,10	1484:3 1511:20
distribution 1639:20	1525:20 1533:14	1456:24,25	1517:1 1619:17,20
divergent 1669:20	1533:16,17,19,20	1457:13,14	1619:23,25 1627:3
divided 1465:8	1533:21,23,25	1458:12 1459:19	1627:6,11,18,19,20
1480:20 1483:14	1534:6,11,19	1470:7 1472:9	1627:22,23 1628:5
dividing 1506:4	1536:3,12,15,21,22	1478:2 1482:21,22	1628:6,7,22,23
divinity 1461:15,18	1537:2,14,20,22	1483:5 1491:21	1629:3,4,6,12,21
1462:12 1463:22	1538:8,10,14,17,18	1494:4,19 1498:15	1629:21 1630:8,21
1469:11,12	1540:4,15 1580:6	1500:19 1501:5,12	1631:8,21 1632:10
1470:14 1473:5	1600:4,6	1502:15 1508:16	1632:23 1633:5,10
1483:9 1489:1	doesnt 1433:8	1509:22 1515:9	1633:22 1634:9,14
1500:14 1503:18	1446:23 1447:25	1516:19 1520:21	1634:23 1635:3,10
1503:18,25 1504:3	1471:13,20 1480:5	1523:9,10 1524:22	1635:12,20 1636:8
1504:18 1505:10	1480:6 1495:20	1525:2,4,17 1527:6	1636:14 1637:16
1506:18,19	1533:14 1582:19	1527:12 1529:10	1637:17,22,23,24
1507:15 1511:23	1588:10 1601:5	1530:9 1535:23	1637:25 1638:14
1520:21 1522:4,7	1614:17,17	1536:8 1538:24	1638:18,25 1639:4
1523:8,12,15,21	1628:17 1676:23	1540:19 1542:7	1639:17,19
1524:1,11,17	1676:24	1545:8,20 1546:3	1642:12,13 1643:2
1525:14 1526:4	doing 1416:3,5	1546:10,17	1643:3,22,23
1527:11 1528:13	1420:1 1422:24	1550:15 1553:4	1644:12,15,15,19
division 1461:14	1425:9,20 1433:9	1559:22 1561:17	1644:19,21 1647:9
1511:23 1546:23	1433:25 1448:5	1561:17 1563:4,4	1647:10 1648:6,10
1547:11,13 1619:8	1486:18 1488:20	1573:18 1576:8	1648:13,16,19
1619:15,23	1497:23 1512:20	1581:9,9 1582:2,21	1649:7,9,13,17,21
1620:16	1518:20 1519:2	1582:21 1584:13	1649:25 1650:4,22
divisions 1524:3,6	1531:3 1532:7	1585:8,9 1586:2,6	1650:22 1651:21
1547:6,9 1619:4	1544:14 1555:10	1587:2 1592:12,21	1653:5,9,10,13,16
1620:20	1574:16 1575:24	1593:4 1599:16,21	1660:17 1661:13
divorced 1669:6,7,7	1580:19 1585:4	1600:14 1604:13	1661:20 1662:2,9
doctrinal 1506:7	1595:18 1609:5	1613:2,25 1614:24	1662:15,20,22
document 1426:20	1630:6 1636:10	1626:12 1631:12	1663:16,20 1664:2
1426:22 1427:17	1640:5 1650:7	1631:18 1634:11	1665:1,4,9,13,19
1428:1 1429:11,20	1665:14	1634:13,18 1636:4	1666:6 1676:19,21
			•

1677.5	1514:23 1522:23	1566:2 1577:12	1600.01 1600.1 0 7
1677:5 droft 1545:18			1622:21 1623:1,2,7
draft 1545:18	1598:2 1622:20	1582:23 1588:25	1623:21,22
1554:11 1570:21	1660:9 1665:20	1590:25 1597:14 1597:16 1617:3	1624:16,20,20
drafted 1535:5 drafts 1580:9	1671:2 early 1472:11	1597:16 1617:3	eligible 1595:10 1598:24 1602:23
	•	1631:12 1647:4	
dramatic 1619:16,17	1483:16,19 1484:14 1505:24	1676:10 elaborate 1595:16	1602:25 1603:6,12
dramatically 1660:7 draw 1551:25	1484:14 1505:24 1540:24 1544:8		1604:24 1616:24 1623:25
draw 1551:25 drawing 1495:22	1540:24 1544:8 1580:9 1605:7	election 1594:23,24 1594:24 1595:7,8	1623:25 email 1449:7,8
drawing 1495:22 drawn 1418:5,8	1580:9 1605:7 1676:11	1594:24 1595:7,8 1595:17 1596:11	emaii 1449:7,8 1521:2 1522:11,15
drawn 1418:5,8 1504:20	16/6:11 earn 1563:1	1595:17 1596:11 1596:12,16,21	1521:2 1522:11,15 1608:11
draws 1513:25	earn 1503:1 easier 1484:11	1596:12,16,21	emails 1426:5
drop 1501:6 1565:20	1502:3 1512:17,19	1597:13,16,17,19	1496:16
1565:20	1502:3 1512:17,19	1597:20 1598:1,3	embryological
dropin 1563:24	1624:6	1600:2,20 1602:7	embryological 1676:1
dropped 1501:5	east 1506:4,5	1600:2,20 1602:7	emerge 1545:8
dropping 1564:3,4	1543:16 1614:5,6	1602:10,18,21	emphasis 1668:10
1565:21	easy 1488:18	1603.18 1004.4,18	empire 1506:3
drosophila 1638:6	1499:18 1575:2	1604.20,21 1603.6	employ 1453:10
duces 1532:6	editions 1472:9	1609:10,16 1610:6	employed 1411:6
1539:21	education 1421:18	1610:19 1611:2,8	1432:13 1543:6
due 1527:23 1540:25	1431:11 1435:7,14	1610:19 1611:2,8	employees 1534:2,4
1541:2 1650:10	1431.11 1433.7,14	1612:16 1613:9,25	1604:12
duke 1598:14	1456:17 1509:18	1612:16 1613:9,23	employer 1405:6
1621:17 1622:6,19	1597:7	1614.9 1613.3,10	1406:2 1429:13
duly 1410:14 1411:2	educational 1543:24	1620:8 1621:11	1430:1,17 1434:17
1460:25 1461:7	educational 1545.24 edwin 1627:7	1623:23 1624:21	1434:25 1437:10
1542:18 1543:2	1632:10 1642:13	elections 1595:25	1434.25 1437.10
1626:2	effect 1442:11,13	1596:3,6,23	1437.13,23
dus 1418:4	1536:12 1606:3	1597:23 1598:22	1440:17 1476:9
duties 1425:12	effective 1431:3	1609:1 1610:4	1477:9,16 1504:5
1602:24 1603:7	1554:13 1568:24	1621:23	1504:10,12,23,24
1664:25	1677:7	electric 1602:13	1508:17,19
dvbi36200 1642:1	effectively 1448:4	1603:23 1604:3,7	1529:11 1530:16
dvbi36400 1626:11	1554:16	electronically	1531:9,10,16
dx 1407:2	effectuate 1609:11	1528:16	1532:10,17,22
dynamics 1506:5	effort 1434:19	element 1474:1	1533:20,22
	1525:4,13	1475:10 1499:11	1534:14 1537:2
E	efforts 1438:21	elevator 1596:7	1541:19 1542:13
e 1406:1,1 1407:1	eight 1429:7 1453:16	eleven 1406:6	1549:12,17
1408:1 1409:1	1458:16 1468:9	eligibility 1531:18	1550:18,20 1564:8
1597:21 1598:11	1499:23 1500:24	1594:21 1600:19	1564:13,23 1565:1
1600:3 1603:13	1501:22 1502:21	1615:3 1616:18,22	1569:12,13,25
1617:3	1567:25 1575:6	1616:23 1617:10	1570:2 1571:6,9,22
eager 1551:25	1672:16,17	1617:15,18,18,25	1578:3,8,19,21
1565:18 1566:3	eighth 1405:17	1618:1,6 1621:5,8	1593:18,21,25
earlier 1441:12,13	either 1460:7	1621:9,13,15,16,22	1594:14,20 1595:3
1456:9 1479:10	1498:22 1533:20	1622:1,4,7,14,18	1597:1 1598:8

1599:3 1600:13	enjoy 1471:13	ethics 1412:15	1461:8 1543:3
1601:3 1602:1,8,9	1543:22	eunics 1412:15 evaluation 1492:16	1401:8 1545:5 1626:3
1601:3 1602:1,8,9	enrollment 1468:8	1647:8	example 1458:23
1606:13 1610:18	1501:4	event 1475:12	1472:4 1566:13
1611:24,25 1612:8	enrollments 1500:6	1509:25 1607:3	1573:18 1579:25
1612:10 1614:14	ensure 1421:16	1609:23 1007.3	1575.18 1579.25
1615:3 1616:20	1607:5 1611:11	events 1439:13	1592:18 1597:10
	entail 1432:6	1507:24 1509:12	1597:18 1621:7
1620:9,15,23,24 1621:22 1623:13			
	1543:18	1512:1 1543:21	examples 1558:15 1657:4 1675:22
1623:15 1624:14	enter 1593:19,22	eventually 1669:3	
1625:12 1651:15	entered 1461:19	everybodys 1647:5	exams 1413:10,11,12
1678:6,14	1470:7 1485:24	evidence 1429:25	1466:11,13
employers 1408:4	entering 1439:21	1430:2,7 1438:19	1483:12,15,16
1438:4,20 1439:24	1488:24	1439:18 1532:16	1495:7 1496:17
1440:1 1530:19	entertain 1443:19	1532:20 1533:18	1503:9,13
1531:25 1533:21	1614:11	1533:19 1565:3	exceeded 1526:7
1533:23 1534:24	entertaining 1546:3	1570:4,7 1571:24	exception 1596:13
1540:9 1550:9	enthusiasm 1522:22	1578:23 1590:3	exceptions 1545:20
1571:17,20 1594:3	entire 1475:22	1594:1,10,16	excess 1523:18
1594:9 1597:5	1588:6 1606:25	1599:4 1600:18	1619:21
1599:18 1601:11	1624:5	1601:8,17 1612:2,4	exchange 1575:21
1602:2 1612:1,24	entirely 1421:7	1612:9,12 1617:16	exclusive 1495:10
1613:5 1615:17	1431:21 1535:11	1618:3,7,17,22	1627:21 1630:2
1617:1 1620:13	1601:2 1668:12	1620:14 1623:9,13	exclusively 1545:25
1623:9 1625:20	entitled 1433:19	1623:17 1679:12	1551:21 1559:25
employment	1436:10,13 1444:8	exact 1464:13	1560:1 1628:9
1618:10 1620:7	environment 1555:8	1593:25 1614:1	1629:3 1636:16
enable 1631:7	episcopal 1505:23	exactitude 1668:10	1647:19 1657:7
encourage 1512:4	1506:6	exactly 1414:15	1658:23,25
1559:18 1560:11	equal 1615:24	1499:17 1574:3	excuse 1434:2
1577:4	equation 1622:19	1610:20 1614:24	1511:24 1547:24
encouraged 1511:20	equinus 1482:3	1638:4 1673:25	excused 1460:14,15
1512:6	equivalent 1553:12	exam 1496:10	1530:12,14
encouraging	error 1538:24	1497:4 1499:8,9,11	1593:12,13
1558:13 1650:9	es 1600:1,8	1503:8 1513:3,5,20	1678:18,19
endeavor 1529:23	especially 1484:7	1514:8 1525:12	execute 1579:20,22
endeavors 1649:23	1552:9 1561:10	1556:1	executive 1619:3
ended 1466:12	1588:8 1647:6	examination 1411:4	exercise 1515:13
1496:18 1514:17	1650:3 1675:8	1452:18 1454:14	exhibit 1408:3
1598:8	essentially 1535:20	1460:4 1461:9	1409:3 1426:16,21
engage 1518:12	1538:16 1550:12	1491:2 1526:19	1427:14 1430:3,6
1669:12,12	1584:21 1590:16	1529:2 1543:4	1438:14,20 1440:1
english 1417:12	1599:18	1583:3 1590:5	1477:9,16 1504:5
1472:9 1543:25	establish 1435:19	1591:16 1628:5	1504:12 1508:19
1544:2,3,11	1436:11,14 1618:8	1671:19 1673:17	1531:1,4,9 1532:9
1551:23 1568:10	established 1602:16	examinations	1532:10,14,17,21
1590:20 1666:17	estimate 1678:1	1485:15	1532:22 1549:12
1667:7,9	et 1677:23	examined 1411:3	1549:18 1550:9,14
L	•		

1550 10 20 1564 0	1 405 04	4 1501.5	1470 6 1474 6
1550:18,20 1564:8	experience 1425:24	extensive 1581:5	1473:6 1474:6
1564:13,23 1565:1	1444:14 1446:11	1596:20	1490:2 1500:15
1569:12,13,25	1446:13 1457:15	extensively 1466:25	1543:19,20 1544:9
1570:2 1571:6,17	1469:22 1497:18	1522:11	1557:2,16,18,20,21
1571:19,20,22	1512:22 1519:6	extent 1438:6	1560:9,11,23
1578:3,8,19,21	1524:16 1525:11	1482:21 1488:1	1561:2,4,5,21
1589:11,12,22,23	1573:12,15,21	1500:20 1510:3	1579:24 1585:10
1590:1 1593:22,25	1581:5 1585:7	1518:9 1533:25	1590:16 1611:13
1594:9,14 1597:1,5	1607:11 1610:8	1534:9,19 1536:12	1640:10 1645:3
1598:15 1599:4,22	1626:8 1627:17,18	1537:13 1594:12	1670:21,22,25
1600:15 1601:3,12	1628:4,20 1629:2	1599:20 1628:21	fail 1555:22,25
1602:2,8,9 1605:15	1629:18 1630:2	external 1497:3	1577:9,13,21,23
1605:19 1606:7,13	1642:1 1645:15	1671:5	1590:25 1591:3
1606:14 1607:15	1662:3 1666:5	externally 1524:7	1668:1,5,8,10,14
1607:19 1610:18	1675:1,10	extra 1500:21,23	1668:17,25 1669:1
1612:2,8,10,23,24	experienced 1560:5	1589:16	1673:22 1674:3,6
1616:20 1620:9,13	1560:7	extreme 1546:14	1674:19
1620:15,23,24	experiment 1665:18	$oldsymbol{F}$	failed 1617:23
1623:13,15 1624:8	experimental 1661:3		1618:14 1623:19
1625:6,10 1650:5	1677:17	face 1545:2	fails 1644:21
1651:14,19	experiments 1659:15	facet 1664:8	fair 1432:19 1491:7
1679:13	1661:19,23 1662:1	facile 1484:23	1512:24 1515:15
exhibited 1650:4	1662:3,6,11 1663:4	facility 1610:7,10	1552:13 1653:14
exhibits 1438:11	1665:2 1677:15	fact 1481:14 1491:16	fairly 1471:6
1439:24 1440:5	expert 1479:20	1498:16 1500:19	1496:19 1542:6
1508:15,17 1534:1	1480:8 1544:21,25	1535:8,24 1536:7	1592:6
1534:6,9 1537:3,11	1546:15 1568:2	1536:18 1537:4,9	fall 1461:19 1462:5
1593:24 1594:6	1656:9 1663:20	1551:25 1596:12	1464:6 1478:5,7
1623:12 1679:11	expertise 1483:4	1598:14 1606:10	1489:10,14 1503:9
1679:12	1505:19,22 1568:2	1609:12 1623:4	1548:18 1555:20
existence 1492:19	1656:11,16	1635:2 1649:8	1556:17 1558:1
1568:4	1657:21,24 1658:3	1652:10 1655:19	1583:19,24
expect 1459:22	experts 1544:23	1655:23 1657:3	1584:14 1586:4,7
1551:22 1559:14	1580:13	1659:17 1661:8	1586:19 1600:21
1560:14 1561:7	explain 1434:3	1665:9	1611:11 1648:10
1576:12 1635:21	1488:22 1547:16	factors 1497:3	1673:6
1656:16 1657:20	1558:9 1606:12	1509:1 1602:19	fallen 1483:14
expectation 1494:11	explained 1640:6	1603:4 1604:7	1660:7
1494:15 1521:4	explaining 1415:3	facts 1598:23	familiar 1492:6
1654:21 1659:13	1546:6 1555:4	factual 1600:10 faculties 1479:19	1504:16 1516:12
1676:19	1575:2		1516:13 1549:22
expectations 1415:8	explanation 1496:14	faculty 1422:21,22	1564:17 1633:16
1426:25 1466:1	explicit 1497:2	1423:2,5,20,22,23	1633:21 1636:24
1473:21 1490:11	explicitly 1582:20,24	1424:7,11 1425:16	family 1609:6
1618:18 1635:23	1676:23	1427:10 1436:6,9	far 1440:9 1483:13
expected 1415:12,15	express 1611:14	1437:5,7 1442:11	1488:20 1511:17
1425:5 1561:24	expressed 1524:25	1448:1 1453:9	1581:4 1649:14
1567:11 1635:24	expressing 1463:25	1465:22 1469:1,5	1660:17 1661:13
			•

	1	l	
fashion 1423:7	fehon 1627:3,3,18	figures 1481:13	1456:19
1445:13 1451:22	1628:5 1629:3,21	1516:11	fink 1548:1 1553:22
fasman 1406:3	1630:9 1635:10,12	file 1530:23 1605:2	firm 1516:21
1407:5,8,17,20	1635:20 1636:8,14	1606:11,12,24	first 1411:2 1424:3,3
1427:15 1428:5	1637:16,22,24	1607:17	1428:16 1436:18
1429:5,16 1430:8	1638:14 1639:4	filed 1538:9 1540:24	1448:19 1461:7
1430:11,19,21	1648:16	1541:8 1597:8	1464:6,16,19
1433:6,8,16,19,25	fellow 1465:8 1470:1	1613:6	1469:15,24
1434:9 1435:1	1474:2 1513:18	files 1440:5 1679:13	1473:11 1474:19
1438:10,17,19	fellowship 1562:5	fill 1514:3 1563:16	1478:13 1490:4
1440:4,7,12,19,22	1649:3	1563:17	1504:22 1507:7
1441:4,10,11	felt 1467:1 1496:14	filled 1609:23	1512:17,20
1449:17 1452:11	1516:19,21	final 1416:22 1424:1	1519:20 1533:5,6
1456:7 1457:12,16	1518:18 1638:2	1424:9 1465:4,7	1535:5 1543:2
1459:2,25 1531:23	1640:2	1474:1 1495:24,25	1548:9 1554:7,11
1542:10,15 1543:5	ferguson 1627:6,7,19	1496:5 1499:1	1558:25 1560:24
1549:9,15 1550:8	1628:6 1629:4,21	1513:5,20 1530:19	1568:5 1570:16
1550:23,24 1564:7	1630:21 1631:8,21	1531:19,25	1574:20,23,24
1564:11,19,25	1632:11,23	1541:21 1556:1	1575:13 1576:6,11
1565:4 1569:11,16	1633:10,22 1634:9	1591:5,10,19	1576:15 1583:21
1569:22 1570:5,9	1634:14,23 1635:3	1593:22 1637:22	1585:2 1586:9
1570:10 1571:2,4,9	1637:17,23,25	1637:24 1646:23	1588:5 1603:6
1571:10,16 1572:1	1638:18,25	finalize 1513:19	1604:16 1605:25
1578:6,14,24	1639:17,19	finally 1439:12	1626:2,7,10 1629:9
1583:2 1591:17	1642:13 1643:3,22	1578:1 1603:3	1630:8 1632:1,4
1593:7 1657:10	1644:12,15,19	finals 1647:19	1635:13 1643:22
fast 1414:12	1647:10	1671:8	1643:24 1644:1,5
favor 1438:23	fergusons 1633:5	financial 1450:9,11	1647:3 1648:9
1596:6 1618:5	fernbach 1622:24	find 1431:4 1437:4	1649:15 1650:14
1623:6	fewer 1524:10	1471:14 1472:12	1651:24,24,25
favoring 1436:1	1562:3	1482:14 1507:6	1652:6,22 1653:1,5
favors 1596:10	field 1483:20	1512:16,19 1522:3	1657:9 1667:14,17
1598:22	1544:14,15,25	1598:25 1604:2	1668:3 1672:13
fear 1598:12	1545:4 1585:8	1621:11	1675:9
feasible 1511:3	1609:6	finding 1417:16,23	fit 1585:11
february 1599:1	fields 1566:2	1437:7 1558:15	fits 1422:2 1446:25
federation 1406:15	1580:22 1583:1	1602:20 1610:21	five 1418:14,16
feedback 1425:19	fifth 1419:20,21,24	findings 1655:6,11	1419:9 1420:24
1466:6,22 1468:25	1421:1 1422:8,10	finds 1430:1 1480:6	1452:1 1466:13
1576:23 1630:4,5	1455:5,9 1456:12	1640:14	1475:6 1524:2
1635:16 1636:9	1457:15,19 1458:8	fine 1443:2 1540:10	1525:7 1541:9
1637:16 1639:1	1459:9,19,21,23	1562:7 1593:5	1592:15 1593:2
1644:22 1650:8	1460:7 1489:1,15	1612:17 1613:3	1619:9,11,19
1675:8,11,12	1489:22 1541:3,13	1614:25 1616:15	1632:16 1638:8,9
feel 1466:4 1471:17	1658:14,16	finished 1420:18	1638:10 1642:10
1491:21 1516:15	1668:16 1673:23	1452:11 1587:1	1652:21 1672:14
1517:1 1664:5	figure 1545:16	1658:19	1672:15,17 1678:9
feels 1479:8 1650:7	1606:20	finishing 1419:3	fiveminute 1625:14

fiveyear 1461:21	form 1487:1 1669:9	framework 1421:4	1624:15 1635:22
fix 1630:5	formal 1523:5	frankly 1509:11	1636:11 1637:2
flesh 1638:21	1552:19 1662:15	1510:23	1657:13 1678:7,14
fleshedout 1638:1,20	formally 1552:15	fraud 1595:22	1037.13 1076.7,14
fleshing 1639:3	format 1499:9	fraught 1529:22	G
float 1546:21 1547:4	1507:17 1621:22	free 1466:4 1509:11	gai 1450:21,23
floor 1405:17	1643:6 1644:23	1523:2 1547:4	1451:5 1455:8
1406:11	former 1643:10,19	1641:1,5	1524:2,13 1525:7
fluctuate 1678:2	formula 1594:22	french 1471:23	1525:12,24 1562:8
focus 1448:19	1600:19 1616:18	1472:17 1479:12	1563:2,6 1585:25
1455:12 1484:21	1616:22,23 1617:8	1479:21 1480:2,2,9	1587:1,4,4,9
1485:1 1546:12,14	1617:10,15,23,25	1481:14	1592:10,10,15,19
1552:7 1559:23	1618:1,6,15 1621:5	frequency 1607:14	1592:24 1593:2
1568:2,20 1653:20	1621:8,9,13,15,19	frequent 1562:14	gail 1653:1
1675:25	1622:1,4,7,8,9,15	1563:8	gas 1602:13 1603:23
focused 1422:19	1622:18,21 1623:1	frequently 1498:10	1604:3,7
1656:10	1623:2,7,21,22	1588:22	gather 1471:16
focuses 1481:5	1624:20	fresh 1557:25 1647:5	1479:9
1506:4	formulates 1514:12	friday 1410:5 1499:3	gathering 1512:3
focusing 1478:13	forth 1413:18	1594:19	gauge 1474:22
1485:10	1554:22 1610:3	friends 1524:14	gc 1610:2
folks 1500:24	1618:17	1525:6	general 1448:8
1502:21	forthright 1650:6	front 1434:1 1641:15	1519:4 1566:13
follow 1472:13	forthrightness	fulfill 1584:20	1596:4 1610:1,3,4
1659:9	1650:6	1620:18	1610:16 1655:15
followed 1643:7	forum 1439:3,11	fulfilled 1455:8	generalize 1413:24
1644:3 1645:23	forums 1435:25,25	fulfills 1587:4	generally 1415:8
1657:13	forward 1448:25	full 1420:6 1517:19	1466:16 1512:3
following 1431:5	found 1482:6 1510:3	1526:5 1666:17,21	1518:4 1567:1,3
1435:19 1602:17	1596:22 1621:20	fulltime 1547:17,18	1570:12 1619:10
1610:12 1621:23	1675:5 1677:7	fully 1418:12 1611:8	1653:19
1646:9 1661:23	foundation 1469:14	fun 1665:23	generic 1435:4
1665:14	founding 1435:23	function 1422:9,12	generous 1466:2
follows 1411:3	fountain 1663:22	1546:3 1552:5	genes 1659:3
1461:8 1543:3	four 1466:12	1579:13 1641:10	genre 1488:2
1602:22 1613:23	1473:16 1525:25	1641:18,19	geographic 1508:11
1626:3	1526:1 1529:23	functional 1479:23	1602:24 1603:8
footnote 1598:6	1560:21 1606:11	functions 1546:5	geographically
ford 1407:3 1410:12	1606:18,19,21	funded 1418:12	1482:25
1410:17,17 1411:1	1638:9 1643:2,22	funding 1478:24	george 1599:9
1430:22 1435:6,20	1648:24 1649:8	further 1430:3	german 1479:14
1438:25 1439:6,15	fourth 1422:5	1436:8,25 1440:10	1480:2
1440:20,23 1441:3	1456:22 1457:14	1452:14 1459:25	getting 1417:22
1441:12 1460:13	1489:10,15,24	1460:3,13 1521:1	1443:25 1444:3
foremost 1656:9	1508:2 1526:2	1526:16 1529:12	1484:20 1556:25
forget 1484:13	1569:9 1572:20	1583:2 1593:6,7,8	1570:5,24 1584:25
1612:23	1648:6,18 1652:21	1606:18 1611:19	1587:9 1649:2
forgetful 1570:6	framed 1494:10	1615:4 1619:20	1656:8

gig 1498:2	glad 1638:23	1656:18 1657:14	graders 1465:6
give 1412:20,22	gmail 1406:17	1663:3 1668:17	grades 1413:18
1416:20 1424:10	go 1410:19 1420:14	1674:18,21	1416:20 1420:12
1426:14 1433:23	1431:6 1434:4	1677:20	1420:13 1424:10
1434:11 1452:17	1440:11 1441:14	good 1413:17 1416:9	1466:21 1495:5,18
1456:11 1458:3	1444:9 1446:10	1430:22,23	1519:23 1555:22
1472:3,12 1480:14	1460:16 1463:17	1446:16,24 1471:7	1561:8,20 1591:9
1496:22 1499:19	1463:18 1472:12	1471:18 1482:6	1591:19,21
1514:5 1527:21	1476:4 1506:8	1514:4 1518:6	1638:16 1640:2,4
1541:23 1543:23	1508:2 1515:14	1522:20 1550:4	1647:13,16,22,23
1551:6 1557:23	1525:8 1528:3	1600:10 1609:20	1647:25 1648:1
1561:18 1566:13	1536:6 1542:6	1626:6 1631:20	1668:18,19 1675:6
1571:2 1575:15	1552:21 1557:5,6	1635:17,21	grading 1413:5,8,15
1606:20 1614:1	1561:18 1573:19	1636:12 1638:16	1415:5,19 1416:3
1637:8,19 1638:8	1587:23 1601:21	1638:23 1640:8	1416:13,14 1465:8
1644:21 1662:18	1605:23 1624:7	1644:11,20,23	1465:17,23 1466:9
1670:11 1675:12	1631:3,7 1633:7	1652:20 1655:1	1466:18 1467:12
1675:22	1634:16 1651:19	1657:24 1668:22	1468:10,14,25
given 1424:2,8	1671:10 1678:8	gotten 1489:9	1496:3,25 1497:1
1429:19 1463:24	goal 1476:19	1512:24 1633:22	1497:13,20,22
1466:24 1475:21	1582:21 1595:8	grad 1422:9 1438:2	1498:13 1501:25
1479:14 1480:19	goals 1421:16	1447:6 1453:3	1512:16,24
1490:1 1495:19	1557:14 1577:14	1455:7 1592:24	1561:21 1591:8
1508:10 1517:20	1649:11	1623:2 1655:12	1637:6,8 1639:1
1517:22 1520:22	goes 1443:3 1449:8	1662:2,10	1640:1 1646:21
1533:21 1536:17	1534:7 1558:17	grade 1413:9,20	1647:18 1668:11
1537:9 1540:4,12	1653:9 1677:17	1416:12,23	1668:24
1546:6 1548:16	going 1413:25	1420:12 1424:2,7,8	graduate 1405:8
1555:18,19,23	1414:2 1428:22,23	1424:8 1466:24	1413:14,14,19
1562:20 1570:25	1429:24 1437:17	1467:2 1494:2	1414:20,21,23,24
1575:24 1582:10	1438:8 1439:22,23	1495:3,7,8,13,16	1414:25 1416:7,15
1594:10 1603:22	1447:19 1449:20	1495:20,24,25	1416:16 1417:5,16
1607:13 1609:7	1464:16 1466:4,7	1496:5,6,13,24	1417:20,25
1613:25 1615:16	1466:24 1497:21	1497:5,8,10,14,21	1418:12,18,22
1615:19 1621:5	1499:7 1501:7	1498:3,5 1512:17	1419:8,12,14,16,18
1630:3,4 1637:12	1512:7 1515:4,4	1512:19 1519:15	1419:21 1420:17
1638:19 1639:15 1647:14 1672:1	1521:13 1530:25 1533:16 1537:10	1553:15 1561:13	1420:22 1421:7,11
1647:14 1672:1	1535:16 1537:10 1537:11 1541:25	1561:18 1577:9,12 1577:22 1590:25	1422:14,24 1423:8 1423:25 1424:15
gives 1535:9 1550:3	1546:1 1550:6	1577.22 1390.23	1423:23 1424:13
1613:7 1640:13	1540.1 1550.0	1591.5,4,5,10,20	1424.18,21,23
1613:7 1040:13	1574:16 1577:5	1639:18,20 1668:7	1425:14,18,21
giving 1420:25	1574.10 1577.5	1668:22 1669:1,2	1420.1,7,13,13,23
1497:5 1515:1	1611:23 1612:8	1674:18	1432:14 1435:9
1555:10 1557:11	1613:10 1618:24	graded 1413:15	1432:14 1433.9
1605:3 1640:3	1623:12 1625:19	1498:8 1512:21	1442:12 1445:2
1647:24 1669:2	1628:1,18 1631:22	1638:12 1647:19	1447:17,21,22
1676:5	1649:18 1651:19	grader 1494:23	1448:17,19
	1017.101031.17	S-44CI 11/T.23	1110.17,17

1449:12 1450:25	1535:17 1625:6	1632:1,12,19	hearing 1405:15,16
1452:22 1454:19	granting 1625:7	hall 1599:13 1613:24	1407:6,13,19,23
1455:5 1456:16	grants 1655:1,11	1614:2	1410:1,15,18,19,21
1458:14 1461:11	granvillegrossman	handed 1620:12,24	1410:1,13,18,13,21
1469:10 1473:6	1543:16	1638:13,22	1410.24 1421.2,9
1488:15 1489:16	great 1523:1	handing 1426:20	1421.13 1427.24 1428:6,10,19,22
1506:18 1516:18	1541:12 1609:17	1504:9	1429:2,19 1430:13
1518:12 1524:21		handle 1480:4	1429.2,19 1430.13
	greater 1548:25		,
1539:11 1548:23	greatest 1457:5	handling 1596:1 1604:5	1433:23 1434:4,8
1549:1,3 1550:25	1595:10	- 0 0 110	1434:11,15
1551:12 1552:8	greek 1479:25	happen 1454:18	1436:15,19,22
1554:16 1555:8	1506:5	1566:24 1567:14	1437:11,13
1562:24 1567:23	greenwood 1614:3	1588:7,10,12	1438:18 1439:20
1568:18 1569:7,8	greg 1544:9	1610:21 1674:1	1440:6,8,13,16
1571:13 1572:10	grounds 1535:16	happened 1413:13	1441:2,9 1449:15
1572:17,17,18	1655:15	1418:2 1498:24	1452:13,16,19
1573:17 1577:6	group 1414:21	1499:12 1500:17	1454:12 1455:25
1578:10,25 1579:2	1423:14 1438:25	1669:3	1456:4 1457:10
1579:6,14,18,21	1441:22 1513:9	happens 1416:22	1458:21 1460:2,12
1580:18 1581:4,19	1575:8 1672:12	1575:11 1586:16	1460:16,20 1461:1
1583:14,20 1584:1	groups 1414:18	1588:5 1591:24	1461:5 1463:1,13
1592:22 1595:10	grow 1511:12	1614:21	1469:16 1475:23
1596:19 1597:8	growing 1417:20,21	happy 1434:3 1538:2	1476:5,8,11
1599:11 1603:8,15	grown 1544:16	1563:19,20 1615:8	1477:10,13 1487:4
1604:14 1608:8,11	gsu 1439:5	hard 1413:24	1487:9 1493:5
1619:1,5 1620:4	gsua 1539:7	1414:12 1638:24	1501:11 1502:9,12
1621:2,22 1622:16	guess 1417:7	1650:3 1665:12	1502:16,22
1623:5 1626:22	1422:20 1428:25	1678:1	1504:22 1505:1
1629:14 1642:7	1442:6,25 1492:15	harvard 1597:19	1508:17 1510:6
1649:19 1653:19	1497:14 1522:13	1649:3	1526:11,14,18,20
1655:16,16,24	1529:23 1538:3	hasher 1639:25	1528:25 1529:11
1656:5,23,25	1562:15 1591:2	hasnt 1472:2 1486:1	1529:17,18 1530:6
1657:4,8 1659:9	1592:23 1607:8	1563:15,18	1530:11,15,24
1664:19,22,23	guidance 1465:21	havent 1427:17,21	1531:2,7,15,24
1665:14 1666:13	1528:4,5 1610:3	1489:8 1508:5	1532:4,21 1534:2,9
1666:22 1667:13	guide 1474:12,14	1523:24 1525:20	1534:24 1535:1,16
1667:17 1668:7,15	guideline 1635:4	1526:3 1545:22	1535:17 1536:16
1668:20 1671:3	guys 1457:10	1607:23 1658:19	1537:9 1539:10,14
1675:23 1676:7		hc1 1489:15	1539:18,20,25
1677:10 1679:6	H	hc3 1489:15 1490:9	1540:13,17,19
graduated 1525:7	h 1406:4 1408:1	hct3 1494:3	1541:1,15,19
graduates 1412:9	1409:1	head 1453:15 1494:5	1542:4,11,19
graduation 1524:15	hadnt 1481:15	1563:9 1584:2	1549:11 1550:10
grammar 1545:6	half 1467:11 1517:19	1660:3	1550:16,18
grant 1448:7 1579:7	1521:16,17 1528:2	hear 1540:11	1564:23 1569:25
1625:4 1654:6,9,10	1529:19,20,24	heard 1439:1,7	1570:8 1571:3,20
1654:13,15 1655:7	1530:18 1560:24	1469:18 1529:7	1578:19 1583:5,8
granted 1533:6	1560:25 1574:24	1622:16 1627:24	1584:15,18
8- 411004 1000.0		1022.10 1027.21	10010,10

1500 15 22 1500 5	1500 12 12	1500 0 1502 20 22	1470 15 1400 11
1589:15,23 1590:6	1580:12,13	1500:8 1503:20,22	1470:15 1492:11
1591:14 1593:8,11	1601:19 1646:17	1503:23,24 1504:3	1519:25 1520:3,17
1593:14,17 1594:8	1662:10 1671:5	1504:21 1505:9,16	1520:19 1521:3,24
1594:17 1595:3,23	helped 1485:3	1506:11,24,25	1522:1 1528:16,20
1597:6 1598:8	1519:3 1662:12	1510:14 1517:17	1553:13,14
1599:5,15,23	1677:1	1518:3,7 1519:5,8	1612:15 1613:11
1600:16 1601:13	helpful 1468:16	1521:18,18 1544:1	1613:16 1640:9,11
1601:21,25	1510:4,5,15,17	1544:3 1551:24	1640:13,17,22,23
1602:13 1605:18	1528:7 1551:20	hmm 1638:24	1641:7,10,12
1611:23 1612:6,13	helping 1445:8,12,25	hoffman 1490:16	1646:13 1674:22
1612:21,22 1613:1	1545:18 1555:15	hold 1411:25	1674:23 1675:2,3
1613:4,7,18,21	1566:16 1579:6	1414:11 1449:24	1675:10 1677:24
1614:14 1615:2,7,9	helps 1444:14	1468:21 1469:16	house 1569:20
1616:5,12,16	1487:22	1484:10 1488:24	housed 1546:20
1617:17 1620:15	heres 1631:25	1516:8 1520:3	housekeeping
1622:2 1623:11	hes 1433:9 1435:13	1521:25 1525:3	1508:14 1538:23
1624:2,11,14,18,22	1436:8,9 1463:1	1543:13 1611:7	1542:11
1624:25 1625:9,12	1505:15,18 1506:1	1671:23,24	humanities 1417:10
1625:15,18	1506:10 1631:22	holding 1464:24,25	1473:5 1489:20
1627:22 1628:18	1675:18	holiday 1541:5,7	1548:5,9,11,13,15
1629:9 1632:4,18	hesitate 1550:2	1614:18	1556:5,19,22
1632:21 1634:6,21	hey 1496:15,16	holidays 1610:12	1560:20 1563:24
1651:15 1657:12	hierarchical 1592:6	home 1609:19	1574:7 1584:8
1662:19 1665:21	high 1416:19 1490:5	1673:12	1585:20 1586:11
1671:11,14,17,20	1545:6 1610:9,14	hone 1485:3	1619:15
1673:14 1675:18	1615:15	honor 1443:13	humanity 1549:4
1676:8 1678:6,10	higher 1501:4	hoops 1500:21,23	1558:1
1678:13,17,20,24	1597:7	hope 1557:18 1575:3	humor 1510:22
1679:11	highly 1510:4	1576:20 1577:3	hundred 1636:7
heart 1438:3	1521:21 1608:25	1580:24	hunter 1652:16
heavily 1521:10	hire 1419:1 1478:24	hopefully 1496:21	hurdle 1558:25
1567:16	1505:21	1510:18 1511:6	hyperbole 1509:6
hed 1634:12	hired 1444:3	1676:15	I
held 1413:6,6	hirschfeldt 1439:1	hoping 1473:23	id 1445:1 1473:10
1429:14,15 1439:4	1439:10,14	1509:9 1658:9,9	
1478:14 1519:25	historian 1505:18	hot 1654:24	1530:21 1595:6 1597:4 1599:3
1522:5,6 1543:10	1506:21 1507:4,5	hour 1405:18 1414:7	idea 1504:1 1678:4
1598:3 1617:14	historical 1429:11	1467:7,11 1509:16	ideal 1662:25
1620:4 1623:25	history 1457:6	1521:8,16,17,23	ideas 1486:25
1674:22 1679:8	1464:7,9,14,20,22	1522:16 1530:18	1497:21 1545:13
help 1432:13 1471:8	1467:18 1469:8,24	1613:13 1632:24	1545:22 1575:21
1514:24 1518:19	1470:1 1483:10	1662:15,19	
1523:22,24	1484:15 1487:7,7	hourly 1470:18	1649:18
1547:12 1555:11	1488:8,18 1489:4	hours 1413:6,7	identical 1535:5,8,8 1535:10
1558:12,22	1490:14,17 1491:8	1414:4,8,10,10	
1563:25 1566:21	1491:19,23 1492:9	1415:11,15 1425:4	identification
1566:22 1576:2	1493:7,10 1494:6	1465:1 1467:4,6,10	1426:18 1438:16
1578:13 1579:21	1494:20 1498:18	1467:13,14	1504:7,10,14
	-	-	_

1531:6 1532:19	1503:5 1506:20	impossible 1608:23	1534:2,3 1573:11
1549:14,17	1508:9 1510:18	impression 1647:3	1582:16 1603:13
1564:10,13	1511:5,5 1514:14	1662:18	1609:20 1615:15
1569:15 1571:8	1514:20 1520:11	improve 1496:21	1624:3
1578:5,8 1597:3	1522:19,21,23	1666:13	industries 1596:7
1602:11 1605:17	1523:2 1524:5	inclined 1496:22	inefficient 1480:7
1612:1 1620:11	1526:21 1534:16	inclining 1480:8	inform 1450:5
1623:8	1534:16 1538:13	include 1438:25	informal 1497:15
identified 1426:20	1539:14 1543:19	1439:1 1582:24	1520:7
1477:9 1513:2	1547:20 1550:25	1617:11 1649:2	information 1471:15
1613:23 1615:23	1552:24 1556:4	1677:19	1472:13 1478:6
1621:3	1557:24,24	included 1534:17	1537:8 1551:4
identify 1426:22	1558:18,24	1677:14	1565:12 1573:3
1549:18 1578:9	1562:21 1563:11	includes 1533:10	1594:6,12 1605:12
1596:21	1567:2,5 1570:5	1555:3	1606:16 1607:12
identifying 1514:25	1573:16,24 1578:8	including 1535:14	1608:4,17 1663:21
idolatry 1484:17	1582:1 1584:17	1537:14,22 1549:3	informing 1546:6
ill 1433:16 1463:14	1586:2 1587:15,16	1549:6 1666:24	infrequent 1521:7
1472:8,12 1480:3	1588:20 1591:7	incoming 1478:5	1521:19
1480:17 1488:16	1592:6 1599:8,19	increase 1595:21	inherent 1664:17
1505:4 1531:11	1599:25 1600:12	increasingly 1417:18	inhibit 1640:22
1540:23 1541:11	1601:9 1615:8	incredibly 1541:12	inhibited 1641:6
1560:24 1595:16	1628:1,18 1638:23	independence	initial 1535:18
1677:22,22	1649:4,18 1657:13	1557:23	1536:10
illinois 1405:17	1658:9 1660:21	independent	initially 1500:4
1406:12 1603:11	1673:5,6	1515:13 1664:14	1536:14 1622:6
1679:7	imaginal 1638:6	1664:16,18,20,21	1667:11
illness 1468:1	imaginative 1546:4	independently	injustice 1412:17
1498:22	imagine 1488:2	1488:3 1659:7	input 1495:16
im 1411:11 1414:12	1491:19 1503:10	indicated 1479:10	1646:25 1647:13
1414:13 1417:8	1631:14	1480:14 1487:16	1647:23
1418:4,8 1421:20	imagining 1566:16	1487:20 1491:14	inquiry 1522:17
1421:25 1426:20	1566:19	1498:19 1503:3	inside 1546:2,6
1428:7,8 1429:24	immediately	1511:2 1525:2	1579:16
1432:7,8 1434:3	1610:11 1617:2	1536:20 1608:9	insight 1485:8,11
1436:13 1439:23	1644:9	1610:17 1613:5	insofar 1485:5
1442:6,25 1443:1	imperial 1506:2	1616:19	1492:7 1495:6
1442:0,23 1443:1	implied 1520:7	indicates 1610:8	1505:18,18,20
1449:16 1452:11	implies 1630:5	1635:1	1510:18 1647:24
1452:25 1453:8,11	1656:23	indication 1605:3	1648:1 1649:13
1452:25 1453:8,11	imply 1629:25	1607:1 1618:25	instance 1466:22
1457:10 1458:7	important 1442:14	individual 1444:2	1472:1 1481:20
1457.10 1438.7	1456:18 1552:7	1507:1 1533:15,22	1472.1 1481.20 1497:14 1498:4
1481:13 1470:8,22	1557:21 1558:10	1507:1 1555:15,22	1500:17 1503:16
	1580:8 1601:18	individually 1566:12	1500:17 1503:16
1489:7,7,19,20		•	
1491:11 1494:22	1605:24 1668:20	1579:5	1510:9 1515:18,21
1496:1,4,4,22	importantly 1598:6	individuals 1435:17	1522:18 1638:5
1501:3 1502:13,18	1608:15	1435:21 1457:19	1664:1 1669:14

1676:1,4	intend 1508:7	1561:23 1562:4,5	intro 1510:10	
instances 1472:12	1524:22 1531:20	1563:3,11,13	introduce 1427:14	
1481:25 1498:4	intended 1607:6	1566:10 1573:18	1534:6 1537:3	
1506:17,20	1627:19 1628:7	1579:4 1582:3	1589:21 1599:20	
institutes 1484:14	intention 1628:14,24	1585:7,17,21	1599:25 1600:7	
institution 1476:24	1634:23 1639:22	1586:4,7,8 1587:4	1601:17	
instruct 1432:1	1639:22	1587:17,18,20	introduced 1477:17	
1457:22	intentional 1509:7	1592:13,19,25	1537:10 1550:14	
instruction 1465:21	interact 1506:2	1673:11	1589:13	
1468:4,25 1469:2	1518:16 1543:21	international	introducing 1554:7	
1499:10	1551:13	1473:17 1475:13	1600:11	
instructor 1420:3	interacted 1490:8	1609:13,22,24	introduction	
1427:1 1432:21	1491:18	interning 1550:2	1412:15 1578:17	
1433:5 1443:10,11	interaction 1493:24	interns 1548:23	introductory	
1444:23 1447:7	1519:18,21	1549:1,2,8 1552:1	1518:11	
1451:11 1454:8,10	1576:12 1628:6	1553:3 1556:14,15	invariably 1475:1	
1454:16,19,20,23	1629:3	1556:18 1557:1,23	invested 1521:22	
1458:7 1466:2,5,20	interactively 1514:9	1558:10,13,21	investigation	
1466:23 1468:1,2	interdisciplinary	1559:5,11,18,21,21	1537:17,24	
1469:7 1493:17	1473:3	1559:23 1560:4,10	investigations	
1557:9,14 1558:18	interest 1435:12	1560:12,15 1561:2	1474:4	
1558:18,23	1436:21 1437:11	1561:7,11,16	investigators 1661:5	
1559:12,17	1437:19 1438:8	1562:4,8,11,20,22	invited 1667:3	
1561:14 1590:12	1463:25 1511:14	1562:24 1563:6,17	involve 1474:15	
1590:17,20 1592:7	1538:11,19	1565:7 1566:23	1481:24 1482:10	
1636:13	1565:22,24 1618:9	1567:7,8 1582:16	involved 1433:13	
instructors 1418:19	1620:6 1650:23,23	1583:14,15,19,24	1435:3,9 1436:13	
1418:23 1419:1	1651:20 1653:9,10	1583:25 1584:5,10	1441:13 1445:8	
1420:7,15 1422:4,7	interested 1479:1	1584:20 1585:1,3,9	1447:20,21 1466:9	
1422:15 1426:15	1480:21 1482:5	1585:13,14,25	1466:10 1468:13	
1431:10,18,23	1486:6 1503:5	1586:14,19,25	1468:14,15	
1432:25 1435:10	1506:1 1522:19	1587:7,22 1588:1	1472:10 1622:14	
1441:15,17,24	1544:12 1551:14	1588:24,25 1589:7	1651:3	
1442:8 1446:18	1551:17,21 1573:6	1592:9	involvement 1434:18	
1450:17 1452:23	1573:9,23 1581:11	interpretation	1587:3	
1453:2,5 1454:18	1581:17,21	1464:14 1598:10	involves 1487:1	
1455:6 1456:10	interesting 1458:15	1661:3 1663:6	1659:8	
1458:18 1459:23	1514:1 1558:19	interrupting	involving 1506:7	
1460:7 1559:18,19	interests 1483:18	1523:23	irregularities	
1561:12,15,19	1651:22 1653:16	interview 1446:7	1595:21	
1585:8 1590:22	1669:20	1551:7,10,11	irrelevant 1436:19	
1591:23 1629:13	intern 1548:7,13,21	1565:14,15 1573:4	1534:12 1600:5	
1671:24	1549:20 1550:5	interviewed 1551:8	isnt 1443:13 1501:7	
instructs 1585:6	1551:2,22 1552:25	1667:2	1552:18 1560:1	
1604:6	1556:24 1557:8,10	interviews 1565:16	1592:9 1659:17	
integral 1655:17	1557:17,24	1573:25	issuance 1617:3	
intellectual 1473:22	1558:25 1559:17	intimidation	issue 1435:17	
1474:3 1661:10,14	1560:23 1561:14	1595:22	1437:19 1443:5	
	_	-	<u>-</u>	

	•		-
1495:3,13,24,25	1579:16 1584:10	kinds 1546:16	1639:24 1642:2
1557:20 1563:15	1589:18 1602:23	1573:22 1583:1	1649:12 1650:10
1563:18 1566:18	1603:7 1644:11	knew 1469:17	1654:22,24 1659:6
1595:12 1598:1	joe 1544:10	1474:18 1525:6	1660:1,2,17
1601:16 1622:4,10	john 1472:4	know 1415:7,9	1661:13 1663:18
1657:17	joining 1650:21	1416:8,9,25 1417:4	1663:25 1664:6,7,8
issued 1495:20	1666:22	1417:9 1418:5,9	1667:8,16 1675:4,8
1607:4	joseph 1544:9	1423:22 1425:4,8	1676:3,4,22,22
issuer 1496:5	journal 1580:1	1427:25 1428:6,14	1677:4,5 1678:2
issues 1437:10	journalism 1545:10	1428:18,19,21	knowing 1516:18
1533:16 1560:11	journalists 1545:20	1429:22 1433:8,13	knowledge 1429:20
1585:9	1545:21	1437:15 1442:13	1434:18 1463:21
item 1539:20	judging 1446:22	1450:23 1451:2,7	1478:12 1479:24
items 1539:22	judgment 1515:13	1451:18 1452:21	1482:22 1484:13
itll 1472:1 1507:18	july 1431:4,5	1453:2,12,22,23,24	1491:11 1496:23
1509:15 1597:14	jump 1500:20,22	1454:1,3,4,6,7	1498:7 1504:1
1624:8	jumped 1500:20,22	1455:7,10,10	1507:10 1518:11
ive 1413:6,7,13	june 1605:7	1458:12 1459:20	1523:17 1544:25
1450:24 1462:1	junior 1423:4	1460:6 1466:22	1545:1 1552:10,14
1479:19 1482:6	1655:20 1656:6	1467:3 1469:2,10	1552:16,19,20
1483:15 1488:13	1662:10,13	1474:8 1476:21	1563:5 1608:18
1491:16 1504:17	juniors 1419:7	1479:5,9 1480:18	1663:22
1508:4 1510:20	justice 1412:16	1482:21 1492:18	known 1651:1
1514:13,24	1442:1	1494:4 1498:15,17	knows 1513:9
1515:20 1522:6,10	justify 1620:7	1499:5 1500:19	
1522:11 1523:7		1501:5,11,12	$oldsymbol{ ext{L}}$
1524:20,21 1529:7	K	1504:2 1506:23	11599:4
1529:19 1558:2,3,4	kamil 1407:21	1507:1 1515:1	lab 1648:3,6 1649:17
1559:2 1565:6	1625:20 1626:1	1516:18,19 1518:4	1649:25 1650:22
1569:12 1571:4	karen 1622:24	1520:7 1524:14	1651:6 1653:20
1578:7 1620:12,23	katherine 1547:20	1525:17 1527:6,12	1655:15,17,20,25
1649:17	1553:20	1528:9 1529:22	1656:6 1657:4
	kathy 1568:15	1530:15 1534:1	1658:22 1661:17
J	1590:21	1539:7 1563:4,4	1662:10 1664:25
j 1406:4,10	keep 1488:18 1512:2	1564:14 1573:20	1666:3,5 1675:14
january 1470:6	1531:20 1672:16	1580:5,7 1581:4,9	1675:25,25 1676:1
1478:22	1677:2	1581:9 1583:18	1676:2,3,7,22
jargon 1638:7	kenneth 1544:10	1585:24 1586:3,23	1677:10
jersey 1406:16	kent 1614:6	1587:2 1590:24	labor 1405:2
jigsaw 1585:11	kept 1428:15	1591:2 1592:12,21	1436:12 1437:22
job 1415:9 1426:24	key 1620:21	1593:4 1595:23	1537:16,24 1596:1
1444:3,11,16,18,19	kicked 1470:22	1599:16,21	1679:4
1464:15 1468:12	kind 1415:9 1421:4	1600:14,17 1601:1	laboratory 1614:6
1476:24 1487:24	1425:19 1473:10	1607:2 1613:25	labs 1649:8 1651:9
1487:24 1488:9	1510:23 1519:6,6	1614:18,19,22	1653:20
1489:24 1490:21	1546:21 1547:3	1616:7 1628:22	lack 1608:3 1635:1
1491:24 1509:11	1566:21 1664:9,10	1629:9 1634:23	language 1468:16
1543:8,10 1579:15	1667:24	1636:4 1638:4,7	1471:12 1480:12
L		, ,	

1481:6 1484:21	1558:12 1575:11	1568:16	lines 1440:20
1485:4 1496:3	1614:4	lectures 1412:19,20	linguist 1544:10
1580:11 1617:6	leave 1557:4 1598:9	1412:22 1464:24	link 1597:15 1621:10
languages 1471:12	1606:3 1608:14	1467:7 1515:17	list 1484:7 1503:12
1471:19,20,25	1609:18	1559:5,7,8 1574:21	1534:8 1597:6,6
1472:18 1479:15	leaving 1458:2	1575:1 1576:5,7,9	1624:8 1665:1
1480:4 1481:12	lector 1571:12	1643:2,22 1644:5	listed 1504:2
1485:5	1572:13,25,25	1670:12 1671:1,24	1620:19 1660:18
laptop 1522:13	1572:13,23,23	1675:5	1660:23 1661:8,15
large 1417:14,24	1574:13,15	lecturing 1555:4	listings 1504:18
1512:3 1536:11	1575:12,13	led 1414:18 1524:9	lists 1471:9 1482:9
1615:12 1633:18	1576:11 1579:4	1575:1,10 1630:24	1482:11
1664:16 1668:5	1582:3 1587:14,17	1646:8 1655:7	literally 1605:8
largely 1671:2	1587:19 1588:16	left 1437:22 1564:20	literature 1486:13
larger 1499:25	1588:17,18	1578:16 1607:8,19	1486:15,17,21
1500:2	1590:11 1591:25	lefthand 1606:14	1487:2 1669:18
largest 1473:25	1666:4,7,16,23	legal 1535:20	litigable 1437:19
late 1462:18 1544:8	1667:16,19 1670:2	length 1523:3	litigate 1621:25
1610:25 1676:10	1671:22 1672:8,9	lesson 1589:8	1622:4
laterally 1474:8	1672:19,21 1673:2	letter 1425:24	litigated 1622:10
latin 1471:23	1673:9,10,19	1463:25 1477:11	litigation 1436:22
1479:12,20 1480:9	lectored 1668:8	1487:21 1488:2	1437:1,12
1481:14	lectoring 1576:15	1577:22 1590:25	little 1415:6 1433:23
latitude 1490:1,6	1668:15	1591:3 1597:13	1446:21 1467:15
law 1535:24 1595:19	lectors 1567:8	1621:4 1648:1	1479:18 1482:12
1596:14	1568:17,18	1668:7,18,19,22	1484:6,11 1489:7
lawrence 1542:16,21	1570:13,17	1669:2 1674:18	1507:23 1514:6
1542:22 1543:1	1571:13 1572:7,9	level 1414:22	1522:2 1527:21
lawyer 1660:20	1574:18 1575:1,10	1482:12 1518:12	1528:23 1558:25
lead 1414:17 1516:5	1576:2,5 1577:1	1572:22 1629:14	1567:21,22
1517:4 1518:5	1582:17 1587:20	1656:11	1570:13 1577:8
1559:14 1637:3	1587:23,25 1588:4	levels 1421:24	1590:10,19
1645:22 1656:24	1588:13 1589:5,7	library 1471:10	1591:22 1638:24
1660:12 1670:14	1590:10 1591:4,7	1482:17	1638:25 1641:21
1670:16,19 1671:3	1591:19 1667:11	license 1679:17	1666:7 1667:6
leading 1416:3	1671:3,22,25	lieu 1522:15	1669:23 1672:2
1462:23 1463:12	lecture 1422:23	life 1488:15	live 1543:20 1600:23
1555:9 1642:15	1465:2 1467:14	liked 1639:5 1644:13	1600:24 1601:15
1675:17	1494:7,12,14	likelihood 1609:7	llp 1406:3
learn 1416:8,9	1498:21 1499:19	liken 1448:2	location 1564:2
1442:14 1443:8	1502:17 1515:19	limit 1592:10,16	1603:2,14 1613:24
1445:21,22	1515:25 1516:8,25	limitation 1569:5	1615:19 1616:5,6
1511:12 1514:7	1575:6,25 1640:15	limitations 1527:24	locations 1611:18
1516:20 1545:5	1643:6 1644:1,6,24	limited 1478:4	1612:16 1613:9,18
1666:1 1669:24	1645:3	1600:9	1613:22 1615:13
learned 1497:17,20	lectured 1492:12	linda 1547:23	1615:23
learning 1443:7	lecturer 1468:19	line 1435:18 1436:18	lock 1603:3
1444:4 1511:16	lecturers 1426:25	1437:17	lockout 1603:21

lodging 1473:20	1649:20 1663:15	1609:1,9,15,21	manually 1596:4
log 1528:21,22	1663:21	1610:19	manuscript 1665:3
logical 1656:17	lounge 1522:6,7	mailin 1597:23	maph 1584:8,15,16
1657:21	1523:7	main 1416:10	1584:17 1592:20
logistical 1508:10	love 1572:16	1423:18,20 1468:3	mapp 1652:1,1,6
1527:23	1661:20,24	1473:10 1489:8	margaret 1548:1
long 1411:13,20	low 1416:19 1468:8	1545:11 1642:13	1553:22
1418:11 1458:13	1496:13,17	maintain 1488:3	mark 1438:10
1531:15 1543:10	1497:15 1503:2	1668:21,22	1504:9 1530:25
1547:21 1553:9,11	1580:3	maintained 1428:1	1531:8,8 1549:9
1568:3 1612:17	lower 1482:12	1428:12 1429:23	1564:7
1614:18	1578:16 1639:18	1505:6 1616:21	marked 1408:3
longer 1429:7,15	1652:10	major 1417:14	1409:3 1426:17
1475:20 1536:11	loyola 1622:15	1419:8 1432:8	1438:15 1477:15
longstanding 1596:2	lulls 1474:20	1546:8 1551:24,24	1496:10,19 1504:6
look 1416:16	lump 1527:13	1551:24	1504:13 1531:5
1420:23,24 1426:9	lunch 1530:17	majority 1606:9	1532:8,18 1549:13
1429:6,9 1435:4	1531:12 1613:15	1633:18	1549:17 1550:13
1446:10 1453:7,23	lunches 1509:12	majors 1416:25	1564:9,12 1569:12
1454:2 1522:20	luther 1484:17	1417:1,11,13	1569:14 1571:7
1545:7 1552:2	lyons 1548:1	1419:2 1422:19,25	1578:4,7 1597:2,5
1565:18 1566:20	1553:21	1423:5 1432:11	1602:10 1605:16
1578:2 1617:5		1445:10 1669:18	1605:19 1612:1
1651:18 1652:14	M	1669:19,19	1620:10,12 1623:8
lookback 1617:9	m 1405:18 1613:10	making 1421:21	marker 1494:23
1618:4 1621:19	1613:11 1678:22	1432:9 1473:11,13	markers 1465:6
1622:7	1678:25	1525:4 1576:19	market 1476:25
looked 1416:13	ma 1488:24	1634:12 1666:2	1509:11
1466:20 1481:8,17	maam 1477:14	manage 1676:25	marking 1438:13
1565:17	mac 1676:2,7	management	marks 1412:17
looking 1444:15,17	madame 1410:19	1436:10 1666:1	1416:17,18
1446:24 1448:8,24	1430:19 1476:11	1676:22	mary 1544:2
1458:17 1463:23	1595:23 1597:6	managerial 1436:7	mass 1548:1 1553:21
1466:17 1501:16	1602:12 1605:18	managing 1510:20	master 1619:14
1503:5 1504:17	1612:22 1615:6	1566:18 1567:5	masters 1465:6,11
1505:2 1536:1,3,20	1620:15	mandatory 1517:18	1465:15 1488:25
1536:22 1551:11	mail 1595:15	1517:20	1519:14,21
1551:16 1552:4	1596:10,12,15,16	manner 1598:4	1543:16 1544:3
1554:21 1565:22	1596:24 1597:15	1602:6 1609:3	1549:4 1584:7
1565:23 1570:23	1598:15,17	manual 1595:24	mastery 1516:21
1573:6 1576:18	1600:20 1602:18	1596:1,6,10,23	matches 1557:3
1649:4	1602:21 1608:8	1597:14 1598:22	material 1416:9
lookout 1480:16	1609:22,24	1598:23 1600:21	1443:7 1499:7
looks 1569:19	mailed 1595:17	1603:18 1604:6,19	1516:22 1518:10
1638:16	1598:21 1602:15	1608:5 1610:22	1521:24 1560:5,8
lost 1601:5	1603:24 1604:3,11	1611:5,17 1612:15	1633:16,24
lot 1425:17 1480:23	1604:21 1605:5,14	1614:10 1615:11	materially 1435:9
1511:3 1554:14	1607:7 1608:12	1615:18	materials 1558:2,3,4

1558.10 14 17 00	1675:2	1544:9 1549:6	militates 1602:20
1558:12,14,17,22 1566:9 1589:8	meaning 1515:12	1544:9 1549:6	mintates 1602:20 mind 1507:20
math 1488:20	1577:16 1607:22	1557:20,22	1649:14 1663:19
1489:19,20	meaningful 1650:8	1585:10 1588:14	mindful 1531:21
1529:22 1541:13	means 1656:8	1666:18	mine 1509:17
1529.22 1341.13	meant 1456:8 1495:6		minimum 1500:11
matter 1405:14		memo 1610:1,2,4	
1434:22 1436:23	mechanics 1531:18 1594:23 1595:1,6	memory 1647:5 menard 1516:8	minor 1533:12
1434:22 1436:23	1600:20 1601:9	mention 1441:22	minute 1434:11 1571:2
1437:22 1438:4	1600:20 1601:9	1442:4,24 1599:10	minutes 1430:11
	1615:5 1624:21	mentioned 1442:18	1452:17 1521:17
1535:24 1540:3,8 1540:21 1575:20		1449:6 1450:17	
1594:23,24 1602:6	mechanisms 1626:15 1626:21 1627:12	1454:17 1469:24	1521:20 1678:9 misheard 1627:23
1615:10 1669:5			
	medical 1580:1	1480:17 1484:22	misquoted 1446:9
1670:11 1679:5	medieval 1472:24,25	1501:16 1515:18	missing 1525:12 1631:15 1679:13
mattered 1668:23 matters 1438:5	1473:1 1475:13 1483:14	1605:21 1659:3 mentor 1557:17	
matters 1438:5 1440:11 1542:12	1483:14 meet 1423:14	1592:20 1649:14	misspoke 1500:1 mistake 1489:12
1607:10	1432:10 1466:11	1650:16 1662:25	1539:9 1673:7
matthew 1407:10,16	1473:7,12 1475:5	mentoring 1639:5	misunderstanding
1460:22 1461:3,4,6	1513:18 1520:24	1649:7,24 1650:2,4	1485:18
mauerbach 1406:13	1521:2 1523:2,4	mentors 1549:3	mixed 1414:22
maximize 1610:16	1549:1 1574:22	1584:8 1627:20	1465:16
mcenerney 1407:16	1632:24 1646:16	1628:8 1655:20	mode 1496:4 1608:9
1542:16,21,22	1662:14	1656:1	models 1516:7
1543:1,6 1549:16	meeting 1416:3	mere 1623:4	modern 1480:2
1574:15 1578:25	1423:24 1427:10	merely 1422:1 1435:2	1483:16 1484:14
1591:18 1669:16 1671:2	1432:14 1459:1		modernist 1483:19
	1465:25 1496:20	merger 1653:15	modernists 1472:11
mcnamara 1598:18 mean 1416:15	1497:6 1499:1	met 1466:25 1523:7	molecule 1651:3
1429:7 1442:1	1502:6 1503:7 1521:17,23	1523:14 1603:24 1618:22	molecules 1650:19
1429:7 1442:1	1631:23 1663:3	methods 1624:4	1653:16 mols 1405:15 1407:6
		1676:25	
1447:19 1457:1,3 1459:7 1462:20	meetings 1423:23 1475:7 1662:16	michigan 1406:11	1407:13,19,23
1463:13 1487:2	1663:2	middle 1416:19	1410:1,15,18,21,24 1421:2,9,13
1405.13 1467.2	meg 1548:1 1553:21	1471:23 1472:17	1427:24 1428:6,10
1520:20 1523:24	1576:18		,
1520:20 1523:24	melissa 1406:10	1479:12,21 1480:9 1613:14 1652:21	1428:19,22 1429:2 1429:19 1430:13
1534:22 1542:5	member 1423:5,20	1673:24 1674:2	1429:19 1430:13
1573:15,21 1582:1	1424:7 1435:23	midterm 1465:4,7	1430.16 1433.23
1575:13,21 1582:1		1513:5,19 1637:21	, , ,
	1436:6,9,9 1448:1 1448:25 1465:22	1637:23 1646:22	1436:15 1437:13 1438:18 1439:20
1588:16 1592:3,10		midterms 1647:19	
1592:12 1599:7,16	1469:1,5 1544:11		1440:6,8,13,16
1599:24 1612:3	1560:23 1561:4,5	1671:6	1441:2,9 1449:15
1628:12,19	1590:16 1670:21	migration 1650:19	1452:13,16,19
1631:13 1636:9	members 1423:2	1651:10 1653:25	1454:12 1455:25
1661:2 1669:8	1424:11 1534:20	militate 1610:21	1456:4 1457:10

	1	1	1
1458:21 1460:2,12	1678:13,17,20	name 1410:16	1653:11,17 1654:1
1460:16,20 1461:1	moment 1410:20	1461:2 1495:11	1654:4,18,23
1461:5 1463:1,13	1429:20 1477:19	1542:20 1597:10	1659:4
1469:16 1475:23	1508:14 1514:11	1621:3 1665:21	neurons 1651:10
1476:5,8 1477:10	1516:19 1526:10	narrow 1544:20	1654:1
1477:13 1487:4,9	1544:5 1595:17	1546:11 1552:7	never 1450:3,24,25
1493:5 1501:11	1601:22 1616:13	narrowed 1654:3	1503:2 1511:22
1502:9,12,16,22	1622:20 1659:20	national 1405:2	1518:18 1522:10
1504:22 1505:1	1660:15	1537:15 1595:25	1525:3 1630:1,3
1508:17 1510:6	monday 1499:2	1679:4	1639:10 1644:21
1526:11,14,18,20	1575:9 1614:22	nature 1533:15,24	1647:15
1528:25 1529:11	1677:22	1535:22	new 1406:6,6,16
1530:6,11,15,24	money 1486:12	near 1498:25	1429:10 1455:20
1531:2,7,15,24	1527:5	1603:10	1478:23 1482:19
1532:4,21 1534:24	month 1598:2	nearer 1427:6	1482:20 1483:6
1539:10,14,18,20	months 1470:8	nearing 1541:1	1545:13 1552:10
1539:25 1540:17	moot 1655:2	nearly 1608:23	1552:10 1572:13
1540:19 1541:15	morning 1410:6	necessarily 1459:7	1597:10 1622:22
1541:19 1542:4,11	1430:22,23 1499:2	1536:9	nickname 1627:7
1542:19 1549:11	1542:7 1678:22	necessary 1421:22	niestat 1619:2
1550:10,16,18	motion 1533:5	1466:8 1518:12	night 1575:9,14
1564:23 1569:25	motivating 1575:3	1538:18 1603:18	nine 1535:15 1593:3
1570:8 1571:3,20	move 1427:14	1617:25 1618:16	1641:3
1578:19 1583:5,8	1463:2,14 1508:14	1620:5	nlrb 1596:5,8
1584:15,18	1532:10 1550:8	need 1427:15 1448:2	1597:11 1598:18
1589:15,23 1590:6	1564:21 1569:23	1475:2 1487:23	1598:25 1602:14
1591:14 1593:8,11	1571:16 1578:17	1500:12 1516:24	1603:25 1607:3
1593:14,17 1594:8	1589:21 1593:21	1552:11,22	1611:10 1617:6,21
1594:17 1595:3	1593:22,25	1561:17,17	1618:12 1621:3,21
1599:5,15,23	1594:17 1599:3	1577:17 1580:19	1622:13 1679:5
1600:16 1601:13	1607:14 1611:23	1580:20,21	nlrbs 1596:14
1601:21,25	1611:25 1615:2	1583:19 1587:13	nodding 1430:25
1611:23 1612:6,13	1623:8 1624:25	1636:10 1650:13	1449:14
1612:21 1613:1,4	1648:2 1657:10	1665:2	nominal 1507:5
1613:18,21	moved 1570:6 1602:1 1611:10	needed 1487:20 1500:20,22	nominations 1426:6
1614:14 1615:2,9		1518:19 1567:16	1426:7,11 1449:9
1616:5,12,16 1623:11 1624:2,11	moving 1666:5,5	1637:2 1638:3,20	1449:21,22,24,25 nonlab 1478:14
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	multiple 1556:23 1577:4 1585:4	1637:2 1638:3,20	1481:9 1486:5
1624:14,18,25			
1625:9,12,15,18 1627:22 1628:18	1605:2 1606:10,24 1613:18 1636:1	needing 1579:19 needs 1566:21	1487:11 1529:5 nonstandard 1617:7
1627:22 1628:18	music 1669:19	1579:14	1621:12,16
1632:21 1634:6	mutual 1669:24	negate 1525:21	1621:12,16
1651:15 1657:12	mutually 1514:2	neglected 1599:10	norm 1653:19
1665:21 1671:11	myron 1516:8	neil 1648:10	1656:7 1661:7
1671:14,17,20	myrum 1310.0	neurocrest 1650:19	normal 1414:2
1673:14 1675:18	N	1651:20 1652:18	1419:16 1420:6
1676:8 1678:6,10	n 1406:1 1407:1	1652:23 1653:2,6	1424:13 1648:21
1070.0 1070.0,10		1032.23 1033.2,0	1727.13 1070.21

	•	•	•
1655:10 1656:4	1612:23 1614:1	obtained 1619:10	1454:12 1455:25
normally 1413:21,22	1615:1,17,24	occasion 1461:24	1456:4 1457:10
1414:7 1415:7	1618:12 1621:4,7	1498:20 1499:19	1458:21 1460:2,12
1419:9,20 1422:18	1624:3 1647:17	occasions 1462:2,8	1460:16,20 1461:1
1459:22	1648:21 1679:7	1487:15 1522:14	1461:5 1463:1,13
nos 1438:15 1440:2	numbered 1500:3	1536:3 1664:1	1469:16 1475:23
1508:20 1594:15	numbers 1482:16	occur 1517:23	1476:5,8,12
notable 1467:25	1512:3 1553:3	1595:15 1676:9	1477:10,13 1487:4
note 1429:6,12	1604:13	occurred 1433:3	1487:9 1493:5
1438:23 1538:23	numeral 1597:13	occurring 1469:18	1501:11 1502:9,12
1540:23 1564:19	nuremberg 1619:7	odd 1484:13	1502:16,22
1570:15 1571:18	nuvo 1596:7	offer 1421:5 1438:4	1504:22 1505:1
1597:24 1599:8	nw 1406:16	1438:19 1562:6	1508:17 1510:6
1621:12 1622:11		offered 1421:21	1526:11,14,18,20
note4 1617:21	0	1447:10 1493:13	1528:25 1529:11
noted 1541:15	object 1428:25	1493:13 1494:9	1530:6,11,15,24
1594:9 1612:7	1612:3 1623:10	1507:17 1511:4	1531:2,7,15,24
1619:17	objecting 1600:13	1568:10,11	1532:4,21 1534:24
notes 1605:25	objection 1433:15,17	offering 1453:13	1535:17 1539:10
1673:1	1433:22 1434:20	offers 1518:15	1539:14,18,20,25
notice 1405:15	1439:19 1441:1,2,8	office 1413:6,6	1540:17,19
1490:10 1534:5	1441:9 1447:18	1414:10 1428:13	1541:15,19 1542:4
1537:2 1597:16	1462:23 1463:12	1428:15 1465:1	1542:11,19
1600:2	1508:16 1530:4	1473:19 1492:11	1549:11 1550:10
noticed 1536:10	1532:12,13	1519:25 1520:3,16	1550:16,18
1582:18	1550:15 1564:22	1520:19 1521:3,8	1564:23 1569:25
notified 1464:3	1569:24 1571:19	1521:23,25	1570:8 1571:3,20
1499:2	1578:18 1594:8	1522:16 1640:8,11	1578:19 1583:5,8
notify 1534:13	1599:17 1612:7	1640:13,17,21,23	1584:15,18
noting 1550:17	1627:25 1628:11	1641:7,10,12	1589:15,23 1590:6
notion 1554:10	1628:19 1675:17	1646:13 1674:22	1591:14 1593:8,11
notwithstanding	objections 1532:11	1674:23 1675:2,3	1593:14,17 1594:8
1604:1	objective 1640:1	1675:10	1594:17 1595:3,23
number 1417:11,13	objects 1439:17	officer 1405:16	1597:6 1599:5,15
1432:10 1435:22	1594:2	1407:6,13,19,23	1599:23 1600:16
1435:22 1437:6	observation 1576:24	1410:1,15,18,19,21	1601:13,21,25
1438:24 1449:21	1635:22	1410:24 1421:2,9	1602:13 1605:18
1480:19 1486:21	observe 1492:8,14	1421:13 1427:24	1611:23 1612:6,13
1495:7 1500:11	1576:21 1635:13	1428:6,10,19,22	1612:21,22 1613:1
1521:21 1524:14	observed 1492:7	1429:2,19 1430:13	1613:4,18,21
1535:13,25	1588:13,16,17,19	1430:16,19	1614:14 1615:2,7,9
1536:25 1537:1,13	1588:21 1644:15	1433:23 1434:4,8	1616:5,12,16
1538:6,22 1539:21	observer 1616:1,2	1434:11,15	1620:15 1623:11
1553:14 1562:17	observers 1615:18	1436:15 1437:13	1624:2,11,14,18,25
1577:20 1578:8	1615:24 1616:4	1438:18 1439:9,20	1625:9,12,15,18
1597:5,10,12,24	obtain 1418:15	1440:6,8,13,16	1627:22 1628:18
1599:2,4 1606:15	1510:25 1619:9,16	1441:2,9 1449:15	1629:9 1632:4,18
1609:17 1611:18	1619:18	1452:13,16,19	1632:21 1634:6

1451 15 1455 10	1520 25 1540 15	1400 7 17 64 2 4	1.100 5.1.00 5
1651:15 1657:12	1539:25 1540:17	1490:5 1564:3,4	1438:7 1623:5
1662:19 1665:21	1542:3,4,13	oneyear 1617:8	orientation 1478:6
1671:11,14,17,20	1547:16 1548:3	1621:19	original 1533:11
1673:14 1675:18	1549:9 1550:6	ongoing 1508:11	1600:17 1653:22
1676:8 1678:6,10	1552:24 1556:12	online 1665:10,23	1653:24 1679:9
1678:13,17,20	1556:18 1557:4	1676:17	otten 1493:1,4
officers 1438:24	1558:24 1562:8,11	open 1522:13	1494:11 1503:21
1535:16	1562:17 1563:1,5	1600:17	1518:3,15 1519:12
offices 1520:22	1566:1 1567:10,19	opening 1614:11	1519:19 1520:3
officially 1415:14	1568:13 1569:11	operating 1615:13	1525:2 1648:13
oh 1442:23 1457:2	1571:16 1572:24	operative 1524:4	ottens 1505:20
1459:19 1467:21	1573:5 1576:23	opinion 1591:25	ought 1429:8
1472:4 1483:7	1577:1 1578:1	1618:13	outcomes 1557:15
1494:3 1503:5	1581:7 1590:15	opportunities	outdated 1605:1
1507:18 1522:19	1592:8 1593:5	1570:17 1572:6	outline 1596:14
1522:21 1525:8,8	1594:8 1601:13	1667:17	outlined 1491:17
1562:15 1563:7,20	1612:6,21 1613:21	opportunity 1422:18	1625:5,10
1570:24 1589:15	1616:5,12 1623:11	1429:9 1457:20	outlines 1426:24
1591:13 1638:23	1624:14 1626:19	1458:1,4 1477:22	outset 1645:9
1655:22 1662:22	1627:17 1630:14	1494:9 1501:2,8	outside 1434:10
1673:5,7 1674:8	1635:7 1636:18	1511:9 1516:23	1444:21 1467:1
okay 1421:13	1639:8 1643:18,25	1540:2,4,8 1595:11	1469:11 1503:17
1428:22 1429:2	1644:11 1646:12	1611:13 1640:14	1506:18 1523:5,5
1432:19 1433:12	1646:16 1651:23	1640:18	1524:7,16 1525:10
1438:13 1440:10	1660:22 1662:9	opposed 1600:11	1553:14 1649:11
1440:13 1444:15	1670:8 1671:17	opposes 1595:13	1649:12 1671:4
1445:4,21 1446:12	1672:25	opted 1468:9	outstanding 1539:23
1448:7 1449:5	old 1429:14 1479:21	option 1479:14	overall 1422:2
1450:8,13,16	1607:13,18	1649:2	1435:14 1447:9
1452:6,11,13	1676:24	optional 1577:10	1497:1 1502:3
1453:2,25 1454:6	older 1459:12,13,14	order 1410:3 1451:2	1554:4
1456:4,22 1460:12	omission 1535:21	1471:10 1482:17	overbroad 1535:22
1464:16 1468:21	once 1422:4 1423:16	1491:12 1500:12	overlap 1481:11
1469:22 1472:18	1455:23 1499:12	1540:5 1598:25	1483:17 1485:21
1476:18 1477:22	1508:3 1557:7,13	1644:7 1668:22,24	1486:1
1478:13,14,16	1567:7 1572:15	1669:15,16	overlapping 1421:23
1484:1,20,24	1576:8 1588:23	ordered 1595:18	overlaps 1510:19
1486:7 1487:20	1616:16 1664:18	1596:22 1598:16	overly 1533:7
1489:3,13,22	oneandahalf	1604:21 1607:7	1534:18
1490:1,23 1495:2	1509:16	1610:20 1623:23	overrule 1447:19
1495:23 1497:16	oneandahalfhour	ordinary 1505:7	overseeing 1438:2
1502:22 1507:3	1509:18	organization	overwhelming
1515:8,17 1517:7	onehour 1631:23	1596:19 1666:3	1606:9
1519:15 1521:25	1663:2	organize 1435:22	overzealous 1467:15
1526:18 1527:16	oneoff 1493:12	1543:21 1597:9	owens 1478:1 1525:9
1528:19,25	onequarter 1567:24	organized 1574:20	
1530:11,15,24	ones 1421:16 1423:8	organizing 1433:14	<u>P</u>
1538:16 1539:10	1440:9 1488:23	1435:3 1437:21	p 1406:1,1 1613:11

	_	_	
1678:25	1570:15,20,21	1604:9,16 1612:14	1526:15 1529:14
packet 1589:18	1572:3	1617:14,22	1530:5,9
page 1480:19 1515:3	parameters 1421:8	1628:25	pedagogical 1554:19
1538:25 1564:20	parceled 1664:7	parting 1514:11	1555:16 1574:10
1570:16,20	pardon 1438:21	partly 1540:25	1574:11
1618:13 1643:20	1638:6	parts 1413:1 1606:4	pedagogies 1554:6,9
1651:24 1652:5,10	paris 1481:6	1625:8	1566:11 1581:21
1652:15,25	part 1421:25	party 1539:2,11	pedagogy 1445:23
1674:10	1451:19 1456:16	pass 1483:12	1509:2,8 1512:12
pages 1652:21	1463:10 1464:12	1555:22,25	1551:17,19
paid 1419:25 1425:9	1474:10 1486:16	1561:17 1573:24	1552:13 1558:6
1462:10,13	1487:13 1516:17	1577:9,13,21,23	1566:10 1573:6
1470:18,20,25	1537:16,24	1590:25 1591:3	1581:11,17
1527:7 1588:24,25	1546:23,24	1668:1,5,8,10,14	1582:25
1589:5	1554:17,19 1556:9	1668:17,24 1669:1	peer 1658:8,17
panel 1439:5	1575:2 1579:20	1673:22 1674:3,6	1661:24 1676:13
1475:11	1582:25 1584:9	1674:19	pending 1428:25
paper 1424:9	1589:14 1590:8	passed 1483:16	1433:22 1540:16
1474:16 1487:1	1601:1,4,10 1610:7	1487:22 1621:21	people 1415:6,9
1523:20,23 1551:6	1628:14 1629:13	passes 1464:2	1420:25 1424:3,7
1551:7 1560:24,24	1643:5 1645:10	path 1582:17	1429:14 1431:13
1561:1,6,11 1564:1	1649:8 1659:18,25	patterns 1580:14,15	1434:2 1435:16
1565:13 1566:20	participate 1566:17	paul 1406:5	1441:22 1445:16
1573:4 1574:10	1603:17 1667:4,11	pause 1508:13	1456:12,20
1575:5,12,16,21	participation	pay 1475:20 1617:2	1465:13 1511:25
1591:25 1631:3,10	1598:24 1620:7	paycheck 1462:15	1524:16 1544:13
1631:17 1643:8	particular 1450:3	1527:25 1528:1	1544:22,23,24
1644:3,6,25	1454:7 1479:6	paychecks 1471:1	1545:3,4,12,14
1645:18,24 1646:3	1487:3 1502:18	1527:4	1549:5,6 1552:10
1646:9,21,25	1505:15 1524:23	payment 1527:13,14	1552:12,18,22
1658:8,17 1660:19	1544:19 1545:7	1624:4	1556:25 1562:23
1660:23 1661:9	1547:12 1551:23	payments 1528:15	1567:7,12,17
1674:13 1676:14	1552:18 1554:8,9,9	1528:16	1569:6 1573:6,8
papers 1413:20,21	1556:19 1558:23	payroll 1462:16	1578:12 1580:15
1416:17 1466:19	1564:1 1566:2	1470:7 1617:1,19	1581:4 1582:7,20
1473:7 1474:8,12	1575:25 1580:14	pcp 1651:1,3	1582:22 1583:22
1512:17,19,21	1585:10 1597:24	pearlman 1406:5	1584:4,5,6,12,23
1554:21 1555:10	1614:15 1615:16	1407:12,15	1585:3 1587:22,25
1555:17 1560:15	1630:21 1640:4	1462:23 1463:12	1613:16 1656:6
1560:22,25 1561:1	1642:23 1664:7	1469:14 1476:4,11	percent 1563:10
1561:3 1575:6,8,14	particularly 1480:10	1476:14 1477:11	1600:4 1606:10,17
1575:22 1579:7,8	1497:15 1519:4	1477:14,18	1606:19,22 1607:9
1630:24,25 1631:9	1551:13 1610:25	1487:10 1493:6	1607:16,21,24
1633:6,17 1638:12	1629:23 1630:19	1501:13 1502:10	1608:1 1646:21,22
1638:13,22 1661:6	parties 1410:3	1502:13,19,23	1646:22,23,25
1666:25 1670:3,6,9 1674:7	1434:21,23	1504:8,15 1505:3	1660:8,10
	1437:14 1531:11 1532:24 1540:1	1508:13,22 1510:24 1526:10	percentage 1585:24 1586:24 1659:23
paragraph 1535:9	1332.24 1340:1	1310.24 1320:10	1300.24 1039:23

1660:1,6 percentages 1660:4 perfectly 1655:10	1657:2 petition 1436:12	1449:1 1451:3,23 1451:24 1458:10	1598:4 1606:2
_	r	1431,24 1436.10	1607:14,15
	1500:16 1524:13	1461:11,15,17,19	1645:17,21
1656:4	1524:24 1525:9	1461:22 1465:14	placed 1440:4
perform 1660:23	1530:22 1532:6	1465:18 1470:1	1585:15
performance	1533:1,6 1534:16	1498:10 1503:14	places 1546:12
1492:14,16	1535:4,17,19	1503:17 1505:13	plan 1666:2
1496:21 1497:4	1536:10 1537:7,17	1505:16 1583:15	planar 1650:24,25
1576:13	1537:25 1538:7,9	1584:4,12,22	planned 1677:16
performed 1603:7	1538:14,15,18	1585:24 1586:4,24	planning 1468:15
1661:23	1540:24 1541:8	1619:9 1649:2	1542:1
performing 1422:9	1597:8 1605:13	1656:8,9 1664:19	plans 1649:1 1663:9
1422:12	1606:9 1621:2	pharyngeal 1652:17	1663:12 1665:11
perfunctory 1525:15	1622:5,9 1624:9	1652:19	1665:17 1676:13
period 1418:11	1625:2,4,5,8	phenomena 1596:19	1676:18 1677:12
1470:25 1482:25	petitioned 1524:19	phillip 1598:18	1677:13,18
1483:14 1582:10	1524:20 1608:2	philosophical 1516:7	platform 1665:10,22
1614:19 1617:2	petitionedfor	philosophy 1411:12	1676:17
1621:16	1606:16,23,25	1411:14 1412:8	please 1428:9
periods 1480:24	1607:9 1609:14	1413:12 1415:20	1430:12 1461:1
1483:1,12 1505:24	1611:13 1616:25	1416:24 1417:1,9	1477:20 1542:19
1603:20 1617:19	1617:12 1618:8	1418:12,18	1550:9 1571:2,17
permanent 1455:14	1619:1 1620:17	1419:14 1423:11	1637:19 1645:25
1657:14	petitioner 1405:9	1431:11 1435:8,15	1651:14 1660:15
permit 1437:17	1406:8 1410:9,11	1439:8 1442:1	1671:10
1438:8 1439:23	1430:5 1434:19	1444:24 1445:10	plenary 1559:19
1463:14 1600:18	1440:25 1452:13	1445:17 1448:8	plus 1424:21
1602:5,7	1460:2,20,22	1451:4 1452:22	plymouth 1617:6
permitted 1598:24	1531:1,4 1532:5,9	1453:10 1454:9	point 1428:24
1600:23 1601:16	1532:14,21 1533:1	1456:1,3 1457:8	1451:5 1467:16
1622:3	1533:18,19	1639:19	1485:24 1509:9
person 1420:5	1537:10 1539:7,13	phrased 1536:14	1510:12 1511:18
1424:3 1437:1	1539:19 1550:11	phrases 1638:4	1516:6,13 1518:18
1552:18 1587:13	1550:14 1571:19	physical 1520:22	1524:7,24,25
1646:8 1650:12	1583:9 1589:10,12	1522:16 1528:10	1526:2,3 1528:15
1660:19 1661:9	1590:1 1593:8	1528:14 1576:15	1540:14 1593:1
personal 1663:17,18	1599:5 1602:2	1607:20,22,24	1608:13 1613:13
personally 1511:25	1616:9 1624:19	physics 1669:18	1620:13 1622:11
1525:17 1672:7	1625:6,10 1651:16	pi 1655:11,12	1634:10 1638:5
personnel 1667:3	1651:18	pick 1421:16 1509:5	1659:22,24 1660:9
persons 1610:10	petitioners 1409:4	picketing 1603:4,22	pointed 1620:21
persuading 1546:6	1410:9 1426:16,21	picture 1570:12	points 1450:21,24
pertain 1659:11	1436:15,17 1533:5	piece 1579:16	1452:1 1496:22
pertaining 1594:7	1537:18,21	pierce 1627:23,24	1524:2 1525:1,7,12
pertains 1524:5	1589:21,23 1612:7	pierces 1627:20	1525:24,25 1526:1
1656:24	1625:1	pin 1596:8	1562:8 1563:2,6
pertinent 1632:5,10	ph 1417:5 1418:15	pitch 1513:21	1585:25 1587:1,5,9
1655:3 1656:21	1418:16 1422:7	place 1546:14	1592:10,11,16,19

	1	1	1
1592:20,25 1593:2	1457:25 1478:14	1555:16	prepared 1483:15
1605:24 1619:9,10	1479:1 1481:9	practicing 1575:20	1486:20,25
1619:17,18	1486:5,8 1487:11	practicum 1554:24	1513:11,12 1516:5
1620:22 1631:3,7	1500:23 1528:19	precedent 1596:9	1599:25 1612:19
1633:6,10 1634:15	1529:6 1533:2	preceding 1617:2	1620:25
1638:9,9,10,11	1534:25 1549:20	preceptor 1423:25	preparing 1467:14
polarity 1650:24,25	1550:3 1564:16	1424:25 1425:6,10	1514:8
policies 1458:13	1571:13 1594:21	1445:21 1446:6	prepped 1467:8
1501:1 1603:25	1595:4 1599:6	1451:11	prerogative 1415:18
policy 1436:20	1602:3 1612:25	preceptors 1418:19	1415:21
1460:6 1596:2,9	1613:6 1614:15	1418:23 1419:2	prescribe 1664:25
polish 1485:4	1615:4,7,17,23	1423:10,12	prescribed 1665:3
politics 1505:24	1616:21 1618:15	1424:10,12,24	presence 1441:5
polling 1603:20,20	1620:5 1624:19,23	1425:5,9,14,22	1510:21 1650:3
pool 1513:25 1514:3	1673:20	1431:10,23	present 1468:4
poor 1496:10	positioned 1624:1	1432:25 1435:11	1492:10,11,12
poorly 1496:10	positions 1411:25	1441:15,17,24	1515:22,24 1526:7
populated 1652:17	1417:19 1427:1	1442:8 1445:6,9	1530:3 1603:2,13
population 1417:20	1429:14 1434:22	1450:17 1452:24	1609:2 1618:3
1417:21	1434:24 1435:11	1453:8 1458:4,5	1640:19 1641:3,9
portion 1594:3	1448:9 1455:19	precisely 1428:9	1670:6 1672:8
1598:11 1609:14	1531:11 1532:25	1435:16	presentation 1643:7
1638:3 1668:6	1543:13 1581:14	predict 1569:2	1643:14 1644:3,6,9
porzio 1406:4	1581:24,25	predominantly	1644:14,20
1410:19 1427:17	1612:14 1673:11	1661:5	1645:24 1646:2,5,9
1428:24 1530:25	positive 1630:3,4	preelection 1436:19	1646:18,21 1647:1
1532:13 1535:1	1636:9 1644:22	1622:1	1647:4
1538:12,16,21	1650:8 1660:13	prefer 1476:23	presentations
1539:5,24 1540:10	possession 1534:19	1551:18 1561:2	1643:11,15,17
1540:18,22 1541:3	1536:23	preference 1457:18	1644:25 1645:7
1541:7,11,18,21	possibility 1437:20	1457:18 1563:12	1647:7,9 1670:4
1542:3,9 1593:24	possible 1429:21	1563:16 1595:24	presented 1439:6
1595:1,5 1597:4	1445:13 1455:4	1604:19	1516:22 1618:21
1599:8,25 1600:22	1456:20 1498:9,15	preferences 1557:1,2	1641:4 1645:18
1601:14 1602:12	1498:16 1501:10	preferred 1643:11	1669:11
1605:18 1611:25	1563:1 1615:14	prefers 1479:13	presently 1666:9,10
1612:22 1613:2,5	1632:13	preliminary 1486:23	president 1439:15
1613:19,22	possibly 1589:1	1659:10	presumably 1435:11
1614:17 1615:6,20	1649:22 1654:25	prep 1467:15 1471:8	1445:22 1447:12
1616:6,15,19	post 1464:1	1514:17,22,24	1450:13 1451:10
1620:12 1623:14	potential 1438:1	preparation 1481:23	1452:5 1488:1
1623:18 1624:6,13	potentially 1429:21	1491:13 1499:20	1501:3
1624:17 1625:7,11	1615:12 1676:6	1503:8	presume 1443:17
porzios 1531:17	practical 1555:1	prepare 1487:22	1449:1 1500:19
position 1411:10	practice 1436:13	1513:3,15 1575:13	1558:3
1435:5 1436:16,17	1437:22 1463:21	1579:6 1589:7	presumption 1596:6
1444:10 1455:14	1475:20 1554:19	1630:22,25	1596:10 1618:5
1455:14,15,21	practices 1498:13	1646:17	pretty 1471:16

1507.5 1514 10	1650.00 1651.01	1605.10 1675 10	1471.9 02 1476 00
1507:5 1514:10	1650:22 1651:21	1625:19 1675:19	1471:8,23 1476:20
1525:15 1643:11	1653:13,16	proceeding 1410:8	1476:22,23 1477:2
previous 1425:23	1660:17	1437:12 1537:12	1477:4 1478:16,21
1446:11,12	principal 1661:5	1610:12	1479:4 1480:5
1486:25 1576:10	principally 1482:25	proceedings 1410:7	1481:17 1483:18
1645:15 1651:21	principles 1574:8	1437:23,23 1438:5	1485:8,9,21
previously 1477:15	printed 1505:5	1529:8 1540:6	1486:18,20
1481:15,21	prior 1411:25	1600:18 1678:22	1487:22 1490:2,5,9
1486:24 1488:23	1412:2,3 1429:14	1679:4	1490:14,16,17,19
1491:17 1550:13	1466:12 1469:6	process 1421:20	1490:20 1491:3,4
1583:16 1587:11	1484:16 1488:24	1443:16 1456:11	1492:1,3,5 1494:11
1612:4 1636:14	1493:11 1499:3	1480:25 1514:8	1495:10,17 1496:2
1651:6 1677:3	1501:19,20 1507:7	1525:16 1545:13	1496:12,16 1497:1
prewritten 1513:24	1512:21 1516:3	1545:16,22 1551:2	1497:2,12,25
prickle 1650:18	1518:8 1529:23	1551:3,19 1552:9	1498:3,5,13,20
1651:3,7,9,20	1532:8 1534:12	1552:20 1556:6,25	1499:4,5 1500:20
1652:3,7,12	1552:2 1566:23	1561:9 1565:9,11	1500:22 1502:6,25
1653:16 1659:3	1573:11 1607:21	1566:8 1568:21	1505:20 1507:21
primarily 1437:9	1607:25 1608:1	1569:3 1573:1,2,2	1513:8,16,17,24
1439:21 1446:11	1613:6 1622:3	1573:19 1580:20	1514:7,9,12,25
1468:10 1551:12	1623:12 1631:23	1580:21 1592:4,4	1515:8,12,17,22,24
1568:10,17	1632:24 1654:7	processed 1526:4	1516:1,24 1517:2
1677:17	prioritize 1665:20	1622:12	1517:11,25 1518:2
primary 1465:5	priority 1420:25	produce 1561:8	1518:3,14,15
1494:22 1495:6	1456:12	producing 1654:21	1519:12,19 1520:2
1496:5 1511:14	private 1677:4	production 1540:14	1525:2 1527:1,5
1604:25 1608:9	probably 1465:15	profession 1546:2,7	1529:4 1559:1
1640:1 1656:1	1467:8,10,11,14	1579:20	1627:11 1640:19
1660:20,24	1473:25 1477:3	professional 1475:11	1640:21,24
prince 1619:23,25	1478:4,4 1496:16	1546:5 1568:24	1641:15 1643:7
1627:11,22	1498:1 1507:23	1571:15 1579:17	1645:22 1646:10
1628:23 1629:12	1508:3 1521:22	1580:22 1582:25	professors 1473:20
1642:12 1643:2,23	1535:14 1583:22	professionally	1490:7 1497:9
1644:15,19,21	probative 1536:16	1510:13	1512:5 1517:24
1647:9 1648:3,19	problem 1458:12	professor 1410:11	1626:25 1628:21
1649:7,9,13,21	1540:20	1411:11,14,16	1632:21 1635:10
1650:4,22 1651:6,9	problematic 1608:12	1412:2,3,4,7	1639:14 1640:15
1653:5,9,10	problems 1544:13	1415:18,21 1420:9	1641:3,9 1642:10
1655:25 1658:22	procedure 1595:19	1430:22 1435:6,20	1642:13 1643:2
1661:13,16,20	1596:14 1597:14	1438:25 1439:1,6	1647:20 1674:25
1662:2,9,15,20,22	procedures 1603:25	1439:10,14,15	proficiency 1479:17
1663:16,20 1664:2	proceed 1430:17	1440:20,23 1441:3	proficient 1479:16
1665:1,4,9,13,19	1440:17 1460:21	1441:12 1442:1	program 1422:20
1666:6 1676:19,21	1476:9 1530:7,19	1460:13 1463:23	1432:8,18 1445:19
1677:5	1531:12 1532:23	1464:2 1465:25	1461:17,19 1543:9
princes 1628:7	1540:9 1542:12	1466:25 1467:1	1544:6,12,15,17,18
1629:6 1648:6	1583:9 1612:21	1468:4,9,18,19	1546:8,17,19
1649:17,25	1613:1,4 1616:17	1469:8 1470:13	1547:17 1548:2,4,4

		·	
1548:7,8,12 1549:4	propose 1447:6	1660:17 1661:15	1527:14 1548:16
1552:6,23 1553:1,5	1513:21 1614:11	publicize 1438:22	1548:20 1553:10
1553:6,8 1555:22	proposed 1422:1	publicly 1536:21	1556:17 1560:21
1558:19 1565:16	1653:24,25	publish 1676:13	1562:2,2,3,7,15
1567:19 1573:11	proposes 1447:6	published 1658:2,5,7	1567:18 1575:7
1573:12,16 1574:9	1605:9	1658:17	1576:22 1577:2
1576:13,17	proposing 1613:10	purpose 1551:10	1583:19 1586:5,11
1577:14,18 1581:6	propriety 1621:25	1631:2 1634:20	1587:12 1588:5,6,7
1581:20 1582:10	prose 1554:17	1635:12	1588:11,23 1589:3
1582:19,23	proskauer 1406:3,7	purposes 1504:10	1589:4 1605:7
1583:16 1584:7,11	prospects 1649:16	1542:1 1609:11	1606:2,5 1608:21
1587:21 1588:3,14	protein 1659:8	1640:22 1675:3	1611:1,5,22
1589:19 1590:18	prove 1617:24	pursuant 1405:15	1617:13 1618:11
1591:1 1619:10,19	proven 1620:4	1597:19	1624:1,5 1632:12
1666:12,19,23	provide 1423:17,19	purview 1448:16	1632:17 1642:11
1667:3,19,25	1468:3 1509:10	1510:19	1667:14,15,18
1668:23 1670:2,7	1534:14 1547:10	put 1416:17 1421:3	1668:3,8 1673:8,21
1670:24,25 1671:1	1547:14 1548:8,12	1429:13 1444:8	1673:24 1674:2
1673:13	1558:11 1566:22	1445:12 1446:23	1675:9
programming	1595:9 1607:3	1450:13 1471:9	quarterlong 1574:2
1619:5	1608:16 1613:14	1482:18 1496:2	1666:17
programs 1548:3,6	provided 1426:10	1533:18,19	quarterly 1462:13
1573:22 1577:24	1466:18 1495:8	1558:14 1571:5	quarters 1462:3
1582:12	1498:21 1509:12	1594:5 1612:19	1548:11 1561:23
progress 1603:4,22	1534:11 1537:15	1665:11 1676:18	1562:1 1567:10,13
1667:13	1537:20,23	puts 1515:10	1567:17 1576:10
progression 1490:24	1605:11 1607:23	puzzle 1585:11	1577:4 1586:20
1567:2	1635:4 1638:14	0	1608:22 1619:25
project 1478:23	1661:9		1666:21
1510:21 1655:5	providence 1472:6	qualifications	query 1497:16
1659:10,11 1669:5	1516:14	1463:25 1480:1	question 1421:2
projects 1659:5	provides 1547:1	qualified 1506:10,16	1428:9,17 1434:17
promoted 1411:21	1640:17	1507:2 1573:24	1435:4 1437:25
prompts 1554:21	providing 1561:11	qualify 1526:2 1666:24	1442:6 1456:25
prong 1608:4	proving 1623:20	qualifying 1503:13	1463:15 1474:23
prongs 1603:23	provision 1537:5	quality 1422:1	1484:10 1489:3
pronouncing	provisional 1416:17	1577:12	1502:15 1510:1,11
1476:15	1416:18 1561:8,8	quarter 1413:23	1512:18 1517:2
pronunciation	provisions 1535:11	1422:5 1425:5	1519:1 1522:19
1485:22	provost 1427:2	1452:20 1453:3,14	1530:7 1534:7
proof 1438:4	1428:13,15 1429:7	1453:18 1454:18	1560:2 1572:24
1522:25	provosts 1426:23	1454:20,21,24	1624:7 1628:11
proper 1533:8 1534:7 1607:1	public 1482:22 1536:5	1455:2,3 1458:19	1630:11,12 1632:6
1534:7 1607:1	publication 1579:8	1458:20 1462:5,6,7	1632:9 1634:6,13 1638:5 1639:2
proposal 1595:14	1660:25 1661:10	1462:17,18 1475:7	1640:18 1641:23
1621:25	1663:10 1665:3	1475:8 1507:24	1645:25 1656:20
proposals 1579:7	publications 1653:14	1508:3 1519:20	1656:23 1657:10
proposais 13/3./	publications 1033.14	-500.5 1517.20	1030.23 1037.10

1657:16,18 1658:6	r1k 1476:24	1555:6 1568:24	rebutted 1618:6
1658:11 1660:21	ra 1478:14 1481:9	1569:3,4 1580:18	recall 1468:1
1662:5 1664:17	1486:5 1487:11	reading 1420:19	1498:23 1499:16
1675:19,20	1527:1,4,9,14,19	1426:14 1427:22	1503:19 1510:6,8
questioning 1410:5	1528:16,19 1529:9	1474:11 1479:25	1550:10 1631:24
1435:19 1436:18	racial 1412:16	1515:8,9 1569:1	1631:25 1661:21
1437:18 1439:23	raelene 1679:16	1575:22 1580:21	1672:11
questions 1413:17	raise 1466:24	1610:15 1614:19	receipt 1477:25
1430:9,17 1431:7	1470:22 1518:15	readings 1467:9	receive 1429:24
1432:15 1433:20	raised 1434:19,21	1484:17 1514:17	1450:18,20 1462:9
1438:3,6,9 1440:17	1437:10,15 1438:4	1514:25 1515:3	1462:15 1463:4
1440:20 1441:16	1503:11 1598:19	1585:7	1465:21 1469:1
1441:18 1450:16	range 1496:12	ready 1467:9	1492:18 1509:9
1452:14 1454:13	1533:9 1566:4	1474:12,14,17	1527:16,25 1528:5
1456:8 1460:13	ranges 1515:3	1513:21 1516:15	1528:10 1532:10
1466:4,13,15	rank 1647:21	1520:5 1556:4,10	1562:8 1585:25
1474:17,20,25	ranked 1647:20	1556:13 1625:12	1592:9,24 1607:6
1476:2,9 1497:12	ranking 1647:25	real 1490:11 1575:10	1609:2 1612:8
1513:3,5,9,11,13	ranks 1417:10	realistic 1501:8	1623:12 1649:1
1513:15,19,21,23	rapidly 1604:22	realistically 1542:6	received 1408:3
1514:8 1516:24	rapport 1479:8	really 1450:23	1409:3 1430:4,6
1518:2,4,16,21	rare 1423:24	1459:19 1489:19	1469:2 1478:3,6
1520:6,8,9,13	1596:13	1489:19 1492:2	1487:6 1490:12
1521:1,5 1522:11	rarely 1608:7	1494:4 1522:19	1495:12 1508:18
1522:15 1526:16	rate 1610:9,13	1563:18 1568:1	1522:18 1526:3
1529:1,12 1530:10	rates 1589:2	1579:3 1600:5,24	1527:3,14 1528:14
1565:5 1583:2,9	ratio 1454:8,10,11	1630:6 1635:21	1528:15,17
1591:15,18 1593:7	rationale 1675:6	1636:10 1644:13	1532:15,19,22
1593:9 1598:19	rcx 1407:2	1648:6 1649:15,17	1550:19,21
1602:22 1615:7	rd 1598:6	1650:14 1668:23	1564:24 1565:2
1616:13 1626:7	rds 1598:16	1675:8 1677:1	1570:1,3 1571:21
1628:13,15	rdx 1407:2	1678:2	1571:23 1578:20
1637:19 1641:14	reach 1455:9 1517:1	reason 1421:19	1578:22 1589:24
1671:15 1673:15	1520:23	1447:19,21	1590:2 1594:1,10
1678:7,14	reached 1518:18	1448:18 1489:20	1594:15 1602:8
quick 1421:2	1521:8	1595:13 1609:12	1604:24 1607:5
quickly 1480:18	read 1427:15 1474:8	1623:10,12 1664:2	1609:22 1612:11
1529:15 1548:17	1474:16 1477:20	reasonable 1598:10	1620:14 1623:16
1565:19,22 1611:1	1477:23,25 1478:8	reasonably 1598:24	1630:17 1631:16
quite 1428:5 1435:5	1481:16,21 1496:1	reasons 1439:18	1679:12
1550:3 1551:25	1546:2 1559:12	1534:21 1535:9	receiving 1439:17
1552:7 1565:22	1580:15 1604:10	1595:16 1604:25	1519:23
1588:20	1604:15 1630:23	1610:24 1611:16	recess 1430:14
quote 1598:25	reader 1424:4,6	1612:4 1622:20	1434:13 1440:14
1604:2	1601:19	1623:19 1625:5,9	1460:18 1476:6
	readers 1545:19	1662:24	1532:2,5 1583:6
<u>R</u>	1552:21 1554:13	rebuttal 1631:21	1593:15 1601:23
r 1406:1	1554:15,17,18	1634:9	1608:14 1625:14

1605.16 1671.10	d 1577-21 22	1642.11 1646.12	
1625:16 1671:12	red 1567:21,22	1642:11 1646:13	relationship 1492:1
1678:11	1570:13 1577:8	region 1405:3	1492:3 1663:17,20
recollect 1631:11	1590:11,19	1437:17 1534:15	1663:24 1664:5,10
1633:9 1634:25	1591:22 1666:7	1538:7 1598:3	1664:10
recollection 1630:9	1667:6 1669:23	1602:7 1621:7	relationships 1547:5
1630:21 1633:4,23	1672:2	1622:16,17,23,23	relatively 1501:23
1635:1 1668:4	redirect 1454:14	1622:25 1625:3	1596:18
recommendation	1460:4 1529:2	1679:5	relevance 1433:15
1450:5	1591:16 1673:17	regional 1436:24	1433:18 1434:20
record 1410:1,2,16	refer 1471:19 1529:4	1437:16 1540:3,7	1530:4
1410:20,21,23,24	1612:23	1540:12,16	relevant 1437:10
1420:8 1427:19	referenced 1505:9	1594:22 1598:2,11	1462:17 1482:6
1430:13,16 1431:8	references 1480:20	1598:20 1602:4,17	1515:1 1537:8,11
1434:5,7,8,12,15	referred 1504:23,24	1604:1,8 1610:3,5	reliable 1472:9
1434:16,21,24	1645:14 1653:8	1615:9 1621:6,17	religious 1477:4,5
1435:1,10 1436:14	1654:9	1621:20 1622:6,17	1510:10
1438:17 1440:13	referring 1452:20	1622:24,25 1625:3	remains 1674:8
1440:16 1442:3	1502:16 1629:17	register 1553:2	remember 1441:18
1444:23 1447:7	1649:8 1654:13,14	1555:24	1441:20 1442:15
1453:3,6 1456:11	1662:5 1677:9	registrar 1420:13	1472:3,5 1491:12
1458:18 1460:17	reflect 1435:2	1495:6 1591:12	1500:5 1626:12
1461:2 1466:22	1496:23 1497:7	1605:10,21	1634:11,19
1476:4,5,8 1477:9	reflected 1515:2	regular 1417:23	1635:25 1642:24
1477:17 1493:17	reflection 1467:2	1423:24 1425:19	1644:7 1646:20
1505:1 1508:21	reflects 1496:25	1466:6 1473:4	remind 1499:14
1526:11,13,14	reformation 1484:16	1475:6 1486:16	removed 1535:11,15
1531:12 1532:1,4	refresh 1630:20	regularity 1480:15	renaissance 1484:16
1532:25 1535:3	1633:4	regularly 1473:7	rendered 1655:2
1536:2 1537:19,22	regard 1431:22	1496:20 1497:7	renee 1543:16
1538:25 1539:6	1436:12 1439:13	reiterate 1633:13	repeat 1562:11
1540:1 1541:16	1441:15 1442:5,20	reject 1438:11	repeatedly 1662:25
1542:20 1547:16	1445:5 1446:17	1439:23	repetitive 1576:9
1550:22 1566:14	1456:10 1511:11	rejected 1408:5,6,7	rephrase 1634:13
1583:5,8 1590:13	1519:19 1527:5 1596:18 1614:15	1440:3,5 1679:13	1645:25 1672:20
1590:17,20,22	1629:21 1630:15	relate 1481:10 1483:2 1657:17	replicate 1555:7
1593:14,17,20,23			report 1426:23
1594:20 1595:4 1599:6 1600:3	regarding 1436:21 1595:8 1598:20	1675:14 related 1421:11	reporter 1442:16
		1452:5 1481:13	reporting 1528:4
1601:5,19,21,25	1605:11 1615:5		represent 1505:4 1578:14
1612:7,18 1625:15	1628:5 1653:16	1484:21 1505:19	
1625:18 1636:13	regardless 1587:8 1674:17	1506:13 1538:10	representation
1650:17 1671:10		relates 1438:7	1436:22 1437:23
1671:11,14 1678:9	regards 1438:1	1605:14	1536:1 1537:19
1678:10,13,23	1439:22 1532:25	relating 1497:13	1538:1,4 1596:3,15
1679:8	1593:20 1594:12	1502:6 1659:16	1604:6 1610:2
recording 1679:11	1600:19 1615:4	relations 1405:2	1621:2,23
recrossexamination	1624:15 1628:24	1537:16 1596:1	representative
1456:6 1529:13	regeneration 1642:4	1679:4	1609:8 1611:12

represented 1540:1	1486:2,3,19,21,23	1425:13 1435:20	1486:13,15,23
request 1420:17	1498:2 1508:11	1464:17 1467:22	1487:2 1531:10,10
1533:10,16,25	1514:16,23 1529:5	1471:4 1473:9	1540:4,8 1580:3
1534:17 1535:23	1529:5,8 1536:6	1487:23 1490:13	1598:16 1653:13
1537:13 1540:15	1544:14 1552:6,17	1501:25 1524:10	1661:24
1541:21 1611:7	1596:20 1603:9	1574:5 1584:21	reviewed 1658:8,17
1621:18	1609:5 1618:17	responsibility	1676:14
requested 1533:23	1648:3 1649:11	1418:3,25 1431:12	reviewing 1421:15
requests 1521:8	1650:18 1651:9,21	1431:21 1443:14	1472:15 1474:11
1533:11,15 1534:5	1654:6,9,10 1655:2	1502:1 1556:10	1588:4 1621:20
1535:12 1536:4	1655:11,13,25	1561:19,20 1587:8	reviews 1486:18,21
required 1415:9	1656:25 1657:3,7,9	1591:21	revoke 1530:22
1446:4 1488:24	1658:22 1659:1,5	responsible 1416:4	1532:6,8 1533:1,6
1494:9 1499:20	1659:14,15 1660:3	1421:20 1422:23	1535:5,17,19
1507:8 1510:18	1660:11,20,24	1423:14 1424:1	1536:10 1537:7
1520:23 1524:2	1661:2 1664:24	1432:7,9 1464:23	1540:24 1625:2,4,5
1538:9 1548:10	1665:6	1464:24,25 1465:1	1625:8
1553:2 1563:2	researching 1659:24	1474:11 1557:8	revoked 1534:22,23
1582:9 1586:10	1660:2	1561:21 1647:17	rhetorician 1669:13
1608:16 1618:20	reserve 1471:9	1672:22	richard 1630:8
1658:5 1666:16	1482:18	responsive 1536:15	rick 1627:3 1635:25
requirement 1451:5	resident 1543:15,19	1536:23	1648:16
1487:12,13	1599:11,13	rest 1514:3 1535:8	right 1423:21
1494:13,16	resides 1605:4	1659:8,18,24	1431:14,25
1580:25 1581:3	respect 1415:4	1660:2,5,8,11	1438:10 1443:8,11
1618:24 1619:22	1418:21 1437:4	restaurant 1523:13	1444:7,17 1445:3,7
1620:2 1658:8	1454:16 1455:5	restrictions 1577:15	1445:14 1446:18
1660:18,22 1661:1	1465:23,24	result 1509:20	1447:1,24 1448:6
requirements	1467:17 1468:24	1608:22 1609:2	1449:2,4 1450:6,7
1432:11 1451:17	1471:24 1480:11	1618:25 1619:6	1450:15 1451:25
1455:8 1456:19	1485:12 1489:3	1620:3	1452:3 1453:16,19
1502:11 1511:3,6	1494:20 1498:18	resulted 1596:23	1459:25 1460:12
1523:19 1524:13	1500:8 1509:19	results 1569:4	1464:20 1467:21
1603:9 1617:18	1512:8,16 1517:3	1655:2 1660:13	1482:21 1487:13
1618:19,23 1619:5	1520:16 1521:11	resume 1444:9	1489:6 1495:23
1620:17,19 1661:1	1537:1 1594:3	1450:14 1531:13	1497:18 1498:21
1673:12	1664:24 1673:19	1531:24 1678:22	1502:19 1503:14
requires 1553:13	respective 1434:24	resumption 1606:4	1510:15 1519:8
1567:25 1573:3	1532:25	retake 1587:14,21	1530:20,23 1534:8
1579:11,12	respond 1565:22	return 1410:6	1537:22 1541:9,14
1619:24	1641:21	1608:19 1609:18	1558:5 1559:3
requiring 1537:5	respondent 1474:18	1615:1 1635:22	1561:21 1567:2,6
research 1470:3,11	respondents 1474:9	returned 1609:23	1571:1 1581:15
1470:12 1471:5,17	responding 1496:18	returns 1512:23	1587:14 1592:11
1476:24 1477:11	1554:20	reveal 1482:22	1593:11 1601:7
1478:24 1479:4,23	responsibilities	revert 1676:24	1627:9 1636:16
1483:4,13,18	1415:4,13 1416:1	review 1428:25	1638:5 1641:24
1485:14,20,25	1420:4,7,8 1425:6	1437:14,20 1447:5	1642:9 1643:1

	-	-	-
1644:10,11	1472:7 1554:20	1610:4	1499:4,5 1500:20
1646:24 1653:4	1568:18 1574:11	scheduled 1530:16	1500:22 1502:6,25
1655:3,14 1664:11	1615:22 1616:1	1540:7	1511:20 1513:8
1666:8 1669:4,21	1665:1	schedules 1603:17	1514:25 1515:24
role 1418:21 1432:4	runs 1494:17	1677:2,3	1516:1 1517:2,11
1435:14 1438:1		scheduling 1473:12	1517:25 1518:14
1462:11 1470:9	S	1585:4,5 1610:6	1520:2 1527:1,5
1481:6 1506:1	s 1406:1 1408:1	scheiner 1478:18	1529:4
1510:22 1514:19	1409:1 1437:6	schilling 1652:22	schreiners 1481:17
1527:4 1552:9	1583:15 1584:4,12	schneider 1652:11	1482:19 1483:18
1645:10 1650:18	1608:8 1664:19	scholars 1444:17	science 1619:8
1659:3	sake 1624:3	1473:14,16 1474:7	sciences 1470:2
roles 1436:5 1527:8	salvatore 1406:5	1480:24 1506:16	1473:6 1614:4
1583:1	1531:14 1599:13	school 1458:14	1619:7,11,24
roman 1506:3	1601:4 1616:10	1461:14,16,18	scientist 1664:14,16
1597:12	sample 1551:5	1462:13 1463:22	scientists 1664:18,20
room 1434:3	1565:12,13 1573:3	1469:11,12	1664:21
1473:12 1614:1,2,5	1573:4	1470:14 1483:9	scope 1533:8 1534:8
1616:1,4	san 1602:13 1603:23	1503:18 1504:18	1535:22 1654:3
rosch 1652:11	1604:3,7	1507:15 1511:24	score 1496:17
rose 1406:3	sat 1630:9 1635:10	1520:21 1522:4,7	1647:17
rosenbaum 1429:6	1640:21,24	1523:8,12,15,21	scott 1605:10,20
rotated 1455:15,16	satisfied 1451:5	1524:1,11,17	se 1599:11
1649:9	1537:25 1538:22	1525:14 1526:4	search 1471:14
rotation 1648:6,9,12	1539:22 1549:24	1527:12 1528:13	1480:23
1648:16 1650:1	1604:8	1545:6,6 1546:24	searching 1480:25
rotations 1648:5,21	satisfy 1603:9	1568:12 1569:20	seating 1523:12
rough 1637:9,12,25	sauce 1601:6	1577:16,18 1594:4	second 1417:12
1638:7	saves 1416:5	1594:7 1618:18	1424:6 1436:19
rounds 1467:13	saw 1491:19 1636:22	1619:4 1620:16	1464:12 1467:17
rubric 1637:9,13,13	1645:6	1622:22 1649:19	1469:16 1473:14
1637:17,25 1638:1	saying 1497:6,14	1675:23	1504:23 1533:3,7
1638:7,10,13,14,20	1500:9 1518:1	schoolhouse 1567:21	1534:12 1535:6
1639:1,3,5	1522:25 1538:17	1567:22 1570:13	1560:25 1603:12
rule 1414:13 1596:4	1574:14 1575:23	1572:14 1574:4,6	1604:20 1614:3
1598:22	1600:12 1601:9	1577:8,23 1590:11	1622:11 1629:18
rules 1537:5 1577:25	1634:11,12	1590:19 1591:22	1632:12 1641:25
ruling 1535:16	says 1536:11 1537:4	1666:8 1667:6	1643:12,13
1540:20 1541:16	1537:13 1539:1	1669:24 1672:2	1651:25 1652:5,17
1600:17,22 1601:8	1561:14 1577:17	schools 1546:15	1667:15 1668:7
1625:2	1591:25 1607:20	1547:6,9	1672:14
run 1412:23 1414:21	1610:5 1664:3	schreiner 1470:13	secretary 1435:24
1419:2 1423:12	scale 1479:18	1478:16,17,21	1439:16
1424:14 1436:2,2	1647:21	1479:4 1480:5,13	secrets 1482:23
1472:8 1480:17	scattered 1602:23,25	1481:10 1483:24	section 1414:6
1510:23 1575:15	1603:6,12 1604:2	1484:3 1485:8,9,21	1464:25 1467:8,10
1636:22	schedule 1425:2	1485:22 1490:19	1502:2 1517:18
running 1424:19	1504:20 1603:1,16	1492:1,3,5 1493:14	1518:10 1548:13
	<u> </u>	1.72.1,0,0 1175.11	10.10.10

1556.24 1557.7 0	1507.6 0 11 12 15	gamantiag 1405,22	garre 1410,10 22
1556:24 1557:7,9	1597:6,9,11,13,15	semantics 1495:23	serve 1418:19,22
1557:13,14,15	1597:22 1605:22	semester 1574:16	1422:7,14 1424:11
1559:15 1560:3,3	1606:7,14,18	1598:7 1611:11	1454:19,20,23
1560:20,23	1607:15,19 1611:9	seminal 1602:14	1461:24 1474:9
1562:22 1585:15	1613:9 1621:10	seminar 1419:6	1530:23 1546:5
1585:22 1595:25	1622:12 1630:20	1422:19 1484:17	1558:23 1561:24
1596:13 1601:2	1635:2 1636:2	1500:5 1575:8,14	1586:25 1587:23
1604:5 1630:8,24	1637:10 1641:9	1575:15	served 1462:1,5,8
1631:2,24 1632:14	1643:18 1646:11	seminars 1423:1	1464:5 1468:18
1632:25 1633:1,7	1651:19 1673:1,7	1554:20	1469:19,25 1470:3
1635:9,13,21	1675:7 1677:6	seminary 1482:16	1491:9 1503:18
1636:25 1637:3	seeing 1567:3	send 1420:17 1426:5	1506:18 1533:4
1670:20,23	1634:11,19,25	senility 1631:13	1587:11,22
1672:10,22	1635:1	senior 1547:22	service 1534:12
sections 1412:23,24	seek 1487:24 1508:7	1572:22 1626:24	1562:9 1586:1
1414:5,9 1415:1,5	1511:20 1578:13	1655:24 1661:6	1592:25 1594:4
1465:23,25 1466:6	seeking 1435:21	seniors 1419:7	services 1547:10,15
1468:22,24 1475:8	1510:25 1537:2	1423:13 1424:2	serving 1455:6
1482:7 1492:11	1618:1	1655:23	1465:4 1469:23
1517:5,10,14,24	seeks 1534:10,19	sense 1413:16	1507:7 1519:2
1518:17,19 1519:3	1537:3	1416:8 1453:1	session 1475:2
1548:15,19	seen 1427:17,21	1458:17 1466:16	1509:16,25 1510:1
1556:19,23,25	1491:18 1504:17	1505:13,17	1510:2 1574:23
1560:6 1562:3,19	1504:19 1525:20	1515:10 1541:23	1588:17 1632:23
1562:23 1563:16	1533:17 1567:1	1541:23 1552:19	1633:11 1635:17
1572:10,15	1581:22 1636:2	1567:4 1591:6	sessions 1475:6
1583:21,23 1584:9	1662:9	1602:25 1646:14	1507:14 1510:7
1585:1,2,4,14,17	sees 1472:14	1668:25	1512:11 1522:1
1586:12 1629:23	segue 1656:19	sent 1605:9	1529:16,17,17,18
1630:13,16,17,22	segues 1656:22	sentence 1481:4	1529:25 1530:2
1636:5,11,20	select 1420:23	separate 1462:15	1559:19 1566:9
1640:25 1641:2,4,5	1459:1 1566:23	1483:12 1490:4	1574:21,25 1636:1
1641:8 1645:14	1573:11	1527:7,17,21	set 1421:4 1460:6,9
1670:14,16 1671:4	selected 1425:21	1545:4 1581:2	1471:15 1474:3,9
1671:23,25 1672:1	1426:4 1458:25,25	1600:7 1670:20	1480:15 1492:6
1672:6	1474:18 1649:6	separately 1462:10	1495:9 1497:24
secular 1506:5	selecting 1418:22	1463:4 1527:14	1499:7,21 1513:9
secure 1524:18	1420:14 1474:6	1546:22	1545:2 1557:14
see 1427:20 1442:4	selection 1421:20	september 1606:5	1594:22,24
1443:1 1448:21,21	1435:9 1482:1,3	1608:20 1611:4,8	1615:10 1618:16
1451:21 1457:4,7,7	1563:13 1595:14	1611:21 1614:22	1619:4 1624:10
1457:9,17,17	1648:2	sequence 1629:7,10	sets 1471:15 1506:15
1458:3,3 1459:22	selects 1435:8	1629:14	1610:2
1472:7 1481:1	self 1484:25 1509:4	sequences 1558:1	setting 1523:5
1488:4 1489:21	selfreflective 1509:6	serious 1604:23	settings 1512:4
1505:2,4 1513:22	selfreflexive 1509:2	seriously 1575:4	settled 1500:7
1551:14 1570:18	1509:5,6	sermon 1480:18	seven 1529:24
1578:14 1596:7	semantic 1495:21	sermons 1472:4	1542:2 1556:21

1585:20 1672:14	1536:18 1595:12	skills 1468:16	sooner 1614:12
1672:15	1609:13	1479:12,12	sore 1489:7
shakes 1513:22	significantly 1502:3	1479.12,12	sorry 1414:12
sheer 1481:13	1535:13 1603:1	1509:20 1566:17	1426:10 1428:7,8
shell 1472:1	similar 1423:7	1649:24 1650:2,4	1420.10 1428.7,8
shen 1472.1 shes 1471:13 1479:7	1467:22 1468:13	skip 1441:25	1449:16,16
1480:8 1482:20	1481:11 1491:15	sliding 1479:17	1453:19,20
1491:17 1492:7,25	1506:25 1524:3	slightly 1417:22	1456:24 1457:10
1538:4 1650:11	1536:25 1565:11	1447:2 1464:12	1457:12 1483:4
sheva 1436:7,8	1579:23 1603:16	1603:15 1638:18	1489:7 1502:13
1437:4,7	1620:24	slip 1618:12	1505:1 1514:20
shift 1527:9,11	similarly 1596:5	slots 1418:2	1539:14 1570:24
shop 1523:6,9,11,11	1614:12	small 1419:6	1570:24 1571:17
shops 1471:10	simple 1435:5	1422:19,25	1570.24 1571.17
shops 1471.10 short 1430:14	1451:22	1459:21 1499:16	1587:16 1599:8
1434:13 1440:14	simply 1474:16	1501:23 1502:21	1656:19 1672:19
1454:13 1440:14	1553:15 1585:3	1501:23 1302:21	1673:5,6,7
1530:17 1532:2	simultaneously	1597:13 1621:4	sort 1458:6 1466:2
1542:6 1583:6	1615:14	smaller 1417:22	1466:14 1468:3
1593:15 1601:23	single 1544:16	1468:7 1517:15	1471:7,13 1473:22
1625:16 1671:12	1632:13	smith 1547:23	1471.7,13 1473.22
1678:11	sir 1431:3 1432:6	soaking 1663:21	1473.23 1474.1,2,7
	1433:14 1446:5	soandso 1496:15,17	1474.9,19 1479.10
shortly 1647:4 shouldnt 1574:3	1456:15 1481:19	1507:18 1522:25	1479:23 1482:4
show 1416:18 1505:8	1543:11,14,18,24	social 1470:2 1473:5	1491:14 1494:16
1517:22 1534:2	1544:7 1551:10	1543:21 1594:4	1491.14 1494.10
1549:16 1564:12	1560:17 1564:14	1619:7,8,11	1490.12,13,22
1569:11 1589:10	1564:17 1566:14	society 1475:11	1505:24 1506:3
1597:4 1651:13	1569:18 1570:11	software 1666:3	1503.24 1500.3
showed 1517:19	1570:18 1570:11	1676:3	1510:11 1513:23
1525:10 1638:15	1570.18 1571.11	solicit 1420:16	1510:11 1515:25
showing 1437:1,2,18	sit 1636:11 1640:10	solicited 1420:21	1515:24,25 1514.2
1438:8 1538:10,19	1662:9	1421:4 1436:4	1518:6 1519:18
1605:19 1609:8	sitdown 1522:16	1437:3 1440:23	1520:6,6,22,25
shown 1436:21	site 1596:8,8 1611:9	1441:7	1520:0,0,22,23
1437:11 1620:3	1617:20	soliciting 1426:6	1525:2,8,15
shows 1534:3	sites 1600:14	1479:3	sorts 1416:20,21
1569:22	sitting 1574:14	somebody 1446:15	1449:23 1510:22
shubin 1648:10	1635:12	1450:1 1455:20	sounded 1514:1
shut 1586:12	situation 1418:7	1477:3 1478:2	sounds 1642:9
side 1440:12 1483:20	1511:7 1523:1	1567:4 1592:13	1646:24
1615:25 1659:4	six 1459:1,3 1542:2	1668:9	source 1472:2
sign 1564:2	1593:2	someones 1449:20	sources 1472.2 sources 1471:14
signature 1539:1,17	sixth 1456:20	1545:9	south 1405:16
signed 1439:14	size 1548:17	somewhat 1468:15	1406:11 1614:2
1605:23	skill 1492:6 1497:24	1479:17 1510:19	space 1520:22
significant 1443:13	1499:21 1506:15	1512:23	1547:2
1443:14 1450:2	1545:5	soon 1540:14	spanish 1479:13
			I -

speak 1472:20	1648:15 1673:3,4	statement 1439:12	1422-25 1426-0 15
speak 1473:20 1505:11 1662:20	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		1423:25 1426:9,15
	square 1406:6	1515:15 1534:10	1427:1 1433:11
speakers 1439:6	squared 1603:25	1612:24 1613:6	1436:1 1445:2 1447:6 1450:13
speaking 1415:9	staff 1417:19,24	1616:20	
1496:4 1570:11	1418:1 1547:17,19	statements 1534:15	1454:19 1461:11
special 1419:7	1549:6 1556:8,13	1537:15,23 1538:8	1461:22 1466:25
1432:17 1475:8	1576:13,17 1588:3	states 1405:1	1474:8 1488:15
specialize 1544:18	1588:8,14 1671:1	1535:20 1596:2,15	1493:22 1494:1
specialties 1580:12	stage 1448:10	1607:11	1496:9,15,20
specialty 1544:21,21	stamm 1679:16	stay 1458:14 1521:4	1497:6 1503:17
1545:18	stand 1542:16	1567:8 1582:9	1505:14 1506:18
specific 1466:4	standard 1463:21	stem 1642:3 1646:12	1506:24 1516:18
1486:22 1511:4	1537:6 1616:23	stemcell 1642:11	1519:14,21 1522:6
1515:2,3 1600:20	1617:10,24 1618:2	stenographer	1522:7 1523:7
1637:19	1618:6,15 1621:9	1626:17	1550:25 1551:6
specifically 1471:22	1621:14 1622:14	step 1434:9 1484:20	1554:20 1555:10
1577:21 1675:14	1622:17 1623:2,7	1508:23 1664:13	1555:16 1560:13
specifics 1612:15	1623:20,22	steven 1406:4,5	1560:15 1563:24
speculating 1501:3	standardization	sticking 1666:2	1565:13,21
speculation 1639:10	1639:23	stipend 1461:21	1566:19,20,21
speech 1439:9	standing 1514:3	1462:10,13,21	1568:18 1569:8
spell 1410:15 1461:1	1668:23	1463:7 1475:21	1573:4,17 1577:11
1542:20	stands 1496:18	1527:6 1528:14,16	1579:6 1588:4
spend 1415:15,17	start 1461:17 1477:8	stipulated 1597:20	1592:3,5,22
1425:17 1472:7	1478:13 1588:18	1617:4	1596:19 1605:4
1480:7 1554:14	1595:6 1608:20	stipulating 1599:19	1606:15 1607:11
1609:5 1659:23	1611:4,21 1613:7	straight 1555:4	1607:12 1609:22
1677:25	1613:10 1614:24	street 1405:16	1621:2 1622:16
spent 1415:3	1626:7 1628:1	1614:5,7	1623:3,5 1635:3
1521:22 1633:12	1658:6	strenuously 1595:13	1640:14 1642:8
1660:2,6	started 1442:11	stretch 1521:6	1643:7,10,14
split 1448:13	1507:25 1508:1	strictly 1448:16	1644:8,24 1646:2
1475:24,25	1643:1,12 1648:9	strike 1433:12	1646:17 1650:14
1632:18	starting 1478:23	1512:18 1538:22	1653:19 1659:9
spoke 1520:2	starts 1562:5	1553:17 1577:7	1662:13 1676:7
spoken 1435:25	1570:16 1606:5	1603:3,21 1657:11	students 1405:8
1498:12	1614:21	strives 1454:9	1412:22,24 1413:2
spread 1514:4	state 1410:15	strong 1447:18	1414:6,20,22,23,25
spring 1423:16	1434:23 1461:1	1492:1,2 1595:24	1415:1 1416:3,16
1452:21 1462:6,7	1531:11 1532:24	1604:19 1618:5	1417:5,5,17 1418:1
1464:8,10 1489:10	1533:2 1537:21	structure 1465:3	1418:12,15,18,22
1489:14,23	1540:12 1542:19	1475:20 1643:9	1419:12,15,18,21
1526:23 1555:19	1594:20 1595:4	stuart 1613:24	1420:17,22,23
1556:16 1586:5,8	1599:5 1612:13	1614:2	1421:6,8,11 1422:7
1586:13,15 1598:7	1624:19	student 1413:14,14	1422:9,14,25
1605:7 1606:2	stated 1478:10	1413:20 1414:25	1423:8,18 1424:4
1610:25 1617:13	1520:25 1598:3,7,8	1416:7,16 1417:20	1424:15,19,21,24
1618:10 1624:1	1598:18 1602:3	1419:8,16 1423:21	1425:14,18,21
	1		

1426.1 11 12	1605.12 1606.1 0	1527.22 1610.19	1525.4
1426:1,11,13 1432:14 1435:10	1605:13 1606:1,9	1527:23 1619:18 1660:5 1663:10	1535:4
	1606:17,17,19		substantive 1551:23
1435:15 1438:2	1607:6,14,20,21,23	studying 1485:22	1560:5,7,12 1561:5
1442:12 1447:17	1607:24 1608:8,11	1609:6 1660:8	1566:2 1669:20
1447:21,22 1448:7	1608:14,15,19	stuff 1482:12	1670:11
1448:19 1449:23	1609:1,5,13,17,24	1663:18	substantively
1452:22 1453:4	1614:23 1615:1	style 1649:7	1495:24 1496:1
1455:6,7 1459:9	1616:24 1617:12	subfield 1483:15	substitute 1510:2
1463:22 1464:1	1618:8,20,22	subject 1436:21,25	successful 1581:10
1465:6,10,11,14,15	1619:1,8,12,16,18	1437:12,19 1448:2	successfully 1572:16
1465:16,18	1619:21 1620:1,4	1485:9 1554:4	1579:22
1467:12 1468:9	1621:22 1623:24	1621:1 1650:17	suffering 1464:13
1469:11 1473:5,6	1626:22,23,24	1669:5	1469:9 1482:2
1478:5 1482:18	1630:7,23 1631:8	subjects 1563:22	1488:9 1489:17
1490:8 1495:12	1640:2,13,17,25	1652:23	1490:10,20,25
1498:10 1499:9,14	1641:11 1643:16	submit 1443:21	1491:13,24 1493:8
1499:23 1500:7,12	1643:17 1645:23	1463:24 1479:2	1493:11 1499:22
1501:22 1503:3	1646:5 1647:14	1482:16 1487:21	1502:13 1513:2,10
1512:1 1514:4	1650:11 1655:12	1495:5 1538:6,8,14	1514:18 1515:5,23
1518:7 1520:23	1655:13,16,17,20	1576:16 1658:10	1517:9,21 1521:21
1521:7,17,22,23	1656:2,5,24,25	1665:2	1526:22
1523:4,8,14	1657:1,4,8,25	submits 1611:2	sufficient 1432:10
1525:10,14	1662:3,10 1665:14	submitted 1466:20	1522:12 1613:16
1533:22 1534:3	1666:14 1668:2,3,7	1496:11 1524:21	1615:1
1539:11 1543:21	1668:13,16,20,21	1525:9 1526:1	suggest 1502:8
1548:24 1549:1,3,5	1670:3,6 1671:3	1532:6 1538:17	1598:23
1551:12 1552:8	1672:11 1673:21	1591:12	suggested 1421:10
1554:8,16,23	1674:1,5,21,22	submitting 1466:21	1482:7 1495:19
1555:5,8,14,24	1675:1,3,6 1677:10	1575:7 1600:13	1496:6 1676:20
1558:11,12	1679:6	1666:24	suggesting 1561:13
1560:21,22	studied 1651:7	subpoena 1530:22	suit 1669:16,16
1562:24 1563:2	studies 1411:12	1531:8 1532:6,10	suite 1406:11
1564:3,4 1565:20	1418:25 1424:5,14	1533:3,5,6,7,9,11	sum 1527:13
1566:4 1567:23	1426:8,8 1427:12	1534:5,8,10,13,18	summaries 1633:5
1569:6,7 1571:13	1431:19 1432:5,13	1534:21,22 1535:2	1634:10,15,15
1572:17,18,18	1448:17 1449:12	1535:6,18 1536:11	summary 1471:18
1575:3,5,22 1576:1	1450:25 1455:11	1537:7 1539:21	1543:23 1600:6,25
1576:16,21 1577:6	1455:22 1456:12	subpoenas 1532:8	1631:9,10,16
1577:10,11,13,23	1457:19 1472:24	subsequent 1489:18	1633:9
1579:19 1581:5,20	1472:25 1473:1,3	1508:1 1525:6	summer 1555:19
1583:14,20 1584:1	1473:19 1475:13	1645:2 1647:11	1556:16 1598:9,12
1584:22 1585:25	1477:4,6 1506:7	subsequently 1464:3	1604:22 1606:3
1586:4,9,25 1591:1	1510:10 1528:4,6	1655:7	1608:14,17 1609:5
1591:2,3,3,8	1619:16	substance 1560:8	1609:9,17,18
1592:24 1595:10	study 1483:3,7,10	1669:6,7,8,9	1610:20,22
1597:8 1598:9	1485:13,17,19	substantial 1544:17	1648:18 1676:15
1599:11 1603:8,15	1488:21 1489:8,16	1598:19	supervised 1637:21
1604:2,14 1605:2	1505:19 1506:14	substantially 1533:4	1637:22

supervising 1632:16	1480:13 1481:9	1673:8,12 1674:22	1491:16 1493:10
supervisor 1437:2	1482:19 1490:19	table 1615:25 1616:2	1507:12 1532:3
supervisory 1435:14	sustain 1628:18	tables 1615:22	1533:13 1553:15
1435:20 1436:11	sustained 1441:2,9	1616:1	1553:15 1555:22
1437:5,8,21 1438:1	swap 1561:1	tad 1467:18 1468:11	1569:23 1578:16
supplying 1425:19	sworn 1410:14	1469:6,11 1488:6	1583:7 1587:12
support 1423:17	1411:3 1460:25	1488:13,16	1593:16 1601:8,24
1435:12 1534:16	1461:8 1542:18	1490:24 1493:9,18	1608:2 1612:5
1537:16 1538:15	1543:3 1626:3	1506:21,25	1625:17 1633:14
1538:19 1548:8	syllabus 1420:10,18	1514:14 1515:20	1636:3 1642:18
1601:17 1618:14	1420:18 1443:23	1515:23 1519:9	1667:25 1668:2
1655:12,15	1446:22,24,25	1526:22 1626:10	1671:13 1678:12
supportive 1649:10	1482:4,8 1507:21	1629:12 1636:1	takes 1609:21
1663:17	1510:10,13	1642:6 1667:24	1668:9
supports 1617:17	1514:12,18 1515:5	taing 1484:16	talk 1413:2,16
1649:22	1515:11,15	1501:20 1512:25	1416:19 1466:5
suppose 1416:7	system 1451:19	1526:25 1675:9	1473:21 1487:15
supposed 1462:17	1528:17,21	taint 1436:11	1499:22 1512:4
1500:4 1557:16	1553:10 1606:16	1437:21	1518:2 1523:2
1620:18 1638:8	1607:22,25	take 1415:22	1544:5 1550:6
sure 1418:4,9,9	1647:25	1430:11 1444:20	1567:19 1626:18
1421:21 1432:9	systems 1605:1	1446:4 1477:19	1640:8 1641:5,25
1443:5 1444:11		1484:6 1486:4,8	1643:20 1647:8
1453:8,11,20	<u>T</u>	1489:21 1493:7	1650:14 1662:22
1470:22 1473:12	t 1408:1 1409:1	1504:4 1507:8,10	1663:17,18,25
1473:13 1474:17	1632:13	1508:25 1509:5	1666:4 1667:23
1476:5 1501:17	ta 1462:5 1464:5	1518:7,14 1531:9	1677:13
1503:6 1508:9	1465:5,8 1467:4	1542:8 1545:7,18	talked 1413:7
1511:5 1514:3,20	1469:20,23,25	1547:24 1548:10	1442:21 1503:16
1518:5 1524:5	1470:1 1490:3,12	1552:25 1553:2,3	1518:21 1581:25
1534:17 1535:1	1491:9,22 1492:6	1554:11 1555:25	1584:23 1588:3
1538:12 1552:5,11	1500:13,24	1560:19 1561:19	1654:6 1676:17
1552:11,22	1501:16,23 1502:4 1502:11,20 1503:6	1566:1,6 1569:6,8	talking 1426:12
1555:13 1556:10	,	1569:10 1574:1	1441:12 1457:11
1567:2,6 1571:3	1503:18,20 1505:21 1506:19	1575:3 1577:12,17	1507:18 1514:13
1573:16 1574:18	1503.21 1300.19	1577:22 1578:1	1514:14 1544:23
1576:3,19 1582:1	1513:18 1514:19	1580:16 1586:10	1554:15 1587:18
1583:5 1588:20,20	1515:16 1514:19	1613:15 1624:22	1654:16
1590:7 1591:7	1519:24 1521:2	1626:17 1636:19	talks 1652:16
1595:5 1600:8	1517.24 1321.2	1666:16 1668:14	tas 1463:23 1466:10
1614:23,25	1525:13 1527:6,11	1668:17 1673:22	1466:13 1498:12
1633:25 1634:14 1637:11 1643:21	1527:19 1528:14	1674:3,5 takehome 1413:12	1521:2 1526:1
1637:11 1643:21	1626:8 1627:18	1465:3,4 1499:9	1627:20 1628:8 1636:6
1673:25	1628:6 1629:6,18	1465:3,4 1499:9 taken 1430:15	taship 1462:14,16,19
surname 1461:4	1630:2 1640:14	1434:14 1440:15	1462:20 1463:5,10
surprised 1636:2	1641:1,25 1645:15	1434:14 1440:15	taships 1463:18,20
surprised 1030:2 susan 1470:13	1667:20 1669:4	1483:23 1484:2,18	task 1547:12
Susan 14/0.13	1007.20 1007.1	1403.43 1404.4,10	13K 1341.12

tasks 1471:7	1450:8 1457:14	tells 1571:11	1439:20 1449:7
taught 1412:11,19	1461:25 1462:1,9	temperaments	1480:3 1491:12
1413:13 1414:14	1462:11 1464:7,9	1490:7	1513:13 1542:12
1414:16 1415:24	1464:11,18	ten 1470:17 1499:17	1593:19 1594:5
1419:8,11 1423:4,7	1465:22 1468:3	1528:20 1553:8,11	1600:23,24
1423:8 1435:16	1487:16,17	1556:3,8 1567:25	1601:15 1602:5
1469:6 1493:14,23	1491:19 1492:8	1632:15 1647:17	1620:21 1627:20
1523:18 1553:19	1507:14,16 1508:5	1647:21	1628:8,19,24
1553:25 1559:2	1508:6,7,24	tend 1567:7,8,16	1629:8,24 1630:16
1563:11 1568:5,7	1509:14,20,21	1576:9	1634:18,19,24,24
1568:13,17	1510:16 1511:1,21	tenth 1643:16	1654:7,10 1657:14
1573:18 1576:8	1512:8,9,11,22	tenured 1411:17,18	1660:16 1661:21
1577:9 1585:21	1524:7,7,16 1525:1	1411:20 1430:24	tests 1602:17
1636:5 1666:18	1525:7,11 1526:2,8	1436:6,9 1437:5,7	text 1480:20 1481:20
1667:15,17	1548:8 1553:22	tenweek 1553:8,11	1505:11 1522:20
tax 1471:2 1528:4	1555:9 1556:17	1553:12,12	1546:1,2 1559:12
taxes 1462:16 1463:5	1559:12 1562:22	teresa 1477:25	1568:22,23 1580:9
1463:9	1562:23 1565:24	term 1412:17	textbooks 1482:17
teach 1412:8	1570:17 1572:6,14	1453:17 1485:18	texts 1472:8,15
1416:10 1419:1,15	1572:18 1573:21	1498:25 1501:19	1480:15 1481:8,15
1419:17,22	1574:5,5,6,19	1503:4 1529:7	1481:17 1482:13
1420:10 1422:5,22	1577:5,5 1581:6	1614:21	1579:18
1423:2,2 1442:14	1583:23 1584:13	terms 1417:10	thank 1410:18
1443:8,8 1446:15	1584:14 1603:9	1421:17 1422:2	1421:9 1430:8,19
1447:7,15 1457:20	1618:17 1619:9,10	1459:5 1501:25	1436:5 1440:7,19
1457:23,25	1619:13,13,17,18	1508:24 1535:13	1441:10 1449:18
1482:13 1489:9	1619:21,22,25	1541:25 1595:7	1452:12 1456:4
1493:16 1506:11	1620:1,2 1632:24	1613:8 1618:9	1459:25 1461:5
1510:18 1549:7	1637:7,8,9 1639:19	1620:6 1669:11,12	1476:11 1484:1
1556:4,14 1557:12	1670:21	testified 1411:3	1493:5 1504:11
1559:18 1561:25	team 1645:3 1662:4	1428:10 1429:23	1526:15 1530:13
1562:6,16 1567:23	technical 1432:15	1431:9 1435:6,13	1538:21 1540:18
1571:14 1572:14	technicalities	1441:13 1442:19	1540:22 1541:18
1572:16 1576:6	1516:14	1449:8 1461:8	1542:9,10 1550:23
1618:20 1637:7	technician 1659:5	1488:23 1514:23	1564:25 1570:9
1667:14 1670:19	1677:11	1524:4 1543:3	1584:18 1590:23
teacher 1511:12	technicians 1655:21	1619:3,8,12,15,20	1593:12 1595:5
1519:3	1656:5 1657:1	1619:24,25 1626:3	1599:15 1602:12
teachers 1406:15	techniques 1497:20	1629:22 1635:17	1616:19 1623:14
1582:20,24	1574:10,11	1637:12 1639:12	1625:11 1626:20
teaches 1412:25	tecum 1532:7	1640:10 1641:2	1641:20 1652:20
1553:18 1568:14	1539:21	1649:6 1655:18	1672:25 1678:17
teaching 1412:12	telephone 1522:9,10	1661:19 1662:14	thanks 1476:18
1416:11 1420:9	tell 1484:12 1486:7	1669:16 1671:2	1487:9
1425:23,25 1443:7	1553:6 1554:4	testify 1470:23	thats 1423:4,21
1444:9 1446:11,12	1574:13 1633:5	1628:20 1631:22	1427:20 1428:15
1447:22 1448:1,9	1640:14 1665:7	testimonials 1426:10	1431:14,25 1442:6
1449:5,5,13,20	1671:23	testimony 1439:19	1442:19,25 1443:2

		I	I
1443:4 1445:3,7,14	1423:6 1429:10	1557:22 1559:7,8	1550:3,12 1551:9
1445:20 1448:6,16	1432:9,12 1433:22	1561:12 1567:7	1554:16 1556:13
1449:4 1450:2,15	1437:1,2 1449:7,8	1575:6,7,9,24	1557:10 1561:14
1451:25 1452:5,9	1454:7 1472:5	1576:3,19 1577:14	1561:15 1562:16
1454:12 1455:4,15	1483:17 1484:22	1581:17 1582:9	1567:12 1570:25
1456:5 1457:22	1499:23 1514:4	1584:8,22 1587:8	1571:4 1573:16,17
1458:5,6,17 1460:9	1516:11 1521:3	1592:15,17	1580:12,14
1460:11 1463:6	1534:8 1537:5	1620:18 1674:18	1588:25 1589:1,6
1477:8,11 1479:21	1538:23 1545:20	theyve 1455:23	1589:15,20
1486:16 1489:13	1546:11 1548:21	1576:8 1586:25	1600:12 1601:2,7
1497:24 1500:8,17	1548:25 1553:1	1617:8 1620:2	1601:10,18
1503:23,23 1516:9	1556:1 1562:3	thing 1445:5	1604:13 1612:23
1517:11 1521:5,13	1566:7 1567:15	1446:17 1466:15	1613:15 1614:22
1524:8 1528:25	1581:2,2,19	1499:18 1504:20	1616:12 1633:19
1531:2,22 1535:23	1583:22 1584:11	1507:14 1525:16	1634:3,4,4 1642:24
1536:9 1537:6	1591:24 1592:10	1541:21 1550:2	1650:2,3,11 1661:2
1539:8,16 1540:10	1592:16 1604:13	1560:20 1676:22	1664:6,16 1668:4
1541:15 1544:22	1610:5 1652:15	things 1432:16	1669:10 1671:17
1548:22 1552:17	1661:8 1664:6	1449:23 1450:3	1672:13,16
1557:18,19 1562:1	1668:10	1466:7 1469:18	1673:14,23
1562:7,17 1567:6,6	thesis 1419:4	1471:9 1498:7	1678:20
1568:24 1572:21	1423:12,13 1424:2	1509:3 1510:16,20	thinking 1421:25
1580:24 1582:4	1425:15 1445:13	1510:23 1512:14	1507:20 1545:14
1584:16 1585:23	1653:24 1654:18	1535:1 1545:14	1552:10 1554:12
1587:15 1589:3	1654:23 1655:4,25	1547:2 1597:9	1568:23 1580:10
1590:4 1591:14	1659:18,19,24,25	1621:12 1638:21	1580:17
1593:5,24 1599:23	1660:4,12	1641:11 1649:4	thinks 1588:8
1601:9 1607:21	theyll 1420:24	1663:15 1665:4	third 1448:11,14
1610:18,20 1613:2	1509:25	1674:23,24 1675:4	1456:22 1457:13
1614:4 1616:9,12	theyre 1415:14,15	think 1415:8,14,16	1468:11 1488:21
1616:15 1617:5,21	1416:11,14 1418:5	1415:16 1427:18	1489:1,25 1507:22
1620:20 1624:4,6	1420:7 1421:7	1429:8 1433:21	1562:2,15,16
1624:24 1625:6	1423:14,24 1440:8	1436:5,6,8,10,13	1567:18 1569:9
1632:9 1639:9,12	1444:4,5,18 1445:8	1442:3 1446:9	1572:20 1586:10
1643:24 1661:7	1445:8,19 1447:20	1447:18 1448:11	1603:21 1608:6
1662:15 1664:11	1447:22 1448:11	1449:7 1452:11,16	1614:5 1643:13,14
1664:20 1666:12	1448:24 1451:6	1458:15 1476:23	1644:2
1668:12 1669:3	1454:25 1455:23	1482:5 1491:12	thought 1464:8,10
1670:4,17 1673:14	1462:18 1471:6	1496:17,19 1508:3	1464:21,23
1678:1,5	1480:23 1481:13	1511:14 1521:13	1467:19 1469:9,25
theme 1480:16	1507:1,17 1509:15	1528:25 1530:5,7	1473:24 1483:11
themes 1474:3	1509:22 1510:5	1531:21,22 1535:3	1484:15 1488:8,9
1482:4	1518:13 1524:2	1535:14,23 1536:9	1488:19 1489:4
theology 1504:3	1528:9 1535:10	1538:13,23 1539:2	1490:10,15,18,25
1510:17	1537:10,11,25	1539:6 1540:13,19	1490:25 1491:9,23
therell 1559:9	1545:14 1546:3	1541:3 1542:6,7	1492:9 1493:8,11
theres 1413:25	1551:14,20	1544:23 1545:4,17	1494:6,21 1498:19
1414:12 1421:22	1552:19 1555:13	1548:18,20 1550:1	1503:21 1506:11

1506 05 1517 17	1420 1 1422 1 2	4.11.1466.0.22	1657.10
1506:25 1517:17	1430:1 1432:1,2	told 1466:8,23	1657:19
1518:3,7 1519:5,9	1458:10 1470:25	1478:22 1486:10	trained 1556:15
1521:18,19	1472:7 1473:25	1491:3 1494:13	1557:10 1655:18
1545:22 1558:2	1478:3 1480:7,24	1495:7 1497:6	1657:5,25
1600:8,10,16	1482:24 1483:12	1517:11 1518:3	training 1446:4
1639:25 1660:12	1483:14 1489:21	1524:23 1601:15	1483:19 1486:16
thoughtful 1509:7	1492:12 1502:1	1630:6 1635:20	1507:8,11,12
thoughts 1552:11	1504:20 1507:8	1644:12,19,19	1508:5 1518:8
three 1423:14	1512:17,20	1645:9 1665:19	1551:19 1553:1,5,6
1438:11,20	1513:10 1516:21	1668:16	1553:16 1554:15
1455:20,23 1459:4	1522:19 1526:17	tomorrow 1540:25	1555:21 1566:7,7
1459:20 1462:2	1527:1,19 1531:16	1541:10 1605:8	1573:25 1574:2,8
1463:20 1464:10	1531:21,22	1678:22	1580:25 1581:3
1467:6,10,20,21	1532:11 1541:12	tones 1474:10	1582:20 1587:13
1469:9 1473:10	1547:21 1554:14	tool 1665:23	1587:21 1629:24
1483:11,12	1568:5 1576:6,11	tools 1666:2	1629:25 1630:12
1484:15 1488:5,9	1576:15 1578:16	top 1453:15 1475:8	1630:15,17
1489:5,6 1490:10	1582:10 1594:11	1494:4 1563:9	1656:17,24
1490:18,25 1491:9	1595:2 1598:4	1584:1 1592:10	1657:22 1666:17
1491:23 1492:9	1603:2 1609:21,25	topic 1419:7 1472:5	1666:22 1675:13
1493:8,11,16	1611:3 1613:10,15	1480:16 1481:2	transcript 1679:10
1498:19 1500:8	1615:16 1624:17	1482:19 1486:1,24	transfer 1432:16
1502:14,21 1513:1	1624:23 1626:18	1493:12 1494:12	transition 1664:9
1513:2,8 1514:14	1633:14 1636:1	1502:18,20	transitioned 1663:19
1517:3,8,16	1649:16 1650:5	1507:19 1514:5	1663:23
1519:24 1521:14	1659:21,23 1660:1	1653:15,21,22	translated 1647:25
1521:19 1525:25	1660:3,6,8 1661:16	1656:10 1658:23	translating 1468:17
1544:9 1548:11	1662:16,20 1666:1	1659:15 1660:12	traveling 1609:7
1553:13 1560:21	1671:21 1672:13	topics 1419:10	treated 1491:22
1567:12 1584:6,14	1672:14,21,22	1482:20 1486:22	tremendous 1416:5
1586:22 1587:16	1678:21	1510:7 1515:1	1501:6
1591:22 1595:20	timely 1609:3	1516:20	tried 1524:17
1597:22 1598:15	times 1406:6	total 1473:15	true 1428:8 1478:11
1602:17,19,22	1423:15,15	1562:17	1536:9 1573:5
1603:3,4,23	1467:25 1475:4	totally 1522:24	1583:14 1592:9
1604:11,13,24	1486:17 1511:4	tote 1592:17	1599:19 1602:4
1606:21 1615:13	1540:7 1554:2,3	tougher 1497:1	1664:20 1668:12
1615:23 1619:11	1568:8	tour 1455:24	1679:9
1619:19 1621:15	timing 1613:8	towing 1617:6	truly 1491:21
1638:9 1644:5	1677:19	town 1468:2,20	trust 1466:3 1469:3
1648:5,21	title 1464:12 1543:8	1498:20,22 1516:4	1491:15 1505:20
throw 1450:1	1543:10 1626:14	tracks 1620:25	trusts 1491:3
thursday 1542:7,8	1642:3	tracy 1547:22	truth 1442:1
thursdays 1574:22	titles 1587:16	1553:20 1568:15	truthful 1511:14
tied 1474:3	today 1478:8	1590:21	try 1416:9 1474:22
time 1415:3,6 1416:6	1507:18 1540:21	trade 1482:22	1484:9 1496:21
1418:11 1425:17	1541:3,13,17,25	train 1569:2 1629:22	1522:3 1557:2
1427:6 1428:11	1671:2 1678:21	1656:5,14 1657:2,9	1558:22 1588:20
	-	-	_

			Ī
1665:12 1669:14	1490:5,8 1492:25	uhhuh 1446:8	1442:18 1446:2
1672:16 1676:21	1506:25 1507:24	1449:10 1451:9	1548:10 1559:10
trying 1462:24	1527:24 1547:25	1456:13 1458:9	1565:23 1567:24
1489:21 1491:11	1548:10 1555:11	1483:7 1491:6	1569:9 1572:19,20
1555:7 1569:2	1562:1 1567:17	1512:15 1565:8	1586:10 1642:7
1585:11	1569:17 1570:6	1570:8 1592:14	underneath 1653:4
tuesday 1405:17	1571:1 1584:9	1626:9 1634:17	understand 1441:25
1575:9 1677:22	1586:21 1591:18	1654:8 1672:5	1451:8,18,19
tuesdays 1574:22	1593:24 1595:19	ulpn 1539:3	1483:5 1500:25
turn 1456:19 1459:7	1602:24 1604:9	ultimate 1495:2	1502:15 1523:22
1512:13 1548:3	1605:1 1606:21	1649:10 1663:10	1523:24 1552:5,8
1637:6 1651:24	1607:13,18,18	ultimately 1487:24	1552:12,23
turning 1519:22	1611:20 1614:9,25	1495:13,16,19	1579:15 1580:11
1554:12	1615:21,25 1616:3	1561:19	1580:19,20 1590:7
turnout 1610:16	1616:3 1619:19,25	umbrella 1600:21	1592:8 1601:19
turns 1677:1	1622:21 1626:25	unable 1499:6	1604:10,15 1625:7
tuscaloosa 1611:9	1632:19 1638:8	1524:18	1639:4 1649:1
tutelage 1659:6	1642:25 1643:17	uncertain 1518:20	1660:21 1674:24
tutor 1563:21,22,23	1643:24,25 1644:1	uncontroverted	1675:4
1564:2 1565:10,21	1644:24 1652:25	1618:22	understanding
1565:21 1566:6,20	1653:15 1655:23	undergrad 1421:6	1448:17 1500:14
1567:4,11 1579:3,4	1656:1,1 1662:10	undergrads 1447:23	1500:15,25
1587:11,12	1663:3 1665:19	1551:13,15 1577:5	1538:13 1540:6,10
tutorial 1419:5,6,17	1668:5 1671:18	1667:15,16	1579:12 1593:18
1420:4 1423:4	type 1544:19	undergraduate	1593:21 1594:19
tutorials 1419:1,11	1554:24	1411:12 1414:23	1624:18
1419:15,22	types 1569:5,6	1415:1 1417:1,19	understood 1490:6
1420:15 1422:8,15	typical 1513:24	1418:24 1419:4	1491:15 1494:16
1423:3	1550:4 1560:19,20	1420:22 1421:17	1631:4
tutoring 1564:16	1601:7	1422:20 1424:5,14	undoubtedly 1609:4
tutors 1564:5,6	typically 1413:4,6,11	1425:15 1426:8	unduly 1533:7
1566:8,15 1587:17	1419:15,19	1431:11 1432:5,7	1535:22
tweeting 1529:25	1454:25 1481:21	1432:11,13,17	unfair 1436:12
twice 1454:25	1510:14 1521:5	1435:7,15 1439:7	1437:22
1588:23	1545:12,19 1546:2	1445:9 1447:5	unfortunately
two 1412:25 1414:8	1546:4,5 1555:25	1453:13 1454:8,10	1472:10
1414:8 1424:3,7,20	1556:16 1559:10	1455:11,12,22	uniformly 1429:18
1424:21 1435:22	1561:10,12	1486:20 1487:5	union 1433:13
1440:20 1442:5,7	1572:13 1575:8	1558:11 1572:9,15	1435:3,21 1436:2,4
1450:3 1453:5,7	1576:14,14,18	1626:23,24	1437:3 1439:17
1458:19,22,23	1579:9 1580:8	1655:23 1657:1	1440:24 1441:6
1459:6,6,8,20	1581:7 1586:18,21	1666:13 1667:12	1533:4 1534:1,6,13
1465:16 1466:10	typographical	1668:3,21	1534:13,14,20,20
1466:14 1467:10	1538:24	undergraduates	1536:2,6,7,14
1467:13,19		1412:8 1416:11	1537:3,4,6,15
1473:16 1475:8,24	U	1419:3 1421:22	1538:6,14 1594:2
1476:1 1481:4	u 1437:6 1608:8	1422:17 1425:18	1605:5,9 1611:19
1488:25 1489:4,8	ugrant 1619:3	1426:5 1433:4	1614:8,8 1616:1
ĺ			· ·

1617:23 1618:1,2,7	507:19 1474:6 1507:21
1622:5,13 1623:19	
1660:23 1609:19 1611:2 1619:18	voir 1427:16
unionization 1613:23 1616:2,4 utilized 159	
1434:19 1436:1 1618:16,21 1621:8 ————————————————————————————————————	voluntarily 1486:11
1438:23 1439:13 1621:17,24 1622:3 V	1582:7
1595:12 1622:15 1679:6 vacant 1522	
unions 1536:22 universitys 1428:13 vacation 16	
1595:14 1617:7 1536:5,13,17 1609:6 16	
1621:18,25 1589:19 1595:8 vanderpoe l	
1021.10,20	461:3,4,6 voter 1595:21,22,22
unique 1468:6 1611:7 1619:6 1476:15,1	
1546:8 1656:16 unknown 1606:4 1477:19 1	1010.10 1021.15
1657:20 unnecessarily 1526:16 1	
unit 1591:6 1606:23 1410:8 1540:5 1530:12	1598:13,25
1606:25 1607:9 1595:20 variable 15	
1608:2 1609:14 unpacking 1522:24 variation 1	
1615:13 1618:10 unreliable 1607:13 varied 147	
1618:14 1619:1 unsure 1417:8 1550:3	
1620:17 1624:9 1592:24 varies 1415	:16 W
united 1405:1,8 unusual 1415:7 1458:12,1	3,14 wait 1428:23,23
1539:12 1679:6 1596:17 1618:19 1521:10 1	
universities 1418:8 unusually 1468:8 1562:21 1	.672:13 waiting 1615:15
1546:9 1597:7 updated 1488:3 variety 141	<u> </u>
1616:11 1621:1 1624:8 1432:10	1524:13
university 1405:5 upload 1677:11 various 143	35:25,25 waiver 1524:19,24
1411:9 1412:1 upper 1414:22 1487:15 1	
1425:24 1428:1 url 1564:19 1569:22 1619:4	want 1434:1 1446:15
1429:24 1439:14 1578:16 vary 1522:2	2 1603:1 1456:17 1457:17
1444:21 1445:1,4 use 1414:16 1415:25 1618:18	1466:3 1476:21
1451:3 1461:12 1428:20 1449:19 veracity 15	94:6 1478:13 1479:18
1479:20 1480:1 1468:18 1480:7 verbal 1510	
1488:14 1489:1 1481:11,14 verbalized	1520:24 1482:13,22
1505:6 1512:22,25 1485:18 1496:2 verbally 15	20:25 1484:10 1494:12
1524:8 1528:22 1534:1 1545:16 1633:11	1509:23 1511:8,15
1536:8,19 1542:15	27:20,23 1511:19 1512:2
1543:7,14 1544:4,6 1558:2,3,17 1559:1 1427:25 1	429:4,10 1514:4,20 1520:23
1546:11,13,18 1580:14 1598:21 1429:17,2	1530:22 1531:16
1547:7 1549:5 1607:9 1616:22 1667:12,1	3 1531:16 1535:7
1551:1 1552:1,6,16 1617:16,23 versions 14	28:20 1538:12,24 1551:1
1552:17 1553:10 1641:12 1674:23 versus 1577	7:22 1555:13 1558:14
1567:20 1569:8 useful 1555:14 1600:20	1558:20 1559:21
1577:25 1578:15	5 1559:22 1560:9
1595:13 1597:11 usefully 1576:3 victoria 16	19:23 1561:13 1569:4
1598:14 1599:9 uses 1499:9 view 1663:1	16 1576:7 1585:6,9
1604:17,22 usual 1617:18,19 views 1438	:22 1589:1 1590:7
1605:10,11,13,22	0:12 1598:12 1599:20
1606:15 1607:2,8 usually 1412:25 visiting 147	73:14,16 1600:3 1601:4

1612:13 1626:6	1486:25 1555:12	weitzman 1406:4	1630:18
1633:13 1634:22	1661:8	1407:22 1612:19	wheaton 1487:7
1641:14 1648:2	weak 1425:5	1625:14 1626:5	whereabouts
1651:18 1659:6,9	website 1426:24	1628:1,3 1629:1,16	1608:19
1662:18 1673:22	1427:3,21 1428:2,4	1632:8,22 1634:8	whiner 1547:22
wanted 1466:5	1428:13,14,16	1651:13,16,17	1553:20 1568:16
1468:18 1474:22	1429:1,3,4,24	1657:15 1665:25	1590:21
1486:12 1497:7	1453:21 1504:18	1671:10,15	whos 1432:13
1499:10 1501:18	1505:6 1528:23	1675:17 1678:8,16	1446:16 1551:16
1509:7 1518:5	1533:21 1549:20	welcome 1483:22	1592:19
1600:9 1614:8	1549:21 1564:16	wellequipped	wide 1566:3 1602:24
1615:21,21 1633:6	1569:21 1578:15	1516:20	1603:7
1634:16 1668:14	1589:19	wellestablished	widely 1618:18
1674:3	websites 1536:5,6,21	1437:18	wife 1543:15
wanting 1497:16	1536:24	wellfamiliar 1516:10	wild 1619:14,17,20
wants 1415:22	wed 1475:7 1495:11	1516:11	willemien 1490:16
1563:25 1610:16	1540:11,14	wellqualified	1493:4
warranted 1496:14	1561:25	1506:10	william 1544:2
1623:21	wee 1519:14	went 1434:16 1490:2	williams 1544:9
washing 1518:6	week 1414:4,11	1507:23 1508:3	willing 1537:21
washington 1406:16	1415:11,16 1439:2	1636:24 1638:4	1538:1,4 1557:22
1599:9	1467:4,6,7,7,10	1649:25	1614:10,13
wasnt 1428:5	1470:15 1517:20	west 1506:4	winner 1586:15
1487:12 1501:24	1517:22 1521:21	weve 1429:16,18	winners 1426:3
1508:1 1514:11	1521:23 1528:20	1439:6 1517:3	winter 1423:15
1522:24 1525:16	1553:13 1574:20	1531:3 1532:7	1548:19 1562:2
1540:25 1541:2	1574:23,23,24	1549:17 1563:16	1567:16 1586:5,8
1600:3 1630:11	1614:16,25	1563:17 1575:24	1586:19 1626:11
1632:15 1644:8	1643:13,13,13,14	1581:22,24	1627:12 1648:12
1657:10 1676:5	1643:16,16 1644:2	1596:20 1597:4	1673:2,2
way 1416:9,15	1655:24 1662:15	1601:14,15	wish 1438:12
1421:11 1442:14	1662:21 1665:10	1616:21 1617:11	wishes 1593:19
1448:18 1451:14	1665:19 1668:16	1621:3,4 1624:3,10	1594:20 1611:14
1459:8 1462:12	1672:1,3,4 1673:23	whats 1411:10	1624:15
1481:10 1491:12	1677:16,21,24,25	1433:7 1443:4	withdrawn 1622:10
1494:10 1495:9	weekly 1517:9	1458:10 1472:8	withdrew 1622:5
1496:1 1511:16	1591:8 1665:7,11	1476:19 1481:2	withheld 1462:16
1514:10 1519:4	1665:17 1676:18	1519:15 1522:20	1463:5,9
1525:21 1536:14	1677:12	1523:1 1551:2,10	withholdings 1471:2
1552:12,23	weeks 1501:18	1563:21,22	witness 1407:2
1555:14 1560:17	1503:4 1516:3	1564:12 1565:9,17	1410:4,9,10,13,17
1574:20 1576:20	1553:8,11 1556:3,9	1567:20 1568:20	1411:2 1421:7,10
1580:11,15	1567:25 1588:5	1572:25 1599:19	1427:25 1428:3,7
1600:11 1624:6	1632:15,16	1605:19 1612:1	1428:18,21
1637:7,23 1639:6	1643:24,25 1644:1	1620:12 1623:8	1429:19,23
1643:16 1664:11	1645:2	1663:3 1665:3	1430:18 1434:1,2,9
1666:1 1669:13,14	weigh 1623:6	1677:13	1434:17 1438:2
ways 1480:24	weight 1594:11	whatsoever 1629:24	1440:11,18
ways 1480:24	weight 1594:11	wnatsoever 1029:24	1440:11,18

1449:16 1452:14	1444:14 1445:16	1579:5 1580:10	1445:19 1487:1
1456:2 1457:13	1447:25 1450:24	1590:15 1617:1	1543:9 1544:5,12
1458:23 1460:15	1455:17 1467:13	1660:7 1676:5,6	1544:12,15,18,19
1460:21,24 1461:3	1470:12 1471:12	works 1416:15	1544:22,24 1545:1
1461:7 1469:15,19	1471:20 1473:18	1448:18 1462:12	1545:2,4,5,8,13,16
1475:25 1476:10	1478:20 1480:7,12	1473:24 1477:3	1545:21,24
1487:6 1501:12	1482:25 1483:1	1485:11 1505:23	1546:15,17,19
1504:25 1510:8	1485:7 1486:2	1506:7 1563:23	1547:12,17 1548:4
1530:13,14,16,19	1489:23 1491:18	1659:6	1548:4,7,12,13,21
1531:17,19,21,25	1506:9 1512:5,5	workshop 1423:12	1548:23 1549:1,8
1532:24 1534:10	1514:16 1515:2	1424:9 1472:19,24	1549:19 1550:4
1534:15 1537:14	1545:13,25	1472:25 1473:1,4,9	1551:2,5,17,22
1537:23 1538:7	1546:24,25 1550:4	1473:16,22 1475:5	1552:5,9,12,14,20
1540:6,9 1541:20	1551:19 1552:22	1475:9,10,16	1552:23,24 1554:7
1541:24 1542:14	1554:13,21 1555:2	1527:17,18 1555:7	1554:8,10,20
1542:17,21 1543:2	1558:8,16,20	1566:12 1567:5	1556:5,8 1557:8,12
1583:10 1584:17	1560:18 1562:12	1574:24 1575:10	1557:17,21,23,24
1589:14 1593:13	1563:6,13 1564:2	1575:18 1676:2,8	1558:19,20,24
1594:18 1625:1,20	1566:16 1567:11	workshops 1419:3	1559:5,23,24,25
1626:2 1627:24	1567:17 1569:3	1424:14,19 1473:2	1560:1,4,10,10,13
1628:12 1629:11	1572:12 1577:1,3	1555:6 1566:16,17	1560:14 1561:2,3,7
1631:22 1632:5,20	1579:23 1584:5,7,9	1568:19 1574:12	1561:14 1563:3,5
1634:10 1651:13	1584:11 1585:9	1574:25 1576:22	1563:11,13,21,22
1665:23 1671:16	1586:14 1592:21	world 1488:21	1563:23 1565:6,10
1676:10 1678:7,15	1603:1 1616:8,10	worry 1525:3,5	1565:13,16,24,25
1678:19	1653:20,25	worse 1607:10	1566:6,10,23
witnesses 1410:3	1654:18 1655:5	worth 1666:22	1567:5,9,11,23,25
1541:24 1593:20	1659:7 1661:3	worthiness 1655:4	1568:2,25 1571:15
1618:21	1664:21,22	worthy 1661:4	1573:3,7,12,22
witnesss 1628:14	1667:22,22 1670:3	wouldnt 1501:7	1574:11,19,23,25
wondering 1578:9	1670:8 1676:23,24	1592:20 1600:23	1575:6,10,15
wont 1498:1 1593:5	1677:17	1634:22	1576:1,12,17
1601:8	workday 1528:17,21	wow 1522:21	1578:11,25 1579:2
word 1494:15 1495:9	worked 1472:2,19	write 1426:12	1579:3,4,13,14,14
1504:4 1509:4	1481:23 1486:19	1450:6 1492:16	1579:16,21,25
1525:18 1535:15	1528:20 1583:16	1514:5 1522:21	1580:13,18,20
1535:21	1592:1,2,18	1560:21 1575:5	1581:1,3,6,10,12
wording 1464:13	1628:23 1632:1	1649:3 1655:11	1581:18,22 1582:2
1535:13 1600:9	working 1425:17	1674:6,10	1582:16,20,24,25
wordings 1536:11	1445:9 1470:10	writer 1423:21	1583:13,16
words 1494:21	1471:13 1479:13	1552:3 1554:11	1584:10 1585:21
1533:13 1536:12	1487:11 1513:16	1568:22 1580:9,11	1585:25 1587:11
1558:15 1622:25	1545:12 1551:14	writers 1425:15	1587:12 1588:4,14
1646:14	1552:8 1553:21	1544:14 1546:1	1589:19 1590:10
work 1415:22	1556:7 1562:24	1554:12 1569:2	1590:17 1591:4
1422:16 1424:23	1565:23,23	1573:9 1669:17,25	1592:13,25
1426:12,24	1566:11,12,20	writing 1419:2	1656:15 1657:19
1431:23 1443:23	1567:4 1573:9	1423:12,13	1666:12,13,18,18
	-	-	

1666:23 1667:3,19 1607:25,25 1669:5 1600:16 1624:13 1607:25,25 1669:5 1609:15,17.20 1670:24,7,12,24 1638:23 1639:13 1649:17 yep 1488:11 yep 1488:12 year 1411:22 1419:9 youk 1406:10 york 1406:10 york 1406:10 york 1406:10 york 1406:10 york 1406:10 york 1406:66 15507:24 15507:15 1806:6,8 1491:13 142:8,10 1631:16 1633:5,9 1456:12,21,23 1457:15,19 1458:8 1495:12,35,9 1456:12,21,23 1460:14 1513:4,4 1558:2 1496:14 1513:4,4 1528:2 1498:25 1507:22 1498:25 1507:22 1498:25 1507:22 1498:25 1507:22 1497:21 1498:10 1506:17 1515: 4 150				
1667:25,25 1669:5 1600:16 1624:13 1639:13 1639:14,119 1639:24,712,24 1670:24,712,24 1670:25 1671:1,22 1660:7 1662:7 1666:3 1660:7 1662:1 1660:3 1673:2,9,9,10,19 1673:2,9,9,10,19 1673:2,9,9,10,19 1673:16 1674:4,8 1677:16 1672:16 1674:4,8 1677:15 1580:6,8 1674:16 1677:16 1597:11 1797:15 1580:6,8 1491:13 1425:1,13,5,9 1455:1,2,3,5,9 1455:1,2,3,5,9 1455:1,2,3,5,9 1455:1,2,2,1,2 1662:11 1600:10 1631:8,10 1631:16 1633:5,9 1455:1,2,3,5,9 1455:1,2,3,5,9 1455:1,2,1,2,3 1600:14,18,22 1675:11 wrongful 1634:23 wrote 1442:20 1445:14 1513:4,4 1528:2 1460:14 1513:4,4 1528:2 1460:14 1513:4,4 1528:2 1489:15 1582:2,24 1499:2,24 1499	1666:23 1667:3.19	1595:1 1599:23	1607:13.18	00 1405:18 1530:16
1669:15,17,20	*		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
1670:2.4,7,12,24 1638:23 1639:13 1649:17 yep 1488:11 york 1406:6,6 1597:11 1597:11 york 1406:6,6 1597:12 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:13 1597:20 1598:3 1607:21 1597:13 1597:20 1598:3 1607:21 1598:3 1607:21 1597:13 1597:20 1598:3 1607:21 1597:13 1597:20 1598:3 1607:21 1598:1 1606:14 142:3 1506:4 142:14 142:3 1506:4 142:14 143:4 1598:2 1449:15 1449:15 1449:15 1449:15 1449:15 1597:12 1597:12 1598:3 1499:22 1499:21 1499:12 1499:21 1499:12 1499:12 1499:12 1597:12 1597:12 1597:12 1597:12 1597:13 1597:12 1597:13	,			
1670:25 1671:1,22				
1671:22,24 1672:7				
1672:9,18,21 1672:16 1674:4,8 1672:16 1677:16 1674:4,8 1672:16 1677:16 1577:11 1577:15 1580:6,8 1580:17 1600:13 1448:11 1450:1,2 1580:17 1600:13 1448:11 1450:1,2 1580:16 1633:5,9 1456:12,21,23 1631:16 1633:5,9 1456:12,21,23 1457:15,19 1458:8 1679:17 1600:13 1459:19,21,23 1460:7 1472:23 1488:21 1489:2,10 1488:21 1489:2,10 1488:21 1489:2,10 1528:2 1488:2,1489:1,15 1527:22 1528:13 1525:4,17 1538:16 160:8 100 1408:8,9 100 1408:8,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	,	v 1	
1673:2,9,9,10,19 written 1413:20 1672:16 1674:4,8 1677:16 your 1406:6,6 1597:11 your 1427:7 1428:12 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1497:4 1528:1 1455:1,2,3,5,9 1631:16 1633:5,9 1456:12,21,23 1457:15,19 1458:8 1458:24 1459:10 your 1441:25 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1598:3 1607:21 1508:10 1517:19 1517:21 1521:20 1563:10,15 1660:8 1406:61 1514:5 1527:22 1528:13 1528:2 1497:24 1488:1 1498:25 1507:22 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:12 1562:13 1608:1 1638	*	,		
written 1413:20			•	
1427:7 1428:12 1497:4 1528:1 1491:18,22,25 1575:15 1580:6,8 1421:1 1422:8,10 1580:17 1600:13 1448:11 1450:1,2 1550:10 1597:9,11 1598:3 1607:21 1598:3 1607:21 1598:3 1607:21 1598:3 1607:21 1508:13 1539:22 1540:15 1570:20 1598:3 1607:21 1598:3 1607:21 1608:1 1608:		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	•	0/3/1007.21
1497.4 1528.12 1497.4 1528.12 1497.4 1528.12 1575:15 1580:6,8 1580:17 1600:13 1448:11 1450:1,2 1550:10 1597:9,11 1597:13,15 1500:10 153:8,10 1455:12,21,23 1635:4 1455:12,21,23 1635:4 1455:12,21,23 1635:4 1456:12,21,23 1635:4 1456:12,21,23 1635:4 1456:12,21,23 1635:4 1459:19,21,23 1675:11 wrongful 1634:23 1473:15 1474:5 1460:7 1472:23 1460:7 1472:23 1470:71 1408:1 1409:1 1514:5 1528:15 1548:9,18 1528:15 1548:9,18 1528:15 1548:9,18 1528:15 1548:9,18 1528:15 1548:9,18 1542:17 1444:4,12 1444:4,15 1444:4,15 1444:4,15 1446:17 1444:4,15 1446:17 1444:4,15 1446:17 1444:4,15 1446:17 1444:4,15 1446:17 1444:4,15 1446:17 1444:4,15 1446:17 1448:4 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:24 1459:25 1500:15 1500:15 1500:15 1500:15 1500:16 150:1				1
1575:15 1580:6,8 1421:1 1422:8,10 1448:11 1450:1,2 1500:10 1597:9,11 1540:15 1570:20 1598:3 1607:21 1597:13,15 1608:1 1448:21 1459:10 1448:11 1459:10 1448:21 1459:10 1448:21 1459:10 1448:21 1459:10 1448:21 1459:10 1448:21 1459:10 1448:21 1459:10 1563:10,15 1660:8 1449:21 1548:21 1459:10 1563:10,15 1660:8 1449:21 1548:21 1459:10 1563:10,15 1660:8 1449:21 1548:21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1563:19 1562:12 1563:19 1562:16,20,21,21 1563:19 1563:19 1562:16,20,21,21 1563:19 1563:19 1562:16,20,21,21 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:19 1563:11 1503:9 1503:2 1597:23 148:14,16 1429:8 1449:23 1549:23 1449:25 1550:9 1507:12 1509:15 1507:12 1219:10 1409:6 131405:3 1622:17 1409:6 131405:3 1622:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 1391407:17 13141148:16 1461408:11 144148:6 1461408:11 144148:6 1441418:6		•	v	
1580:17 1600:13		, ,		
1601:10 1631:8,10	*	*	v	
1631:16 1633:5,9 1635:4 wrong 1453:6 1494:22 1526:22 1675:11 1496:7 1472:23 1446:14 1513:4,4 1528:2 X x 1407:1 1408:1 1409:1 1514:5 Y y 1514:5 yeah 1421:19 1433:6 1442:17 1444:4,12 1446:17 1444:4,12 1446:17 1448:4 1453:22 1459:12 1458:24 1489:2,10 1499:15 1508:2,3,4 1511:5 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1675:10 168:1 1606:14,18,22 1621:10 younger 1459:12 youre 1441:25 1517:21 1521:20 1563:10,15 1660:8 1608:1 1494:25 1517:21 1521:20 1563:10,15 1660:8 1608:1 1492:20 1495:21 1498:21 1488:21 1492:20 1495:21 1497:21 1498:10 1506:17 1515:4 1527:22 1528:13 1566:17 1515:4 1526:16,20,21,21 1566:17 1515:4 1556:10 1563:19 1666:7 1677:20 1668:1 1608:1		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
1635:4	· /			
wrong 1453:6 1458:24 1459:10 younger 1459:12 younger 1459:12 1500:10 1517:19 1494:22 1526:22 1459:19,21,23 1460:7 1472:23 1444:15,16 1563:10,15 1660:8 1466:14 1513:4,4 1488:21 1489:2,10 1488:23 1488:15 1480:21 1483:22 1488:23 1485:1 1400:1 1514:5 1488:21 1489:2,10 1484:8,23 1485:1 1400:1 1514:5 1508:2,3,4 1511:5 1508:2,3,4 1511:5 1527:22 1528:13 1527:22 1528:13 1525:4,17 1538:16 10036 1406:6 10048:8,9 1409:1 1514:5 7 1508:2,3,4 1511:5 1508:2,3,4 1511:5 1527:22 1528:13 1525:4,17 1538:16 1535:11 1596:22 11470:21 1533:11 1535:11 1596:22 1614:6 1004 1408:8,9 1	1		* *	
1494:22 1526:22 1459:19,21,23 1460:7 1472:23 1441:15.16 1563:10,15 1660:8 1661:4 1513:4,4 1528:2 1489:2,10 1489:25 1507:22 1508:2,3,4 1511:5 1527:22 1528:13 1460:7 1562:12 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1566:17 1515:4 1658:3,9,16 1608:13 1617:9 1618:4 1633:15,17 1635:25 1642:6,18 1649:15 1650:14 1658:2,1448:17 1448:4 1445:22 1499:23 1500:3 1489:25 1507:22 1566:7 1565:14 1659:7 1506:8 1660:7 1516:4 1660:7 1516:4 1660:7 1516:4 1650:7 1665:8 1613:15 1642:7 1130 1599:25 1604:5 1613:16 1619:16 1650:7 1665:8 1660:7,11 1613:11 1613:11 1485:2,6 1486:12 1488:17 1492:3,15 1499:22 1494:24 1497:23 1500:3 1507:23 1500:3 1507:23 1500:3 1507:23 1500:3 1503:20 1506:15 1511:10 1519:1,4 1529:24 1529:24 1529:12 1529:15 1529:24 1555:20 1563:12 1572:8 1555:20 1563:12 1555:20 1563:12 1555:20 1563:12 1555:20 1563:12 1555:20 1563:15 1568:6,11 160:3 1441:6 1448:6 1449:		*		
1675:11 wrongful 1634:23 wrote 1442:20 1466:14 1513:4,4 1528:2 X x 1407:1 1408:1 1409:1 1514:5 Y y 1514:5 yale 1621:7 yeah 1421:19 1433:6 1442:17 1444:4,12 1446:17 1448:4 1453:22 1459:24 1465:12 1472:11 1485:2,6 1486:12 1486:11,11,16 years 147:23 1508:2,3,45:15 1562:16,20,21,21 1566:13 1572:20 1586:3,9,16 1608:13 1617:9 1618:4 1633:15,17 1635:25 1642:6,18 1649:15 1650:14 1658:9,14,16 1658:17 158:2 1666:7 1677:20 youve 1414:14,16 1621:1,11,16 years 147:23 1503:20 1506:15 1499:22 1494:24 1497:23 1500:3 1503:20 1506:15 1511:10 1519:1,4 1520:18 1521:12 1524:1 1529:24 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:01 1563:12 1556:15 1568:6,11 1444:15,16 1443:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:15,16 1448:185:1 1488:21 1488:22 1488:23 1488:22 1488:83 1488:22 1499:20 1495:21 1506:17 1515:4 1526:17 1538:16 1535:11 1596:22 111470:21 1533:11 1535:11 1596:22 111470:21 1533:11 1535:11 1596:22 11301 1595:25 11604:5 11301 1595:25 11604:5 11301 1595:25 11604:5 11301 1595:25 11604:5 1144:14,16 1629:17 1635:7 1666:7 1677:20 youve 1414:14,16 1621:1,14 122 1407:13 125 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1408:10 1449:25 1455:20 1566:17 1575:24 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1556:15 1568:6,11			•	
wrongful 1634:23 wrote 1442:20		* *	· ·	
wrote 1442:20 1475:4,22 1488:15 1480:21 1483:22 1480:21 1483:22 1480:21 1483:22 10036 1406:6 102024 1614:6 <th< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>,</td><td>· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·</td></th<>			,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
1466:14 1513:4,4 1528:2	U			*
1528:2		,		
1489:25 1507:22 1498:10 1506:17 1515:4 1527:22 1528:13 1528:15 1548:9,18 1525:4,17 1538:16 1535:11 1596:22 1613:15 1642:7 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:17 1562:13 1572:20 1586:3,9,16 1608:13 1617:9 1618:4 1633:15,17 1648:17 1448:4 1445:12 1446:17 1448:4 1453:22 1459:24 1465:12 1472:11 1485:2,6 1486:12 1492:22 1494:24 1497:21 1498:10 1506:17 1515:4 1525:4,17 1538:16 1525:4,17 1538:16 1535:11 1596:22 1613:15 1642:7 11301 1595:25 1604:5 1600:14 12 1597:7,24 1600:1 1650:7 1665:8 1600:7,11 1613:11 1650:7 1665:8 1600:7,11 1613:11 1650:7 1665:8 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1619:16 1621:1,14 1	*		*	
Table Tabl	1528:2			*
1508.2,3,4 131.3 1527:22 1528:13 1525:4,17 1538:16 1535:11 1596:22 1613:15 1642:7 1561:25 1562:12 1566:17 1655:7 1629:17 1635:7 1629:17 1635:7 1629:17 1635:7 1638:24 1644:10 1608:13 1617:9 1618:4 1633:15,17 1635:25 1642:6,18 1649:15 1650:14 1658:9,14,16 1649:15 1650:14 1658:9,14,16 1675:12 1472:11 1485:2,6 1486:12 1497:23 1500:3 1503:20 1506:15 1511:10 1519:1,4 1520:18 1521:12 1524:1 1529:24 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1609:7,11 1613:15 1642:7 11301 1595:25 1604:5 11301 1595:25 1604:5 11400:14 12 1597:7,24 1600:1 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1619:16 1621:1,14 1415:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 145:24 1435:4 1409:6 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 123 1408:10 1409:6 124 1409:6				
1409:1 1514:5		* *		
Table Tabl			*	
Y 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1562:16,20,21,21 1563:12 1562:16,20,21,21 1563:12 1563:12 1563:13 1572:20 1563:15 1638:24 1644:10 1639:77 1638:24 1644:10 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1619:16 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1619:16 1621:1,14 1621:1,14 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 123 1409:6 123 1409:6 124 149:25 125 1407:14 127 1409:6 128 1408:10,10 128 1408:10,10 128 1408:10,10 128 1408:10,10 128 1408:10,10 128 1408:10,10 128 1408:11 13 1405:3 1622:17 13rc198325 1405:8 139 1407:17 13rc198325 1405:8 139 1407:17 13rc198325 1405:8 1679:5 139 1407:17 145 1408:11 1	1409:1 1514:5	*		
y 1514:5 yale 1621:7 yeah 1421:19 1433:6 1442:17 1444:4,12 1444:14,15 1446:17 1448:4 1453:22 1459:24 1465:12 1472:11 1488:17 1492:3,15 1492:22 1494:24 1497:23 1500:3 1503:20 1506:15 1511:10 1519:1,4 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1567:13 1572:20 1586:3,9,16 1608:13 1617:9 1618:4 1633:15,17 1638:24 1644:10 1650:7 1665:8 1666:7 1677:20 youve 1414:14,16 1415:24 1435:4 1466:7 1677:20 youve 1414:14,16 1415:24 1435:4 1466:3,2,3 1469:3 1550:12 1572:8 1503:20 1506:15 1511:10 1519:1,4 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11	\mathbf{v}			
yale 1621:7 yeah 1421:19 1433:6 1586:3,9,16 1608:13 1617:9 1638:24 1644:10 1600:7,11 1613:11 1442:17 1444:4,12 1618:4 1633:15,17 1638:24 1644:10 1600:7,11 1613:11 1444:14,15 1618:4 1633:15,17 1635:25 1642:6,18 1666:7 1677:20 1613:16 1619:16 1445:12 1472:11 1658:9,14,16 145:24 1435:4 146:23,23 1469:3 1505:9 1507:12 1488:17 1492:3,15 1492:22 1494:24 1499:13 1448:19 1556:7 1568:13 1560:7 1568:13 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1459:16,17 1462:3 1556:7 1568:13 1569:5 1529:15,21,25 1530:2 1553:24 1679:7 1520:18 1521:12 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1563:15 1568:6,11 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1619:16 1621:1,14 122 1407:13 125 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 163:15 1560:14 1556:7 1568:13 1580:17 1582:18 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 1548:24 1644:10 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1619:16 1621:1,14 1658:9,14,16 1676:11,11,16 1656:7 1568:13 1580:17 1582:18 <td></td> <td>* * *</td> <td></td> <td></td>		* * *		
yeah 1421:19 1433:6 1608:13 1617:9 1650:7 1665:8 1600:7,11 1613:11 1442:17 1444:44,12 1446:17 1444:45,15 1635:25 1642:6,18 1666:7 167:20 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:16 1600:7,11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:11 1600:7,11 1613:11 1613:11 1621:1,14 122 1407:13 122 1407:13 125 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1409:6 128 1409:6 128 1409:6 13 1405:3 1679:5 139 1407:17 1659:5 139 1407:17 1659:5 160:2:17 160:2:17 160:2:17 160:2:17			1629:17 1635:7	
1442:17 1444:4,12 1618:4 1633:15,17 1666:7 1677:20 1613:16 1619:16 1444:14,15 1649:15 1650:14 1658:9,14,16 1446:23,23 1469:3 122 1407:13 1485:2,6 1486:12 1676:11,11,16 1505:9 1507:12 127 1409:6 148:17 1492:3,15 1418:14,16 1429:8 1530:2 1553:24 1409:6 1497:23 1500:3 1497:23 1500:3 1499:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1654:3 1662:9 1500:18 1521:12 1529:15,21,25 1530:2 1553:24 1679:7 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1550:12 1572:8 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1566:7 1677:20 1613:16 1619:16 1642:1,14 122 1407:13 125 1407:14,15 127 1409:6 128 1408:10,10 1409:6 1409:6 13 1405:3 1622:17 1679:5 139 1407:17 13 1405:3 1622:17 139 1407:17 13rc198325 1405:8 1679:7 146 1408:11 146 1408:11	•	1586:3,9,16	1638:24 1644:10	*
1444:14,15 1635:25 1642:6,18 1635:25 1642:6,18 1649:15 1650:14 1621:1,14 1446:17 1448:4 1649:15 1650:14 1658:9,14,16 1415:24 1435:4 122 1407:13 1485:2,6 1486:12 1676:11,11,16 1505:9 1507:12 127 1409:6 148:17 1492:3,15 1418:14,16 1429:8 1529:15,21,25 128 1408:10,10 1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1654:3 1662:9 1679:5 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1563:15 1568:6,11 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 20 14th 1481:6	, •			*
1446:17 1448:4 1649:15 1650:14 1415:24 1435:4 122 1407:13 1446:17 1448:4 1649:15 1650:14 1415:24 1435:4 122 1407:13 1453:22 1459:24 1658:9,14,16 1676:11,11,16 1466:23,23 1469:3 1505:9 1507:12 127 1409:6 1488:17 1492:3,15 1492:22 1494:24 1492:13 1448:19 1556:7 1568:13 1503:2 1553:24 1409:6 1497:23 1500:3 1499:25 1455:20 1457:13,14 1550:17 1582:18 1679:5 1511:10 1519:1,4 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1550:12 1572:8 1503:23 1508:6,11 2 2 1520:18 1521:12 1553:23 1508:6,11 1459:16,17 1462:3 1550:12 1572:8 1555:20 1563:12 2 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 146 1408:11 1449:25 1448:19 1459:16,17 1462:3 1459:16,17 1462:3 1550:12 1572:8 1555:20 1563:12 2 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11	*	1618:4 1633:15,17	1666:7 1677:20	
1453:22 1459:24 1658:9,14,16 1465:12 1472:11 1658:9,14,16 1446:23,23 1469:3 125 1407:14,15 1485:2,6 1486:12 1488:17 1492:3,15 1418:14,16 1429:8 1529:15,21,25 128 1408:10,10 1492:22 1494:24 149:25 1455:20 1530:2 1553:24 1409:6 1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1459:16,17 1462:3 1654:3 1662:9 139 1407:17 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 2 2 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 2 2 2 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 14th 1481:6	′	1635:25 1642:6,18	youve 1414:14,16	*
1465:12 1472:11 1676:11,11,16 1505:9 1507:12 127 1409:6 1485:2,6 1486:12 148:14,16 1429:8 1529:15,21,25 128 1408:10,10 1492:22 1494:24 149:13 1448:19 1530:2 1553:24 1409:6 1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1511:10 1519:1,4 1459:16,17 1462:3 1654:3 1662:9 137c198325 1405:8 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 2 2 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 2 2 146 1408:11 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 14th 1481:6		1649:15 1650:14	1415:24 1435:4	
1485:2,6 1486:12 years 1417:23 1503.9 1307.12 128 1408:10,10 1488:17 1492:3,15 1418:14,16 1429:8 1530:2 1553:24 1409:6 1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1556:7 1568:13 1679:5 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1654:3 1662:9 1679:5 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 2 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 2 2 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 2		1658:9,14,16	1446:23,23 1469:3	*
1488:17 1492:3,15 1418:14,16 1429:8 1530:2 1553:24 1409:6 1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1459:16,17 1462:3 1654:3 1662:9 13 1405:3 1622:17 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 2 2 2 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 2 2 146 1408:11 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 14th 1481:6		1676:11,11,16	1505:9 1507:12	
1492:22 1494:24 1429:13 1448:19 1556:7 1568:13 13 1405:3 1622:17 1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1654:3 1662:9 13 1405:3 1622:17 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1654:3 1662:9 139 1407:17 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 2 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 2 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 2	*	years 1417:23	1529:15,21,25	· ·
1497:23 1500:3 1449:25 1455:20 1580:17 1582:18 1679:5 1503:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1654:3 1662:9 139 1407:17 1520:18 1521:12 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 2 1531:2,23 1539:4 1555:20 1563:12 2 145 1408:11 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1679:7 1449:25 1448:19 1459:16,17 1462:3 1654:3 1662:9 1550:12 1572:8 1555:20 1563:12 1679:7 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 146 1408:11 1449:25 1448:19 1654:3 1662:9 1679:7 1575:10 1503:23 1555:20 1563:12 1679:7 146 1408:11 146 1408:11 1449:25 1455:20 1449:25 1455:20 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1679:5 1575:10 1503:3 1654:3 1662:9 1575:10 1503:3 1654:3 1662:9 1575:10 1503:3 1654:3 1662:9 1580:17 1	1	1418:14,16 1429:8	1530:2 1553:24	
1503:20 1506:15 1511:10 1519:1,4 1520:18 1521:12 1524:1 1529:24 1531:2,23 1539:4 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1730:20 1506:15 1457:13,14 1459:16,17 1462:3 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1563:15 1568:6,11 1730:17 1382:18 1654:3 1662:9 139 1407:17 13rc198325 1405:8 1679:7 145 1408:11 146 1408:11 14th 1481:6		1429:13 1448:19	1556:7 1568:13	
1511:10 1519:1,4 1520:18 1521:12 1524:1 1529:24 1531:2,23 1539:4 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1637:13,14 1459:16,17 1462:3 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1563:15 1568:6,11 17034:3 1002:9 2 10034:3 1002:9 10034:3 1002:9 10034:3 1002:9 11034:3 1002:9 11034:3 1002:9 11034:3 1002:9 11034:3 1002:9 12034:3 100		1449:25 1455:20	1580:17 1582:18	
1520:18 1521:12 1524:1 1529:24 1531:2,23 1539:4 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1520:18 1521:12 1548:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1563:15 1568:6,11 1563:15 1568:6,11		1457:13,14	1654:3 1662:9	
1520:18 1521:12 1524:1 1529:24 1531:2,23 1539:4 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1488:25 1524:22 1543:12 1544:8 1555:20 1563:12 1563:15 1568:6,11 146 1408:11 146 1408:11 14th 1481:6		1459:16,17 1462:3		
1524:1 1529:24 1531:2,23 1539:4 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1563:15 1568:6,11 2achary 1406:3 2fasman 1406:7 146 1408:11 14th 1481:6		*		
1531:2,23 1539:4 1550:12 1572:8 1563:15 1568:6,11 1563:15 1568:6,11 1563:15 1568:6,11				145 1408:11
1550:12 1572:8	,		zfasman 1406:7	146 1408:11
1575.10 1500.02				14th 1481:6
ı ı ı ı	1575:19 1592:23	· ·	0	15 1412:24 1414:6

1415:15 1431:5	1660:10		52 1407:8 1408:5
	20001 1406:16	3	
1467:13 1517:19		3 1536:25 1538:25	1438:15,20,24
1517:21 1521:20	2008 1412:6	1588:25 1589:1	1439:24 1440:2
1563:15 1593:25	2009 1427:5	1596:24 1606:17	53 1408:6 1438:15
1594:3,3,9,15	201 1408:17	1612:24 1616:20	1438:20 1439:3,9
1620:15,20	2012 1461:20 1478:7	1621:14 1652:15	1439:24 1440:2
1646:22 1678:25	1648:10	30 1405:18 1414:1,3	54 1408:7 1438:15
150 1417:3	2013 1648:12,15,18	1500:7 1605:6	1438:20 1439:12
1506 1610:2	2014 1462:6 1464:6	1646:22,23 1678:4	1439:24 1440:2
15a 1593:25 1594:3	1472:23 1489:14	1679:8	545 1608:1
1594:9,15 1620:16	1626:11 1627:12	31 1605:8	55 1408:8 1504:6,10
1620:20	2015 1411:23	312 1406:12	1504:23 1508:15
15person 1500:4	1430:24 1462:6	325 1602:14	1508:17,20
15th 1481:7	1464:8 1472:23	326 1596:8	555 1406:16
160 1408:12	1475:14 1489:14	33000 1667:7	56 1407:9 1408:9
1600 1617:21	1503:9 1607:20	34 1408:5,6,7	1504:13,24 1505:5
161 1408:12 1617:21	1608:1 1673:2,4	35 1412:21	1508:15,18,20
163 1606:22	2016 1462:7 1464:10	364 1618:12	57 1407:11 1408:10
165 1408:13	1470:7 1477:12	3721361 1406:12	1532:10,18,22
166 1408:13	1478:22 1526:23	39 1606:22	57th 1614:5
167 1408:14,14	1655:7 1673:3	3a 1624:8	58 1408:11 1549:11
17 1598:1 1606:19	2017 1405:18		1549:13,18 1550:9
174 1408:15,15,16	1452:21 1599:1	4	1550:11,14,18,21
1408:16	1605:7 1606:6	4 1537:1 1621:7	1570:6
178 1617:6	1611:1,5,21	1678:25	5835 1614:2
179 1407:18	1617:13 1618:10	40 1465:13,14	59 1408:12 1564:7,9
18 1453:11 1559:10	1624:1 1679:8	1544:8 1568:6	1564:13,23 1565:2
1560:22 1651:14	202 1406:17	1581:22	1570:6 1571:19
1651:15,16,19	208 1408:17	45 1477:9,16	6
186 1407:19	21 1618:13	1531:13	
187 1407:20	212 1406:7	450 1607:23	60 1408:13 1412:22
19 1559:10 1560:22	216 1408:18	470 1596:8,8	1548:20 1562:20
1980 1568:6	219 1405:16 1408:18	471 1596:8	1569:12,14,25
199 1611:10	22110 1596:13	48 1407:6 1606:19	1570:3 1571:17
1994 1653:9	222 1407:22	1607:16,21	1585:3 1589:11,13
1998 1602:14	227 1407:23		1589:22,23 1590:2
19th 1406:11	22nd 1541:8	5	600 1589:1
1b 1652:3,7,12	23 1409:5 1599:1	5 1537:13 1563:10	60603 1406:12
1st 1431:5	24 1501:7	1606:17 1652:15	61 1408:14 1571:7,9
	25 1543:12 1606:5	1660:8	1571:17,20,23
	1608:20 1611:4,8	50 1407:7 1417:7	1572:3
2 1531:14,25	1611:21 1614:22	1465:13,13	62 1408:15 1578:4,8
1535:10,25	1646:21,25	1548:20 1562:20	1578:19,22
1536:23 1595:25	25th 1614:24	1584:2 1678:4	63 1408:16 1597:2,5
1604:5 1606:22	26 1407:5 1409:5	500 1475:21	1599:4 1602:2,8,10
1622:23	269 1407:24	50300 1666:17	1620:24
20 1467:14 1521:17	28 1500:7 1611:10	50minute 1521:6	64 1408:17 1605:16
1605:7 1607:24		50th 1614:7	1605:19 1606:14
L			

	Page 17	3 2
1610:18 1611:24		
1612:2,8,11]	
65 1408:18 1583:22]	
1583:24,25 1585:3		
1585:13 1620:10		
1620:13,23 1623:9		
1623:13,16		
651 1617:6		
68 1608:1		
00 1000.1		
7		
7 1407:4		
70 1583:22		
70s 1544:8		
72 1407:12 1409:5		
1426:17,21,21		
1427:14 1430:3,6		
73 1409:6 1531:5,7		
1532:9,15,21		
1625:6,10		
8		
8 1406:11 1500:9,10		
1501:7 1539:22		
1540:15 1596:22		
1607:21		
80 1606:17		
80s 1544:8		
85 1608:1		
8794400 1406:17		
8794400 1400:17		
9		
9 1405:18 1533:10		
1538:6,22 1539:21		
1613:10,11		
1621:14 1678:22		
90 1548:19 1556:25		
1562:18,19		
1583:19,21,23		
1585:1,2,14,17		
1600:4 1618:12]	
924 1614:5		
96 1606:10,19,22		
1607:9		
9693440 1406:7		
	<u> </u>	